CORPORATE SOCIAL RESPONSIBILITY:

A COMPARATIVE

APPROACH

By

DAREN LOVE

Bachelors of Science in Vocal Music Education

Oklahoma City University

Oklahoma City, Oklahoma

2000

Submitted to the Faculty of the
Graduate College of the
Oklahoma State University
in partial fulfillment of
the requirements for
the Degree of
MASTER OF SCIENCE
May, 2008

CORPORATE SOCIAL RESPONSIBILITY:

A COMPARATIVE

APPROACH

Thesis Approved:

Dr. Judith Mathers

Dr. Lucy Bailey

Dr. Ed Harris

Dr. Gordon Emslie

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Nomenclature

BBC: British Broadcasting Corporation

CLASSE: Child Labor Alternatives through Sustainable Systems in Education

CSR: Corporate Social Responsibility

DHS: Demographic and Health Survey

ERA: Education Reform Act

IFESH: International Foundation for Education and Self-Help

IITA: International Institute of Tropical Agriculture

IMF: International Monetary Fund

MNC: Multinational Corporation

NGO: Non-Governmental Organization

OECD: Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development

TNC: Transnational Corporations

UBE: Universal Basic Education

UNEP: United Nations Environment Program

USAID: United States Agency for international development

WCF: World Cocoa Foundation

WLF: Washington Legal Fund

CHAPTER ONE

Introduction

"Do put your precious corporate social responsibility resources in education, our people's ability to survive and their ability to get out of poverty is anchored on quality and relevant education"
-Jesli Lapus, Filipino Education Secretary Speaking in 2006. Basic Education Forum Held in Manila Philippines

The spread of globalization and the role it plays in transforming the educational landscape is as multifaceted a dilemma for scholars as are the combinations of corporations and indigenous people whom they encounter. Multinational corporations (MNCs) and their stakeholders share a commonality in their dependence on culture as a means to sustain cohesion within heterogeneous societies in order to help them achieve their social and economic goals (Capshaw, 2005). To deal with possible conflicts of interest that may result from the overlap of specific cultural priorities, MNCs make gestures of goodwill to the peoples and states on whom they depend for both natural resources and human capital, through Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR). As the quote above suggests, CSR plays a critical role in both the educational quality and economic prosperity of those living in developing regions. For those in the field of comparative education, the impact of CSR programs must be considered when accounting for changes in educational priorities of those stakeholders who have come to depend upon multinational corporations for their survival.

The significance of this study is to question the ongoing intrusion of western economic trends in transforming indigenous educational structures. The need for such an

analysis comes due to the fact that within neo-colonial critiques there is an absence of literature dealing with the role of CSR in further explaining how this transformation is progressing. By investigating case studies of CSR and education through the lens of social cohesion this study will hopefully bridge this gap in scholarship.

<div align="center">Problem</div>

Corporate social responsibility is a complex phenomenon which aims to supplement or replace elements of the public welfare system that are failing to serve society. State educational needs are being met more frequently by the multinational corporations operating within their host countries borders. Unlike public institutions which are subject to government oversight, corporate social responsibility is often exempt from government agency supervision. While it is the clear motive of public education to serve social cohesion, the motivation of multinational corporations in providing corporate social responsibility may be economically or politically motivated. The consequences for social cohesion are unclear if the responsibilities of education are appropriated to the pillar of business.

<div align="center">Purpose of this Study</div>

The purpose of this paper is to provide an introduction and conceptual frameworks with which to explain what effect CSR programs have on the realignment of national educational policy priorities when meeting the organizational objectives of multinational/transnational corporations.

Three Frameworks for Analysis

To compare the impact of CSR on education I have chosen to accompany each section with a case study, one from Nigeria, China, and the Gold Coast of Africa. The three case studies are preceded with a more detailed look at each conceptual framework. Each case study provides a short historic examination of the host country's education sector and a review of the MNCs economic and social ventures within the host country. Multiple frameworks allow for analysis of corporate social responsibility program design, how the implementation is accomplished, and the motivation for its particular assemblage. It is important to note that in each of the three examples, multiple levels of analysis may be applied. Interrelated issues arise that apply equally to both the global society and the local concerns of parents, teachers and students involved in the program. An effort was made to consider how corporate social responsibility affects education issues at both the local and global levels. The case studies chosen apply particularly well to their corresponding framework for analysis. In the final example, which deals with a CSR program attempting to raise academic achievement in Ghana, the case will be examined through a multi-tiered analysis using all three frameworks.

Organization

In the first chapter the social pillars of education and business are established. The following chapters are arranged so that the relevant framework of analysis precedes the case study which it deals with. For instance, the chapter dealing with Hofstede's cultural indices acts as a framework for following chapter dealing with Coca-Cola's CSR in Nigeria and so forth. Chapter eight explores the notion of using multiple frameworks for analyzing CSR educational programs.

Definitions

Classic Liberal(ism): An economic doctrine stressing the value of human rights, property rights, and a free-market economy.

Commodification: The transformation of what is normally a non-commodity into a commodity, or, in other words, to assign value.

Corporate Social Responsibility: The voluntary commitment of companies to contribute to social and environmental goals.

Cultural Revolution: A set of reforms by Communist Party of China's Chairman, Mao Zedong, officially as a campaign to rid China of its "liberal bourgeoisie" elements and to continue revolutionary class struggle.

Creative Destructionism: Schumpeter's vision of capitalism, innovative entry by entrepreneurs that sustained long-term economic growth, even as it destroyed the value of established companies that enjoyed some degree of monopoly power.

Deterritorialization: The weakening of ties between culture and place.

Direct Social Action: A form of Corporate Social Responsibility denotes the efforts of corporations to directly confront social problems without the prompting of governments.

Globalization: The increasing global connection between economic, social, cultural, and technological spheres.

Government-Business Partnerships: A form of corporate social responsibility, where corporations act on social problems in partnership with governments and under their direction.

Han Chinese: The largest ethnic group in China and the largest ethnic group in the world.

Hukou: The system of residency permits which dates back to the 1950s where household

    registration is required by law in the People's Republic of China and Taiwan.

Indigenous Knowledge: Knowledge particular to a given ethnic group. Generally not

    broadly shared or known.

Lumpenproletariat: A term used by Karl Marx and Frederich Engels to describe the social

    undesirables in a state.

Market-Failure: A classic-liberal understanding that there are sectors of the economy

    where the free hand of the market and deregulation fail.

Market-Solutions: A neoliberal economic concept that supposes for every "market-

    failure" there lies a sector of the economy which is capable of providing a free-

    market solution.

Multinational Corporation: A corporation which operates in at least two countries.

    reward the laws and regulatory agencies in which they operate.

Neoliberal(ism): The reemergence of nineteenth century classic-liberal policies within the

    20th century.

Oral Tradition: A way of passing on knowledge that is informal and not written.

Ota: A state in Nigeria, home of Iganmode Grammar School

Periphery: Term used in World Systems Theory to describe dependent states existing on

    the outer edges of the society of states. Often exploited by core nations for

    resources and labor.

Political Philanthropy: Corporate social responsibility aimed at procuring the goodwill of

    politicians, made in the hopes of gaining political favors in return.

Post-Nationalism: Arjun Appadurai's term for the new set of global relationships.

Particular in its use to describe emerging sociological *"scapes"*.

Quasi-Market Policy: Neoliberal economic policy which seeks to apply market-solutions to traditional state welfare agencies.

Reciprocal Altruism: A form of giving in which one person or group provides a benefit to another without expecting any immediate payment or compensation.

School Choice: Describes programs that allow students to choose to attend any of various participating private and public schools, usually based on a system of vouchers, tax credits, or scholarships.

School Vouchers: A certificate given by the state allowing parents to choose a private school rather than public school for their children.

Shareholder: An individual or company that own shares of stock in a joint stock company.

Social Cohesion: "The ongoing process of developing a community of shared values, shared challenges and equal opportunity within [a country], based on a sense of trust, hope and reciprocity among all [citizens]" (Jeannotte and Sharon, 2001).

Social Contracts: A principle entailing (based on the writings of Rousseau) the act of people freely entering into an agreement with their government and willingly sacrifice a degree of freedom in order to live within a civil society.

Stakeholders: Any party capable of being affected by a company's action.

Transnational Corporation: Often used interchangeably with Multinational Corporations. Used here to denote a trend by corporations in a global environment to transcend state regulations and show greater concern for International laws and regulations.

CHAPTER TWO

In this section I will look at the roll of education as a pillar of social cohesion and define the four functions described by Heyneman in carrying out its purpose. Comparative education scholar Stephen P. Heyneman (2003) asserts that society is constructed of four basic "pillars" which support social cohesion: political organizations, social organizations, educational organizations, and economic or business organizations. Each pillar has a dual role in that they provide a sense of identity to citizens living within the state, and help support the sovereignty of the state within the international society. For our purposes we will only be examining the interaction of two of these pillars. We will first discuss education and its four essential functions to society (Heyneman, 2003) followed by business and its special case of Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR).

The First Pillar: Education

It is important to note at the outset that the four organizing pillars of society play an integrated role in the establishment of social cohesion. "Education can only successfully contribute in conjunction with other organizational pillars: social, political and commercial" (Heynemann, 2003, p. 186) However, multinational corporations through CSR provide a way in which states may subcontract one element of the social contract out to another pillar. The overwhelming evidence of my study suggests that, regardless of the states condition, CSR undermines the social, political, and economic structure upon which the pillar of education is connected.

While Heyneman's model provides an unambiguous approach in articulating how social contracts are formed it does not address the incredibly interwoven complex relationship that each of these pillars in reality play with one another. The fact is both social and political considerations are prevalent in each of the case studies provided. Further studies may focus more consciously on the intricate relationship that each of these forces pose on the issue. I accept the limitations of this framework on the basis that CSR is foremost economic solution and for our purposes the dilemma to which it is suppose to rectify is education. My hope is that the ruff hewn will expose the intricacies involved in the topic and allow further inquiry on the subject.

The first function of education as described by Heyneman (2003) is to teach the "rules of the game' or ' the interpersonal, political, social, and legal principles underpinning good citizenship, the obligations of political leaders, the behavior expected of citizens, and the consequences for not adhering to these principles" (p. 29). The push for a renewed emphasis on civics education has been international in scope. Prior, (2006), cites such factors as the stress of globalization on local traditions, increasing multiculturalism, and a decrease in community volunteerism as all contributing to countries emphasizing basic civics education as a means to solidify democratic institutions. He also emphasizes that the curriculum of civics education should be a project which involves students, teachers, staff, administration and community groups rather than simply federal mandates that show up on standardized tests.

The second function of education, according to Heyneman (2003), is to create institutions which reflect a diversity of citizen participation. In order to decrease the distance between social groups and promote diversity in citizens' social interaction, it is

expected that education build trust among citizens with diverse social backgrounds. In the United States this concept has helped to shape laws which promote racial equality through ending public school segregation. Kozal (2005) highlights the social segregation that remains in inner cities and documents the resulting negative effects that the failure of social integration has on students and communities. He argues that to be socially isolated in the United States determines the quality of opportunities (third function) as evidenced by acute racial segregation that remains along largely urban/suburban lines.

The third function of education Heyneman suggests is very closely related to that of the second. He states that it is the function of education to give an equal opportunity to all students. The purpose of this role is to instill confidence in public institutions so that citizens will trust and abide by laws. Note that in providing the opportunity for success Heyneman is not suggesting that the role of education is to ensure academic achievement for all. Rather, "a sense of fairness" must be adhered to when providing instructional opportunities regardless of a person's social background. Heyneman (1983) is clear that globally the determinants of educational attainment vary greatly based on the socio-economic status within a state. However, in affluent heterogeneous society's curriculum and assessment choices are more often than not made to ensure that certain social groups remain in control. As Shohamy (2000) states:

> "It is often claimed that hegemonic groups (especially educational bureaucrats) use tests for power and control to suppress and eliminate multicultural differences in covert ways. It is the realization of those in authority that test takers will change their behaviors in order to succeed on tests that leads them to use tests as disciplinary tools… tests become turned into arms of policy and for imposing control" (p. 3)

The final role of education according to Heyneman is to act as adjudicator to varied community interest groups by finding common ground to local dilemmas and thereby supporting social cohesion. Heyneman says adjudication may be achieved thru

educational institutions such as public school boards, professional councils, and parent teacher associations. Community groups influence every aspect of the educational process, from curriculum to staffing. Schools do not always agree on what is the right course for action and the strain on educational institutions to address and fairly act upon the concerns of so many constituents can be overwhelming.

Before turning attention to the second social pillar of business it is important to note two things. First, that the broad sets of responsibilities congruent to the education sector are applicable to every nation in the global community of states with democratically elected institutions. Heyneman (2000) relates that the overarching fundamental expression of these four purposes in a democratic society is to provide for a citizenry willing to abide by self-regulatory social contracts (p. 174). Social contracts take precedent over personal opinions, allowing citizens to interact in a way that is respectable to one another based on norms and common obligations to the society. Second, in the absence of such self-regulatory social contracts, economic development is not possible (Bates, 1989). Many of the economic ills in peripheral nation-states can be traced to an absence of social cohesion amongst various ethnic, and religious, and linguistic groups. As the discussion moves forward it will be important to ask the following question:

 1. Which of these purposes does business have a legitimate role to play in shaping educational policy as defined by Heyneman?
 2. What are the consequences for social cohesion if the responsibilities of education are appropriated fully to the pillar of business?

The Second Pillar: Business

In this section I turn to the pillar of business and explain both the traditional view of corporate responsibility to social cohesion and the emerging consensus regarding a more robust form of involvement in the form of CSR. Corporations often have a much larger economic footprint than the whole of communities in which they operate. Corporations are in some cases so large they often dwarf not only communities but entire nation-states. The largest of these companies that operate across multiple boarders, whose scope and wealth is global in nature, are commonly referred to as Multinational Corporations or MNCs. According to Gilpin (2001), MNCs produce up to 80 percent of the worlds economic output (p. 89). Palmer (2001) asserts that MNCs distort the commitment of business to social cohesion for two reasons. First, because the MNCs, which begin as domestic corporations, craft their mode of operations under different rules and regulations, their ability and willingness to develop the social cohesion of their host country is limited by the self-interest of the corporation. Wealth is ultimately removed from the host nation through the exploitation of natural and human resources. Second, because host nations in developing regions often lack fully developed democratic institutions, MNCs are tempted to lobby against or even bypass national laws by creating alternative social structures. When nation-states lack the basic social structure needed for an MNC to take full advantage of a countries resources, the MNC will create those structures.

While education contributes to social cohesion through the replication of shared cultural norms and values, the pillar of business, according to Heyneman (2005), contributes through the creation of capital and the distribution of wealth. Many economists see business's obligation to social cohesion only in these narrowly defined

11

terms. This sentiment is expressed by Friedman (1962) when he stated that "There is one, and only one social responsibility of business—to use its resources and engage in activities designed to increase its profits so long as it stays within the rules of the game, which is to say, engages in open and free competition, without deception or fraud" (p. 133).

Implicit here is that Friedman believes business to be actors responsible to the social contract of the nation-state in which it operates. Schoolman (1987) explains that "Even liberals who are unequivocally hostile to community must acknowledge communitarian sentiments within liberalism" (p. 205) As such, it would be logical to assume that business operates as merely one interest group seeking to shape policy through the adjudicative responsibility of the education sector. It can be understood why corporations who only make up a portion of the larger economy in which they operate, would be content with this role. By limiting their involvement in education to that of advocate for particular policies they are maximizing profits and producing the largest possible return to shareholders. However, not all corporations are simply actors within a greater social whole.

The reason corporate organizations have abandoned their traditional role of promoting social cohesion through wealth creation and have chosen instead to involve themselves in actions of Corporate Social Responsibility has occurred due to a political shift that vaulted neoliberal economic tenants to the center of public discourse. As the aforementioned quote by Friedman suggests, some economists hold a negative opinion regarding business involvement in social institutions. This view stems from the classic-liberal understanding that there are sectors of the economy where the free hand of the

market and deregulation fail. These "market-failures" occur in education, according to John Stuart Mill (1965), because "The uncultivated cannot be competent judges of cultivation" (p. 953) nor, argues Mill, can cultivation be trusted to parents who may or may not be able to provide equity to their children in the form educational provisions. This economic theory has provided the basis for bureaucratic, hierarchical control of public education for the past hundred and fifty years.

Recently, classic-liberal assumptions of the welfare economy were replaced by theory which attempts to liberate every sector of the society from what many see as the shackles of government control and inefficiency. Described as "neoliberalism", this economic theory has two goals as applied to social institutions. The first is to provide "market solutions" to those institutions, like education, which have previously been analyzed as market failures. These solutions come in competitive reform initiatives such as school voucher programs and tying federal funding to standardized test results (Apple, 2005). The second goal of neoliberalism is to make government agencies responsible for ensuring that competition and efficiency in these new markets flourish. Olsen's (1996) explanation of neoliberal reliance on government's role is very illuminating.

> "Whereas classical realism represents a negative conception of state power in that the individual was to be taken as an object to be freed from the interventions of the state, neo-liberalism has come to represent a positive conception of the states role in creating the appropriate market by providing the conditions, laws, and institutions necessary for its operation"(p. 340)

 MNCs are the beneficiary of neoliberal economic reforms because more of what was in the public arena becomes potential profit that may be exploited. However, bureaucratic decentralization does not ensure a rapid market transition. MNCs which provide for educational programs in either the absence of institutional structures, or who actively work with governments

who are trying to privatize those sectors into competitive market environments, must work to fulfill the needs of stakeholders while at the same time creating a profit.

To gain a comparative understanding of what role Corporate Social Responsibility plays in influencing policy trends in the education sector of host nations, we must first define CSR in a broader sense. The European Union (2002) broadly defines Corporate Social Responsibility as the voluntary commitment of companies to contribute to social and environmental goals. These commitments are aimed at improving the lives the MNCs stakeholder as well as benefiting the MNC itself. According to Freeman (2004), a stakeholder is a party who affects, or can be affected by, the company's actions. This includes consumers, employees and shareholders. MNCs who invest resources in CSR believe that elements of social cohesion beyond wealth creation and distribution are their responsibility. As the three cases of CSR programs aimed at educational development are explored, it is important to distinguish who is the supposed beneficiary of the program, what are the programs purported goals, and determine ultimately whether the program adds to or detracts from the society it intends to serve.

CHAPTER THREE

Cultural Substitution

"We must however, note that the education sector is just one of several other sectors contending for government limited resources and in the face of economic doldrums and upsurge in demand for quality social services by the populace. It is obvious that no government, irrespective on how benevolent, can single-handedly provide all the facilities needed in schools. Hence, the need and genuine call for other stakeholders to participate in funding education"
- Gboyega Salami, Chairman of the Coca-Cola Company in Nigeria

If the replication of culture is a responsibility embedded in the pillar of education, as Heyneman suggests, then it must be expected that CSR programs targeting education reform take into consideration cultural norms and values and integrate them into the framework for improving existing curriculum and instruction. Corporate social responsibility links the national and corporate culture of a state. In this section I will define the role of each as it applies to national educational imperatives.

National Cultural Dimensions

Power Distance is the first national cultural dimension used by Hofstede and is defined by Newman and Nolan (1996) as "… the extent to which people believe that power and status are distributed unequally and accept that unequal distribution of power as the proper way for social systems to be organized" (p. 755-756). High power distance societies rely on a small group of privileged individuals to make all social choices and, predicts that citizens within these societies will act opportunistically seeking personal gain, choose conformity over independence, carry out orders from those at the top,

perceive inequalities among individual traits and intellectual abilities, and have less faith and trust in their fellow citizen (Doney, Cannon, & Mullen, 1998).

The opposite then would be expected among low power distance societies where power is distributed more equally among citizens. In low power distance nations, people tend to share power with those around them, be less likely to conform, value relationships on the basis of group involvement, view their fellow citizens with equity in terms of their intellectual potential, and have more trust in their fellow citizens. Addressing the impact of power distance on educational policy, Friederichs (1991) notes that equalities and inequalities in education can be identified by which groups have access to policy creation. The author also suggests that different functions of the educational process may be overt or remain hidden, such as what types of curriculum are offered and which students are chosen to have access to the curriculum deemed most critical to a society's future. According to the author, this has a tremendous impact on what role the student will envision for him/herself in society.

Uncertainty Avoidance is the second dimension identified by Hofstede used to predict cultural norms within a society. Doney (1998) declares "Tolerance for unstructured, unclear, or unpredictable situations determines the extent to which people try to mitigate uncertainty by adopting strict codes of behavior by establishing formal rules and by rejecting deviant ideas and behaviors" (p. 614). Countries with high uncertainty avoidance would then be expected to have citizens be less opportunistic, have a high level of predictability in relationships and keep those relationships over a longer period of time. Countries with high uncertainty avoidance also place a great deal of value in expert opinions and are more likely to trust social institutions.

In contrast countries with low uncertainty avoidance would be expected to tolerate risk and be more willing to engage in opportunistic behavior. They are also more tolerant of a wide range in behavioral norms and be less likely to establish relationships which last for a long period of time. Friederichs (1991) notes that issues related to uncertainty avoidance in the education sector can be found in an institutions uncertainty in policy issues regarding curriculum, including to what degree schooling is limited for the purpose of assessment. Also, uncertainty avoidance addresses the issue of which topics may be deemed too controversial for student participation.

The third of Hofstede's cultural dimensions which apply to the nation-state is "social principledness". Kubow and Fossum (2003) describe social principledness as the "… inclination on the part of a culture to acquiesce, without question, to authority, thereby accepting the society's conventional values and norms" (p. 268). Bond (1986) notes that within the education sector social principledness clarifies which norms are pertinent to which issues. It also accounts for how teachers and students are either encouraged or discouraged from questioning authority. Also, social principledness can be used to explain how classroom environment reinforces conformity.

The final cultural dimension identified by Hofstede is "Locus of Control". Friederichs (1991) defines locus of control as "… a set of generalized beliefs or expectations about how positive and negative reinforcements are obtained…" (p. 203). At one end, as Friedrich describes, the locus of control is internality, where an individuals efforts determines the amount of praise or punishment he or she receives. On the other end individuals are of the opinion that externalities, such as fate, luck, or environmental conditions determine success or failure. Reliance upon either internalities or externalities

can shape how teachers and students perceive their role as significant in the education process. It can also account for how schools punish and reward students.

Within the preceding framework, Hofstede provides a framework to identify national cultural identify, that may then be applied to public education to determine what norms and values are most likely to be replicated thru educational institutions. This framework presumes that shared social interests within educational institutions are the sole responsibility of the nation-state. The question may then be asked: What happens though when neoliberal market theory is used to reform public institutions? Whose cultural norms and values are being replicated when MNCs become responsible for the policy and instruction of their shareholders education? Hofstede (1991) reminds us that, "Using the word 'culture' for both nations and organizations suggests that the two kinds of culture are identical phenomena. This is incorrect: a nation is not an organization, and the two types of 'culture' are of different nature" (p. 181). Hofstede describes the difference in cultural spheres as being related to how an individual views his commitment to the society/organization and how much of that responsibility and how much of that responsibility is based on a need for self-preservation. It then becomes necessary to analyze the schools function of cultural reproduction not through national cultural framework but through the corporate/organizational framework of the company taking responsibility for newly privatized sector.

<center>Corporate/Organizational Dimensions</center>

Hofstede's framework of cultural indices has been widely used to explain national tendencies toward cultural imperatives; however, his review of organizational cultural framework has yet to be used to examine the influence of MNC culture on CSR

<center>18</center>

programs that target education. In his book *Cultures and Organization: Software of the Mind* (1991) Hofstede makes the analogy between unseen software that drives hardware in the same way that unseen culture drives corporations/organizations. The organizations' culture is then measured along indices he creates and corporations fall along a spectrum relative to other organizations.

In preparation to recognize the shift that moves Iganmode schools away from national cultural reproduction and toward corporate/organizational reproduction in Chapter 4, we must first discuss Hofstede's (1991) six dimensions of organizational culture (Hofstede, 1991). Also, Hofstede notes that while the national cultural dimensions focus primarily on learned "values," corporate/organizational cultural dimensions focus more on "practices." The reason for this, claims Hofstede, is that it is in the developmental stages of institutional engagement (school, family) that people are taught which values to adopt by an early age. Practices on the other hand are developed once a person enters the workplace and is socialized into the accepted procedural roles placed on them in the form of duties related to their employment and those people with which they work.

The first corporate/organizational dimension discussed by Hofstede is "Process vs. Results." Hofstede indicates that companies which value process oriented culture tend to avoid taking risks and put little effort in their jobs from day to day. The opposite can be found in companies which value results. They tend to be comfortable in unfamiliar situations and are less adverse to risk. There is a general negative and positive which accompanies each of these dimensions respectively. Most companies/organizations view a results oriented culture to be a positive while they tend to view a process oriented

culture as a negative. According to Costa (1977), the trend of educational administrators valuing a results oriented culture in the classroom seems to echo the positive sentiments of businesses towards results oriented culture in the workplace.

Hofstede's second cultural dimension applied to corporate/organizations is described as employee oriented vs. job oriented. Companies which have a high employee oriented culture tend to care about the needs and personal issues of their employees. They also are more likely to make business decisions in groups or committees. On the contrary, job oriented business cultures tend to care more about the job people are doing than about employee well being. Also, in a job oriented culture company decisions are made by individuals at the top of the organization rather than through committee recommendations.

Recognizing policy initiatives in the United States as far back as 1973, Nash and Agne (1973) were advocating "career education" as a way to "…develop a sense of competence- awareness that they (students) have cultivated skills which qualify them for meaningful salaried work…" (p. 67). According to Nash was to emphasize "job performance" (p. 68) and prepare students for economic achievement and market performance. The obvious parallels between this type of educational reform and Hofstede's second cultural dimension applied to organizations reveals interplay of cultural imperatives from the business pillar of society onto the educational pillar.

The third dimension of corporate/organizational culture identified by Hofstede is parochial vs. professional. In a parochial company, individuals identify personally with the company for whom they work. Their private lives are determined by their professional norms of behavior. Parochial companies provide their employees with a

culture of trust in the corporation to look after their future needs. In a professional

culture, employees view their private lives as being their own business. They believe that

they are employed on the basis of their ability and are comfortable looking out for their

own future.

The fourth element of corporate/organizational culture presented by Hofstede is

open systems vs. closed systems. Open systems view outsiders and newcomers as

welcome within an organizational structure. Closed systems, on the other, hand are very

secretive in their mode of operations and outsiders are not welcome. New employees in

open systems are quickly integrated into the social structures of the company, while in

closed systems acceptance can be long process of gaining the trust of colleagues.

Hofstede's fifth element of corporate/organizational culture is loose control vs.

tight control. Employees in a loose control organization are less likely to take corporate

norms and practices seriously and view them as being relatively unimportant to their job

performance. Administrators in loose control organizations typically have less

willingness to enforce corporate policy on their employees. In a tight control

environment, employees are very committed to the institutional norms of operation and

the administration strictly enforces corporate policy. This cultural dimension may be used

by neoliberal reformers in analyzing the efficiency of their policy and to determine their

effectiveness of their schools at achieving academic results. In the following analogy by

Weick (1976), the concepts of loose control and tight control are intermingled with

references to education as an organization.

> "Imagine that you are a referee, coach, player, or spectator at an unconventional soccer
> match: The field for the game is round, there are several goals scattered haphazardly
> around the circular field; people can enter and leave the game whenever they want to;
> they can throw balls in whenever they want; they can say "that's my goal," whenever they
> want to, as many times as they want to, and for as many goals as they want to; the entire

game takes place on a sloped field; and the game is played as if it makes sense.

If you now substitute in that example principals for referee's, teachers for coaches, students for players, parents for spectators, and schooling for soccer, you have an equally unconventional description of educational organizations…" (p. 1)

This characterization portrays all educational institutions as extreme examples of loose control. The more subtle aspect of the article is the willingness on the behalf of the author to substitute corporate cultural principals as a means to diagnose and fix institutional problems administrators face. While Weick recognizes that tight control may not be a prescriptive absolute in addressing educational issues, he is willing to cross the precipice of infusing corporate cultural imperatives into educational institutions.

The final corporate/organizational cultural dimension identified by Hofstede is normative vs. pragmatic. Normative and pragmatic describe the way in which corporations deal with their customers. Normative companies follow a set of operational guidelines when dealing with customers and value sticking to procedural norms in meeting client's needs. Pragmatic companies on the other hand are flexible and willing to overlook operational standards to ensure customer satisfaction above all else. Business ethics then are more closely adhered to in a normative company than in a pragmatic one. Particularly within nations where business ethics are considered less than exemplarily, the impulse by state agencies to address corporate cultural deficiencies through educational policy reform can be motivated by the desire of the nation to remain prosperous in a global market economy.

Frederick (2006) notes "Among the normative corporate guidelines, those tinged with the notion of market integrity include restrictions on political payments and bribes that might inject non-market considerations into business transactions, a recognition of private collective bargaining (rather than government mandates) as a preferred technique

for establishing pay scales, working conditions, and benefits for employees, and some

(but not all) of the consumer protections sought in the [intergovernmental compacts]

accords" (114). The six intergovernmental compacts Frederick refers to include: The

United Nations Universal Declaration of Human Rights (1948), the European Convention

on Human Rights (1950), the Helsinki Final Act (1975), the OECD Guidelines for

Multinational Enterprises (1976), the International Labor Office Tripartite Declaration of

Principles Concerning Multinational Enterprises and Social Policy (1977), and the United

Nations Code of Conduct on Transnational Corporations (not yet completed nor

promulgated but originating in 1972).

CHAPTER FOUR

IGANMODE GRAMMAR SCHOOL, NIGERIA

"It is self-evident that schools cannot reflect a nationalism which does not exist. Schools do not usually create beliefs, attitudes, or values; they communicate them from sources outside their school"
-Alan Peshkin "Education and National Integration in Nigeria" (p. 331)

In this section I will examine how corporate cultural substitution has altered the educational priorities at Iganmode Grammar School in Ota, Kenya. This section provides a glimpse of how national cultural priorities come in conflict with western corporate agenda's. At first glance the injection of corporate funding by the Coca-Cola Company into a small grammar school in southern Nigeria may seem an innocuous CSR program designed to increase educational attainment for students of a state struggling to provide the technological resources essential to a competitive global environment. As is typical with many former African colonial territories, Nigeria has so far failed in its efforts to diversify its economy and develop the infrastructure needed to provide a high standard of living for its citizens. A standard of living whose imagined ideal is of western origin. While rich in oil, 60% of Nigerians live below the poverty line and the average gross domestic product per person is only around 1,500 USD per year (CIA World Factbook, 2006).

Despite some early efforts by the central government to increase national unity through universal educational access, rampant corruption has left school and university facilities in disarray. A 2006 World Bank Project Proposal for the Nigerian education sector notes that "The main contributing factors to low learning outcomes are the poor

conditions of the learning environment to support teaching and learning [e.g. poor conditions of physical facilities, including water and sanitation facilities, inadequate distribution of essential textbooks, and instructional aides, and inadequate teacher training]" (p.5). The report also notes that only about 30% of primary schools have running water and electricity. Such conditions have resulted in a number of MNCs targeting the education sector for improvement.

The rush to exchange an educational policy which replicates national culture with one that reflects corporate culture has its roots in divided colonial governance that dates back to the early 1900's. In his analysis of the effect of education on Nigeria's early efforts at national integration, Peshkin (1967) explains that early colonial division along geographic boundaries served to alienate tribes from one another in an effort to keep hostile factions from threatening British trade interests. The northern sector, which consists primarily of Muslim inhabitants, was not introduced to European forms of education as were the western and eastern regions by Christian missionaries.

 The northern region remained culturally segregated from the tribes in the south and responsibility for educational curriculum was a local concern even following independence. In 1961, as the new state emerged, the objective of educational policy in the northern region was to provide for qualified graduates who could fill the responsibilities once held by their colonial occupiers. Social cohesion was not seen as the responsibility of education in the north, where curriculum was virtually the same prior to independence as it was following the birth of the State (Peshkin, 1967).

Similar lack of unity was present in the western region, where economic priorities took precedent and national unity was missing entirely from the curriculum objectives

determined by regional authorities. Weiler (1964) relates that following independence

technical know-how became the only concern of policy makers in the western region.

Education was seen only as a tool to provide the country with graduates who were

capable to "man the ship of state" (p. 119). Weiler also notes that regional officials

allowed instruction in French, English, or the local tribal dialect. Their lack of a broadly

agreed upon single language for use in academics and business contributed to Nigeria's

early lack of social cohesion.

By contrast, officials in Eastern Nigeria supported a curriculum that was very

determined to promote national cultural integration. Peshkin (1967) notes that while there

is no evidence that schools actually adhered to the recommendations of the regions

ministry of education, the policy to promote Nigerian art, music, history and civics was

part of the ministries official curriculum. However, within the curriculum guidelines,

there were no clear indications as to what these national cultural norms were. Within the

eastern region it is speculated that cultural studies most probably reflected local regional

customs and tribal cultural norms rather than supporting the intent of the policy makers

and their efforts to support national unity through schooling.

Regional disparity led to the creation of Nigeria's national curriculum objectives

codified into the Universal Basic Education (UBE) law in 1969. The UBE has been

revised many times, most recently in 1998. Over the years, policymakers have continued

to increase emphasis on national cultural integration by focusing on civics at primary

level and democracy and human rights in the secondary. However, due to disparity in

enrollment rates among rich and poor, it is difficult to imagine such efforts having any

broad impact on national cultural cohesion. The net enrollment rate for public schooling

in Nigeria is 60.1% of all primary aged children, according to a Nigerian Demographic

and Health Survey (DHS) conducted in 2003. The percentage of children attending

school from the top 20% richest households (82.9% Net enrollment) far exceeds that of

the poorest 20% (40.4%) (Nigerian Education Research Development Council, 2003).

Educational segregation is no longer an issue of tribal customs but of economic

prosperity.

The pressure on Nigeria to increase primary school attendance from lending

institutions like the World Bank and the IMF has led the current administration to

question whether the country is solely responsible, or even capable of meeting the

financial burden of its educational infrastructure. The federal government has made it a

matter of policy to work with MNCs operating in Nigeria to develop CSR programs

which target facility development and increase technological capacity in schools. The

initiative called "Adopt-a-Public School" is described by Obiageli Ezekwesili, the

Nigerian minister of Education, as a way to "…restore [schools] to their old glory and

thus catalyze Nigeria into a model emerging economy by 31st December 2020"(Abiri,

2007). The minister cited a lack of community spirit and involvement for the erosion of

the Nigerian education system.

Nigeria seems poised to embark on a wholesale replacement of national cultural

values for those of Multinational Corporate organizations, claiming that it lacks the

governmental ability to provide "sound and standard education" (Abiri, 2007). It is

interesting that minister Ezekwesili would choose to recall a bygone era to evoke a hope

for renewal. By all indication she longs to return to a time that never existed according to

Peshkin's analysis. By relinquishing absolute control of and responsibility for providing

27

universal curriculum and school facility standards, Nigeria is wagering that MNC investments can do a better job at providing for school infrastructure than the state.

One MNC which answered the call by the Nigerian federal government for increased corporate investment is the Coca-Cola Company. The company has a long history of marketing its soft drinks in Nigeria. Coca-Cola has operated in Nigeria since 1951, and in 2006 sold over 142 million bottles in a country where half of Nigerian citizens suffer from a lack of clean drinking water (UNEP, 1999). However, despite the enormous consumption of its product, Coca-Cola lost market share in 2003 (down 1%) in Nigeria and has begun to restructure how it markets its brand (Coca-Cola IFRS, 2003).

Fast on the heels of its new marketing campaign came news in October 2006 that the company had begun to renovate the Iganmode Grammar School in Ota. The company remodeled existing school rooms, brought in furniture, and most importantly set up a computer room, providing 14 laptop computers for teachers and students. At the ceremony to commemorate the donation to the school, chairman of the Coca-Cola Corporation in Nigeria, Gboyega Salami, announced that "In the day and age of resource control, organizations should not wait to hear from communities in which they operate before they act proactively" (Ibiam, 2006).

According to the government website, the school lacks such basic amenities as running water and access via roads (www.ogunstate.gov.ng/education.htm). The choice to donate laptops supports the notion that the chairman of Coca-Cola did not assess or consider community need before taking action. While it is impossible to directly tie individual acts of CSR with fluctuations in particular market trends, corporations like Coca-Cola appears to base their charitable donations primarily on what is perceived to

improve the company based on organizational cultural imperatives rather than local needs or priorities. Indeed, for Coca-Cola, and other multinationals, CSR is more than just goodwill; it is a foothold to gain influence and a measure of control over national development.

According to Coca-Cola Foundations African Citizenship Report (2005) "Cultural education is central to the foundations' mission" (p.29). However, it is unclear in the case of Iganmode Grammar School whose culture they are attempting to cultivate. The foundation describes its efforts in education to include providing computers, books, and facilities, to reach the goal of improving literacy rates and ultimately providing the "cornerstone for personal success" (p. 29). Gannon (2002), in his description of Sub-Saharan African culture, notes that "African Cultures, while varying from country to country are collectivistic" (p. 427). This means that the expectation of educational autonomy is a very low priority in general among most Africans and corporate efforts to introduce such initiatives are diametrically opposed to the natural cultural current.

However, since Coca-Cola's African Citizenship report (2005) is most concerned with "personal success" (p. 29) and making students aware of "the role of business within their lives and communities" (p. 29), their objective in introducing a competing set of cultural norms becomes clear. This reflects a primacy in the mind of Coca-Cola's corporation for western cultural priorities. Specifically, an Anglo European influenced predisposition of what constitutes a valued economic model. Cultural cultivation from the neoliberal perspective involves removing those elements which inhibit free market growth. This may seem to explain why the MNC would be more concerned with providing computers that would likely link the individual students with the outside world

29

before meeting the collective needs of the school by installing running water or improving access via paved roads. By focusing on the autonomous individualistic needs of the students to achieve economically, Coca-Cola has prioritized its mode of cultural production within Iganmode.

Conclusions

The potential for results from Coca-Cola's CSR initiative to have the inverse outcome of that desired by the community of Ota is enormous. By providing students the capacity to maintain economic viability within a developed western community they are increasing the likelihood more students will in fact move to countries which can facilitate their training. To give an example, should a student at Iganmode Grammar School learn web-design, it is unlikely that there is the infrastructure available for that student to remain within that community. This scenario has been played out over and over as people from developing nations flee the poverty of their home once they gain the educational tools needed to survive elsewhere. CSR which seeks to hasten the availability of modernity to students may only be ensuring even greater economic hardship for those who remain.

In addressing the nation's key issue of improving school enrollment, it is difficult to ascertain the effectiveness of CSR projects like Iganmode. Individually, the probability that any one CSR program will make a noticeable impact on state-wide statistics is unlikely and research investigating the long term impact of multiple CSR programs in a country like Nigeria on specific educational goals is unavailable. It is worth noting here that CSR is as ununiformed as the companies who produce them and the results of their efforts are as equally diverse. Further, the multitude of diversity of corporate involvement

can change depending upon the recipients attitudes towards questions of race, gender, and ethnic diversity. These cultural variables upend any attempt to quantify the effectiveness of programs within a given state. Absent of hard statistical evidence, a few conclusions may still be reached as to the impact of the CSR program at Iganmode Grammar School on the local level.

Nigeria is a country which struggles with national identity. Divided among its ethnic and tribal cultural traditions, the country has in many ways failed to reach a universal social contract that unites its many varied cultural traditions. Frederick (2006) believes that CSR is a natural evolutionary adaptation in a long line human communal development. He identifies a number of key stages integral to achieving a broadly encompassing social contract on which the culture of a nation-state is built. Nigeria, with its ethnic and regional divisions, appears to have never reached such a consensus and remains primarily a collection of what Frederick describes as communities which survive on "reciprocal altruism" (p. 170).

According to Frederick (2006), reciprocal altruism occurs among tribes and clans for the express purpose of maintaining good relations between neighbors. Nigeria's tribal divisions have for the greater part of the twentieth century been based upon what Abbott (2006) describes as "hometown associations". These associations may either be relegated to a specific town or in many cases, specific ethnicity. In either case, the objective of the association is to improve the political conditions of its membership by working or competing with other local associations for resources and political advantages.

Associational membership is widely recognized in Nigeria as a key political vehicle through wich citizens have a more direct route in shaping their communal and

ethnic well-being. Hometown associations are in fact more important in many ways than national political parties and have been instrumental in securing funding for the development of schools. Abbot (2006) states clearly that reciprocal altruism in the form of hometown associations is the prevailing communal order much more so than what he believes to be a national social contract provided by the state. Using associational membership it is possible to envision a different scenario, one in which Coca-Cola actively engage the hometown association at Ota and crafts a CSR which meets the basic communal needs of the students by building a paved road to the school or installing plumbing.

MNCs are predisposed to work with central government authorities and fashion CSR projects which, for better or worse, reflect the administrative goals of their host country. Unfortunately, in the case of Nigeria, there is clearly a failing on the part of the federal government to engage CSR's on how best to engage its citizenry. When adding Coca-Cola Corporation's admitted unwillingness to engage local concerns in discovering what types of support might benefit Iganmode Grammar School, the result is a program whose benefits are at best questionable. An effort to sustain economic growth and prosperity at the national level has led the Coca-Cola Corporation to substitute global corporate values (at the behest of a state eager to outsource the responsibility) for those of the community it intended to serve. Also, there is the failure on the part of the federal government of Nigeria to provide for a more unified social contract which would allow schools to fulfill what Heyneman (2000) believes to be their primary obligation of national cultural reproduction. In the case of States like Nigeria where the central government is eager to hand as much responsibility of its educational commitments over

to MNCs with very little regard to how the CSR is implemented, determining the appropriateness of the project in question remains a very local matter. In addition ignoring local needs may provide none of the improvement intended by the CSR program.

CHAPTER FIVE

POLITICAL INFLUENCE IN EDUCATION

"CSR and partnerships are often 'drops in the bucket,' nibbling at the edges of major public problems.
They are not the road out. The road out is functioning government, a good court system, economic
opportunity for growth"
-Adam Greene, U.S. Center for International Business

In this section I will describe how Multinational Corporations work to alter the

political environment and what role access, support, content and procedure, latitude of

social and political action, play in determining the shape of Corporate Social

Responsibility initiatives. When CSR relies upon self-initiated corporate action to

determine how best to meet the educational needs of a community, the MNC is primarily

engaging in a bureaucratic top down strategy, that is, prioritizing the assistance of the

CSR program based on the MNCs estimation of the most pressing immediate local needs

to shape the program. These priorities reflect an Anglo European tradition of

development focusing on providing individual opportunity for economic improvement

which in turn will strengthen the community at large. This type of CSR, defined by

Frederick (2006) as "direct social action"(p. 32), has limited state direction and is most

often initiated within peripheral countries in the absence of well established federal

programs. In the following section, we will examine the interaction of CSR within states

where national education policy is well defined and corporate intervention is limited to

fulfilling the objectives set out by federal policy mandates. In a case where education

operates under a strong social contract, we may expect not to see wholesale corporate

cultural substitution. However, CSR can have a transformative effect on the politics which may then shape education reform in these situations.

Human development is the focal concern of every political philosophy (Thomas, 1983). The resolve of every state is, in some degree, to impart its own broad political predilection into how schools are run, what curriculum they choose, and how teachers teach. Human development is then shaped through a nation-state's legislation, reflecting its particular political policy. Termed "educational practices", these policies may be either fastidious and echo an authoritarian inclination on the part of the central government, or they may be ambiguous and reflect political tolerance in how human development occurs. In both cases the nation-state relies upon a system of political "support", "content and procedures", and "latitude of social and political action" to define its educational practices (Thomas, p. 8, 1983).

For the discussion of Microsoft and China, I have chosen the political lens of Thomas's framework to focus on this particular aspect of CSR's interaction with the state due to its explanatory power. This framework allows for a close inspection of how minority political concerns can effect the level of CSR involvement in providing access and funding. Also, it reveals the motivation for MNC's to invest in educational programs, which is a thin façade for political pandering, as a means of ensuring a grasp on market share.

Support

Political support for educational attainment occurs through both public and private bodies. Thomas (1983) identifies public bodies as consisting of "parliaments, legislatures, planning commissions, and school boards" (p. 8), all of which are

democratically elected bodies which determine policy. The list of private bodies Thomas

includes is "…religious groups, political parties, ethnic societies, and coalitions of

parents" (ibid). Thomas observes that these groups determine, in large portion, who

receives an education within a nation-state, and more importantly how public funding is

distributed to fulfill financial needs. Noticeably absent from Thomas's list of private

bodies is the multi-national corporation. Little doubt exists however, that today MNCs

play a supportive role through CSR programs.

Through neoliberal reforms, the states have politically alienated ethnic minorities.

Neoliberal school choice policy has a strong Eurocentric connection, particularly

emanating from the United States and Great Britain. The prevailing neoconservative

political agenda of these two countries seeks to export economic policies deemed critical

in maintaining the hegemonic status quo of those two countries. Torres (1995) argues that

"The notion of neoliberalism and the neoliberal state appear to be exported from the

center to the periphery and semi-periphery" (p. 292) Furthermore, Torres identifies the

Business Roundtable (a organization composed of over 160 US multinational

corporations), as a central player in the propagation of neoliberal economic theory abroad

(p. 294).

Ethnically diverse populations present a problem to the rapid dissemination of

neoliberal educational tenants. Torres (1995) states "If choice is the shining armor of the

neoliberal state, multiculturalism is its nemesis" (p. 285). Racial minorities who have

long lacked political support in access and funding pose a direct threat to choice policy

by demanding preferential access to educational recourses and by challenging the notion

of Eurocentric primacy. In response to this two-fold threat, governments and business

leaders have turned to CSR as a way to pacify minorities by providing the illusion of assistance with selectively targeted programs. These programs create the illusion of preferential treatment, while at the same time working behind the scenes to limit minority access to educational opportunities.

Social status resulting from specific ethnic backgrounds can play a major role in determining who receives political support. The Organization for Economic and Co-operative Development (OECD, 1994) noted that, globally, ethnic minorities represent the most common groups of people who are most likely to receive the least political educational support in the form of access and funding. States that modify their commitment to educational support based upon neoliberal economic policy have the most direct negative impact on minority groups (Tomlinson, 1997).

The UK offers particularly valid insight into the effects of school choice on ethnic minorities because of the longevity of its implementation in England. Tomlinson (1997) examined the impact of policy in place for the better part of a decade, beginning in 1988 with legislation which would become known as the Education Reform Act (ERA). The following review of Tomlinson's report reveals the racial effects of the ERA.

The racially segregating effects of the ERA's market oriented reforms create a condition where political support is diminished both in terms of access and funding. Access has been altered through policy initiatives commonly known throughout the world as school choice. Tomlinson explains that school choice was meant as a means to increase control among "consumers" (parents and students) and lessen the power of "producers" (state) (p. 64). In school choice initiatives, information regarding the academic success or failure of each school is made public. Generally, parents are then

allowed to enroll their student in whichever school they deem to be a good fit for their child. The expected result of these initiatives is that lower performing schools will be forced to improve by increasing test scores and attracting new clients or close due to lack of funding resulting from decreased enrollment (Lubienski, 2007).

Tomlinson (1997), in citing evidence from the U.K.'s experience with school choice, concludes that such reforms create racially segregated schools by offering white (majority) parents the opportunity to send their children to schools with a lower number of minority students. She also notes that school choice reform is truly a global phenomenon affecting not only the ethnic partitioning in states with traditionally liberal market economies but also impacting countries where ethnic homogony has historically been a key focus of educations social goals. In China, particularly in higher education, quasi-market based reforms have been a long standing part of Shichanghua (Marketization), which according to Yin and White (1993) "…denotes a process whereby education becomes a commodity provided by competitive suppliers, educational services are priced and access to them depends upon a customer's calculations and ability to pay" (p. 23).

Furthermore, for ethnic minorities who face the challenges of a state imposed quasi-market reality, the entry of government-business partnerships designed to provide equal opportunity is problematic. In noting the capacity for positive minority assistance through a corporate program Ward (2004) insists "…the voluntary CSR practices of private enterprise cannot be an effective substitute for good governance" (p. 7). MNCs who maintain a very public policy of supporting the political interests of minorities through CSR initiatives may privately be undermining those same groups. In 1994, the

Journal for Blacks in Higher Education (1994) noted that over 400 of the largest U.S.

corporations contribute to the Washington Legal Foundation, an organization committed

to challenging the legality of minority based scholarships and affirmative action.

Prominent companies such as Exxon Mobile, 3M, and RJR Nabisco are among those

MNCs supporting the WLF who are also involved in CSR educational programs with the

goal of providing support for minorities both domestically (US) and internationally.

The resulting situation occurs in which a state through quasi-market policy, risks

alienating its minority population and partially transfers responsibility for those groups

onto MNCs for whom political support may or may not be a true vested interest. In such

an environment, it becomes necessary to assess the possibilities by which support may

alter the political environment. Thomas (1983) notes that states seek to advocate for

behavioral education which teaches subordination to power patterns set by the social elite

even among minorities (p. 19). MNCs, on the other hand, have no such obligation to

maintain the Eurocentric political status quo.

<center>Content and Procedures</center>

Although public interest groups are ultimately accountable for the adoption of

support related neoliberal policy reform, once that threshold of public accountability has

been breached multinational corporations have tremendous latitude in how educational

content and procedures are shaped. MNCs which work closely with the political

objectives of public bodies are responsible for crafting very detailed programs aimed at

improving the educational objectives through CSR. Traditional public and private

political groups make an effort to control educational content within schools that reflects

everything from shaping students economic and philosophic values, to how teachers are

<center>39</center>

hired (Thomas, 1983). According to Frederick (2006), CSR projects that are based on "Government and Business Partnerships" (p. 33) are designed to fulfill these objectives by infusing corporate resources in order to enhance curriculum guidelines.

The principle of "commodification" or the transformation of what is normally a non-commodity into a commodity, helps articulate how elements of content and procedure in education are sold to the highest bidder. By extension, commodification also plays a role in determining who has more influence on shaping curriculum content in CSR programs. It is important to keep in mind that ideally, according to the Committee for Economic Development (CED), the state should be solely responsible for developing the best content and procedural policy to meet the needs of its constituents (Frederick, p.33, 2006). The MNC is to act only in accordance with the guidelines established by public political groups.

According to Eyre (2002), the outsourcing of content and procedures to MNCs has occurred through a process of "commodification" and is defined as a process through which "social domains and institutions …. [come]… to be organized and conceptualized in terms of commodity production, distribution and consumption" (p. 67). The term commodification is meant to relay a sense of tangible unrefined goods. If public education viewed from a neoliberal perspective is merely an unrealized market, Thomas's 'content and procedures' might find its economics parallels with pork bellies and oil. And just as MNCs are motivated to secure the cheap natural resources needed to increase profit, they likewise work to ensure an equally firm hold on how they procure human resources. While Eyre is responding to a perceived threat of students becoming unwitting consumers, a threat which is a distinct possibility, there exists an equally large threat that

the commodification of content and procedures will result in students becoming product in the form of potential human resources.

Educational content within government-business CSR is built on a partnership involving traditional public and private bodies along with the MNC. As early as 1971, the Center for Economic Development insisted that such partnerships be the result of state determined goals and priorities, and businesses should only function as a means to fulfill governmental initiatives (Frederick, 1981). Harrison and Kachur (1999), however, indicate that MNCs have had a growing degree of influence on how content and procedures are shaped in CSR programs. The resulting environment has become one where "…the State becomes the facilitator of policies, and 'stakeholder' consultations displace the legislative process" (p. 74).

The fear of loosing control of internal educational content runs parallel in many other government-business partnerships. Government-business partnerships are susceptible to redirection of policy impetus because often the MNC provides the bulk of the funding and resources for the programs. In such circumstances the reform of content and procedure may impact the very underlying political-economic structure of a society. While Thomas (1983) notes that "…no governmental system intentionally encourages its own overthrow or replacement by a competing system" (p. 11), CSR may be the Trojan-Horse of global neoliberal economic reform. Margolis and Walsh (2003) explain that "…asking companies to advance educational reform….does give firms and their executives' significant influence over public policy" (p. 290).

Latitude of Social and Political Action

The ability to shape content and procedure acts then as a catalyst for political change. While governments may not perceive CSR as undermining state sovereignty, the global corporate neoliberal revolution has supplanted social welfare reform as the dominate force in spurring political action. In identifying the set of actors most likely to spur on social discontent, Thomas (1983) argues that university professors are most prone to be targets of "counter actions" (p. 18) by official political bodies. Although still a major force for social upheaval, MNCs are beginning to play an equally pivotal role through education based reform as university professors. While university instructors' detachment from official political bodies allows for a somewhat easy counter by governments, CSR which organizes educational support and content with the consent of central authorities are less likely to encounter such a political backlash. Furthermore, while university professors are not a homogenous group when it comes to advancing specific political economic reforms, MNCs without exception wish to transform political policy to reflect an environment that will give them the best opportunity to maximize profits.

The literature supporting the notion that CSR has a definitive political goal is scarce. Likewise studies dealing specifically with the political ramifications of educational CSR are nonexistent. However, one study that deals specifically with the political influence of CSR was conducted by Sims (2003). In it she notes that through political philanthropy corporations gain access to, or build political goodwill with politicians. Analysis of data from the study survey, completed by 44% of all fortune 500 companies, revealed that nearly three fourths of those companies polled had been

solicited for CSR contributions by politicians at least five times in the space of one year. Of those corporations surveyed, half of those companies which responded reported to have made a philanthropic donation on behalf of a politician's request. Acts of CSR which were not directly tied to political pandering were found to be associated with political figures over 82% of the time. The corporations surveyed admitted that CSR has been an important tool for gaining access and favors from politicians. Sims concludes that there is an undeniable link between CSR and political influence.

These findings have an enormous effect when considering CSR programs engaged in educational reform. Not only can it be expected that political latitude for CSR reflecting neoliberal influences are and will be permitted but that MNCs may be able to use CSR as a platform to ultimately persuade political bodies to produce polices which will directly benefit their profit margin.

CHAPTER SIX

MICROSOFT: BEIJING PUBLIC LIBRARY

"Only 5 percent of US college undergraduates today are pursuing degrees in Science and Engineering, compared with 42 percent of university students in China".

-Committee on Science Engineering and Public Policy (National Academic Press, 2006)

This section applies Thomas's framework of political influence in examining Microsoft's CSR initiative at the Beijing Public Library. I will relate the history of Chinese educational development from the past fifty years and argue Microsoft is taking advantage of the particular political environment to secure a wealth of talented human resources. The statistic from the quote above appears in Microsoft's 2006 Corporate Responsibility Report. The quote is meant to relay a sense of urgency for the United States, which the report author state is finding itself more and more at a competitive disadvantage in the number of highly trained science and engineering personnel. It is also meant to justify the expanding role that Microsoft continues to play in bringing technology into domestic educational settings through CSR programs. However, while the need for more engineers and scientists in the United States may be factual, the notion is disingenuous considering Microsoft's developing relationship with China. Strategically, Microsoft has already chosen the path ahead regarding from where the bulk of its future human resources will come. A huge reservoir of highly trained labor willing to work for a fraction of what their American counterparts demand has lead Microsoft to take the political steps necessary to ensure that it has access to this supply.

While Microsoft is primarily interested in increasing its economic prosperity through the use of an expanding Chinese workforce, the Beijing government's main concern is maintaining political control of those citizens. At face value, this appears to be a win-win game where both parties can achieve their respective goals. However, when analyzed from both a state and global perspective, it is clearly a zero-sum game where the only possible winner is the MNC (Microsoft) and both the producing state (China) and consuming state (USA) suffer loss. China, for its part, has determined that a policy of market liberalization is key to ensure that one party rule prevails, therefore making it their goal political. This mix of western economic ideological norms into a Eurasian tradition of socialism spanning back for more than a half century has created a dynamic, some would argue schizophrenic, political economy in China today. In order to maintain its bid for access to the vast human resource China possesses, Microsoft has found ways to affect the political climate through the use of CSR, thereby maximizing access to cheap abundant labor. While the CSR program at the Beijing Public Library may be very small in scale, it is a shrewd political move by Microsoft to build goodwill with the communist party leadership. Microsoft has used communist China's long uneasy relationship with its migrant minorities to gain a foothold of trust with political party officials.

A Brief History of Minority Policy in Chinese Education

Chinese minority access to education is a primary example of political access to education within a state (Thomas, 1983). Thomas reviews the three major educational movements under communist rule as they pertain to ethnic minority status. The purpose of the earliest minority education policy following the 1949 revolution was to maintain a

degree of autonomy for the outlying border regions, allowing for traditional ethnic educational methods, especially with regard to rural peasants, who remain the vast majority of China's population. Following a split in Russian-Sino relations in the late 1950's, Chinese central government authorities sought to control ethnic content and procedures by requiring more uniform cohesion to the communist party's educational directives.

The Cultural Revolution of 1966 marked a turning point in how ethnic minority educational policy was formulated. No longer was the central government content with promoting inter-ethnic consolidation by allowing autonomous educational content. Rather, minority groups were required to engage in a very thorough curriculum on the nature of class-struggle. After completing their education, students were expected to return to their farms and villages and teach the older generation to take control of their means of production and break from the traditional system of serfdom which still pervaded the outer provinces.

Little opportunity existed for minority students to continue their education in major urban centers. In fact, the central government officially decreed that since minorities were naturally less capable intellectually they should return to their rural commune and continue teaching the older generations the liberating truths of communism, along with implementing any vocational or agricultural skills they had been taught. In this regard, the official state decree of "from the commune, back to the commune" was the rule (Thomas, 1983, p. 134).

The end of the Cultural Revolution occurred in the fall of 1976 marking an abrupt change in policy regarding minority access to education. What came to be known as the

"Four Modernizations Movement" was an attempt by the party in Beijing to move the country forward and match the industrial, agricultural, scientific, and military productivity of the worlds other great powers. The communist party chiefs no longer viewed the Han intellectual superiority as sacrosanct and were willing to provide minorities with access to institutes of higher learning. Since 1976, an official policy of affirmative action was created to help minorities by "assisting the backward areas because of their special situation" (Thomas, 1983, p. 142). College graduates and students engaging in scientific research were, for the first time, provided the opportunity to work in state funded laboratories and institutions.

According to Shaohua (2000), despite efforts to bring ethnic equality during the years of the Four Modernizations movement, the vast majority of minorities in China remain bound to the land. A long standing policy restricting the migration of Chinese away from their provincial homes ensured that only the most elite minority students found their way into the majority dominated urban centers. While access to education became a universality for minorities and provincial authorities were given greater flexibility in determining content and procedure, the policy of "Hukou" (p. 9) , which limited inter provincial travel of Chinese citizens, managed to keep ethnic populations relatively segregated.

To be sure, the policy of Hukou is not meant to be strictly aimed at minorities. There were tens of millions of Hans during the first 40 years of communist rule who were relegated to their rural communities, unable to migrate to urban centers because of the bureaucratic red tape. However, the prevailing official communist party dictum not only views the majority Han population as intellectually superior, but that minority

populations should remain set apart (Thomas, 1983). In turn, access and content were to be directed by Han because "Elder brother must care for and love their little ones, who must in turn respect and be concerned for their elder brother" (p. 142).

Since 1992, following Deng Xiaoping's call for unbridled economic growth and the subsequent demise of the Hukou system, almost 100 million migrant laborers poured into the cities in search of work (Shaohua, 2005). According to Roberts (1997), this trend has continued. On average, urban Chinese make Rmb 400 (US$46) a month, compared to half that of those living in the countryside. The problem of migrant labor is not a new one for China. The country accounts for 22% of the world's population and only 7% of its arable land. In recent years a marked drop in recent years of agriculturally viable land accured due to overuse of fertilization chemicals which have degraded much of the available soil. The potential for social unrest with the influx of so many poor migrants poses a real threat to the communist regime in Beijing (Li, 1996).

A review of Chinese 2000 census data reveals that a majority of migrants now flooding the urban centers originate from provinces like Xinjiang and Yunnan in the west, which have also have larger minority populations. According to Roberts (1997), only 7% of migrants in 1993 were educated above a 7th grade level. It has been the policy of the Chinese government to hand responsibility for the educational needs of minority immigrants over to municipalities and the corporations who employ them. Despite attempts to integrate them into their urban surroundings, migrants are widely viewed as being responsible for an increase in crime. "Migrants were held responsible for 60% of the crimes in Jiangsu province, and in Beijing one-half of the arrests in 1993 were of nonresidents" (p. 274).

The previous description presents the political backdrop into which Microsoft inserted its educational CSR program known as "Upward Potential". Traditionally, educational access and content for minorities has never been a concern of those living in the eastern urban centers. As rural Hans and ethnic minorities alike flow into the eastern cities, questions of how best to assimilate this mass of humanity into a productive society remains a weighty matter for the central communist authorities in Beijing.

Microsoft's History in China

"It is clear that late twentieth-century nostalgia is intimately bound up with consumerism"
-Roland Robertson (p. 159)

In 1998 Microsoft took the plunge in China by opening a research and development center which initially hired approximately 100 employees. At the time China accounted for 30% of the annual growth rate for personal computers and it remains one of the fastest growing information markets in the world. Microsoft's investment of over $800 million in developing the Chinese market was possible, according to Jack Breese, assistant director for Microsoft Research, because of "the strength of China's economy and the quality of its academic system" (Troy, 1994). Since Microsoft's initial foray into the country, the relationship between China and Microsoft has been rocky. Plagued by human rights and copyright issues the company has publicly contemplated removing itself from the country as recently as November of 2006.

Despite criticism from human rights organizations concerning operations within China, Microsoft's willingness to stay is based on a belief that the Corporation is having an impact on the culture of China, and that the true potential of the market has not yet been realized. The two relevant elements driving Microsoft's CSR in China are sales and labor. It can be argued that in the case of Nigeria, Coca-Cola's sole motivation for

implementing the CSR project at Iganmode was to help increase lagging profits by giving the corporation a better image, which in turn allowed for a set of cultural priorities to be injected which fit the neoliberal model of education reform. In the case of Microsoft in China, both of the aforementioned catalysts of sales and labor serve to create an environment where CSR can secure gains for the company.

According to Micklethwaith and Wooldrige (2001) MNCs value productive labor that is both well educated and plentiful. One of Microsoft's first Chinese employees was Dr. Harry Shum a graduate of Carnegie Mellon University with expertise in Robotics. He left China at the age of 17 after completing a master's degree in electronics in Hong Kong. He is now head of the Microsoft Beijing Research and Development Center. The center is credited for groundbreaking research in the areas of advanced multimedia technologies, digital entertainment, wireless networking and the next level of data mining. Dr. Shum explains that the reason most major industries set up research institutes in China is not so much because of a higher density of genius IQ's, but that the higher population density makes finding a greater number of great minds in one country more plausible. For Microsoft, the allure of plentiful, productive labor at a bargain price acts as a counterweight in a business model suffering from disappointing sales. The allure is so great that Microsoft has chosen a CSR project that will in fact help maintain the status quo by allaying public fears of a growing migrant crisis. A description of the project is presented below.

The Beijing Xicheng District Library Project

In 2004, Microsoft launched a three year program designed to help migrant farm labors adjust to moving into an urban environment by providing free basic computer skills, designed to give "a leg up" in finding employment in a competitive labor market. The program was launched in cooperation with the Beijing Xicheng District Communist Youth League; the Beijing Xicheng District Library; PlaNET Finance, an international non-government agency; and the White Pigeon Young Volunteers Association of the Beijing Normal University. The communist youth league was responsible for providing migrant participants, the Beijing Xicheng District Library provided a venue, and Microsoft provided 200,000 (US) dollars in start-up funds plus the computers and the curriculum.

The White Pigeon Young Volunteers Association of Beijing Normal University initially had full responsibility for the training; however, many of Microsoft's own employees volunteered as instructors in the program. The process of admittance into the training program is competitive and based on the potential of the applicant to succeed in the program as the program progressed. In its first year of operation, the program formally trained 280 rural migrants, while some 9,000 members of the general public received informal training. Microsoft is working with its partners to make the program economically sustainable by charging a small fee for the informal training to keep the migrant training commercially viable (Beijing Xicheng District Library, 2004).

The case study of Microsoft's CSR project at Beijing serves almost no practical purpose when weighing the impact 280 graduates against the 80 million migrant workers. However, considering China's urban distrust of rural migrants the impetus that fuels

Microsoft's charity may be viewed cynically as nothing more than an attempt to garner political favoritism. According to Buderi (2006) this type of CSR is part of Microsoft's wider policy of "guanxi" (p. 218) (building relationships) whose goal is to work with China to improve education.

This relationship is key to understanding the CSR of Microsoft in China. In 2002, Ya-Qin Zhang, director of Microsoft's Beijing lab announced what insiders dubbed "The Great Wall Plan." an effort to greatly increase the amount of money invested in Chinese programming education to the amount of 25 million U.S. dollars over three years. The money goes to support training materials and personnel that focus on training the students with the most potential the Microsoft training system. The program has subsequently been extended over another three year period. The access to Chinese software programmers, trained to develop systems which are Microsoft compatible and the agreement has lead to the establishment of many postdoctoral fellowships giving Microsoft access to the best and brightest China has to offer. Since the advent of Microsoft's "Great Wall Plan" Microsoft Research Asia has swelled to over 140 researchers and is producing in excess of 200 technical papers a year. The Chinese Ministry of Education has shrugged off fears that Microsoft will gain too much control over future technical graduates and is committed to producing well-equipped students in exchange for the development of technical infrastructure.

Microsoft's intention of helping a few poor migrant laborers become more technically trained buffers the true political intention of securing a qualified technical supply of human resources. For Thomas, the issues of access, content and procedure, and latitude of social control are all well in play. The underlying motive of providing training

at the Beijing Library avails Microsoft the political clout to train the very best graduates, with content and procedure which they control and furthers the company's influence on social control by taking the best students away from potential state-run initiatives and utilizing them in a private firm.

CHAPTER SEVEN

POST-NATIONAL EDUCATION TRENDS

"The classic modern multinational corporation is a slightly misleading example of what is most important about these new forms precisely because it relies crucially on the legal, fiscal, environmental, and human organization of the nation-state, while maximizing the possibilities of operating both within and across national structures, always exploiting their legitimacy" –Arjun Appedurai, 1996 (p. 168)

In this section I will observe how globalization, in an economic sense, has provided a unique environment into which CSR has come to fill the void left by failed state apparatus. I will define what roll education plays in a globalized or post-national world viewed through the accompanying contexts of communication, soco-cultural, and philosophical transformation that has occurred in our post-national world.   As a component of MNC's drive to privatize state educational institutions, Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) acknowledges the sovereign right of states to determine the extent of corporate intervention in educational issues. The efforts of Microsoft in China, while reflecting economic globalization priorities, effectively remain a stateist condition or focused within state. Nigeria's transfer of its educational liabilities into the hands of private corporate interests reveals more about the instability of the Nigerian state than the capacity of corporations such as Coke to independently usurp control over state controlled institutions. Appedurai's (1996) contention above proves true as it applies to both direct-social action and government-and-business partnerships.

While identifying the boundaries of corporate philanthropic influence, multiple global organizations are transcending the confines of state apparati to deliver both ideational alternatives and structures which support local societies (Appadurai, 1996) .

Organizations such as Habitat for Humanity and Green Peace are engaged in global social priorities operating well outside the confines of traditional state sovereignty. Interestingly, terrorist organizations are also committed to "…mobilize men (and sometimes women), money, equipment, training camps, and passion in a bewildering cross-hatching of ideological and ethnic combinations" (p. 167). Transnational terrorist organizations such as Hamas, which have received increased scrutiny since the attacks in 2001, have constructed educational alternatives designed to appeal to localities eager to construct a post-national society that is not based on a neoliberal corporate agenda.

I have intentionally, up to this point, described corporations which promote CSR within the operational limitations of State sovereignty as being "multinational corporations". When describing corporations which appeal to the authority of international institutions and seek to remove themselves from the oversight of the state we are describing transnational corporations. Transnational Corporations (TNCs), for their part, are aware of the encumbrances of the state and of the ability for organizations, like the ones listed above, to motivate social reform through the transformation of local economic and political concerns. While it remains the contention Gilpin (2001) that the state remains the primary arbiter of global hegemonic stability, there is little doubt that many corporations are adjusting to what they perceive as a post-national world.

Furthermore, the international society of states, stemming from the Westphalian order, has remained the only legitimate international body (Bull, 1977 p. vii). However, it is the *intention* on the part of the corporations to transcend these international political norms, rather than create any major shift in the global geopolitical order, which justifies a

change in terminology. To this end, the term Transnational Corporation seems appropriate and will be utilized throughout this section.

<div align="center">Providing a Framework</div>

Kubow and Fossum (2003) frame the discussion of globalization and education broadly within the contexts of the economic and political, information and communications technologies, sociocultural, and philosophical/ethical categories. The very general nature of this framework reflects the uncertainty among scholars as to whether globalization is a verifiable phenomenon. Gilpin (2001) notes, that from an economic perspective, "Trade investment and financial flows were actually greater in the late 1800's, at least relative to the size of national economies and the international economy, than they are today" (p. 364). While there are undoubtedly technological advances which put pressure on nation-state identity from both above and below, we are perhaps too near the actual event to say with any certainty that we are or are not witnessing anything new with regard to globalization.

With that in mind, the purpose of analyzing education in a post-national context remains justified, if for no other reason than, as Bull (1977) reminds us, the current arrangement of the "anarchical society of nation-states" (p. vii) is by no means ensured. In fact, the possibility that Transnational Corporations as global entities may outlive the state is one of many possible eventualities. Kubow and Fossum's framework identifies cases supporting the theory of globalization and a perspective into how corporations, through CSR, adapt to the changing educational environment.

The Political Economy of Globalization

"I think of the global as something having more to do with the hegemonic sweep at which a certain configuration of local particularities try to dominate the whole scene, to mobilize the technology and incorporate, in subaltern positions, a variety of more localized identities to construct the next historical project" (Hall 1991, p.67).

The argument that globalization is the result of an ever broadening interconnectedness between previously alienated localities and the resulting intermingling of those local cultures is very compelling. It is, according to Jones (2000), a bottom-up approach which has the most potential explanatory power to account for both the elements of diversity and uniforminity in globalization. To be clear this does not, in my opinion, negate the fact that CSR operates from a top-down model of interjecting itself into the state social contract. Rather, the quote merely suggests that from a sociological standpoint, localities appear to have a greater ability to connect and trade with the outside world. In so doing, communities become self-aware of their unique cultural identity and contribute to a global economic fabric that is independent of the hegemonic system of states.

The case for globalization assumes that CSR will emulate neoliberal corporate reform and integrate various economic, technological, socio-cultural, and philosophical practices from other localities across the globe in order to meet consumer demand. To do so requires TNCs to gain some understanding of indigenous culture. Hart (2005) suggests that to develop more effective models of CSR corporations must become more indigenous. "By hearing the true voices of those who have previously been bypassed by globalization, and by learning to codevelop technologies, products, and services with nature and local people, [TNCs] can become native to the places where they operate" (p. 219).

However, Segall (2005) argues that indigenous culture cannot be an equal partner in the globalization of education. Rather, "It is the economic relationship, in which capitalists position concentrations of labor and resources in transparent school connections, that respond to the global market economy" (p. 115). Segall contends that TNCs are globalization's neo-colonial conquistadors, taking advantage of the weakness of state institutions and the self-realized cultural and economic dependency of the western world. Indigenous knowledge and culture are unlikely to play a role in shaping CSR because of the predilection on the part of TNCs for western norms.

<center>Information and Communications Technologies</center>

The flow of information throughout much of the world remains, primarily, an oral tradition. That is, knowledge is passed from recipient to recipient through direct word of mouth in the form of stories, poems, myths and riddles to name but a few (Reagan, 2005). For indigenous communities who have relied upon oral tradition as the principal tool for collecting knowledge and information, the technological innovations of the past century have had the effect of shrinking the space and time between themselves and more technologically advanced societies (Castells, 1996).

The ways in which indigenous people come in contact with and adapt to the global information barrage can lead to a cultural disruption that displaces individuals and communities. Segall (2005) offers that the greatest threat to indigenous knowledge comes through the disruption of what he calls "valued beings" (p. 53), meaning simply individuals who, through an indigenous oral based curriculum, have become an integrated part of the community. TNCs which come in contact with indigenous

<center>58</center>

communities have the potential to alter both the indigenous knowledge base and how education of that base is transmitted throughout the community.

Fernando (2003) defines indigenous knowledge as "…a body of knowledge associated with a fixed territorial space for a considerably long period of time" (p. 56). Fernando relates that indigenous knowledge systems are under threat, not only from the contamination by the western knowledge base, but also in the exploitation of indigenous knowledge by TNCs. "The rhetoric of indigenous knowledge is used by these companies as means of free advertising for the [transnational companies] that market their products as produced by indigenous communities and with their traditional systems of knowledge" (p. 67).

The preservation of indigenous knowledge has become an indicator of socially conscience business practice. Technology and communication are viewed as a means through which TNCs can quickly transform economic liabilities into economically productive communities. However, as Hart (2005) notes the transformative effects of global technology often leaves indigenous knowledge in ruins. CSR should then concentrate on the assimilation of indigenous and global knowledge. "For [TNCs], the best approach is to marry their global best practices with newfound local knowledge and understanding gleaned from widening the corporate bandwidth" (p. 186).

Socio-cultural Considerations

According to Kubow and Fossum (2003), socio-cultural integration, resulting from the redistribution of populations throughout the world, has created both an argument for and against cultural homogenization. When viewed through a purely economic perspective, the trend toward homogenization can be very clearly identified. However,

these indigenous cultures have a propensity to reinvent themselves and retain a degree of their indigenous cultural identity particularly when it comes to educational interests.

Appadurai (1996) identifies the process of "Deterritorialization" (p. 37) as a central force in globalizing socio-cultural identities. One example of Deterritorialization has been the demand for cheap labor, dispersing members of poorer local communities into traditionally wealthy societies. Nostalgia for local products and outlets of religious and cultural familiarity give rise to a market aimed at what are essentially homesick populations. TNCs have identified these potential markets, described as "ideoscapes" and "mediascapes" (p. 38) and distributed products based on the need to connect dislocated laborers with their local culture. Perhaps the most vivid example of this can be found in the "foreign foods" isle at any local Wal-Mart Superstore. A massive increase in Deterritorialization of labor by Latino's in the United States has resulted in stores such as Wal-Mart bringing local ethnic food and cultural items (including religious apparati) into their stores. As a result many products which might have otherwise had a very local Latino base of consumption have reached a mass retail market.

Deterritorialization of labor, culture, and finance has modified the way TNCs manufacture products. According to Segall (2006), the new modernity has shifted neoliberal focus away from government regulatory agencies and toward the demands of the ever diversifying market. The race to meet the ever emerging global markets has resulted in a continuous transformation on the part of the TNC. Schumpeter's (1950) notion of "Creative Destructionism" notes that consumers in the global marketplace has a sense of increased individuality, resulting from a weakened (although not abandoned) democratic social contract. Local liberation from the confines of national consumption

have created an environment where TNCs can focus more on shifting market demand and less on state regulation.

<center>Philosophical Considerations</center>

Kubow and Fossum (2003) note that there are three major ethical and philosophical concerns that arise from globalization and that they center on the prospect of attaining social justice. First, they note that within the emerging global order, "Global security at least requires a similar reformulation of educations main aims" (p. 293). Second, the authors observe that a "digital-divide" (p. 293) is likely to occur and those without access to technological training will have difficulty participating in the global economy. Finally, they comment that the forces of globalization demand that a universal set of human rights be applied and that individuals be availed of some degree of world-citizenship. According to the Kubow and Fossum, it is the responsibility of schools to instill a sense of multicultural acceptance and that social-justice in all three of these areas is a process in which educators must engage.

In 1999 the United Nations established the *United Nations Global Compact,* "…a framework for businesses that are committed to aligning their operations and strategies with ten universally accepted principles in the areas of human rights, labour, the environment and anti-corruption " (UN Global Compact, May, 17 2007). Included in these principals is conflict-resolution and peace building through which businesses and non-governmental organizations (NGO's) cooperate in the establishment of CSR aimed at reducing violence through educational initiatives. The compact has overseen projects like the "Mines to Vines" program in Croatia, a partnership between the NGO "Roots for Peace" and TNCs like Robert Mondovi and other Napa valley wineries to help bring local

<center>61</center>

wine production up to modern trade standards. The program brings vintner's from Croatia to universities in the United States and establishes cultural ties between elementary schools in the US and Croatia.

Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) projects play a large role in implementing the directives of the United Nations Global Compact. For TNCs, the impetus to be involved in matters of peace is primarily a utilitarian function. As the compact itself reiterates "[the] Lack of a predictable political and economic framework and increased violence disrupts production and supply lines, increases operating costs and delays completion of planned business activities" (UN Global Compact, September 7th, 2007), TNCs seeking the most direct influence on matters of peace and security are likely to gravitate toward CSR programs like the one in Croatia which focuses on education because "…unless humankind resolves issues of peace and war, partly through educative action, it really will not matter whether we all die in modest economic circumstances, or in great luxury with our knowledge economies working well and our universities efficient" (Cowen, p. 336, 2000).

Human rights, from a perspective of globalization are broad and may encompass volumes of international law. For TNCs, compliance with human rights initiatives, such as the United Nations Universal Declaration of Human Rights, has the benefit of improving relations between the corporations and stakeholders. TNCs involved in the UN Global Compact are encouraged to engage in CSR programs which promote human rights through educational initiatives, which will in turn help support brand image, help gain a competitive advantage, improve staff loyalty, and help meet investor expectations (UN Global Compact, 2006). Kubow and Fossum (2003) agree that "functional literacy" (p.

294) should include educational initiatives designed to teach multicultural tolerance and a basic understanding of universal human rights.

CHAPTER EIGHT

WORLD COCOA FOUNDATION

In this section I will apply Kubow and Fossum's framework to the cocoa producing

region on the gold coast of Africa. I will examine how economic, socio-cultural,

communicative, and philosophical post-national considerations have negatively impacted

both children and adults who participate in cocoa production. More than two million

African farmers grow cocoa in Cameroon, Ghana, Cote d'Ivoire (Ivory Coast), Liberia,

and Nigeria (World Cocoa Foundation, 2007). Responsible for over seventy percent of

the worlds cocoa production, this regional industry is also responsible for some of the

highest levels of forced child labor in the world. A report in 2000 by the BBC

documented that widespread child slavery was common on farms throughout the region

(BBC, September 28th, 2000). The most active state involved in the trafficking of child

labor in the cocoa industry is the Ivory Coast. Modest estimates place the number of

children in slave labor in the region at somewhere near 284,000 of which the Ivory Coast

accounts for more than 200,000 (IITA, 2002).

The revelation of human trafficking in the cocoa industry initially brought

condemnation of those TNCs involved in West-African cocoa trade. In 2001, a bill before

the United States Congress would have mandated a label on every cocoa product which

was certified to be child-labor free. Intense lobbying on the part of the cocoa industry

halted passage of the bill in the United States Senate and interested parties, including the

International Labor Organization, negotiated a comprehensive, six-point problem-solving protocol (labeled the "Harkin-Engel Protocol") aimed at ending the use of abusive child labor in cocoa production. This negotiation was meant to ensure that by July 1, 2005, TNCs involved in the region's cocoa production were not doing business with any farms utilizing child labor (Africa News, February 16, 2007).

To meet the demands of the negotiated settlement, the industry relies heavily on the World Cocoa Foundation (WCF), a non-profit organization representing over 60 chocolate companies and trade associations from around the world (Africa News, October 11th, 2007). The foundation focus is on ways to improve the lives of local cocoa farming communities. The organization insists that "Top down approaches are prone to failure. Cocoa farming communities bring a unique understanding of the challenges they face, creativity in developing solutions, and the ability to bring about real change. The involvement of the community – from the start – is essential" (World Cocoa Foundation, 2007).

Acting as a CSR clearing house in the cocoa industry, the organization attempts to address the root causes child labor, focusing on ways to improve educational opportunities for young people in cocoa producing communities. WCF projects include the International Foundation for Education and Self-Help (IFESH) which supports teacher training and curriculum development for cocoa producing communities in Ghana and the Ivory Coast. The foundation has also organized the Child Labor Alternatives through Sustainable Systems in Education (CLASSE) as a way to improve agricultural training and education in cocoa communities (World Cocoa Foundation, 2007).

The latest educational initiative in the cocoa producing region of Africa is a partnership between the WCF and the Unites States Agency for International Development (USAID). The project, known as the ECHOES (Empowering Cocoa Households with Opportunities and Education Solutions) Alliance, was founded in October of 2007 in an effort to "increase school attendance, raise the number of trained teachers, increase livelihood opportunities for young people and improve literacy levels" (African News, October 11, 2007). The novelty of the approach, according to the press briefing, lies in the coupling of government sponsored foreign direct aid and private CSR initiatives to supply the region with the most relevant community level assistance.

Political Economy

In a New York Times article Colwell (October 31st, 2002) quoted an industry spokesman from Nestle as saying "[child labor] was presented as slavery but it was just the normal practice of family's using children to run the family freeholding." By diverting consumer attention, the industry has been able to both ignore child slavery and promote an ethical image to western consumers. The dilemma of child slave labor in the cocoa producing region of Africa is an example of how post-national globalization affects local educational trends directly through the implementation of CSR programs. Efforts to bring accountability for cocoa production have inappropriately handed responsibility for the sector's educational needs into the hands of the TNCs, who clearly have countervailing economic and political interests. Recalling Segall's (2006) remarks that "transparent school connections" (p. 115) are a result of global economic relationships, it is clear why TNCs would want to fund programs which support community educational

attainment on the supply end of the economic equation rather than opt for a public admission of using child slave labor on the consumption end.

In a recent interview for an article by Mahtani and Wallis (June 8, 2007), Susan Smith, a spokeswoman for the Chocolate Manufacturers Association, a US-based trade group, said having to prove the origin of cocoa would damage the industry. Smith admitted that "Tracing or labelling individual beans is, as a practical matter, impossible" (p. 8). Because TNCs do not buy beans directly from the producers but through a complex system of local suppliers who deliver inventories to local West African ports, it is convenient to argue that they have no knowledge of their products origin. TNCs, who insist that being involved in the distribution process is too costly and invasive, have at the same time built and support educational infrastructure for the communities that produce the beans. By agreeing to the Harkin-Engel Protocol, the cocoa industry has been able to disavow the subject of child slave labor as an impetus for CSR all together. Instead, the industry insists the projects are aimed at improving educational standards for all children throughout the cocoa producing region.

Information and Communications Technologies

The direct result of the industry's choice to fight the US Senate Bill imposing labeling restriction on cocoa products is the negative impact of CSR on indigenous knowledge. The outcome of the industry's choice to promote supply-side social reforms at the local level threatens the indigenous knowledge of West African cocoa producing communities. As noted by Shrum (2000), "globalization of agricultural research has proceeded apace producing knowledge claims that often replace or supplement indigenous knowledge" (p. 97). An example of this has been the "Healthy Communities"

program instituted by the WCF and USAID which is "Designed to teach farmers about disease and pest control, crop management and improved farming techniques" (World Cocoa Foundation, 2007).

As of this writing, the price of cocoa is at an all time low. Yet the World Cocoa Foundation's intended result of bringing western agricultural practices into the cocoa producing sector remains to increase production and provide labor saving technology which will limit the need for child labor on cocoa plantations. The "Healthy Communities" project promotes "increasing family income" by substituting western agricultural norms of operation for indigenous practices. (World Cocoa Foundation, 2007). The beneficiary of the introduction of western agricultural knowledge is solely the Cocoa industry. Indigenous farmers are actually more likely to need child slave labor because of the overall supply increase of cocoa on the world market.

<div align="center">Socio-Cultural Considerations</div>

Child slave labor represents the most revolting form of deterritorialization. By seeking to mitigate the economic impact of child slavery by denying its existence, TNCs remain culpable for the practice. Despite the denials, the child slave trade remains a direct result of neoliberal globalization, impacting children throughout West Africa. A report by Anti-Slavery International (1999) to the United Nations Working Group on Contemporary Forms of Slavery noted that:

"Large numbers of children from Benin, Burkina Faso, Ghana, Mali, Nigeria and Togo are trafficked to Bénin, the Congo, Côte d'Ivoire, Equatorial Guinea, Gabon and Nigeria.…….Children in West and Central Africa are trafficked into several types of economic activity. Studies have shown that children are trafficked from Benin to Gabon to be used as domestic servants, from Mali to Côte d'Ivoire to work on agricultural plantations, from Togo to Gabon, Nigeria, Côte d'Ivoire, Burkina Faso and also on occasions to countries in Europe for use as domestic servants, market traders, child beggars and prostitutes." (p.42)

Migration also plays a role in human trafficking for the cocoa industry. Children throughout the region are drawn to cocoa farms in search of employment only to be taken

as hostages working for free on plantations. The regional extent of the human trafficking is clear evidence for deterritorialization; however, due to the degree and complexity of human movement, accurate figures for the cocoa sector remain elusive (Anti-Slavery International, 23 June - 2 July 1999).

Through human trafficking the concept of "creative destruction" reaches a pinnacle. TNCs have isolated consumers from the reality of cocoa production so that increasingly varied consumer tastes can be supplied with a complete lack of governmental regulatory oversight. A progress report on the Harkin-Engel Protocol issued in July of 2005 noted that in fact, CSR measures introduced by the industry have made only limited progress in curbing the child slave trade and market restructuring policies enacted by the IMF and the World Bank have ensured that the demand for cheap (or free) labor will remain (Biddle, October, 2006).

<center>Philosophical Considerations</center>

Writing on behalf of UNESCO, Fritzsche (2004) notes that child slave trafficking is a direct hindrance to global peace because of its ability to deny children an education. Human rights are for Dr. Fritzsche inseparable from the educational rights of children, among which he innumerate's "The development of respect for the child's parents, his or her own cultural identity, language and values, for the national values of the country in which the child is living, the country from which he or she may originate, and for civilizations different from his or her own" (Fritzsche, 2004).

CSR programs in the cocoa industry deny children this right for three reasons. First, by failing to address the underlying issue of child slavery, the cocoa industry has passively denied some 284,000 children involved in trafficking the opportunity to

<center>69</center>

participate in any form of educational opportunity. Second, for those CSR programs intending to address child labor practices, the imposition of a western oriented curriculum detracts from rather than promotes the child's sense of cultural identity. Finally, CSR programs which focus on a particular economic sector have little interest in promoting national values. In fact, the CSR programs within the cocoa sector promote an economic identity rather than one focused on a broader social contract.

<center>Applying Varying Frameworks of Analysis</center>

Three cases have been presented in which CSR has made an impact on the educational priorities of both states and localities. In presenting these three cases I have argued from both a stateist and globalist perspective. From the perspective of a weak national identity, I purposed that by applying Hofstede's framework, CSR educational programs could be understood as a means to engage in a form of cultural substitution. Applying the notion of cultural substation in the case of the World Cocoa Foundation provides an interesting perspective.

In July of 2005 and 2006, Karen Bridges, a 50 year-old teacher from the UK, raised 5,000 pounds toward the establishment of an elementary school in the cocoa producing region of Ghana. Partnering with Devine Chocolate Company (a company which prides itself on its fair trade practices) Bridges was able to oversee the construction of a three classroom school in the Atwima Mponua district of Ashanti in Ghana. Upon completion of the project, Bridges was "installed the Nkosuohemaa" (Queenmother of Development). The dedicated teacher plans to return to the community every other year to 'to see to the proper development of the community' (Freiku, June 5, 2007 Tuesday).

While the efforts of one well-intentioned individual are not systemic of full blown cultural substitution by a MNC, it is interesting that a company would be willing to facilitate this type of CSR. Devine Chocolate Company has an excellent track record of only purchasing cocoa from plantations which do not utilize child slave labor and a policy of offering fair price to local farmers. The potential risk to the people of the community is that neither Karen Bridges nor Devine Chocolate Company can guarantee the sustainability of the project. However, by initiating such a program, Ghana has no impetus to provide any state run educational facilities for this community. Also, in allowing Karen Bridges and Devine Chocolates to shape community development, the national government of Ghana has relinquished some measure of sovereignty.

Likewise, there may be elements of Thomas's political framework that could be applied to the cocoa region. Restructuring programs by the World Bank and the IMF have clearly had a negative impact on the cocoa producing states' ability to provide political support for educational initiatives. The failure of each of the cocoa producing states to solve political dilemmas in the post-colonial era would certainly provide a degree of explanatory power.

The "ECHOES" project that partners the WCF and USAID with the governments of Ghana and the Ivory Coast lists its objectives as 1) strengthening education policy that mobilizes government ministries, 2) Strengthening teacher and administrator capabilities and 3) Establishing and outfitting community education resource centers (WCF, 2007). These objectives reflect a willingness on the part of the WCF to affect the political environment of state educational priorities through shaping how support and access to education within the country is provided.

My rational in proposing against a political context for CSR in the cocoa sector was the apparent absence of political will within the cocoa producing states to address their educational needs. There are certainly aspects of each case which might justify the use of any of the three frameworks. And it would likely serve to provide for a more complete picture. One might argue that within every state there are elements more prone toward weak or strong national tendencies, as there are areas which are more influenced by corporate globalization.

Conclusions

I began this paper by asking two question: In which of these purposes does business have a legitimate role to play in shaping educational policy as defined by Heyneman? And what are the consequences for social cohesion if the responsibilities of education are appropriated fully to the pillar of business? For the first question I have concluded that business has a role in shaping the educational priorities of states insomuch as it follows, rather than leads, the aspirations or the state in which it operates. The second question may only be assumed, absent of any quantitative evidence, however, I believe that the outcome of sustained corporate involvement in shaping developing countries educational institutions through CSR to be generally disastrous.

In summation, the purpose for this paper was to utilize the explanatory capacity of existing educational frameworks to explore the role CSR programs have on the realignment of national educational policy priorities when meeting the organizational objectives of multinational/transnational corporations. Anecdotally, I have referenced three particular conditions of state that I assert are more appropriate, or at least provide a fuller context. In some cases I have attempted to fit a round peg in a square hole in this regard. The disadvantage of case studies from a temporal perspective is that the author is subject to portraying events from a very limited vantage point. Likewise, the three conditions of state, which I described periodically as being strong, weak, and post-

national, may be subject to any number of variations and it would not benefit an author to try to place for every country into the category in which they belong. Both Word-Systems and Development theorists have struggled with the language of these distinctions and the nomenclature I have used is not meant as an alternative to former efforts but as merely an introductory device to make accessible for the reader who may or may not have a background in global political economy.

Also, with regard to the pillars of social cohesion, I have asserted throughout that the prominence of economics in defining the social contract and how it has disproportionately overshadowed the roll of educational, social, and political interests. This is not to say the current neoliberal perspective will remain the dominant force in shaping our social contract. There is a continual ebb and flow in how these forces align themselves in society and shifts among social priorities are common. However, it is difficult to imagine MNC's putting the genie back in the bottle, so to speak. It is likely that CSR will remain an influence on how state's pursue their educational priorities for the foreseeable future.

Applying generalities in a comparative study becomes more problematic the larger and more diverse the subjects of the study becomes. When dealing with bodies such as states and multinational corporations, the complexity can render efforts to make meaningful inferences seem hopeless. Furthermore, the speed at which international business and society transform themselves brings into question whether an effort to incorporate a current trend, such as CSR, into the broader comparative educational literature is worthwhile. Nonetheless, so long as CSR remains an actor within the global

education environment, the programs reveal much about the nature of business and how it views the public education sector.

That said, the overwhelming evidence suggests that, regardless of the states condition, CSR undermines the social, and economic structure upon which the pillar of education is laid. Furthermore, in every case the reality of the programs effectiveness is often hidden by a thinly veiled façade of public relations. This has become an active part of commercialization. It has become common place to see pamphlets at bistro's and boutiques promoting the companies commitment to education in developing nations. Starbucks, for example, provides a brochure highlighting its CSR initiatives in which it boasts of "… working through Save the Children USA to support a four-year effort to provide children in rural Guatemala with access to quality bilingual education." (Starbucks, 2006). For those consumers who pride themselves on being conscientious the evidence here suggest that, ironically, corporations are likely doing more harm than good.

With regard to the three frameworks of analysis, all CSR programs require a cultural, political, and ultimately economic perspective to obtain the most detailed picture. Hofstede's framework allows us to connect closely with recipients of CSR and identify potential clashes of civilization that may occur in predominantly Euro-American value laden CSR projects. Thomas's framework has the advantage of combining both the cultural and economic perspectives but is weak in its explanatory capacity regarding many of the post-national forces (including TNC's) which have such relevance to the discussion.

The discussion on the framework of globalization provides for the most flexibility in analyzing each aspect of CSR and education. Globalization theorists have in no way

dismissed the state as an active player outright and therefore questions of culture and politics are easily incorporated into the discussion. The problem then becomes that globalization as a framework becomes very large and unwieldy to the point that it looses a degree of explanatory power.

Future Paths of Inquiry

Where the model above succeeds is in opening avenues to future research. While successful in outlining the fundamental elements involved in shaping CSR in a purely qualitative sense, it would be interesting to study the quantitative results of CSR initiatives. Particularly what impact CSR has on ethnicity, and gender. How do girls who graduate from Iganmode fit into their community based on the traditionally valued norm for women? What impact do these women have in the local economy? How many of these female graduates remain in the community? What proportions of ethnic minorities in China are working for western companies who have provided free or supplemental training? How many displaced child slaves find themselves in schoolrooms supported by MNC's along the gold coast?

This type of inquiry goes well beyond what a paper such as this can explore. Longitudinal studies from researchers with access to the day to day efforts of CSR educational initiatives and free access to both governmental and multinational corporate records would be essential in providing the type study which gets beyond the hypothetical and circumstantial and begin to provide a very real narrative that may either support or refute the claims I have made. In either case the need for such a project is imperative for comparative education in helping to close the gap within the current literature.

REFERENCES

Abbot, Charles Wilson (2006). Hometown Associations and Ethnic Unions in Twentieth Century Nigeria:

A Geopolitical and Historical Interpretation. *University of Iowa Graduate School* 2006

Anti-Slavery International (23rd June- 2nd July 1999) Child Trafficking in West and Central Africa

Presented to the United Nations Economic and Social Council Commission on Human Rights,

Sub-Commission on Prevention of Discrimination and Protection of MinoritiesWorking Group on

Contemporary Forms of Slavery, 24th Session, Retrieved October 2nd, 2007

<http://www.antislavery.org/archive/submission/submission1999-03Child.htm>

Appadurai, Arjun (1996). *Modernity at Large: Cultural Dimensions of Globalization* University of

Minneapolis: Minnesota Press

Abiri, Falilat (2007, February 20th). Nigeria: Education Ministry Puts Public School Up for Adoption. *This*

Day

Africa News (February 16th, 2007). *Ghana; Producing One Million Tons of Cocoa and Child Labour*

Public Agenda

Africa News (October 11, 2007). *West Africa; Support for Education in Region Cocoa Communities*

Apple, Michael (2001). Comparing Neo-liberal Projects and Inequality in Education.*Comparative*

Education, 76, Vol. 37 Issue 4, p409-423.

Apple, Michael (2005). Education, markets, and an audit culture. *The Critical Quarterly*. Vol. 47, Iss. ½,

p. 11.

Biddle, Mike (October 3rd, 2006) U.S. Labor Department Funds Project to Evaluate Effectiveness of Anti-

Child-Labor Efforts in the Cocoa Industry *ILAB News Release* Retrieved on October 15th, 2007

< http://www.dol.gov/opa/media/press/ILAB/ILAB20061723.htm>

BBC (September 28th, 2000) *The Bitter Taste of Slavery* Retrieved October 11th, 2007

        <http://www.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/world/Africa/946952.stm>

Bates (1989) *Beyond the Mirical of the Market: The potential economy of agrarian development in Kenya*

        Cambridge: Cambridge University Press

Beijing Xicheng District Library Microsoft. (November 4, 2005). Retrieved March 30, 2007

        <http://www.microsoft.com/about/corporatecitizenship/citizenship/giving/programs/up/casestudie

        s/beijing.mspx>

Bond, M. H. (Ed.). (1986) The *psychology of the Chinese people.* Hong Kong: Oxford

         University Press.

Brown, Tom J.; Dacin, Peter A. (1997) The Company and the Product: Corporate Associations and

        Consumer Product Responses *Journal of Marketing*, Vol. 61, No. 1. pp. 68-84.

Bull, Hedley (1977) *The Anarchial Society* Columbia University Press 1977 3rd edition

Capshaw, N. Clark (2005). The Social Cohesion Role of the Public Sector. *Peabody Journal of Education*,

        Vol. 80 Issue 4, p53-77, 25p.

Castells, M. (1996) *The Rise of the Network Society* London: Blackwells

Coca-Cola Company (2004/2005). Coca-Cola Foundations African Citizenship Report. 40 pages, Retrieved

        March 15 2006 < http://www.thecoca-colacompany.com/citizenship/pdf/TCCAF_2004-

        05_Citizenship_Report.pdf>

Coca-Cola, IFRS (2003) Coca-Cola Hellenic Bottling Company S.A.Interim results for the six months to

         27 June 2003 (IFRS), Retrieved March 10 2006 < http://sec.edgar-

        online.com/2003/08/20/0001156973-03-001242/Section2.asp>

Committee on Science, Engineering, and Public Policy (2006). Rising Above the Gathering Storm:

        Energizing and Employing America for a Brighter Economic Future. *National Academic Press*

Costa, Crist H. (1977). Productivity Efforts in Education. *Public Productivity Review,* Vol2, No. 5, pp. 63-

        76.

Cowen, Alan (October 31st, 2002). War Inflates Cocoa Prices But Leaves Africans Poor *New York Times*

Business, p. 1

Cowen, Robert (2000). Comparing Futures or Comparing Pasts? *Comparative Education,* Vol36, No.3, pp. 333-342.

Doney, Patricia M.; Cannon, Joseph P.; Mullen, Michael R. (1998). Understanding the Influence of National Culture on the Development of Trust. *The Academy of Management Review* Vol. 23 No. 3, pp.601-620.

European Union. (2002) Corporate Social Responsibility: *A business contribution to sustainable development.* Brussels Belgium: Author. Retrieved March 4th, 2007 <http://europa.eu.int/comm/employment_social/ publications/2002/ke4402488_en.pdf>

Eyre, Linda (2002). "No Strings Attached"?: Corporate Involvement in Curriculum. *Canadian Journal of Education / Revue canadienne de l'éducation*, Vol. 27, No. 1. pp. 61-80.

Fernando, Jude L. (2003) NGOs and Production of Indigenous Knowledge under the Condition of Postmodernity. *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, Vol. 590, Rethinking Sustainable Development, pp. 54-72.

Fritzsche, Dr. Peter K. (2004) The Rights of the Child: A Key to Human Rights Education *UNESCO* Retrieved on October 16th, 2007 < http://portal.unesco.org/shs/en/ev.php-URL_ID=3861&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html>

Frederick, William C. (2006). *Corporation Be Good* Indianapolis: Dog Ear Publishing

Freeman, R. Edward; Wicks, Andrew C.; Parmar, Bidhan (May-Jun 2004). Stakeholder Theory and 'The Corporate Objective' Revisited *Organization Science*, Vol 15(3), pp. 364-369.

Friedman, Milton (1962). *Capitalism and Freedom* Chicago: University of Chicago Press

Friedrichs, J. O. (1991). Whose responsibility? The impact of imminent sociopolitical change on Hong Kong education *International Review of Education*, 37(2), 193-209.

Freiku, Sebastion (June 5, 2007 Tuesday) Ghana; British Teacher Installed Nkosuohemaa of Bayerebon No. 3. *Ghanaian Chronicle*

Gannon, Martin J. (2004) *Understanding Global Cultures 3rd edition* Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications

Gilpin, Robert (2001). *Global Political Economy* Princeton and Oxford: Princeton University Press

Greene, Adam (March 4, 2004) *Leadership, Accountability and Partnership: Critical*

    Trends and Issues in Corporate Social Responsibility Cambridge, Mass.:

    Kennedy School of Government Corporate Social Responsibility Initiative p. 7

Hall, Stuart (1991). Old and New Identities, Old and New Ethnicities. IN Anthony D. Kong (ed.), Culture,

    Globalization and the World System: Contemporary Conditions for the Representation of Identity.

    Bringhamton: Department of Art and Art History, State Univerty of New York, pp 41-68.

Hart, Sturart L (2005). *Capitalism at the Crossroads: The Unilited Business Opportunities in Solving the*

    World's Most Difficult Problems Upper Saddle River, New Jersey: Wharton School Publishing

Harrison, T., & Katchur, J. (Ed.). (1999). *Contested Classroom: Education, Globalization, and Democracy*

    in Alberta Edmonton AB: University of Alberta Press

Heyneman, Stephen P. (2003). Education, Social Cohesion, and the Future Role of International

    Organizations *Peabody Journal of Education*, Vol. 78 Issue 3, p25-38, 14p.

Heyneman, Stephen P. (Summer, 2000). From the Party/State to Multiethnic Democracy: Education and

    Social Cohesion in Europe and Central Asia *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis,* Vol. 22,

    No. 2 pp. 173-191

Heyneman, Stephen P. (2005) Introduction to This Special Issue on Organizations and Social Cohesions

    Peabody Journal of Education, Vol. 80, No. 4, pp. 1-7

Hofstede, G. (1991) *Cultures and Organization: Software of the Mind McGraw* New-York: McGraw-Hill

Ibiam, Agha (October, 19th 2006). A Drink of Kindness for Iganmode Community *This Day*

IITA (2002) *Child Labor in the Cocoa Sector of West Africa* August 2, 2002 Retrieved October 15th 2007

Jeannotte, Sharon M. (2001). Social Capital, Social Cohesion, Social Inclusion, Exclusion *Retieved May*

    25th < http://www.phac-aspc.gc.ca/ph-sp/phdd/news2001/pdf/social_exclusion_en.pdf>

Journal of Blacks in Higher Education, The, No. 4. (Summer, 1994). Do Major Corporations Know that

    their Philanthropy is Supporting Efforts to Abolish Affirmative Action and Black Scholarships?

    pp. 28-29.

Jones, Phillip W. (1998). Globalisation and Internationalism: Democratic Prospects for World Education

    Comparative Education, Vol. 34, No. 2 pp. 143-155

Kahn, F.S. (1997) Pandora's box: Managerial discretion and the problem of corporate philanthropy *UCLA*

Law Review, 44: pp. 579-676

Kannellos, Michael (June 5th, 2002). Microsoft Gets Diplomatic In China Cnet News June 5th, 2002

retrieved April 15th, 2007 http://news.com.com/2100-1001-932927.html

Kozal, Jonathan (2005). *Shame of the Nation* New York: Crown Publishers

Kubow, P. K. & Fossum, P. R. (2003). Comparative Education: Exploring Issues in International Context.

Upper Saddle River, NJ: Pearson.

Li, Cheng (November, 1996) Surplus Rural Laborers and Internal Migration in China: Current Status and

Future Prospects *Asia Survey* Vol. 36 No. 11 pp. 1122-1145.

Lubienski, Christopher (2007) Marketing Schools: Consumer Goods and Competitive Incentives for

Consumer Information *Education & Urban Society* Vol. 40 Issue 1, p118-141. Retrieved October

28th, 2007, from EBSCO database.

Mahtani, Dino; and Williams, Wallis (June 8, 2007) Cocoa exports 'fund conflict' in Ivory Coast

Financial Times (London), World News, p. 8

Margolis, Joshua D.; Walsh, James P. (Jun., 2003) Misery Loves Companies: Rethinking Social Initiatives

by Business *Administrative Science Quarterly* Vol. 48, No. 2 pp. 268-305

Martin, Joe (April 19th, 2007) Microsoft sells only 244 copies of Vista in China *bit-tech.net* April 19th

retrieved April 21st 2007 <http://www.bit-

tech.net/news/2007/04/19/microsoft_sells_only_244_vista_copies_in_china/>

Micklethwait, John; Wooldrige, Adrian (Sept-Oct. 2001). The Globalization Backlash *Foreign Policy* No.

126. (Sept-Oct. 2001) pp. 16-18+20+22+24+26

Mill, John Stuart (1965). *"On Liberty". Utilitarianism, Liberty, Representative Government (Everyman*

edn). Collected Works of John Stuart Mill. Vol. iii, ed. J. M. Robson. Toronto and London

Nash, Robert J.; Agne, Russell M. (1973). *Careers, Education, and Work in the Corporate State* Chicago:

The University of Chicago Press

Newman, Karen L.; Nollen Stanley D. (4th Qtr., 1996) Culture and Congruence: The Fit between

Management Practices and National Culture *Journal of International Business Studies*,

Vol. 27, No. 4 pp. 753-779.

Nigerian Educational Research and Development Council (1998). National Policy on Education revised.

Abuja

Nigeria. Federal Ministry of Education (2001). *Education for All (EFA) country report since Dakar and National Plan of Action*. Lagos, Morio Press.

Nigerian teachers end strike over "sale" of public schools (November 25, 2006). Agence France Presse – English Saturday 12:41 PM GMT, 164 words, LAGOS

OECD (1994). *School a Matter of Choice* Paris, Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development, Center for Educational Research and Organization

Olsen, Mark (11 May 1996). In defense of the Welfare State and of Publicly Provided Education *Journal of Education Policy* p.340.

Ogun State Education. (Retrieved April 23, 2007)

< www.fme.gov.ng/ initiatives/List_of_Public_Secondary_Schools_in_Nigeria.pdf >

Palmer, Erik (2001). Multinational Corporations and the Social Contract *Journal of Business Ethics* Vol 31, No. 3 pp.245-258.

Peshkin, Alan (1967) *Education and National Integration in Nigeria Cambridge*: Cambridge University Press

Prior, Warren (Sept. 2006) Citizens and Citenzenship Education *Ethos* Vol. 14 no. 3.

Qiping, Yin; White, Gordon (1994). The 'Marketisation' of Chinese Higher Education: A Critical Assessment *Comparative Education*, Vol. 30, No. 3. pp. 217-233.

Reagan, Timothy (2005) *Non-Western Educational Traditions: Indigenous Approaches To Educational Thought and Practice.* New Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Publishers

Roberts, Kenneth D. (Summer 1997) China's Tidal Wave of Migrant Labor: What Can We Learn From Mexican Undocumented Migration to the U.S.*? International Migration Review*, Vol. 31 No. 2 pp. 249-293.

Schoolman, Morton (1987) The Moral Sentiments of Neoliberalism *Political Theory* Vol. 15, No. 2 pp. 205-224.

Segall, William (2006). *School Reform in a Global Society* Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield

Shaohua, Zhan (2005). Rural Labour Migration in China: Challenges for Policies *UNESCO*

Shohamy, E. (2000). Interfaces of language testing and second language acquisition, revisited. *System.*

 Shum, Wesley (2000). Science and Story in Development: The Emergence of Non-Governmental

      Organizations in Agricultural Research *Social Studies of Science* pp. 95-124.

Shumpeter, Joseph A. (1950). *Capitalism, Socialism, and Democracy.* 3rd ed. New York; Harper

Sims, Gretchen Crosby (2003) Rethinking the Political Power of American Business: The Role of

      Corporate Social Responsibility

Spenner, Kenneth I.; Kerckhoff, Alan C.; Glass, Thomas A. (1990). Open and Closed Education and Work

      Systems in Great Britain *European Sociological Review* Vol. 6, No. 3 pp. 215-235.

Starbucks (2006). *Starbucks In Our Communities: Contibuting positively to our communities and our

      environment.* Informational Pamphlet

Thomas, R. Murray (1983). *Politics and Education: Cases From Eleven Nations* Oxford: Pergamon Press

Tomlinson, Sally (1997) Choice and Ethnicity: the Effects of Educational Markets on Ethnic Minorities

      Oxford Review of Education Vol. 23, No. 1 pp. 63-76.

Torres, Carlos Albertos (1995 - 1996). State and Education Revisited: Why Educational Researchers

      Should Think Politically about Education *Review of Research in Education*, Vol. 21, pp. 255-331.

Troy, Mike (Nov 22, 2004). Wal-Mart donates $1M to research center *DSN Retailing Today*. New

      York: Vol. 43, Iss. 22; p. 28

United Nations Global Compact (2006) *A Guide to Human Rights Impact Assessment* Retrieved October

      13th, 2007

      <http://www.unglobalcompact.org/docs/issues_doc/human_rights/2006_HRIA_draft_June1.pdf>

United Nations Global Compact (May 17, 2007). What is the U.N. Global Compact? Retrieved September

      30th 2007 from <http://www.unglobalcompact.org/AboutTheGC/index.html>

United Nations Global Compact (Sept. 7, 2007). Conflict Prevention/Peace Building. Retrieved October

      10th 2007 from <http://www.globalcompact.org/Issues/conflict_prevention/index.html>

Ward, Halina (January 2004). Public Sector Roles in Strengthening Corporate Social Responsibility:

      Taking Stock *World Bank-International Finance Corporation* p. 7

Weick, Karl E. (1976). Educational Organizations as Loosely Coupled Systems *Administrative Science

      Quarterly* Vol. 21, No. 1, pp. 1-19.

World Cocoa Foundation (2007). *Africa* Retrieved October 14th, 2007

        <http://www.worldcocoafoundation.org/difference/africa.asp>

Weiler, H (1964) Education and Politics in Nigeria *Breisgau, Verlag Rombach* Freiburg p. 294

VITA

Daren Love

Candidate for the Degree of

Master of Science

Thesis: Corporate Social Responsibility: A Comparative Approach

Major Field: International Studies

Biographical: Born November 14th 1975. Parents: Burke and Etta Love. Raised on a farm near Ochelata Oklahoma. Elementary Music Teacher in Ponca City Oklahoma at E.M. Trout Elementary School.

Personal Data: Loves to cook, watch international soccer, and a bit of a germanphile.

Education:
Completed the requirements for the Master of Science or Arts in your major at Oklahoma State University, Stillwater, Oklahoma in May 2008.

Experience:

Professional Memberships: National Music Educators Association, Oklahoma Music educators Association.

Name: Daren Love   Date of Degree: May, 2008

Institution: Oklahoma State University   Location: Stillwater

Title of Study: CORPORATE SOCIAL RESPONSIBILITY: A COMPARATIVE
                 APPROACH

Pages in Study: 84   Candidate for the Degree of Master of Science

Major Field: International Studies

Scope and Method of Study: This theoretical work outlines the fundamental environment
        of Corporate Social Responsibility and its impact on educational development
        from a comparative perspective. It examines how multinational corporations
        institute fundamental change in the balance between Heyneman's social pillars by
        initiating CSR programs. This work also encompasses three case studies
        correlated with different comparative educational perspectives to articulate in
        stark terms the impact of Corporate Social Responsibility on education.

Findings and Conclusions: Corporate Social Responsibility is a neoliberal effort to
        decouple the pillar of education from the embedded social contract. It seeks to
        hasten the privatization of the educational pillar for the benefit of western
        dominated economic consensus.

ADVISER'S APPROVAL: Dr. Judith Mathers