FIERY FORMATIONS OF GLOBAL CITIZENSHIP IN HIGHER EDUCATION: THE TEACHER AS VESSEL

By

ANN MARIE MALLOY

Bachelor of Arts
University of Oklahoma
Norman, Oklahoma
1973

Master of Arts
University of Tulsa
Tulsa, Oklahoma
1986

Submitted to the Faculty of the
Graduate College of the
Oklahoma State University
In partial fulfillment of
the requirements for
the Degree of
DOCTOR OF EDUCATION
December, 2006

“Why do you need teachers?” the visitor asked a disciple.

“Because,” the disciple answered, “if water must be

heated, it needs a vessel.”

Ancient Story

FIERY FORMATIONS OF GLOBAL CITIZENSHIP

IN HIGHER EDUCATION: THE

TEACHER AS VESSEL

Dissertation Approved:

Dr. A. Hyle
Thesis Adviser

Dr. H. Wang

Dr. K. Kearney

Dr. B. Krumm

Dr. A. Gordon Emslie
Dean of the Graduate College

Acknowledgments

To my sons, Terry and Sean, as they grow in global consciousness through their teaching careers in higher education.

With gratitude to Hongyu Wang for allowing me to see myself through her eyes.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

As I teach I project the condition of my soul . . .

Parker Palmer (1998, p. 2)

Academics in American higher education are facing serious challenges since the Trade Tower Tragedy of September 11, 2001. These challenges involve questions about personal identity in the face of the complexities of globalization and require exploration of the theoretical frameworks that have impacted our contemporary involvement with diversity. The first of these frameworks is awareness on the part of Western thinkers of the collapse of the Enlightenment goal of objective reason to organize and hierarchize the great variety of opinions. The second is the philosophical and political awareness of the socioeconomic dimensions of those previously marginalized who are claiming to have knowledge. Third is the increasing critique of the incapacity of groups who have hitherto monopolized control over judgments about truth to continue to sustain their power. Finally, there is the realization of the beauty and importance of including diverse voices (Hill, 1991). The realization that inclusion and diversity are important calls for the transformation of our ethical relationships through more collaborative models of interdependent learning. Interdependent learning provokes complex questions about our

identities as teaching practitioners in the context of our national identity, our intercultural relationships with other countries, and the effects of U. S. policies and technologies on the internal workings of other nations. We can no longer identify ourselves as Americans only; we must now understand ourselves as global citizens and foster global competency in our students.

The American Council on International Intercultural Education (1996) defines global consciousness as an awareness of the diversity, commonalities, and geopolitical and economic interdependence of our world. Involving an appreciation for the influences of other cultures on American life as well as the impact of American policy and actions on the lives of others around the world, global consciousness accepts the importance of all peoples and understands the non-universality of values. Global competencies include being able to work with diverse teams of people in order to help make a difference in society. A globally competent learner accepts responsibility for global citizenship. This landscape of global connections and relationships requires a new approach to our understanding of human civilizations and greater sensitivity to the interplay of complex cultural forces. Global citizenship means finding clarity in plurality while respecting cultural differences.

Law scholar Chua (2002) brought the need for global understanding into sharp focus in her article, "A World on the Edge," when she explained that increasingly explosive global violence lays in the three most powerful forces operating in the world today: market, democracy, and ethnic hatred.

> There exists today a phenomenon, pervasive outside the West yet rarely acknowledged, indeed often viewed as taboo ─ that turns free market democracy

> into an engine of ethnic conflagration. I'm speaking of the phenomenon of market-dominant minorities; ethnic minorities who, for widely varying reasons, tend under market conditions to dominate economically . . . the indigenous majorities around them. (p. 66)

Chua believes these market-dominant minorities are the Achilles' heel of free-market democracy because a disproportionate amount of wealth is concentrated in the hands of the market-dominant minority while democracy intends to increase the political power of the impoverished majority. Aroused by opportunistic, vote-seeking politicians, this majority resents the wealthy ethnic minority and revolts, resorting to ethno-nationalistic violence. She wrote:

> Since September 11, the conflict has been brought home to the United States. Americans are not an ethnic minority (although we are a national-origin minority, a close cousin). Nor is there democracy at the global level. Nevertheless, Americans today are everywhere perceived as the world's market-dominant minority, wielding outrageously disproportionate economic power relative to our numbers. As a result, we have become the object of the same kind of mass popular resentment that afflicts the Chinese of South Asia, the whites of Zimbabwe, and other groups . . . . For the past 20 years, Americans have been grandly promoting both marketization and democratization throughout the world. In the process, we have directed at ourselves what the Turkish writer, Orhan Pamuk, calls "the anger of the damned." (pp. 66-67)

Opinion polls demonstrated how far the image of the United States rose and then fell among its European allies after September 11. A U.S. State Department poll in 1998

found that 78 percent of Germans had a favorable view of the United States. This view continued after September 11, 2001. However, by 2004 in the wake of the war in Iraq, a survey by the Pew Research Center in Washington, D.C. found only 38 percent of Germans had a positive feeling about the U.S. (Reid, 2004, p. 23). Similar percentages were found in France. A few months after the fall of Baghdad, Pew Center pollster Andrew Kohut commented:

> Even in the United Kingdom, the United States' most trusted European ally, 55 percent see the U. S. as a threat to global peace. And in four EU countries, Greece, Spain, Finland, and Sweden ─ the United States is viewed as the greatest threat to world peace, more menacing than Iran or North Korea. (quoted in Reid, 2004, p. 23)

According to Jeffrey Sachs, the director of the Earth Institute at Columbia University, "Currently our military spending outpaces our development aid by roughly 30 to 1," and U.S. leadership in the fight against global poverty would help "restore the hope and confidence of a shaken planet" (Time, 2005, p. 86).

The results of the June, 2003 *Global Attitudes Survey on Views of a Changing World* showed the citizens of the United States as being in the forefront of nations in believing their culture to be superior to others. According to the survey, "Among wealthy nations, Americans stand out for their sense of cultural superiority. Six in ten people in the United States agree with the statement: 'Our people are not perfect, but our culture is superior to others'" (Pew Research Center for the People and the Press, 2003, p. 93). Friedman (2000) explored how this attitude of superiority by Americans can threaten the "underlying fabric of communal life" (p. 302) in other countries because

technologies like the internet, which is driving globalization, preclude them from creating walls between themselves and the systemic forces of economic, cultural, and political influences with which they disagree:

> Plug into globalization without the right software and operating system and it will melt down your economy with the blink of an eye. Plug into it without the right environmental surge protectors and it will pave over your forests in a flash. Open your borders to globalization's cultural onslaught, without protective filters, and you could go to sleep at night thinking you're an Indian, a Chinese, a Brazilian and wake up the next morning to find that all of your kids look like Ginger Spice and your boys all want to dress like Hulk Hogan. (p. 291)

Civilizations all over the world are now dancing to our technological tune and facing their own internal culture shocks as a result. This new internet-driven globalization also has the ability to make an individual a super-power capable of acts of destruction previously possible only through the agency of government. Friedman (2000) addressed the implications of this for every country in the world when he said that it is impossible to build order in this new webbed system of globalization "if you are simultaneously destroying the cultural foundations that cement that society and give it the self-confidence and cohesion to interact properly with the world" (p. 302). The logical outcome is that "without a sustainable culture, there is no sustainable community and without a sustainable community there is no sustainable globalization" (p. 302). Of course, without sustainable globalization, there is no sustainable United States of America because this country is heavily dependent on the rest of the world for resources, trade, and ideas.

Education addressing ethics takes on a whole new meaning when seen from the multiple perspectives of a techno-driven global society. In his article "Navigating the Ethics of Globalization," Peter Singer (2002) wrote:

> If the group to which we must justify ourselves is the tribe, then our morality is tribal. If the group we must justify ourselves to is the nation, then our morality is nationalistic. If, however, the revolution in communications has created a global audience, then we might feel a need to justify our behavior to the whole world in a way no ethic has required before. Thus, for rich nations not to take a global ethical viewpoint becomes morally wrong in the 21st century. (p. B9)

Friedman (2005) called this process the "flattening of the world" (p. 8) which means that we are now "connecting all the knowledge centers on the planet together into a single global network, which — if politics and terrorism do not get in the way — could usher in an amazing era of prosperity and innovation" (p. 8). He described three historical time periods in the flattening of the playing field of the world. The first, Globalization 1.0, lasted from 1492 until 1800 and involved countries and governments attempting global collaborations with others. Globalization 2.0 lasted from 1800 until 2000 with the Industrial Revolution, multinational companies, and the World Wide Web as the dynamic forces driving globalization. He said this gave birth and maturation to the global economy. The third period which we are now experiencing is Globalization 3.0. This is the time in which individuals from all over the world have the newfound power to collaborate and compete on a horizontal global playing field. "Three billion people who had been frozen out of the field suddenly [find] themselves liberated to plug and play with everybody else" (Friedman, 2005, p. 181).

Problem Statement

A globally and multi-culturally competent citizenry of individuals is essential for ensuring the well-being of our world community. Although the shift in ethical perspective toward an appreciation for diversity and inclusion has been part of the multicultural national conversation for many years, a broader international perspective is now necessary.

Many colleges, however, are not promoting successful global learning environments. Reports in *The Chronicle of Higher Education* reflect that many college and university faculty are not willing or able to be "vehicles for a healthy culture" (Berman, 2000, p. 134) by promoting civil intra-cultural, international discourse. For example, during a classroom discussion at Henry Ford Community College in Michigan, a philosophy professor engaged in a verbal sparring match with a student over religion and then physically removed the student from the classroom. At Orange Coast College in California, the administration placed a political science instructor on leave after four Muslim students accused him of calling them "murderers" (Wilson & Cox, 2001, p. A12). Disturbed by these and many other events, the American Association of University Professors created a committee to review these and similar incidents. Although the primary focus is on faculty, the committee is also looking into students, staff members, and academic organizations that have been affected (Walsh, 2002, p. A16).

The question of why this is happening must be addressed. One possibility is that faculty members are not globally conscious themselves. At a conference in Quebec, Canada, titled "Globalization: What Issues Are at Stake for Universities," Harvard

presenter David Bloom (2002) said, "Current faculty . . . are often the ones who feel most threatened by curriculum change [and] without this widespread involvement, reformers will fail to bring on board the very people responsible for curriculum delivery" (p. 8). Perhaps these teachers have not had the experiences necessary to develop an ethic of global identity and citizenship. Teachers who have not looked inward and explored their subjective identities may promote misinformation, disinformation, prejudice, oppression and even hatred in this shared space of social action. In 1998, Palmer described the challenges teachers face:

> Teaching, like any truly human activity, emerges from one's inwardness, for better or worse. As I teach, I project the condition of my soul on my students, my subject, and our way of being together. The entanglements I experience in the classroom are often no more or less than the convolutions of my inner life. Viewed from this angle, teaching holds a mirror to the soul. If I am willing to look in that mirror and not run from what I see, I have a chance to gain self-knowledge – and knowing myself is as crucial to good teaching as knowing my students and my subject, and our way of being together. When I do not know myself, I cannot know who my students are, I will see them through a glass darkly, in the shadows of my unexamined life – and when I cannot see them clearly, I cannot teach them well. (p. 2)

Just as nations are struggling to form new visions of identity and foreign policy, educators must try to understand multiple dimensions of global truth through examinations of personal conscience. Such self-recognition can be the first step in achieving civil discourse in the face of global instability so that a new future in

pluralizing community may be forged. As Cohen (2005) stated, ethics are not simply a matter of individual behavior. Being ethical means promoting "conditions in which virtues will flourish" (Town Hall lecture). Therefore, a global ethic in education involves a teacher's honest self-recognition, academic actions, and promotion of a healthy "connectedness" (Westley, 1988, p. 106) in global context. In this sense, global consciousness or what Havel (1994) called "global spirituality" (p. 62) can be defined and better understood through the life experiences of teachers in higher education who embrace global interactivity. Through their stories and reflections, situated in history, culture, and society, we can learn about global consciousness.

Purpose of the Study

The purpose of this study is to explore the meaning-making of globally conscious college faculty. Since September 11, 2001, Americans have felt a profound sense of loss, making them susceptible to fear, anger, distrust, and a desire for retribution. This climate undermines true global community by creating division, alienation, and human diminishment. How do college teachers move through this to a place of reconciliation and hope? How do they share their journeys of international understanding in collegial community? This research is an exploration of the experiences of faculty who are actively engaged in global interculturalism throughout their lives and in their teaching, and how their global consciousness has developed.

Research Questions

To address the purpose of this study, the three interrelated research questions are:

1. What life experiences have contributed to how a community college professor understands himself and the world?
2. How has global consciousness developed through these experiences?
3. How does a community college professor express this consciousness through teaching?

Researcher Subjectivity

As a female faculty member who has been teaching the arts and humanities in a large, urban community college for 20 years, I have many responsibilities. Most of them are in the classroom, but I have also been administratively charged with promoting global understanding across the disciplines in our collegial community. Some students and faculty embrace a global perspective with enthusiasm and openness; others do not. I have arrived at the orienting theoretical framework (See Conceptual Framework and Data Analysis) as a result of my daily interaction with students and colleagues as I attempt to understand them and promote global consciousness and sensitivity. I expect that this framework will be enriched in this participatory research project because I am a "complete-member-researcher" (Adler & Adler, 1994) working interactively with the life historian in hope of learning more about becoming a life-giving presence, more about living in global human community.

I embrace the idea that "like all truly important things in human life, 'community' is something that happens to us on the way as we seek something else" (Westley, 1988, p. 70). As we discover ourselves through stories, we create community. Life history is important in helping a community remember itself because "in many ways its task is to

give history back to people in their own words. In the process, by giving the past back, it helps us in making our own futures" (Apple, 1993, p. xv). The life historian with whom I am making this journey is Joseph, a Jewish professor born in New York City. He was chosen by students in his college in the Midwest to be their advisor for a newly formed minority student association. This dissertation is a story of collegial community between the researcher and this participant.

As we proceeded, I kept a self-reflective journal, constantly consulting respected spiritual mentors while critically reflecting on my engagement in the process, and bracketing my own experiences of meaning-making. As a participatory researcher, I must be aware of how my own perceptions impact the research process. Therefore, I am honoring the four principles of non-violence described by Mahatma Gandhi as "respect, understanding, acceptance, and appreciation" (Arun Gandhi, lecture, 2004). I hope what emerges from our dialogical interviews will provide understanding and inspiration for all who face the challenges of recreating the world in greater fellowship and solidarity, for all who participate in the generative activity of college teaching and learning.

Conceptual Frameworks

Using life history narrative, critical social theory, and developmental theory, I am exploring how a community college professor engages intercultural understanding. Life history narratives are both personal and contextual, opening a landscape for the global consciousness of teachers who are an important part of cultural formation. Critical theory offers lenses through which to understand how teachers interact with the socio-political

aspects of the world and how this is shaping the realities of their academic work. Developmental theory is helpful in tracking the stages of growth and development.

I am using a life history narrative approach because it is concerned with individual lives as the primary source of data contextualized in history and culture. Personal narrative as social critique shows "how the individual is understood as a social being whose experiences are mediated by and in turn mediate the social world in which he lives" (Bloom, 2002, p. 311). Life history studies provide an opportunity to understand not only the effects of social structures on people but also the ways people themselves co-create culture (Dollard, 1935; Mandelbaum, 1973; Munro, 1998; Sheridan & Salaff, 1984). At such an intersection between the individual and society, situatedness and agency, one can easily see that critical theory can be complementary to a life history approach.

I am also using an orienting framework I developed over many years of intercultural work. This is a beginning framework for narrating global consciousness because it reflects the ways I am authoring myself into global existence. My attempt is to challenge the traditional definitions or meaning-making in Western developmental theory and its constructs of power and agency. When Petra Munro (1998) used a life history approach to understand women teachers' experiences, she was fully aware of her own orienting theoretical framework, but changed her viewpoints as she listened to the life historians' own stories. I am adopting a similar approach and will let the life historian's voice re-author those stages that I have identified. By exploring the "storied nature of knowledge" (Munro, 1998, p. 5) in the life historian as he interacts with the socio-

political aspects of the world, I hope to generate a fuller, more mature framework of global consciousness.

Because college teachers have the responsibility of adapting their academic lives to the new realities of globalization in order to make a difference in society, they must break free of old constraints and see the world anew. The fact that the old Euro-American attitude of the "West is the world" is being replaced with the more complex "West in the world" requires shifts in understanding about the meaning of knowledge and how learning environments operate. How the life historian participates in the process, in this "dance of change" (Senge, 1999), redefining himself and his discipline in response to the realities of global inter-culturalism, is an important part of his academic work and identity.

Procedures

The procedures of this study reflect my desire to avoid relating to the participant as "other." A life history approach is most appropriate because it allows for a more holistic biographical picture in context. It also provides a research methodology that is inter-subjective, collaborative, and reciprocal. Mbilinyi (1989) suggested the term "life historian" as an alternative to the objectifying label of "informant" and "subject." Therefore, a life history narrative approach is the primary strategy of inquiry in this qualitative study.

This inquiry explores how faculty member, Joseph, as life historian, understands himself and is transforming his knowledge about global issues into a living ethic as he commits the public act of teaching music and humanities at a large, urban, community

college campus. He is a person who has experienced severe losses and worked through these with courage and a generosity of spirit that reflects the wisdom gained through sacrifice and spiritual reclamation. Joseph lost many people in his extended Jewish family in the German Holocaust, and I chose him for this study because he has demonstrated the willingness and capacity to work interculturally in service to an under-represented student population in his college. He is a crucial case who "is particularly important in the scheme of things" (Patton, 1990, p. 174) because he is a singular representative of his religion and culture in his college. I want to gain more in-depth understanding through prolonged interaction with this life historian because his actions reflect an evolved global consciousness.

Data Collection

Denzin (1970) identified the main feature of the life history approach as the prolonged interview consisting of a series of interviews in which the participant and interviewer interact to probe and reflect on the participant's statements. The advantage of this approach for my study is that it allows for a more holistic approach to the historical and contextual dimensions of the life historian so that the relationship between the self, society, and academic work can be explored. Thus, it is suitable for illuminating the construction of global self-identity. Therefore, I asked Joseph to participate with me in multiple hour-long, face-to-face, in-depth, self-reflective interviews during the spring of 2006. I also observed him working with his students in the classroom on two occasions, once in a humanities class and later in an honors music appreciation class. I saw some artifacts, including photographs and artwork in his office, and read his writings in musicology. Confidentiality statements, consent forms, and an accurate written statement

of the purpose of the research study were provided. The initial interview questions are to be found in the attached Appendix A. Subsequent interview questions were generated from the previous interview transcripts as the process developed. Audiotape recorders were used in some sessions, and the participant was notified of this in advance. I invited the participant to member check the transcripts for accuracy and to insure the clarity of his perspectives. His identity is protected with a pseudonym.

The semi-structured interviews provided the faculty member the opportunity to explore and articulate his thoughts while negotiating the cross-cultural complexities of a global approach to teaching in the humanities and music. I asked him to reflect on his past and present experiences, challenges, successes, practices, and psycho-spiritual states as he worked in his academic disciplines and as an advisor for a minority student association.

Data Analysis

I used an orienting, open framework of global consciousness to analyze the data generated by the life history narratives. Because the faculty member has a different perspective due to differences in ethnicity and religious background, I drew upon critical social theory to qualitatively interpret how larger contextual factors affect the ways in which he constructs reality. This teacher's perspective was carefully documented in terms of wording and context, and I analyzed his narrations. Through his stories I explored his understanding of the relationship between self and culture, or what Bakhtin (1981) described as "the dialogic self." I focused on the development of his global consciousness through such dialogue.

Using a variety of analytical lenses referenced in the literature review, especially Fowler's (1981) stages of faith, I analyzed the information provided by the participant according to eight capacities of consciousness, including mindfulness in thought as well as feelings of the heart. From my experience, study, and reflections, I developed this open orienting framework so that it transcends the limitations of Western rationalist psychology and applies to people beyond the Euro-American mindset. The framework is meant to be inclusive of those who are formally educated as well as of those who are not. I use gerunds to describe these applications as process, as fluid, ever-changing ways of meaning-making. We move through these, circling and spiraling in our awareness and understanding as new information presents itself, our courage and humility grow, and new insights emerge.

It is a descriptive framework, not prescriptive. The journey each person takes is different, so everyone's patterns of development are different. These descriptors can never be sufficient because they cannot fully encompass the soul-workings of any human being. No visual or verbal representation can ever capture the mysteries of the human spirit. However, a more nuanced understanding of how we negotiate our global identities may prove helpful for those who wish to better understand themselves and how their words and actions may be affecting others. In this research study, new categories and word-forms emerged as this framework expanded and deepened. All of these stages are interactive and mutually informing. There is a sense of flow and organic growth within each and among all of them.

1. Experiential Awakening: Opening to the possibilities of larger world adventures through meaningful experiences, insights, inspirations, and

imagination. This may involve falling in love, suffering, and significant questioning in search of solutions to diversity and global conditions. This can be called the emergence of possibilities.

2. Interactive Comprehending: Actively and thoughtfully seeking information by investigating, listening, reading, recognizing, studying, and pursuing relationships of mutual influence with those who are different. This is attentiveness and a self-directed search for knowledge in an intercultural context.
3. Global Immersing: Finding and applying global examples, adapting, communicating with others and processing such signifying systems as art, music, language, economics, science, politics, philosophy, and religion in global contexts. This involves the re-shaping of the situation of life with creativity, flexibility, assimilation, desire, and civility.
4. Reflective Incubating: Reflecting, meditating, praying, patiently contemplating with responsive receptivity, beholding, waiting in unknowing, pondering, acknowledging, self-monitoring, and resonating with global conditions.
5. Critical Analyzing: Organizing and processing more complexity, deep focus thinking, comparing and contrasting, either-or thinking, consciously relating to higher level goals and taking a stand based on one's beliefs and understanding in the midst of plurality, multiplicity, and the dynamic interplay of intercultural forces.
6. Paradoxical Synthesizing: Whole system thinking, consolidating the paradoxes without losing integrity, living in reciprocity, creating, hypothesizing,

composing, both-and thinking and feeling, cross-cultural negotiating in the midst of commotion, thinking and feeling beyond borders, including nationalities, religion, ethnicity, gender, and so on while understanding the interdependence of all and acting accordingly.

7. Enlightened Valuing: Caring and valuing through an empathy for "the other" beyond the politics of location and difference, collaborating, integrating and balancing reality's spiritual and material dimensions while welcoming ambiguity in human relationships.
8. Universal Loving: Exercising compassion and mercy, living transformative relationships in just covenant, healing, mediating, reconciling, sacrificing for the sake of others, self-forgetting, radical relinquishing of self-consciousness, and embodying grace in action.

Through life history narratives seen through the lens of critical social theory and understood through this orienting developmental framework of global consciousness, my analysis attempts to understand the meanings this community college professor has constructed about his experiences in the world

Significance of the Study

The year 1989 ended the era of a world divided into two opposing superpower camps, ushering in the age of globalization. In his book, *The Lexus and the Olive Tree,* Friedman (2000) described how internet-driven systems like online stock markets, libraries, entertainment, shopping centers, and educational institutions are affecting the environment, economies, and geopolitics of every country in the world as well as their relationships with each other. This new technological, fast-changing, international,

intercultural world is a system that has its own "rules and logic" (p. ix). This must be understood so that the people of the earth will not be lost in the gap between the fast-paced world of the Lexus and the stability of place represented by the olive tree.

Breton (2002) wrote, "Globalization is a social process that radically redefines the space for any form of social action and where the compression of time shakes up our notions for the action's place and territory, thereby undermining [our] reality" (p. 5). The new reality is a shared global "framework for thinking" (p. 3). Therefore, there must be a paradigm shift in higher education if it is to be of service to global citizenship. In 2006, Scott Meyer, CEO of *About.com,* put it another way when he said, "I hope my son learns Spanish and Chinese, and I would love for him to be a computer engineer, but I also hope he studies literature. It's more about how your brain works than about specific jobs" (p. 54).

Profound shifts in our basic understandings of time, place, and identity require that educators in colleges and universities change the ways that we process information and make ethical decisions. In his book, *The Twilight of American Culture*, Berman (2000) argued that "corporate hegemony, the triumph of global democracy/consumerism based on an American model, is the collapse of American civilization" (p. 121). According to Berman, this is reflected in four areas that have marked the decline of other civilizations throughout history, including: accelerated social and economic inequality; declining confidence in socioeconomic problem solving by organizations; rapidly declining literacy, critical understanding, and intellectual awareness; and spiritual death and incivility (p. 19). Berman called this a "systemic emptiness, the spiritual equivalent

of asthma" (p. 54). Furthermore, he believed that "spiritual death . . . naturally overlaps with the collapse of mental abilities but is much larger than this" (p. 52).

If Berman is correct, American educators are challenged to overcome mental and spiritual death by fostering global civility, critical thinking, literacy, socio-economic equality, and intellectual awareness beyond the "bottom line" corporate model. This requires major adjustments in traditional educational theory, practice, and research. The first step is for educators to understand their own self-formations and individual appropriations of what is all around them in the world.

Theory

Understanding global consciousness presents many challenges for American educators. Just the realization that people from various parts of the world think in different ways comes as a surprise to many. Nisbett (2003), a psychologist, admitted to the limitations of his Westerner, deterministic, theoretical worldview:

> I had been a lifelong universalist concerning the nature of human thought. Marching in step with the long Western line, from the British empiricist philosophers such as Hume, Locke, and Mill to modern-day cognitive scientists, I believed that all human groups perceive and reason in the same way. (pp. xiii-xiv)

Because of his academic involvement with a Chinese student, however, he began to question his assumptions about the universality of human cognition and document his own growing consciousness.

This study makes a theoretical contribution to the understanding of global consciousness by exploring how community college teachers use and then go beyond traditional Western models in their quests to understand the complexities of multiple,

intercultural perspectives. Every personal life history contributes to our understanding of responsible teaching for global citizenship in the future. As Bakhtin said, "What is it that guarantees the internal connection between the elements of personality? Only the unity of responsibility. For what I have experienced and understood . . . I answer with my life" (quoted in Casey, 1993, p. xvii). This study is an attempt to understand how individual community college teachers answer the challenges of globalization with their lives.

Practice

Those who teach in higher education and attempt to adopt a global approach find that they, like Nisbett, must grow beyond their Euro-American assumptions and traditions. This involves serious and sustained attention to personal cultivation and constant regeneration in educational practice. When negotiating the realities of globalization, the teacher as vessel is situated between the fire and the students who are learning to flow in their own creative directions. The tempering of the teacher-vessel takes place in his or her ongoing interactions with the world and the students. Globalization has turned up the heat because there are so many new sparks of energy flaming at every intercultural intersection. In this incendiary reality, the teacher must handle the heat with integrity, honor, and honesty, while at the same time being personally present to the students. So the teacher's personal journey of self-realization becomes a public practice of teaching for creative global imagination. My study of the life history of a community college professor's journey of global consciousness may provide inspiration for others who follow on their own pathways of intercultural aspiration in teaching.

Research

The contribution of this study for research in the field of higher education is to present the ever-changing story of a life historian who is challenged by and committed to global education. Fire, water, and the vessel in between are always changing, breaking down and coming together in interaction with each other. So must the teacher-vessel change in response to the conditions of globalization and collegial relationships. In doing this work of witnessing and documenting the life history of a teacher who engages his own transformations to enrich developmental research approaches, I am combining the particular with the general in order to view the global landscape of intercultural inquiry in multiple ways. This puts things into motion by moving the stories from inside to outside across a multiplicity and complexity of perspectives so that we may understand how we can bear better responsibility as we animate and shape our lives and the world of the future.

Summary

As the world becomes more and more globally networked, it is important for educators and researchers in higher education to move into this larger field of action and work with students from an international, intercultural perspective. This involves a change from "the great march of progress from Greece to America" approach that has been traditionally found in the fields of arts and sciences to a "moral creativeness" (Popper, 1994, p. 10) that fuses a new set of purpose-defining skills with bureaucratic and social-psychological skills to effect educational change. Bertaux (1981) said:

> We must learn to conceive of the present as history in the making, if we are to cast a more dialectic and humanist look at our changing world, of late endowed with the thermonuclear capacity to put an end to itself. (p. 7)

Educators are, therefore, rethinking their roles and their own senses of identity to discover how prejudices and lack of understanding about the peoples of the world come into play in the classroom. This recognition of our need to respond appropriately in the formation of global citizenship can be called *upaya*, which literally means in Sanskrit "our skill in means and methods."

Upaya suggests the ability of knowing what is appropriate and required in any specific instance and protecting the conditions through which each student finds his/her own way (Smith, 1999, p. 20). This requires awareness, vigilance, and preparation. Upaya is important in intercultural teaching for those who profess service to a redeemable world. I hope to understand how we are growing as we share the conditions of our own souls, the deepest realms of our humanity, with our students and the world. A poem by the 13th century Sufi poet and mystic of Persia, Jalal-ad-din Rumi, resonates with my intentions:

He Comes

> Love's mighty art from roof to base each dark abode is hewing
> Where chinks reluctant catch a golden ray.
> My heart, when Love's sea of a sudden burst into its viewing,
> Leaped headlong in, with 'Find me now who may!'

Translated by R. A. Nicholson

Reporting

Chapter Two explores the experiences and literature in my life that have informed the orienting framework of global consciousness. The remaining chapters revolve around the life historian and his stories. In the final chapter, I draw some conclusions from the research and commented on how this experience has affected my own journey as a teacher in the arts and humanities.

CHAPTER 2

LITERATURE REVIEW: A NARRATIVE APPROACH

If I give you my truth but do not receive your truth in return,

there can be no truth between us.

Thomas Merton (1965, p. 38)

In *The Tao of Life Stories*, Xin Li (2002) used the aesthetics of Chinese women's culture to engage the reader in an exploration of what it means to be a teacher. She used metonymy (Gilmore, 1994) instead of metaphor to tell her story. According to Gilmore, metonymy is a trope that recognizes "the continual production of identity as a kind of patterning sustained through time by the modes of production that create it" (p. 79). Using the metonymy of knotted strings, Li wove together a poetic and powerful life history of autobiographical and international significance that honors the complexities and perplexities of intercultural difference in continual process. As she narrated her own personal stories, she told the historical and cultural stories of others in relationship to her.

I relate to this notion of metonymy with its sense of movement and process. For me, the metonymy of the ever-changing qualities of fire, water, and the vessels that negotiate the energy between them can be shown most effectively through stories that reflect the lives of community college teachers. Teacher-vessels must be solid on one

side but open on the other. Teachers must be made of such stuff that we can expand and contract rather than be reduced to ashes in the conflagration of modern global realities. We are tempered and thus strengthened as we share in negotiating the current challenges of education in our intercultural world. Relating the stories of our individual lives as we negotiate these challenges is an important and helpful part of the process of professional growth in teaching and learning. Thus, the metonymy is not only about withstanding the heat, but finding illumination as well.

Historian, Esther de Waal, employs an interesting narrative construct in her writings about St. Benedict. Although Benedict died centuries ago, she refers to him as still speaking to us today through his *Rule.* Thus, St. Benedict speaks to us beyond the limitations of time and space. Also, in her book, *Seeking God (1984)*, she ended each academic chapter on the way of St. Benedict with a set of "Thoughts and Prayers" from the Bible, Christian saints, and others who have inspired her. She followed this set of personal sources of inspiration with academic endnotes presented in narrative style in order to explain her sources, references, and personal responses. This approach creates a community of learners and gives the reader a heightened sense of relationship with the author and her story.

Because of the power of story-telling and the nature of my research, I decided to develop this literature review as a narrative. Narrative is among the most important social resources for creating and maintaining personal identity. It is a significant process for creating an internal sense of self and is also a major resource for conveying that self to and negotiating that self with others (Linde, 1993, p. 98). Because I am using a life history approach in this research to explore the inter-subjectivity of my stories with those

of the participant, it is important that I narrate my own stories with as much honesty as possible. I have used the interactive and mutually informing growth stages described in chapter one as markers to map my journey.

Experiential Awakening

My story begins in 1987 as I was just starting my career in college teaching while completing a certification program in lay ministry through my Catholic diocese. There, I was introduced to Fowler's *Stages of Faith* (1981) by a female theologian. Fowler interviewed nearly 400 people, from ages 4 to 88, and determined that all people move through the same stage sequence of meaning-making in life despite the fact that the contents of their images, values, and commitments are different. He talked with Catholics, Jews, Protestants, atheists, and agnostics. The idea that stages of faith development could be identified was very interesting to me because faith had always been presented as an "either/or" proposition in the many religion classes I had taken over the years. Influenced by the work of Piaget, Erikson, and Kohlberg, Fowler identified the states as Intuitive-Projective, Mythic-Literal, Synthetic-Conventional, Individuative-Reflective, Conjunctive, and Universalizing. These reflect the way a person or group moves into "the force field of life" (p. 4) and the importance of identifying and understanding the powers with which we align ourselves. I recognized that the more mature stages of faith described by Fowler are reflected in the film, *Becket* (1964), and started asking my students to analyze the cinematic story of the life of Thomas Becket using Fowler's faith stages. This proved to be a challenging project for the students because they tended to think about faith as something one has rather than as a process of

becoming. This exercise helped them begin to think about their own ways of making meaning in life.

I also began to actively ask, "What are the powers with which I align myself?" I read the 1983 Pastoral Letter on War and Peace written by the National Conference of Catholic Bishops titled *The Challenge of Peace: God's Promise and Our Response*. In the section on citizenship, they wrote:

> The virtue of patriotism means that as citizens we respect and honor our country, but our very love and loyalty make us examine carefully and regularly its role in world affairs, asking that it live up to its full potential as an agent of peace with justice for all people. (p. 98)

Engagement with global affairs became increasingly important in the arts and humanities as I began, over time, to change my approach to teaching the humanities.

My faculty colleagues and I revised our curriculum to include cultures outside the traditional Euro-American in order to expand the perspectives of the students in our classrooms. If learning is "the extraction, from confusion, of meaningful patterns" (Hart, 1998, p. 127), we decided that the confusion of information should be more inclusive if it was going to result in patterns of thinking that would be relevant to the future. We were no longer satisfied with Africa, Asia, South America, Native America, and other non-Western cultures being reduced to sidebars or endnotes to Western civilization. As the Trappist monk, Thomas Merton, once said, "If I give you my truth but do not receive your truth in return, there can be no truth between us" (1965, p. 38). We took this to heart with a global "encounter and response" approach to the academic study of cultures. These attempts to negotiate the expressions of cultures beyond the Eurocentric cause each

of us to re-examine assumptions about canons, aesthetics, the nature of teaching and learning, the Socratic method, dualism, wisdom, and our educational roles. It is confusing, messy, and meaningful all at the same time. I began to call this beginning stage of global awareness, Experiential Awakening. In his classic work, *Experience and Education* (1938), John Dewey emphasized experience as the continuity and interaction between the individual and the environment is the basis from which knowledge develops. Global conditions awaken larger and more complicated experiences of meaning, and therefore the possibility for more complete knowledge. This beginning stage is followed by Interactive Comprehending.

Interactive Comprehending

My work with the students affirmed repeatedly that the experiences of life and artistic expression were only the beginning of learning. Like many other teachers, I was trained in the United States government sponsored taxonomy of Bloom (1964) with its description of the six steps of critical thinking starting with knowledge (which includes experience), followed by comprehension, application, analysis, synthesis, and evaluation. These were helpful benchmarks, but when my art appreciation students had trouble with modern abstract art, I looked to Edward's *Drawing on the Right Side of the Brain* (1986) for a definition of creative process and drawing exercises that could address aesthetic creativity and its relationship with scientific methodologies.

Edwards built her ideas on such thinkers as the German physiologist and physicist Herman Helmholtz, French mathematician Henri Poincare, American psycho-biologist Jacob Getzels, American psychologist George Kneller, and psycho-biologist Roger W.

Sperry. She defines five steps in the creative process as first insight, saturation, incubation, illumination, and verification (1986). I began using some of her drawing exercises to help the students understand the expressive qualities of line in abstract art. The process was very helpful to the students, and I began to realize from their drawings that the descriptions of Fowler, Bloom, and Edwards were missing something. They defined process through foundational building blocks that did not really communicate the energy that I saw between the lines and spaces of my student's drawings. In other words, the sense of motion within the steps and stages was not being adequately addressed. So I began to refer to the stages of meaning-making as double-worded gerunds, using verb forms to suggest a sense of movement. Thus, there is not only energy in each word but between the words as well.

The second stage of my orienting framework became Interactive Comprehending as an adaptation of Bloom's rational foundational step of Comprehension and Edward's Saturation which she described as a verbal, logical process for organizing information. Interactive Comprehending involves a conscious involvement with information to support successful learning and problem-solving. Baars (1997) described this in his "Theater of Consciousness" as important because "the more we must accommodate to new information, the more we need to be consciously involved with it" (p. 306). He also recognized that "every conscious experience is shaped by contextual factors, which are not conscious when they do so . . . content and context are twin issues, ultimately inseparable" (p. 307). This recognition led me into more studies about what is beyond the conscious mind and what is involved when a person becomes more wholly immersed in global contexts.

Global Immersing

I looked at the transpersonal cognitive development models of Wilber (1982, 1983, & 1990) and Thomas (1994) to explore the possibilities of cognitive development beyond the rational level of consciousness. I considered "The Map of Experiential Learning in the Social Practices of Modernity" by Usher, Bryant, and Johnson (1997) in which they describe a post-modern continua of applications within real-world contexts through autonomy-adaptation and expression-application. Their four quadrants of Lifestyle, Confessional, Vocational, and Critical provide a greater sense of simultaneous activity in a less linear model through which educators may help themselves and their students understand their personal meanings alongside the meanings of others in different contexts (p. 120). Thus, multiple voices and multiple selves may be represented. This led to the third stage of my orienting framework which I began to call Global Immersing in order to recognize that there are many ways that people process and take in information that transcend the rational and that these are continual applications that grow out of human responses in real-world contexts.

My definition of Global Immersing was influenced by Cross (1995, p. 98) and the third stage of his Nigressence model of social construction in which Black adults are transformed through the stages of pre-encounter, encounter, immersion-emersion, internalization, and internalization-commitment into persons who are "more Black or Afrocentrically aligned" (pp. 114-115). His model is not necessarily a linear journey of identity, and he contends it leads people to a more expansive sense of self in which the "I" is replaced with a "we" perspective. African-Americans struggling with personal

identity in their local situations find that things look very different when they view themselves more completely in the contexts of their world histories and cultures.

I continued to ponder the ways people express their various kinds of wisdom as I grew to know my African-American, Native American, Hindu, Buddhist, Muslim, Christian, Jewish, and other students. As Erikson (1988) wrote:

> Throughout time and everywhere on the globe, people have earnestly and with great labor undertaken to pass on, to store, and to preserve their nugget of truth, of wisdom. They remain embedded in myth, legend, song, and poetry, carved in hieroglyphs and in cave paintings. In some written form, they have been enshrined as "sacred writ" and "relic" housed in such edifices as tombs, temples, mosques, monasteries, cathedrals and churches. . . . Computers and microfilm increase our capacity to store and make available great riches. (pp. 156-157)

Connecting creativity to wisdom, Erikson delineated ten attributes to wisdom including: interdependence and interrelatedness as part of the ecology of living with others; humor as healing; a sense of the complexity of living in the partially realized "merging of the sensual, the logical, and the aesthetic perceptions of the individual" (p. 184); and *caritas* as an attitude of non-possessive attachment.

Goleman's work, *Emotional Intelligence,* was another important discovery because he explored how "empathy builds on self-awareness, the more we are open to our emotions, the more skilled we become in reading feelings" (1995, p. 96). De Sousa (1990) introduced the idea that emotions and perception can respond in ways that cognition cannot. He discussed how emotive framing processes are central to thought.

Evans (2002) took this further when he suggested that emotions may limit the number of choices in decision-making, guiding us away from certain choices and actions.

Becoming more self-aware and, therefore, better at reading feelings in others, I was awakening to the realities of who my students and colleagues were in terms of global awareness. I was also becoming more sensitive to and less overwhelmed by the incredible diversity I encountered everyday in my huge, multi-campus, urban, community college. For this reason, I began to re-shape the situation of my life by starting faculty development discussion groups in which we could share our experiences.

I also began leading students on international study trips to Ireland, Greece, Turkey, Italy, Germany, England, Austria, France, Switzerland, and Spain. The students and I experienced a total transportation shutdown in Spain as well as a car bombing a block from our hotel in Madrid. We saw striking employees marching in the streets of Seville and Munich, Germany. We tried to avoid rioting in the streets of downtown Athens when Arafat visited. We were surrounded by soldiers with guns as we boarded a bus for Ephesus, Turkey. We also met the most delightful people, saw dazzling art and historical architecture, sang on beaches, danced in the streets of Barcelona on Pentecost, told our stories on a hillside as we viewed the Parthenon under the stars, slept on the floors of American airports with a vast array of people from all over the world, and had many great adventures with every trip. These experiences of immersion exploded our preconceptions about the peoples of the world. We also learned a lot about ourselves in terms of how we dealt with lost luggage, local violence, currency and language differences, the poverty of gypsy camps, changed plans, and a multiplicity of cultural expressions.

I started reading some of the transformational learning literature relevant to global consciousness. Michelson (1996) pointed out that the West has a bias of separating experiences from critical thought. He said that experience is messy and immediate. In the tradition of Western rational thought, this messiness is to be transcended through sustained, self-conscious, rational thought, objectivity, and "a rhetoric of order and control" (p. 444). This attitude in the Western tradition is problematic when moving into the intercultural worlds of such continents as Asia, Africa, and South America. Taylor (1994) who studied adults who had lived in other countries, McDonald (1977), and Mezirow (1998) believed that transformations may occur through a process of assimilative learning beyond the scope of conscious awareness.

This sparked my interest in learning more about the way people in different cultures in the world learn and express themselves, so I began to go on study trips through the East-West Center on Asian Studies. I immersed myself in global affairs and began to reshape the situations of the college, directing conferences on infusing studies about Asia into the undergraduate curriculum and coursework. I became an advocate for global understanding by organizing international film festivals, cultural activities, and representing the college at national conferences. I became so successful that this kind of work became part of my designated employment contract. Meanwhile, I was questioning my own belief systems and those I was encountering along the way of my global journeying. Because I was serving as an advocate for students of many nationalities, ethnicities, and belief systems, I was, in a sense, embracing them as valuable and important. But, how important could these ways of understanding the world be if they collided with my own traditions and beliefs? The old dualism of the Western tradition

with its sense of either/or, right or wrong, self or others, was uncomfortable for me now. It was time to face the conflicts, paradoxes, and complexities that this interplay of forces was creating.

Reflective Incubating

I turned to the more holistic Benedictine tradition of pre-modern monastic contemplation in which I had been educated. I had attended a Benedictine high school, worked for five years running the business office of a Benedictine school, and later became a Benedictine oblate. My office was in the monastery where I had breakfast and lunch with the Sisters everyday. My children attended their school. I prayed with them, worked with them, celebrated with them, and mourned the deaths within the community with them. I am one of them in that the act of oblation involves a statement of commitment to the community of Ora et Labora (Prayer and Work). The Benedictines believe that everything else in our lives is an interruption to prayer, and that prayer is the organizing principle of integration in life. It involves affective responses that may be nameless. The Benedictines live prayer as the flame around which we shape ourselves, always moving in personal relationship with God. The monastery is a school of service that cultivates the awareness of God as the organizing principle and presence of our lives. Benedictines see themselves as vessels of peace in a fractured world.

Through the Benedictines, I met Esther de Waal, an Episcopalian oblate from Wales. I began reading her introduction to Benedictine spirituality, *Living with Contradiction* (1998), and realized its importance in the development of global consciousness. She wrote:

> This polarity, this holding together of opposites, this living with contradictions, presents us not with a closed system but with a series of open doors. . . . We find that we have to make room for divergent forces within us, and that there is not necessarily any resolution of the tension between them. I find it immensely liberating and encouraging . . . that this is the way things are and that the way things are is good. (p. 23)

De Waal believes all of us are people of paradox who can find ways within ourselves to enable the contradictories to become life-giving. We must accept and live in the contradictions. The Benedictine Rule is about creating the favorable environment in which the balanced life may flourish. This approach of tolerance, patience, and "making room for divergent forces" has proven helpful to me in approaching the dynamics of intercultural exchange. The Rule advocates "prudence to avoid extremes: otherwise by rubbing too hard to remove the rust, the vessel may be broken" (Rule, 64-12). Thus, the Benedictine tradition of reflective contemplation helps me understand that I do not have to live dualistically or break away from the multiplicities in the world; rather I can live in global consciousness with its confusing array of perplexities and possibilities. Reflective Incubating means waiting in responsive receptivity and living reflectively, sometimes unknowingly, but with the willingness to be open to what global consciousness brings on the path of working with confusion and diversity.

I began reading about monastic women in the Catholic tradition and appreciated the fact that they were the authors of their own works, believed they had a right to their own thoughts, and realized that their thoughts might be rooted in different experiences and knowledge from their patriarchal mentors and predecessors (Lerner, 1993, p. 47). I

became particularly interested in Hildegard of Bingen who was born in the Rhineland in 1098 AD and selected a life of monasticism, grounding her authority in her own mystical revelations and direct personal relationship with God. She wrote songs, letters, sermons, and scientific studies about her own visions of creation, the cosmos, nature, and humankind in a holistic way, challenging the rationalism and dualism of Christian Neo-Platonism. She wrote in Latin, but not in the Latin of the learned or the hierarchical Church. She wrote in the earthy, practical vulgate of the common man and woman, and the book of her visions became known as *Scivias* or *Know the Way.* An excerpt from her "O Virga Ac Diadema" or "Praise for the Mother" reflects her attempts to transcend the limited definitions of the feminine in her religion in order to celebrate womankind as a reflection of divine beauty and creative love:

4a O how great in its power is…
the form of woman
which He made the mirror
of all His beauty
and the embrace
of His whole creation.

(Vision, p. 15)

Creativity involves the ability to embrace all of creation and value the self and others beyond the limitations of one's traditions. In her book, *Women Who Run with the Wolves* (1992), Estes wrote:

> To create one must be able to respond. Creativity is the ability to respond to all that goes on around us, to choose from the hundreds of possibilities of thought,

feeling, action, and reaction and to put those together in unique response, expression, or message that carries moment, passion, and meaning. (p. 316)

Creative thinking is responsible critical thinking. This was a revelation.

Critical Analyzing

Estes' (1992) definition of creative responsibility involving critical analyzing is the very definition of college teaching. Yet, this was not how I was taught in my undergraduate and early graduate work. I began to critically analyze everything I knew about pedagogy. How did female professors act in the classroom? I had only experienced male professors and knew no women with PhDs. I had to learn how to be a college professor from my colleagues, students, and other "women who run with the wolves" like Estes.

I continued to analyze not only the information I had been given in my undergraduate and graduate work, but also the ways that I had been taught. This raised questions about the integrity of the process of education if authority is placed in only one gendered, ethnic, or nationalistic perspective. My past experiences with all white, male, American professors were presenting problems that I needed to confront if I was going to continue to develop an understanding of multiplicity in a global context. Baars described this process of decision-making as "consciously relating some event to higher-level goals in order to make it conscious more often and thereby increase the chances of successful adaptation" (1997, p. 307). This can be understood as an experience of mature thinking (Merriam & Caffarella, 1999, p. 144) in which knowledge is constructed by the person beyond that provided by authority figures. I became an advocate for actively hiring new

faculty from a greater variety of ethnic and international backgrounds in order to insure that the knowledge we as a college are continually constructing as a learning community has integrity.

From considering the importance of gender and then expanding this awareness to other marginalized groups, I began to realize the importance of critical analyzing for cultivating global consciousness. Critical analysis led me to understand that silenced voices must be included if knowledge is to be authentic. I have observed that the students who develop as the best campus leaders have the ability to thoughtfully and critically analyze their own situations. The more confident they are in this capacity, the more willing they are to include students from diverse backgrounds in decision-making.

Paradoxical Synthesizing

In 1986, Belenky, Clinchy, Goldberger, and Tarule explored how women are alienated and voiceless because they are at odds with the traditional male models of knowing, truth-finding, power, and self-definition. In recognizing this sense of alienation in my own educational encounters, I began to realize how many others around the world must also feel alienated, voiceless, and powerless. Belenky introduced me to the idea that "teaching can be simultaneously objective and personal" and that "there is no inherent contradiction, so long as objectivity is not defined as self-extrication" (p. 224). This resonated with how I thought, believed and operated in the classroom. Education is not just about the objective, rational analyzing of a pre-determined canon of information; it is also about a person's ability to respond to all of the human conditions. The educational process is responsive and thus constantly creative; incorporating experiences,

multiple ways of comprehending and expressing, immersing and emersing, reflecting, analyzing, synthesizing, and living. It is a flow connecting paradoxical synthesizing with all other stages in which global consciousness evolves rather than a set of foundational building blocks inherited from ancient Greece.

Reflective Incubating helped me connect with women thinkers and creators from my own cultural tradition. This led me to critically analyze the role of gender with its dualistic thinking of "them vs. us." As a member of the gender that historically has been silenced, I have grown to desire a "both-and" approach to the problems of teaching and learning in society by incorporating multiple perspectives. Thus, I have become more confident and successful in creating an inclusive and connected collegial community with my students and colleagues.

In this process, I continue to discover and appreciate worldviews outside of my Euro-American classical training that resonate with ways to synthesize the paradoxes of our lives. I discovered works such as *Creative Unity* in which Rabindranath Tagore (1922/1995) of India wrote:

> We stand before this great world. The truth of our life depends upon our attitude of mind towards it – an attitude which is formed by our habit of dealing with it according to the special circumstance of our surroundings and our temperaments. It guides our attempts to establish relations with the universe either by conquest or by union, either through the cultivation of power or through that of sympathy. And thus, in our realisation of the truth of existence, we put our emphasis either upon the principle of dualism or upon the principle of unity. (p. 45)

I decided that I want to place the truth of my existence upon the principles of relationship and unity. I hardly understand all that this involves, but in the face of increasing global conflict and violence, I am committed to an ongoing search for such a sense of creative unity, as it is a caring thing to do.

Enlightened Valuing

The essence of Enlightened Valuing is empathy and concern for others. Caring is essential to this stage, so I considered Starrat's "Multidimensional Ethic of Care" (1994, p. 56) with its three frames of justice, care, and critique and was struck by these alternative ways of viewing global ethical dilemmas, especially since September 11, 2001. Caring about others involves the search for justice from multiple perspectives, not just from one's own, if an appropriate critique of a situation is to be developed.

I explored Noddings' (1984, 2002) theory on the consciousness of "caring for" which requires listening, knowledge, self-awareness, and a response to expressed needs. This response is not a one time event, however, because we need to continue to monitor the effects of our actions and react anew to the responses of those we care for. Thus, an energy system develops that requires not only the establishment of global relationships of caring but also the maintenance of the environment in which caring can be effective (Noddings, 2005, p. 7).

This reminded me of how important colleges and college teachers are in developing and maintaining civil, caring environments where diverse people can come to know and understand each other better through the juxtaposed narratives of their many perspectives. I remember a young male student in one of my classes who, shortly after

September 11, 2001, announced that all Muslims are crazy. An older student who always sat in the back and participated in the class with elegant reserve and quiet respect responded, "I am not crazy." I was afraid that one or both students would withdraw from the class after that, but they both stayed and participated, contributing to the creation of a caring, enriched learning environment that fostered civil discourse and ethical inquiry. Noddings (2005) believes that peace and global citizenship are intertwined, and suggested that "peace may be a precondition for global citizenship" (p. 17) because it is difficult to teach global citizenship when war threatens. But when war threatens, global citizenship is needed and can be cultivated in the midst of conflict to generate greater understanding in the promotion of peaceful alternatives and resolutions. "Teaching for global citizenship may help promote peace" (p. 17). We need to actively create an environment in which such teaching and learning can happen. More importantly, we need to foster the students' desire for study because for every individual "education is a private engagement in a public world for the redemption of both" (Block, 2001, p. 37).

McIntosh (2005) explored the human consciousness of global citizenship, associating it with several "capacities of the mind," including the abilities to observe and evaluate the world, making comparisons and contrasts. Thus, one develops the ability to "see" plurally and understand that both "reality" and language come in versions. She included the ability to see power relations and understand them systemically as well as the ability to balance awareness of one's own realities with realities or entities outside of the perceived self (p. 23). However, she added to these the "capacities of the heart" which include the ability to respect one's own feelings and delve deeply into them as well as the ability to become aware of others' feelings and to believe in the validity of those

feelings. She discussed the ability to experience in oneself a mixture of conflicting feelings without losing a sense of integrity and the ability "to experience affective worlds plurally while keeping a gyroscopic sense of one's core orientations" (p. 23). She also included the capacity to wish competing parties well and the ability to observe and understand the politics of location as they affect one's own and others' positions and power in the world. Finally, she called for the ability to balance "the heartfelt with the felt knowledge of how embedded culture is in the hearts of ourselves and others" (p. 23). The caring capacities of the heart help us overcome our localized feelings and reach out to the world with universal love.

Universal Loving

Universal loving as authentic compassion is not just a personal feeling or sentiment; it is energy that relieves the pain of others through public actions and works of mercy. Fox (1990) wrote, "Education in compassion . . . points to the interconnectedness of things" (p. 232) and should be at the core of all efforts in education. "Allied with justice-making, it requires a critical consciousness . . . in search of authentic problems and workable solutions, born of deeper and deeper questions" (p. 24).

Wang (2004) explored self-creation in a cross-cultural space, describing it as "a third space in which individuality and relationality interact with each other" (p. 78). She related creative self-formation to education, curriculum, and the world:

> One's third space shifts as one interacts with each person, with each text, in each situation. Transformative, it hosts ambivalence, contradictions, and fragmentation, yet not without attraction. Affirmative, it regenerates through

> conflicts and passages. Creative, it holds endless love and boundless energy. (p. 150)

This boundless creative energy of self-formation elevates the aspirations of our souls.

When I heard people after September 11, 2001 say, "I want to kill them all," I realized that the only power on earth that can overcome extremism is love. When teachers profess to serve by providing a safe, ongoing environment for civil discourse, they are participating in creative love. They are choosing to live affirmatively in the belief that education is a viable alternative to violence. Resonating with this is peace activist and founder of the Boston Research Center for the 21st Century, Daisaku Ikeda, who wrote that "the key to the formation of global citizens is the educator . . . . Within the interaction between different personalities – the enormous potential hidden in the deepest realms of life itself may be fully developed" (2005, p. vi). The Boston Research Center for the 21st Century is devoted to envisioning and creating:

> a worldwide network of global citizens developing cultures of peace through dialogue and understanding [in the belief] that the best hope for the realization of this vision is through the active cultivation of an inclusive sense of community, locally and globally. (Marxsen, 2005, p. v)

The recovery of humanity in peaceful community requires educators to journey beyond the borders of nationality, gender, and ethnicity in order to contribute to the construction of a responsible international environment. This is a complex and messy process requiring knowledge, attentiveness, skill, patience, love, and the will to live in the tension of the intercultural questions. Esther de Waal (1998) wrote, "Living with paradox may

well not always be easy or comfortable. It is not something for the lazy, the complacent, the fanatical. It does, however, point us the way of truth and life" (p. 23).

Some teachers proceed through praxis in the spirit of Freire's "conscientisation" to awaken perception and "critical consciousness" (1972b, p. 65) in a chordal triad that harmonizes local, national, and global community. They attempt to broaden the path of understanding by combining experience, rational investigation, assimilative knowledge, aesthetic responsibility, imagination, reflection, critical analysis, emotional sensitivity, creativity, empathy, and loving action into an energy system that is helpful for people around the globe.

My seventh grade teacher created this kind of learning environment. She married a man from South America and, therefore, learned to negotiate two cultures, hers and his. She shared some of her wisdom with us, asking us to debate the value of various countries in South America. I was given the country of Paraguay to research, but I soon discovered that it was one of the poorest countries in South America. So I complained to her that the assignment was unfair and that I wanted Venezuela or Brazil. She just smiled and asked what I was using as my criteria to judge. I said, of course, the standard of living since that was the information I had found in the encyclopedia. She suggested that I consider the quality of life instead. This opened up for me a whole new set of questions and approaches to thinking. I began developing a critical consciousness about the many different ways people live in the world and how different their perspectives are from mine. Connecting with other lives different from my own helped me develop greater understanding and compassion.

Summary

I have narrated my own story of being and becoming a college teacher who is committed to cultivating global consciousness in my life and in my teaching. To help in clarifying important themes within the messiness of these stories, I used the orienting stage framework as a structure through which the movement within and between the stages of growth may be better understood. This is a limited picture because the stages of growth are always overlapping and flowing around and within each other. Like the elemental forces of earth, wind, fire, and water, the human story is ever-changing, but this chapter does reflect my own soul tracings as I journey forth in global consciousness. These soul tracings give a sense of the places from which I have proceeded to meet my fellow teacher and life historian in collegial community. It is a framework within which proportions of global growth are indicated in relationship, "the principle of mutual accommodation" (Tagore, 1995, p. 31). It is the various combinations within each individual's life that account for the vigor of creativity and global responsibility, and the searching shapes us as much as what we learn along the way.

Since the importance of global consciousness is just beginning to be acknowledged in American higher education, I adapted the various developmental stage models found in the literature into an orienting framework that has served as a starting point for my research and my interactions with the life historian. The interactions between us as individuals have provided possibilities for further enrichment, growth, and mutual understanding as we journeyed in care, critique, and global justice. The enriched framework that has resulted from my life history research makes a contribution to the

field of teaching and learning for global understanding and compassion in higher education.

CHAPTER 3

METHODOLOGY

> The growing self-knowledge of the authors is revealed in such encounters.
>
> Steven Weiland (1995, p. 61)

Life history tradition forms the major theoretical framework for this study in global consciousness. Based on naturalistic methods in qualitative inquiry, this project focuses on understanding human experience and how people make sense of that experience. Recognizing that human realities are complex and that meaning is socially constructed by individuals in interaction with their world, this design includes a high level of researcher involvement with the participant through multiple in-depth semi-structured interviews with follow-up sessions, two classroom observations of a humanities class and of an honors music appreciation class, document analysis, and the sharing of artifacts.

Research Design

Theoretical Assumptions and Traditions

Dollard described the life history approach in research as a "deliberate attempt to define the growth of a person in a cultural milieu and to make theoretical sense of it" (1935, p. 3). He wrote that the account of a life should be worked up from some systemic viewpoint and may include both biographical and autobiographical information. This

very basic description has been expanded and refined greatly over the last 70 years and now contains three central elements to be included in defining the growth of a person through life history narration: the person's own story of his or her life; the social and cultural situations of which the life historian and others see the person responding; and the sequence of past experiences and situations in the historian's life (Denzin, 1989b, p. 217). The data produced in my research is reported in narrative form and addresses these three central elements through the following research questions posed in Chapter One. To review, these questions are:

- What life experiences have contributed to how a community college professor understands himself and the world?
- How has global consciousness developed through these experiences?
- How does a community college professor express this consciousness through teaching?

This investigation seeks to understand one community college professor's narrated life history and the social and cultural contexts through which he has grown to become a globally conscious citizen and teacher. The sequence of his experiences and their contributions to promoting global consciousness is traced through a developmental lens.

Furthermore, I believe the study of teachers' lives has become increasingly important because research in education has shown that to understand teaching, one must know about the person the teacher is. This requires that the importance of the individual teacher be re-asserted by knowing the teacher, listening to the teacher, and speaking with the teacher through an intertextual/intercontextual collaboration between the life storyteller and a researcher (Goodson, 1992, p. 234).

Goodson described how each teacher's life is complicated and "operates at a number of intersections" (p. 236). The first is the personal intersection of living on the levels of the surface and the deep. The surface level involves what the person does in everyday routines and tasks. The deep level is about the person as moral, ethical, feeling, and sacred self. What most academics see in each other is the surface level.

The second intersection involves context and considers issues of difference in a person's ethnicity and gender. The third intersection is the point where the teacher's life as experience and life as text meet. Goodson (1992) wrote:

> At root, the relationship between life as lived and experienced and life as reported and rendered in text is distinctive. Within this constraint, the life account should be produced in a way which achieves as much harmony as is possible across these levels. (p. 237)

This study reflects Goodson's three main intersections by going beyond the surface into the life historian's deeper world of personal ethics and aesthetics; contextualizing his story in terms of his ethnic background and intercultural praxis in the academic arts and humanities; and producing his life account by balancing between his own voice and the text of global consciousness. This involves deep engagement with the life historian's cultural situation.

Goodson (1992) also addressed the issue of power in the relationship between the life story "giver" and the research "taker." The approach taken must respect the speaker as the creator of life history rather than as an object of research, and the power relationship must recognize that the voice of the teacher in the life history and the researcher must be given equal value. Therefore, I attempted to be open, aware,

respectful, self-analytical, and reflexive in global consciousness as I developed this research study in life history. I quoted the life historian as much as possible and invited him to respond orally and in writing to this research in any way that he wished.

Data Collection and Procedures

Generating data at the various intersections in the life of a teacher who embraces globalization is very complex. In preparing to meet with the life historian, I studied the literature of consciousness, globalization, education, culture, aesthetics, and life history. The process also involved serious self-reflection on my part as the researcher so that the life historian's story could be understood and narrated with integrity. In studying the work of life history researchers, I attempted to discern the most appropriate ways to identify the participant, design the interviews, choose the setting, analyze the data, and insure the trustworthiness of this extensive engagement.

The data included interviews, observations, artifacts, and documents collected during the spring of 2006 following the approval of the university's Institutional Review Board. The design for this qualitative inquiry followed Patton's (2002) work in that it allowed for the real-world situations to unfold naturally with openness to whatever emerged through a series of five hour-long interviews and more than five follow-up sessions over a period of four months. Two classroom observations totaling nearly three hours were interspersed with the many interviews. Personal writings by the life historian were also analyzed. Although I began with a set of questions in the interviews, the design allowed for changing the questions based on the responses of the participant as I transcribed the interviews and observed his interactions with the students in class. This process was adaptive so that understanding could deepen as situations changed. In the

collection of qualitative data, Patton wrote that one should observe carefully in order to provide detailed description. He said the inquiry should be in-depth, capturing direct quotations from the life historian with an empathetic neutrality and mindfulness (2002, p. 40). Therefore, I invested extensive time and attention in this inquiry, attempting to become immersed in the specifics and details to discover important patterns, themes and interrelationships so as not to reduce the experience to simplistic cause-effect relationships.

Participant

When presenting his research into the life of an individual college professor, Steven Weiland (1995) wrote, "The narrative study of lives inevitably reflects the conditions of particular domains of human activity" (p. 60). He stated his intention as wanting to offer a biographical profile of a single professor as "a form of inquiry into academic work" (p. 60) in order to identify the journey that a teacher takes in his intellectual career. My study has a similar purpose, but is focused specifically on the journey of global consciousness a community college professor takes and how it informs his academic teaching. Weiland discussed the many levels of signification that this type of joint investigation requires in terms of interpretive interactivity as one person faces another. He recognized that the academic co-investigators are self-conscious as important themes and the "growing self-knowledge of the authors is revealed in such encounters" (p. 61). He talked about his "struggle for form" (p. 62) in writing this kind of academic biographical profile, describing it as "experimental in genre" (p. 62).

My research experience resonates with Weiland's because the kind of personal academic relationship that has developed in this life history narrative was previously

unknown to me even after 20 years on a fulltime college faculty. Teachers do not often share their lives. The participant for this study has been on the full-time faculty of a large, urban, Midwest, community college for seven years. Because of his work, students in the college asked him to be the sponsor of a minority student group. He accepted and deepened his journey of global consciousness as a result. He is appropriate for this study because he has a wealth of information to share and is illuminative about global consciousness in college teaching. There are many complex intersections in his life that are instructive to those who wish to understand the formation of global consciousness and how it is part of the teaching/learning process. Joseph is a path-maker and is willing to share his journey with those who may not have had a rich variety of intercultural experiences through which to develop global consciousness. This critical case informs and illuminates the complexities of global consciousness in higher education.

Not only are the many intersections in his life addressed in this study, but also the intersections in mine because how I understand my story affects how I understand and narrate his. So as this narrative developed, more and more layers of complexity emerged as we interacted with each other. The three lengthy interviews became five, and then many short sessions developed. The classroom observations became longer. I began asking him more questions, especially about music, and asked him to read the narrative itself in order to check for accuracy. He gave me some texts to read. His feedback led to further questions and responses from me, creating a multiplicity of layered engagements.

All of these emergent interchanges took place in his office, and he was forthcoming in his responses, readily answering questions, planned and unplanned. He

rephrased the questions at times. He also offered information not in the questions but important to revealing his lived experiences. Each audio taped interview terminated with the understanding that subsequent follow-ups might be needed, and follow-up sessions occurred on a regular basis. At the end of my research, all the data I collected became sufficient to illuminate and inform the utility of this scholarly investigation into the journey of an academic professor.

Researcher

The teacher is being increasingly silenced in the decision-making processes of many educational hierarchies as these structures are re-created in the corporate model. The gap between administration and faculty in higher education is widening as managerial teams of administrators attempt to deal with the ever-increasing complexities of globalization. Teachers have experiences and wisdom that do not necessarily fit in with the various administrative agendas of building student enrollment, scheduling, retention, workforce development, budgeting, and technological systems. After 20 years of experience in higher education, I find that teachers and administrators meet less and less often around the same table. I feel that someone, especially in the arts and humanities, must tell the story of global consciousness from the teaching professional's perspective so that administrative decision-makers will realize the importance and complexity of the teacher's role.

Teachers can also learn from each other as we attempt to negotiate the ever-increasing challenges of this new world order through our academic disciplines and work with the students. We must understand the development of global consciousness in ourselves and others if we are going to foster global citizenship in the future. My

extensive involvement in faculty development and globalization has revealed that the systems and strategies for supporting teachers as they become more globally conscious at the college level are inadequate. Understanding how individual faculty members develop global consciousness is essential if faculty training and development are to improve. To do so, however, the life history researcher must "move away from studying abstractions and get at the particular, the detailed, and the experiential, thus allowing one to grasp the ambiguities and inevitability of different perspectives" (Dimmick & O'Donoghue, 1997, p. 29). This emic posture requires deep and extensive involvement between the researcher and the researched.

As a community college professor, I have an insider's perspective on the necessity of respecting the teachers' own voices which gives me an advantaged position to engage the life historian's own stories. However, due to my shared commitment to global understanding with the life historian, there is a potential danger that I might re-appropriate the life historian's own words into my own framework. Therefore, qualitative research requires that I reflect on and monitor my own values, beliefs, biases, and assumptions as the project proceeds (Mertens, 1998, p. 175). I have done this by self-reflective journaling throughout the research process. This journaling helped me realize more about my own intentions and weaknesses. For instance, I know much more about humanities than about music. So at first, I focused the interviews more toward the integrated humanities. But when Joseph talked extensively about music, I realized that my own orientation was greatly exceeded by Joseph's expertise. I had to go back and research music theory and performance before I could seriously talk with him about music as an important part of his identity. This allowed the significant role of music in

his life to speak back to me, enriching and expanding my understanding. In my research, the relationship between the researcher and the life historian is highly interactive.

Data Analysis Procedures

In processing the data, I transcribed the tapes, attempting to determine essential themes and patterns. Listening to the tapes repeatedly was an important part of the process because it gave me time to analyze inflections and word patterns. It was a good transition between my fieldwork and analysis because it helped me make sense of the data specifically and holistically as new information and insights emerged.

I began with my orienting stage framework in order to situate myself in the process with more integrity and thereby analyze the data offered by the life historian through a systematic viewpoint. As his stories unfolded, my framework was enriched and expanded as I came to understand more about global consciousness from his perspective. His experiences and profound reflections on music and aesthetics opened up a whole new emerging theme for me. Music became a new lens through which I could understand and analyze the story of global consciousness.

Credibility and Transferability of the Study

The process of struggling to understand the life history of another is a "sharing [that] allows us to write life documents that speak to the human dignity, the suffering, the hopes, the dreams, the lives gained, and the lives lost by the people we study" (Denzin, 1989a, p. 83). Lincoln and Guba (1985) argued that the methodology and procedures for establishing the trustworthiness or authenticity of naturalistic inquiry differ from positivist paradigms. Thus, they proposed four criteria for qualitative research to replace

the positivist criteria of internal validity, external validity, reliability and objectivity. They are credibility, transferability, dependability, and confirmability (pp. 289-331). I will discuss the rigor of my study according to the criteria of credibility and transferability as appropriate replacements for internal and external validity.

Credibility

Credibility addresses the issue of the inquirer providing assurances that the respondent's views of his life and the inquirer's reconstruction and representation of it correspond (Schwandt, 2001, p. 258). A person's life is complex and multifaceted with many intersections of experiences and meanings. Therefore, to meet the criterion of credibility in this inquiry and then demonstrate that rich complexity, I have used such activities as prolonged engagement and triangulation (Lincoln & Guba, 1985). In addition to these two activities, a wide understanding of literature was also required in the areas of global education, the academic arts and humanities, teaching in higher education, human development theory, life history narratives, and critical social theory before meeting with the respondent.

Prolonged and substantial engagement involves the investment of sufficient time to learn the respondent's culture, build trust, and test for misinformation (Lincoln & Guba, 1985, p. 301). In this case study, multiple extended interviews, follow-up clarification sessions, and observations took place over a period of more than four months. This allowed time for us to engage in extended discussion and interaction in order to identify important issues and establish a cooperative relationship. I was also able to confirm and reconfirm the data collected in order to assure that the respondent's viewpoints were being accurately represented through triangulation.

Triangulation involves checking information that has been collected from different sources and methods for consistency (Mertens, 1998, p.183). For example, as I recognized that music is an essential part of this life historian's story, I realized that I needed to study it more in order to understand the relevance of what he was saying. I asked for his guidance, and he gave me some music books as well as his dissertation in musicology to read. I also consulted some other sources in order to ground myself better in the art form. I then went back to him with questions. When I attended his class in music, I learned as much or more than the students did. All of these data helped me understand the significance of music in his life history. They also helped me see the important role of music in the development of global consciousness. These multiple data sources including music theory, long and short interviews, document analysis, classroom observations in a humanities class and a music appreciation class, the viewing of artifacts, and witnessing Joseph's three public music performances combined to create a more complete interpretation of the life historian's perspectives.

The member checking in this project was both formal and informal with the respondent having immediate and long-term opportunities to correct errors and challenge perceived interpretations orally and in writing. I allowed ample opportunities for issues to emerge and for him to negate those aspects that did not fit. The process involved intense, ongoing engagement on both our parts.

Transferability

Guba and Lincoln (1989) identified transferability or "fittingness" (p. 124) as the qualitative parallel to external validity in post positivist research. External validity is impossible for the naturalist, however, because it involves statistical confidence limits (p.

316). Therefore, the burden of transferability in naturalist qualitative research is placed on the reader to determine the degree of similarity between the research study and the receiving context. In order to make it possible for someone to reach a conclusion or consider a possibility, the researcher must provide "thick description" of the time, place, context, and culture as a data base that makes reliable transferability judgments possible. This "mélange of descriptors" allows for congruence between sending and receiving contexts (Lincoln & Guba, 1985, pp. 124, 125).

Therefore, I attempted to provide the richest possible range of extensive data from a variety of sources, carefully and accurately narrated, to aid readers in determining the applicability of this community college professor's life story in their own context of global consciousness and college teaching.

Ethical Considerations

Following approval by my university committee and the Institutional Review Board, the participant was contacted. The purpose of the research study was described as well as assurances of confidentiality given. I told him that he had the right to withdraw at anytime and could review any transcript or narrative text during the process. I provided him with a consent form and verbally reviewed it, focusing on the assurances related to confidentiality, storage of data, and the roles of the Institutional Review Board and my committee. The audiotape recordings and transcriptions have been locked in my office and will remain so until the dissertation process is complete. Then the audiotapes and transcripts will be destroyed. I have been very attentive to letting the life historian's

voice come through and attempted to respect his perspectives and responses in my writings.

Summary

This qualitative research study in topical life history narrative adhered to the guidelines for ensuring rigor in qualitative methodology as formulated by Lincoln and Guba. It has been informed by the extensive work of Denzin and others who work in life history methodologies. I used multiple strategies to encourage the life historian's direct input into this narrative text in order to create multiple lenses for conducting this research.

CHAPTER 4

THE TEACHER AS VESSEL

In chapter two, I attempted to give form to my own growth in global consciousness through narrative self-reflection. In this chapter, I begin with a brief biographical sketch of community college professor, Joseph Allen, followed by analysis of his life story through the lens of my orienting stage framework blended with the insights offered by critical theory.

Biographical Sketch: "It makes people happy if you cook"

I have known Joseph for more than seven years. He is in his mid-forties and teaches music and humanities classes in a large, urban community college in the Midwest. He is also a professional musician, playing the string bass in the local symphony orchestra and with a Celtic band. In a picture from his younger days, he looks very much like Kenny G does today. He lost the long curly hair, but still retains the red shade of past days. Tall and slim with the muscular hands and forearms of a musician, he has agreed to share some of his life stories as they relate to his teaching. Our interview sessions took place in his office, a bright, colorful space filled with abstract art and drawings by his two young daughters. The office also smells good, like home-cooking, around lunchtime.

In 1959, Joseph was born in Queens, New York, to parents who were first generation Americans. His father came from Russia and his mother's from Hungary. He says that in his identity of being of Eastern European Jewish ancestry, "the nationality is much less important than the association with the cultural identity of growing up in a Jewish world." His ancestors were isolated from the mainstream cultures of Moscow, St. Petersburg or Budapest because they lived in outlying rural areas and spoke Yiddish. "Things were not that great for people who were Jewish in Eastern Europe at that time, so a lot of them sought to leave."

His grandparents did leave, but many others in the family did not. Joseph's mother and father both lost family members in the Holocaust. His maternal grandfather lost most of his extended family. Joseph remembers his grandfather as a gentle, soft-spoken man, tall with blond hair and blue eyes. Joseph believes that he takes after his grandfather in appearance. When he died, Joseph's grandmother lived with them in a large multiple-family dwelling that they converted into a single family home. It had four kitchens, one in the basement and then three more in the upper stories. Each story had an apartment in it, so his grandmother could live independently. The house was on the beach, and the family rented out part of it in the summer to supplement the income his father made as a school teacher.

Joseph's father served in World War II where he became conscious of the world in a larger sense. He served in France, Belgium, and Germany, and saw firsthand the effects of the Nazi occupation. In 1964 Joseph's parents traveled back to Eastern Europe and reconnected with some family members who had survived, sponsoring some of them when they immigrated to the United States and offering accommodations in their house

for several months. Joseph said that although it was never spoken about directly in front of him, the Holocaust was ever present in their lives because his parents were both depression era kids, and his dad's service in the war was one of the most formative events of his life:

> Emotionally and psychologically, I think World War II was where my dad became a man, where he became conscious of the world in a much greater sense. So many people of that generation talk about how a period of service in the military was such an eye-opening experience. People in that generation lived very provincial lives. They were born in a neighborhood, lived there most of their lives surrounded by family and people of the same culture and ethnic background, and died there. But serving in the military throws people together in a way that they would never had been exposed to otherwise. So my dad talked about how he met guys from Alabama, and the south, and Nebraska. How else would he have ever come into contact with just average kids from various parts of the country? He wasn't going to any Ivy League schools, not that any Jews were going to Ivy League schools.

Joseph feels that his parents experienced anti-Semitism in the U.S. and that it was a shaping influence on their sense of identity. "I think that was something, whether intentionally or unintentionally, that was brought to our experience growing up as kids. We were very conscious of our Jewish-ness." He described this as an "ever constant awareness that people are easily led into allowing themselves to believe that Jews would do something differently, potentially negatively, that others, Christians or non-Jews, wouldn't do." It made him painfully aware that people are willing to believe untrue

things about people that they do not know anything about. This sensitized him to that aspect of the human condition that he described as:

> The human failing of being willing to believe that because people are other, that they are not up to the same standards of moral behavior or practice. So it is easier for them to demonize a particular group if they are the other. That's a kind of a safety net for majority culture. If you're the majority, then you're the ones that can forget about others. I think it is an interesting self-revelation that anybody can fall victim to that kind of demonizing because my parents who were so conscious of how Jews were horribly treated and brutalized in the Holocaust, at the same time seemed oddly insensitive to the plight of others who would be demonized.

Joseph's insight is interesting to me because I am of German descent. Aware of the horrors that took place in Nazi Germany, I have often asked myself how they could have happened. The German people were suffering in the early part of the 20th century and were ready to follow anyone who offered them a way out of their serious economic problems. Infant mortality was high, and industrialization was taking its human toll in places like Berlin. Why are people who are victims themselves so willing to dehumanize and victimize others? As Joseph observed, it does seem to be a universal human failing.

Liang Ho (1996) addressed this question, saying it has to do with a person's desire to be accepted and survive:

> Because the person with less formal and informal power will more likely adopt and use behaviors according to the expectations of the person with greater power, the person with greater power will less likely see, experience or interpret the

> minority person's values and behavior as fundamentally different from his or her own. (p. 90)

Joseph had a taste of what it was like to be in a Jewish majority when he took a trip to Israel with his parents in 1973 after his Bar Mitzvah. Some of his mother's family whom they were visiting had been living in Israel for 200 years. He said that it was really interesting to live in a country that was identifiably Jewish as compared to this country.

> It is a unique experience because in this country, despite the fact that it is a very pluralistic society and diverse, the prevailing sentiment of the country is Christian in almost unconscious ways. It is so unconscious that people who are Christian think that it's not; whereas if you experience life in this country as a minority, you are constantly reminded of the fact that your perspective is not the majority. So when you go to a place like Israel, where the commerce of everyday life is Jewish, it is really different. It also shaped my idea of history in a very different way because when you are in a place as ancient as that, what is old is really old as opposed to New York where what's old is turn of the century. In Israel, there are ruins from the Romans, but that's not the really old stuff. That is pretty profound in historical terms, just a different perspective on time and culture that one can only have in a place not really like the United States. It is a very human experience in a place as ancient as the Middle East, the real Fertile Crescent, where cultures first started appearing. It was also a beautiful place.

Joseph described more about his family, particularly his father's career as a public elementary school teacher in an extremely poor section of Crown Heights, Brooklyn, where the entire population was Black or Hispanic. His father loved the kids and liked

working with them, but with a Masters degree he wanted to move up to administration. The years were 1966 to 1986, a contentious and difficult time in the history of New York City public schools. Affirmative action was becoming an important part of the administrative structure. His father was trying to advance in the system but could not because of the qualifying exam. To be considered for an administrative position, applicants had to take a test. His father would pass the exams, but the tests were discounted because of the fact that there was not a high enough quota of African-Americans exam takers with a passing grade. His father felt that the principal of his school, who was African-American, betrayed him. Joseph commented:

> He was incredibly frustrated. He was embittered by that because at every turn, he was being denied the possibility of advancement through no fault of his own. I knew that my parents harbored certain racist feelings, and that seemed incongruous to me. I see my dad as a tragic figure; he tries to do the right thing. He taught English as a second language to immigrants and really liked teaching the adults in the evening school.

Joseph became aware of the many complexities and contradictions in the human condition through his family's experience. For example, his father became an advocate for Joseph's career in music and teaching despite his ambivalent feelings about it. When asked if his father's experiences had affected his career in teaching, Joseph said that his father did not want him to become a teacher because it was a lot of work for little money. He wanted his kids to do better in the world than he did. "That doesn't mean that he is disapproving of what I do. But I never aspired to being a teacher." Joseph laughed when telling the story of how his father set his career in motion by

introducing him to Henry Hight, a college music professor in St. Louis. Joseph's father met Dr. Hight when his family summered at the beach in their neighborhood. Knowing Joseph's interest in music, his father arranged a meeting. Reflecting back, Joseph said:

> My dad, who had no musical background and no knowledge, could have said, "You're a bass player, and I don't want you anywhere near my son. He's about to make a choice of something practical in his life." Instead, he introduced me to this guy who said he would let me work with him and see if it was worth doing. He gave me a free lesson everyday at my house, and after a week, he talked to my dad again and invited me to move to St. Louis. And I did.

This meeting resulted in Hight becoming his bass teacher, arranging a college scholarship, and inviting Joseph to his home where he was treated as a member of the family. In response to this hospitality, Joseph brought him homemade bread:

> I was a bread baker. I used to bake bread everyday. It was one of the ways that I guaranteed being tied to my house for at least three hours a day. What I would do was I would start the dough and then I would practice while it rose. And then I would punch it down and leave it for the second rise for another hour. And then I'd bake it for another hour. So I got in at least 3 hours of practice a day, and I had two loaves of bread.

He baked bread for his friends who came by and cut off a slice on the way to class in the morning. He baked bread without sugar or gluten for a diabetic friend. "It was a very idyllic situation. I was incredibly poor, but I was happy. It makes people happy if you cook." Joseph's story reminds me of something Isabel Allende (1998) wrote about

baking, “The poet and the baker are brothers in the essential task of nourishing the world” (p. 127).

His interest in music developed when he was a young child. The more he understood music, the more interested he became in engaging in it as a personal pursuit. Music grew into a “way of transcending the material, the mundane, the banal; a way of communicating with what’s out there. It became a form of spiritual practice.” Practicing became a kind of inner journey in which he was able to lose himself, concentrate and let go at the same time. He believes it has a kind of Zen quality where you have to focus on a very specific kind of task and yet be in the flow of things. His words describe music as a kind of meditative process where you have to be in the moment:

> You cannot be concerned about what has happened in the past. If you start thinking about what you’ve done, then you lose your focus on what’s happening in the moment, and something’s going to go wrong. And you can’t be concerned with what’s coming up for the same reason.

Music has led him on to many other kinds of experiences in that it is a very integrative feature of his life. It has brought him to relationships with friends, teachers, family members, colleagues, students, and other individuals who have become important.

He always had friends from other countries. In high school, his best friend was an exchange student from Brazil, an artist who did a humorous pencil sketch of a bass player which Joseph has hanging in his office. In St. Louis, his roommate, also a bass player, was from Sweden. Another friend with whom he shared a close relationship was a woman pianist from Singapore. Although his college attracted mostly local students, the university’s music school was very international because the Suzuki method was being

introduced to the U. S. So despite being a little state university, it had an incredibly diverse student population in music. "I guess in part, that attracted me to the academic life because it gives you access to that kind of diversity. I liked hearing about people and their lives. They just knew different stuff, and I thought that was really interesting." In this case, the music department was much more ethnically diverse than the rest of the university, and Joseph learned that artists from around the world can share certain experiences related to their aesthetic disciplines.

Upon graduation, Joseph moved further south to join a Philharmonic orchestra in the Midwest as a tenured performer. He also pursued his Master's degree in music theory. Then in 1987, he met his wife, married, and moved to Texas to work on his PhD in musicology. He was on scholarship, playing in a local symphony orchestra, and freelancing while completing his coursework. By the time he graduated in 1998, he had two children, was working as an adjunct instructor, writing program notes, and "piecing together a very poor income." His strong Jewish identity did not exclude him from being open to other viewpoints and other identities. He married a non-Jewish woman (the first person in his family to do so), and this opened them both to a heightened awareness of the strengths and shortcomings of their Christian and Jewish cultures. He believes that this relationship has given him the basis for appraising ideas more objectively and has helped him think outside the boundaries of his Jewish identity. He also thinks that this ability is important for his students if they are to gain a global perspective. He defines global citizenship as the "realization of our obligation to sensitively consider the possibility of thinking and believing in other ways that are a manifested part of different

cultures." The influences of his changing historical and social contexts are very different than his parents' generation.

The Development of Global Consciousness

"Why do you need teachers?" the visitor asked the disciple. "Because," the disciple answered, "if water must be heated, it needs a vessel."

Ancient Story

As I reflect on Joseph's story, I am struck by the radiant energy that music provides in his life. He describes the miracle of music as being that indefinable "leap between the sound that is happening and the experience of the person who is receiving it." He recognizes it as the greatest and most valuable experience of his life, and some of his most important relationships have been with his music teachers. His father-teacher introduced him to Henry Hight who helped him begin his professional career in earnest. Through Hight, Joseph met another teacher, John Grayson, "a big, tall guy from Rocky Mountain, North Carolina, who had studied at Julliard." Joseph commented, "I had never known anyone from his culture before. He was the kind of teacher who would have dinner at his house for students. And you'd go, and hang out, and talk, and be intellectual." These professors' houses became homes that Joseph described as "places where people welcome you and you are comfortable and you're not judged. I felt like a family member." This deep sense of feeling at home in the world can be described as "metaphysical comfort" (Philip Ivanhoe, 2006). Joseph remembers his teachers as kind, smart, and generous. Grayson convinced him to stay another year at the university to

complete a double major, not only in performance but also in music theory in case the performance career didn't work out. This background provided Joseph with the skills to teach in the liberal arts as well as in music. Joseph's words reflect how these teachers set him on his path toward teaching. "The most important people in my life have been teachers, and it is a very satisfying thing because knowing that I could possibly play that role in somebody else's life, well, that's a very satisfying role to play."

The teacher-student relationship is a repeating motif throughout Joseph's life story, but as he reflected on the teacher's role as an authority figure, he described a sense of unease:

> Being a teacher in a classroom puts you in a power position because by being there, the students automatically convey authority to you by accepting what you say, by believing that the way you think about something is the correct way of thinking. And sometimes I am not comfortable with that. I want to be in a place where there is more of an exchange, more of an interaction. How can we think about this?

To promote this interaction, Joseph developed a methodological framework that he uses with his music and humanities students. He described this process as "encountering information," then "penetrating the surface" of the information for importance thus freeing the students to use the knowledge to be productive and construct meaning. This is the working model in his philosophy of teaching, and he commented, "It's not so much what I teach but what I communicate to the students about learning" that is important. "Getting an education is about learning how to learn in order to make sense out of all that amorphous stuff." Joseph is working from a place of connectedness, a place where all of

these aspects converge in order to construct meanings. Teachers who work in the complex world of intercultural understanding must be able to negotiate a large web of connections and by so doing, become stronger intellectually, emotionally, and spiritually.

Joseph's experiences as a Jewish minority are very different from mine as a white Christian in the United States. I described three stages in my growing awareness of diversity in the world. The first stage of Experiential Awakening took place in the seventh grade when I had a teacher who shared with me the worldview of Paraguay. This generated Interactive Comprehending which later led to Global Immersing when I sought out relationships with some Cuban refugees in my eighth grade year and then studied Spanish and Latin in high school and college.

For Joseph, these three stages happened at a much younger age and almost simultaneously. He was born into a family that suffered the loss of many family members in the Holocaust. His father, as a first generation American, fought in Germany, France, and Belgium against those who had tortured and destroyed his family members. Joseph's family experience about being Jewish included a profound sense of loss and disconnection. Although his parents were never explicit about the individuals who died, "the Holocaust was ever present in [their] lives." He remembers his maternal grandfather, who lost most of his extended family in Eastern Europe, taking him to the synagogue on a regular basis until he was eight years old. His family was stricter in their observance of ritual while his grandfather lived. They kept a kosher home and belonged to a conservative community where Joseph and his two older brothers went to Hebrew school in preparation for Bar Mitzvah. In 1964 when he was still a young child, his

parents sponsored some surviving family members from Eastern Europe to come to America where they stayed in the family's basement apartment for several months.

For Joseph, experiential awakening and interactive comprehension blended with global immersion in his childhood. As his family adapted and communicated with others in an international context, they reshaped the situation of life with creativity, flexibility, assimilation, desire, and civility. This is what his family had to do to survive. Joseph developed comprehension through his experiences with the many members of his family and learned about the world through his Jewish identity, which transcends nationality. His maternal grandmother and parents continued to creatively foster their international Jewish community in their retirement years in Florida where in 1985 they founded a synagogue with a handful of people. It now numbers over 1,500 members. This is their legacy; this and their three sons.

When asked what he would like his legacy to be, Joseph answered, "If you are a productive contributing member to a positive community, that's about all we can hope for. I think that having contact with the students and trying to share my understanding of things with them is a way of doing that." Joseph's comments bring to mind a reflection by Michael Casey (2001), a Benedictine monk from Tarawarra Abbey in Australia:

> It is only when the systems that guarantee normality break down, that we are able to see further prospects. The price of perceiving the possibility of a new and better integration is the disintegration of the status quo . . . . It is only in the context of the harrowing experience of deconstruction that forward movement is initiated. (p. 61)

When students meet people who understand the world in different ways, they are challenged to look critically at their own life stories.

Reflective Incubating

Gather water, fire, and light.

Bring the world to a single point.

Deng Ming-Dao (1992, p. 3)

Joseph believes that the energy of music, meditating, responsive receptivity, and resonating with global conditions are his center. He said, "Music chose me; I wasn't in control of it." Yet he was able to receive what he was given. This capacity of being able to receive through music is the integrative feature of his life. When he took a meditation class a few years ago, he was struck by the similarities between the Zen practice of meditation and the practice of music and described "participating in the discipline, in the service of that discipline" as really amazing. When he teaches music, he is inviting the students into this energy system that means so much to him. In his teaching, the music, the miracle, the indefinable leap, and the meditative practice all come together in service to the student. There is a mystical quality to this experience. What a gift for someone to share with others! The only things that are more valuable to him than music are his human relationships.

While practicing music Joseph bakes bread, combining the ingredients to be transformed and allowing the mixture to rise. He then punches down the dough so it can incubate and rise again before it is set in the indirect heat that radiates around the bread,

the stuff of life. Baking takes time. It nourishes in the most basic way, exciting the senses with aroma, taste, texture, and visual delight. Isabel Allende (1998) described baking as "God's grace" when she said, "Like poetry, baking is a rather melancholy vocation whose primary requirement is free time for the soul" (p. 127).

While reading some reflections on Christian Benedictine spirituality by Michael Casey (2001), I found this description of humility, and it reminded me of Joseph. "Humility is receptivity because we need to be acted on by others in grace" (p. 56). As I review my eight stage orienting framework, I am dismayed to find no reference to humility. Perhaps this is because humility involves a relationship with authority that causes me some discomfort. But Casey described the Latin root of authority as *augere* which indicates one who nourishes the growth and prosperity of others. He said, "It is not about the needs of the one in authority but about the situation of those on whose behalf authority is exercised" (p. 101). Teachers can help each other through shared reflection. And so my understanding of Reflective Incubating is not only affirmed but greatly expanded ─ with humility.

Critical Analyzing

> If any man would be happy, and not broken by Fate, Wisdom is the thing he should seek, for happiness hides there.
>
> Sophocles, *Antigone*, *Lines 926-930*

When I observed Joseph interacting with a class, I discovered that he is a good critical thinker in that he has a "pervasive organizing core of mental habits and skills [that

are] a shaping force in [his] character" (Paul, 1990, p. 93). Just as Freire's critical theory calls for social action in praxis against injustice, Joseph is committed to serious social involvement and attempts to model good critical thinking for his students as well as challenge them to analytical engagement. He believes that clarity in thought leads to more enlightened value judgments about the realities of the world and that we need others to stimulate and enliven our critical abilities through written and verbal discourse.

This is exemplified in a classroom observation that took place one very cold morning in February. As I enter one of Joseph's classes in ancient humanities, the students are talking about the weather, their cars, jobs, and work schedules as they assemble at 9 a.m. The first question they ask is whether they can be off the following Monday for President's Day. One student asks if the class is going to be boring and if he should leave. Joseph listens and responds with gentle teasing and good humored quips as he hands back homework papers. When he introduces the topic for the day, they stop talking and become very attentive. The lesson is on the 5th century B.C.E. classical Greek play, *Antigone,* to which the students are to respond with written papers. Joseph reminds them not to just summarize the story but to explore its basic conflicts. The class is organized to help the students understand critical analysis as a tool for breaking through collective illusions. Critical Analyzing is the fifth stage in my working framework of global consciousness, and I am very interested in how Joseph models and promotes it in his classroom.

He begins by immersing the students in the world of ancient Greece with rich descriptive language that helps them better understand the characters situated in another time and place. He then focuses on the specific relationship between the art of drama and

religious ritual in this ancient worldview. He uses Socratic dialogue, a technique of ethical inquiry introduced in classical Greece, to engage the students. He asks them the purpose of religious rituals in this specific culture and uses their various responses to move to some other applications around the world, finally defining religious rituals in general as "supernaturalistic expressions in recognition of forces that are greater than human." He says that these help us "to become mindful in a different state of affairs." He explains the idea that this state of mindfulness can help us better critique our own situations, just as Antigone had to critique hers when she wished to give her brother funeral rites against the mandate of the king. Joseph explores how her allegiance to her brother interfered with her obedience to the laws of the state in time of war, putting her life and the lives of her loved ones at risk. Because of her own sense of integrity, honor, and mindfulness, she saw the world differently than those around her.

Joseph then asks, "What is a person allowed to do in relation to the state?" The students answer with various examples, including September 11, 2001, and that leads to further questions, examples, and arguments. This kind of critique using aesthetic expressions from other societies in the past is important because it gives students different points of reference from which to view their own contemporary socio-political situations. Paul (1990) wrote about the importance of critical thinking:

> We do not . . . experience a wide variety of societies and then make a comparative judgment based on independent standards. Rarely do we learn to think within the frame of reference of any group or society other than our own. Rather we begin with a host of prejudgments that we and ours are best, and then interpret and experience the events of our world upon the basis of these prejudgments. Not

> only our thinking but our very identity becomes shaped by thought and experience grounded in prejudgment. If someone questions or criticizes our family, religion, or nation we usually feel personally attacked and rush to the defense. Once they become part of our personal and social identity, prejudices are hard to admit and even harder to dislodge. (p. 161)

By using thinking methods and moral quandaries from the ancient Western tradition and then relating them to contemporary issues, Joseph provides the students with opportunities to probe assumptions underlying their reasoning and identities. This strengthens their abilities to see themselves through multiple lenses, past and present, and is less threatening than contemporary global examples might be.

This historical and aesthetic approach helps students consider ideas and situations more objectively because they do not react as emotionally to cautionary tales from the past as they do to current events. Once they begin to think from more than one perspective, it is possible to introduce even more multiplicity. Throughout the hour, Joseph successfully uses a powerful combination of literature, humor, and Socratic dialogue to promote critical analysis from multiple points of view.

Paradoxical Synthesizing

> Laughter is to the psyche what jogging is to the body
>
> Melvin Helitzer (1987, p. 2)

Joseph understands humor; he is one of the funniest people I have ever met. I rarely have a conversation with him that does not result in laughter. He has a profound

sense of irony and responds with gentle humor. I have never heard him use humor in a cruel way, and I was very impressed with how he used it with his students in the classroom. He understands "good humor" which can be described as "a paradox ─ the unexpected juxtaposition of the reasonable next to the unreasonable ─ that creates surprise" (Helitzer, p. 37).

Humor professor, Helitzer (1987), wrote *Comedy Writing Secrets* to use in teaching his college classes at Ohio University. After hearing him on one of the morning news shows, I wrote to ask about creating a unit on humor and the humanities. He responded with an autographed copy of his book and then listed me as an expert on humor in the back of his subsequent publications. I began getting calls and letters from all over the country. This is one of the most humorous things that ever happened to me, especially since I do not consider myself to be a very funny person. But I treasure the inscription in the front of his book that says, "Good luck on your humor projects. We all need to laugh a bit more and cry a lot less. Your work will help!"

In the stage of Paradoxical Synthesizing, I never mention humor, and yet "good humor" is whole system thinking. Humor involves playing with the paradoxes without losing integrity, and it helps with cross-cultural negotiations in the midst of commotion. Humor is thinking and feeling outside the box and collapses rigid either/or thinking. Helitzer claimed that a "Minority upbringing, filled with uncertainty, anxiety, warding off hostility, and catering to an in-group uniqueness, is fertile topsoil for humor" (p. 297). Perhaps Joseph's life history has contributed to the comedic person he is now. His gift for humor definitely makes him a more effective teacher.

Helitzer included one of his class handouts when he sent me his book, and on this handout he listed the benefits of using "good humor" with the students. The ones that I observed Joseph using in the classroom were: creating attentiveness and interest; promoting a playful and positive attitude; building a feeling of unity; motivating with gentle teasing; and generating ideas, creativity and divergent thinking. He also used humor to promote class discussion, help the students with the retention of material, and establish a student-teacher rapport, even when the students were being difficult and contentious. For example, he brought them to attention by talking about the rituals of Dionysus and Bacchus, the Greek and Roman gods of wine. With spring break coming, the students became more involved in the class because of Joseph's humor about exuberant drinking festivals, like the annual Mardi Gras with which the students are very familiar. He then led them into considering the profound sacrifices that follow this kind of exuberance, using Lent and the crucifixion of Christ as examples. Of course, Easter then follows in the Christian liturgical calendar as an example of the cycle of rebirth. Christ's sense of personal responsibility then led the class back to Antigone and her willingness to sacrifice for her beliefs. Humor allowed Joseph to move from the profane to the profound with graceful ease.

Joseph also appreciates humor in his students. I realized later that the student who asked if he should leave because the class might be boring was attempting humor, and Joseph responded to him saying, "Well, you can't get enough of a good thing." This was a profound truth humorously stated in this context. Humor helps people move outside their own realities. Joseph discussed this, saying, "Students are so accustomed to thinking about their own reality as **the** reality, as the only way to think. One of the things

I like about teaching is giving them the opportunity to get outside of themselves." He believes this is absolutely necessary if one is to gain a global perspective and participate in global citizenship as an interdependent web of international relationships.

Enlightened Valuing

Assalamu Alaikum

(Peace be unto you)

Joseph identified one of the greatest ironies of his life as the day he was asked by a young Iranian-American student to be the faculty sponsor for the newly formed Muslim Student Association. Joseph had finished his lecture on the mystical Muslim Sufi music of Qawwali with footage of the ecstatic meditative dancing of the Whirling Dervishes when the student approached him. Joseph revealed that he was Jewish, and the student responded that this was just fine. When I asked Joseph why he agreed to do it, he said laughingly:

> It was just too good to pass up. OK, here's an opportunity to do something that I certainly never imagined crossing my path, and the students were sincere and earnest and aware, and it seemed like they were really interested. I guess through my presentation of Qawwali music, they had a sense that I was sensitive to the cultural aspects of Islam, and I guess they thought they could trust me.

This ability to commit and collaborate reflects Enlightened Valuing. This involves caring and valuing through empathy for others beyond the politics of location and difference. It requires the welcoming of ambiguity in human relationships as well as the balancing of

reality's spiritual and material dimensions. But I did not include the word, trust, as Joseph does. Trust is the value that makes all others possible.

Joseph described his experience as very "interesting and satisfying" because of the diversity of the MSA group. The students are very diverse in their families' countries of origin in that they represent Syria, Iran, Libya, Jordan, Pakistan, Palestine, and Morocco. What they have in common is Islam and American citizenship. Joseph believes that he might not have been accepted as readily by Muslim students of foreign nationality. He said, "I suspect that they would not agree to have a Jewish faculty member as an advisor as they have done here." He appreciates how the whole group has accepted him and is thankful for that saying, "For the members of this MSA, the United States is home."

As a result of working with the MSA, Joseph and other advisors obtained some grant money to present a conference in the college on "Learning about Islam: Realities and Perceptions." Hundreds of people attended, and Joseph reflected, "I definitely think it was the right thing to do. Because people have been indoctrinated into a flawed ideology, doesn't mean that we have to give up on them." When I asked what he meant by "flawed," he responded:

> I mean if people are indoctrinated into believing that one group is the problem in the world compared to another, that's a flawed ideology. It's not about groups of people who think the wrong way. Everybody, to a certain extent, is guilty of this. . . . I have to say on the top five list of things that I do at the college, being part of that group is one of the most important.

In describing this opportunity to work with the students, he said, "I think it is a chance to expand the possibility of who I am. I am honored to be part of it because it allows me access to perspectives that I wouldn't have otherwise." He asserted, "Global citizenship is a birthright. It is part of who I am. It is also part of my teaching because you can't separate your own identity from what you teach."

He has experienced some internal juggling as a result of his commitment to understanding the world from an intercultural perspective. He revealed that it has made him feel inadequate "because there is so much I don't know." The biggest challenge involves increased awareness and integrating global content in new and meaningful ways. He likes to point out that whether you are teaching ancient China or Mesopotamia or America, "diversity is just inherent in different cultures." He believes we have to help students today understand why people in other cultures do things differently if we are going to be "globally literate."

The process is important because it fosters tolerance which he considers to be "a supreme value." Tolerance allows us to confront the unknown with something more constructive than fear:

> I think it is a great value to teach because you stop seeing other people as simply "other" and just as people with a different solution to essentially the same problem. And you do understand them rather than fear them or mock them.

The personal characteristics that he values and tries to promote in the journey of interculturalism are "openness, tolerance, respect, and inquisitiveness into the way things are." He believes that we must understand that we all do "strange and inexplicable things." He described all of us as having the capacity for being shortsighted, fearful,

ignorant and capable of acting in ways that are not necessarily productive, and said, "I really want [students] to embrace the notion that it is their responsibility to figure out what's right and what's wrong."

Wioleta Polinska (2006) discussed this idea that we all share responsibility for the suffering in the world because we can all do something to stop it. Thus, we are all complicit. When we dehumanize others, we are dehumanized. The well-being of each person is interlinked with the well-being of every other, and when we recognize this, we begin to work in reconciliation rather than retaliation. Meditation helps us understand the degree of violence that exists within ourselves and what we are bringing to the situation. "Meditation does not help us escape the situation but brings us back to it" (Polinska).

Joseph understands how the arts and humanities can help students make decisions about how to value different aspects of the world. He said that one important aspect that deserves attention has to do with the real value of a college education:

> Young people are being told that the function of education in our society is material ─ so that you can achieve success at a material level. But, some things cannot be understood in economic terms. Historically, those material things are not the way value is determined in society. What is of concern to people is understanding the nature of our being, understanding how we act in the world and how we relate to one another. How do we do good? Those are values.

He asserted that you cannot make sense of all the diversity of cultures and the challenges people have had to face with some kind of equation. It is a much more nuanced process full of "variable proportions all the time. Work is both accomplishing a task and understanding a purpose. You have to do both."

Teaching from the Heart

To teach is to create a space in which the community of truth is practiced.

Parker Palmer (1998, p. 90)

The Courage to Teach, Palmer (1998), is an exploration of how teachers draw sustenance in their careers by "teaching from a heart of hope" (p. 163). In our last major interview together, Joseph and I talked about justice and its relationship to power as the sustaining energy in his work with the students. He asked:

> What is justice about in our society? What is it about in our society in relation to other societies? How do people with the ability to influence the lives of other people wield that power and is it being used justly? How can we create more justice? How can we avoid the abuse of power?

Joseph then referenced Jesus of Nazareth and his teachings on "doing unto others as you would have them do unto you." He believes that what Jesus had to say was not as much about washing away sins but about how we need to treat other people, "It's not about who is powerful and not powerful. It's about taking care of one another and living a just, meaningful life." From Joseph's perspective, Jesus was not the first to talk about the "golden rule" nor will he be the last. "But people don't pay much more attention to it when Jesus says it than when Karl Marx says it."

I added, "Or when John Lennon says it."

Joseph and I laughed at this point, and then he continued "That doesn't mean we should stop saying it. When you stop saying it, then things have really gotten bad."

I asked, “Is that our job as teachers, to keep saying it?”

He answered:

> I think it is. I think we have a certain responsibility to the moral consciousness of society, kind of like being a minister, I guess, or a clergyman. I can’t resist the opportunity to point out some of the shortcomings of systems that encourage the abuse of power.

He described how the notion of power has been understood in different ways by different cultures throughout human history and how the industrialized societal model is not always a very pleasant picture. “There are always people who have been exploited and manipulated, who suffer under the system. And that is one of my least favorite things about the society that we live in, that there is this callousness about the nature of power.”

He discussed how Americans are not comfortable with poor people, and try to live as if they don’t really exist, “We’d rather not be bothered by the realization that this inequity in society exists.” He pointed out two options. You can look around and say that you cannot do anything about it, so you’re just going to get what you can. Or “you can live your life in such a way that you model a more just example of how one should wield one’s power.” The “haves” and “have-nots” are always part of the story, but that doesn’t mean that the “haves” should just pretend that the have-nots don’t exist. He explained:

> The way the power-elite of our society want to communicate value is always in economic terms. Everything has to be understood in economic terms, and that rationalizes and justifies whatever it is they do. It is a complete misconception that one can put a dollar value on what is important. We need to have productive

people; we need to have knowledgeable people. We need to have well-trained people because work has become more complicated than ever before. This is where the idea of teaching students how to negotiate the multi-faceted nature of reality comes in, and this gets us back to where we started. Do you have some higher level of thinking that you can engage that will allow you to make sense of all the different things that we have to contend with all the time?

For teachers, Joseph's "higher level of thinking" means living in interactive transformative relationships with students that go beyond providing information. This involves sacrificing material wealth and personal ego in service to higher values like justice. It means embodying grace in action and playing a role in the power structure in order to change social reality for the better. Freire, a Brazilian educationalist who launched literacy programs among the peasant peoples in the early 1960s, discussed this kind of consciousness in his critical social theory. Freire believed that it is through human beings that the world has come into consciousness because men and women are constantly shaping and re-shaping the conditions of life. This self-creating involves the mutuality of reflection, intentionality, and action (1972a, p. 99). It is in the praxis of reflection and intention that "conscientisation" (1972b, p. 78) develops as people move toward greater humanization. Change can only take place in the action that happens in and among human beings, and it involves continual reinterpreting and reinventing through a "permanent process of self-scrutiny" (p. 83). Conscientisation is a form of critical thinking that understands reality as process and transformation.

Joseph commented that this kind of "higher level of thinking" means constantly subjecting yourself to relationships with others. "It's never good enough. You search.

You strive for the highest possible level, but you can never attain perfection. The battering your ego takes in the process of becoming a musician or an academic can be really punishing." David Smith (1999) explained the complexity of this process:

> To be a teacher . . . requires that I face my Teacher, which is the world as it comes to me in all of its variegation, complexity and simplicity. When I do this, I face myself, and see myself reflected in the faces of my brothers and sisters everywhere. (p. 24)

This is what it means to teach in service to higher values like justice.

Joseph described a conversation he once had with his Palestinian colleague, Ali. Joseph began with a question, "Ali, would you want to live in a secular society like the United States or in a theocratic context that was Muslim?" Ali responded that he wanted to live where there was justice. Joseph said that knowing Ali lost his home in Jerusalem due to a political decision and having Ali to talk to and reflect with gives him a real sense of what a Palestinian's experience is all about. Thus, Palestinians are no longer just people who want to destroy the Jewish state; they are no longer objectified as the abstract "other." "It is a lot easier to objectify if you don't engage with the other side, with people who view things differently." Joseph continued, saying that it also gives you a chance to ask another person "How do you see me?" You have to be able to view how a Christian or a Muslim sees Jewish people to really understand. Then you have to confront the fact that there are options in the world, other value systems, other ways of seeing and doing things.

At the beginning of every semester, Joseph tells the students, "The textbook you are reading is biased. Everybody brings a perspective to what they are talking about,

consciously or unconsciously. You have to take that into consideration with regard to everything you hear, and that includes me." This is an important lesson for the students to learn if they are going to stand against oppression because those with less power internalize the so-called truths of those who are stronger, like politicians, the media, corporations, and teachers. Education should be about promoting the ability to think critically so that we can break away from the habits and practices that no longer function well in a global society. Joseph commented, "I think it's good for them to be able to recognize that I don't know everything. That's a valid and valuable learning experience." He continued, "It's better to say 'Let's see if we can find the answer to that question' than just assuming an authoritative position without qualification." This approach promotes awareness and self-confidence and resonates with Palmer (1998) when he said, "To teach is to create a space in which the community of truth is practiced" (p. 90). A teacher who presents himself as the knower of all truth is lying. Palmer (1998) wrote:

> I am often tempted to protect my sense of self behind barricades of status or role, to withhold myself from colleagues or students or ideas and from the collisions we will surely have. When I succumb to that temptation, my identity and integrity are diminished – and I lose the heart to teach. (p. 16)

Maintaining the energy of the heart requires an ongoing commitment to grappling with the personal complexities of identity and integrity in service to the process of truth-finding. It also requires a commitment to live encounters with the students.

Palmer (1998) believes the main challenge of reaching beyond homogeneous boundaries involves fear:

> This fear of the live encounter is actually a sequence of fears that begins in the fear of diversity. As long as we inhabit a universe made homogeneous by our refusal to admit otherness, we can maintain the illusion that we possess the truth about ourselves and the world ─ after all, there is no 'other' to challenge us! But as soon as we admit pluralism, we are forced to admit that ours is not the only standpoint, the only experience, the only way, and the truths we have built our lives on begin to feel fragile. (p. 38)

Palmer described how these live encounters and creative conflicts continuously challenge us to change our lives. Global understanding involves the ability to create connectedness across difference. This connectedness is not about cultural homogeneity but about mutual interactions that change everyone involved as they participate in creative human initiatives. So embracing life as a teacher means committing to a lifetime of personal change in service to developing greater truthfulness in a pluralistic world. Thomas Merton (1955) in his book, *No Man Is an Island*, asserted, "Sincerity is fidelity to the truth," and continued, "Truth is the life of our intelligence" (p. 191). He believed:

> In the end, the problem of sincerity is a problem of love. A sincere man is not so much one who seeks the truth and manifests it as he sees it, but one who loves the truth with a pure love. But truth is more than an abstraction. It lives and is embodied in men and things that are real. And the secret of sincerity is, therefore, not to be sought in a philosophical love for abstract truth but in a love for real people and real things. (p. 198)

Joseph's most sincere reality involves music in human relationship. It is the key to his most passionate and truth-finding self. Although Joseph does not use the word, love, his

passion for music as transcendent and revelatory seems to resonate with some aspects of Universalizing Love. Therefore, in the next chapter I attempt to illuminate the art of music and its power in Joseph's life.

CHAPTER 5

ABANDONING THE BOUNDARIES: THE MUSIC OF THE SPHERES

> The arts do more than bring or bestow peace; they communicate fire.
>
> Irwin Edman (1967, p. 25)

The ancient Greek philosopher, Pythagoras, believed that numbers provide the key to understanding the universe. He argued that since music embodies numbers in ratios and proportions, music exemplifies the harmony of the universe. He also drew an analogy between a vibrating, finely tuned string and the human mind and body. If the string is stretched too tightly, it will break; and if the string is too slack it will be unresponsive. He believed the mind (as musical tone) must function in harmony with the body (as tensed string). So when the human being functions in harmony, this will resonate with the cosmic music of the spheres or planets themselves. Music is Joseph's passion. I have seen him in public performance, and whether he is in a large symphony hall, a Christmas concert in a cathedral, or a rousing Celtic festival, a radiant and sublime energy surrounds him. He plays with a gentle half-smile. He laughingly calls it his "game face," but it is obviously much more. He knows he is sharing the most important energy in his life with others. For him, music is serious theology, or in Greek, the *logos* of the *theos,* the logic of God.

Even as a young child, Joseph was attuned to the fact that "music communicates and expresses things that just can't be expressed in other ways. It's not subject to the hierarchy of organized religious structures [but] it seems to nonetheless express the same central human need." He believes music to be "the greatest experience of his life" because it allowed him to have all kinds of experiences that brought him to his teachers and other individuals who are so important. Beginning guitar lessons in third or fourth grade, Joseph was playing the electric bass by seventh grade. He also played the trumpet, but could not continue when he got braces on his teeth and had to change to the larger mouth piece of the tuba, the bass of the orchestra. In his last semester of high school, he decided to go to college as a music major but did not feel he played anything well enough, so he began private lessons in the string bass which became the instrument of his professional music career. "It's like it chose me more than anything else. There is something about the bass."

In high school, Joseph started listening to and loving Jazz, and was especially inspired by John Coltrane**.** Lamm (1996) described Jazz as a fusion of elements of African, European, and American musical cultures. "It evolved out of three centuries of cultural and racial conflict, a clash between an inflexible dominant culture and a powerful and persistent subculture with its own age-old beliefs and customs" (p. 527). Although a communal experience, a built-in conflict of musical styles lies at the root of Jazz between African-European melody, European harmony, African rhythm, and African-European tone color. As a performance art, it depends on collaboration and innovation at the same time. Through variety, it creates harmony.

Joseph once wrote about the Russian composer, Stravinsky, and his use of myth "as a tool of self-reflection" in his musical theater production, *Persephone.* Joseph argued that in both Russian-Slavic and Western myths, Stravinsky "found a medium that could accommodate consistently and over the length of virtually his whole career, the type of universal expression that is elemental to his music." Joseph traced the path of musical/theatrical works in Stravinsky's early years through his development as "a deracinated Russian to his reorientation as a Gallicized cosmopolitan European." Stravinsky left Russia to work in Europe because of his hatred for the Soviet-communist revolution and would lose all ties with his native Russia by the end of the 1930s.

In writing about Stravinsky, Joseph chose the 1934 production of the redemptive story of Persephone which comes from one of the earliest of the ancient Greek Homeric hymns. The goddess, Demeter, had an only daughter, Persephone, the maiden of the spring. While gathering flowers, Persephone is abducted by Hades, the dark lord of the underworld. Demeter, goddess of the harvest, is grief-stricken and wanders the world searching for her daughter as the earth turns into a frozen desert. Zeus demands that Hades release Persephone, but Hades tricks her into eating pomegranate seeds, the symbolic food of the dead. Thus, she is required to return to the underworld for one third of each year. The remainder of the year, she may remain with her mother in the world of the living. Demeter is reconciled, and the crops begin to grow again (Richardson, 1979). The land prospers through the sorrows and sacrifices of Demeter and Persephone. Demeter grieves for her daughter in the winter when she goes to the underworld, and then rejoices in her springtime return. Persephone loses her youthful innocence in the realms of the dead, but becomes more powerful and awesome as a result of her experiences.

The power of the lowest register of the bass, the tautness of the strings, the creation of harmony out of diversity in an orchestra, the clash of a sub-culture with a dominant majority in Jazz, and the growth of wisdom and prosperity out of sorrow and suffering in the musical story of Persephone ─ these are some of the motifs that resonate most strongly in Joseph's passionate musical journey. These choices have tempered and strengthened him into a strong yet resilient vessel that can withstand the fiery demands and complexities of the teaching profession in a global 21st century. Joseph explained his experience:

> There are two aspects to being a performing musician. One is the discipline of developing your facility to execute your art. And then there is the other when you're actually engaged in the process of performing the work of music. Performing a great work of music [with an orchestra] can be an epiphany experience because you are so much part of an organism, and the organism is dedicated to the realization of this artistic ideal. And it is really a complex thing to describe, but everybody is doing something different, yet you are all doing the same thing for the same end. It is a very synergistic kind of experience. And so when you're doing that, sometimes you're just aware that you're executing something you have to do, but then there are these moments when you feel that you really have a sense of the entire organism that is functioning together ─ the orchestra creating an artistic expression in sound. It's ephemeral though. It's not something. I'm sort of struggling for words to describe it because you can't describe what that experience is, but it is really powerful. It is probably as close to a spiritual kind of experience as we can have. People probably have

> experiences like this in certain types of religious contexts. You see people at African churches, and they are singing and dancing, and the whole place is just rocking. People have this kind of group-think experience, and that's the thing you keep craving after, of doing something that is so intensely joyful. You just want to do it again ─ playing a work and really having things come together. It is just beyond description. It is an interesting thing because when you are engaged in something like that, it's an almost ego-less experience, so it doesn't matter who it is you're engaged in the experience with. So it creates a global consciousness because it breaks down barriers between difference, and the difference is completely irrelevant at that point. But I don't know if it addresses the idea of difference. It is a kind of a paradox. As an educator conscious of global characteristics in various kinds of art forms and cultural manifestations, it is difference that's important because different people do different things for a variety of reasons. But this supersedes difference. Maybe it gets down to a more fundamental aspect of humanness. It's a little bit contradictory.

Joseph's passion for creating orchestral harmony out of individual differences resonates with his desire to create intercultural understanding out of a multiplicity of perspectives. Art creates a kind of coherence out of chaos and can be understood as "that whole process of intelligence by which life, understanding its own conditions, turns them to the most interesting and exquisite account" (Edman, 1967, p. 12). In music, one experiences the rise and fall of the progressions, the deviation and resolution of tones in the melody, the sensual, spontaneous moments and the ecstatic possibilities all at once. As Edman (1967) wrote:

> The arts do more than bring or bestow peace; they communicate fire. In the high climaxes of the fine arts, the psyche, condemned in the ordinary circumstances of living to be diffident and constrained, finds a provocation, an outlet, and an excuse for those fires which are ordinarily banked. (p. 25).

Joseph's passion for and training in interpreting, clarifying, and intensifying the world's realities through music help generate his life of teaching and global consciousness. Those rare, joyful moments in which human beings dissolve the boundaries and create harmony out of difference provide glimpses of what is possible. The promise of such joy fires our passion to live in the dynamic energy of paradox and possibility because it is through difference that harmony resounds. The more we experience the different combinations, the more passionate we become to participate in the unity of possibilities. Palmer (1998) described the importance of passion for one's academic discipline saying, "Passion for the subject propels that subject, not the teacher, into the center of the learning circle ─ and when a great thing is in their midst, students have direct access to the energy of learning and life" (p. 120).

Teachers profess to be the instruments through which this passion is shared, but passion is not enough. As Joseph pointed out, personal proficiency is a necessary element in contributing to the quality of the whole experience. And as each musician must listen carefully to the others and strive for excellence, global citizens must attend to others in order to be contributing members of the international community. Joseph said that playing music "speaks to the idea of how in relationship we can transcend ourselves for some greater purpose. I think that sense of communal experience supersedes anything else." I asked him if he ever feels like he hears something like the voice of God in music.

He smiled and said that he thinks it is presumptuous to think we can even begin to perceive God and then added that it is more like "the echo of the voice of God:"

> I say the echo of the voice of God because I know that the music is not the direct product of the divine will, whatever that happens to be, but I think we all are a kind of echo of that. I think we all have the ability to reflect that back in some way.

The longer Joseph teaches, the more he realizes that passion and proficiency are essential not only in music but in the educational process as well. His training has played an important role in showing him that it is important to have a framework, a way to help students access music through its elements. He uses a systematic approach in order "to distill the information in some way" because it is important to develop a kind of intellectual framework for encountering information. Joseph believes it ultimately comes down to meaning and how one constructs meaning in the world:

> Everybody does it differently, but hopefully [I work] in a way that students can see that there is some kind of pattern, some kind of method to the madness and not just a bunch of stuff flying at them from all different directions. I mean that's the problem we're all faced with on a much larger level all the time. So giving them a sense of how to deal with all that stuff is really what I want to do, so that ultimately they don't need me to show them.

Showing them a way to process experience can be very difficult. In the wordless state of music, for example, we feel and think through movement and rest, dissonance and harmony, tension and release, intensity and dissolution, all built upon timed sounds. Understanding aesthetics in every art form involves the relationship of proportions in

mutual accommodation. When we understand these relationships, we begin to understand more about the complexities of the human condition itself. Joseph is interested in such music as East Indian Raga and Muslim Sufi Qawwali because "each is an example of how musical difference is cultural difference." He says that by experiencing these expressions, they become part of his own sense of cultural awareness.

Joseph gave me a book to read in which Merriam (1964) described ethnomusicology or "the study of music in culture" as:

> that music sound [which] is the result of human behavioral processes that are shaped by the values, attitudes, and beliefs of the people who comprise a particular culture. Music sound cannot be produced except by people for other people, and although we can separate the two aspects [the sound aspect and the cultural aspect] conceptually, one is not really complete without the other. Human behavior produces music, but the process is one of continuity; the behavior is shaped to produce music sound, and thus the study of one flows into the other. (p. 6)

Joseph believes that "all musicology is ethnomusicology because all music is a cultural product." He stated with great emphasis:

> Music is not a universal language; it is a universal human experience, and is culturally defined like every other art form. It is another way of more deeply understanding a culture. The interplay between culture and art is so intimate that you cannot separate the two.

He asserted that music can become an experience of intercultural exchange, but it takes a lot of work "to orient oneself in a purely sonic environment." The main thing he wants

his students to do is really listen, "and it is the single hardest thing to get them to do." Edman (1967) wrote, "In music, the sounds that provoke some reverberant response are the only objects upon which that response can be made" (p. 116). Therefore, listening is essential as the beginning experience in music appreciation. How Joseph fosters the students' abilities to listen can best be understood by experiencing one of his classes in music appreciation.

I join Joseph's honors class on a beautiful spring morning in late March. The classroom has a variety of posters displayed, including one of a young Bob Dylan, another of the Beatles, a timeline of great composers, and a picture of a string quartet. The lesson of the day is on form and pattern in various classical music traditions around the world including: Raga in India, American Jazz, and the work of the Father of European classical music, Joseph Haydn. Raga is playing as students enter the classroom and the music of Haydn as they leave. Joseph sits in a circle with the students going over a handout that includes a detailed description of their assignment, information about pattern and form in music, and some vocabulary words. The purpose of the class is to model the listening approach he wants them to follow when analyzing the elements of music.

Joseph begins the lesson in India where listening to music is itself an art, and "requires long training of ear and soul" (Durant, 1963, p. 587). Raga means color, passion, or mood, and its melodies are both limited and infinite because the Hindu musician is like the Hindu philosopher. He starts with the finite and embroiders upon his theme of repetitious notes until he has created "a kind of musical Yoga, a forgetfulness of will and individuality, of matter, space and time; the soul is lifted into an almost mystic

union with something . . . profound, immense and quiet" (Durant, 1963, p. 588). Joseph loves this music because of the open-ended quality of the improvisation. He says, "It's ecstatic music" and that it reminds him of Jazz "because there's a strong spiritual component to that improvisatory quality." Jazz, or African-American Classical Music, also begins with a basic theme from which the performers develop impromptu variations.

As Joseph compares and contrasts these different kinds of classical music, he becomes more and more passionate. The students are very attentive, making comments, asking questions and answering them. Joseph uses every teaching technique, including screen visuals, the CD player, the blackboard, and the textbook. He plays the piano, tells jokes, gestures, asks questions, sings, lectures, and in every way shares his passion for music. With Haydn's "Surprise Symphony," he illustrates the contrasts of soft and loud, regularity and variety, patterns and improvisation. And he does this by playing segments of Haydn's symphony not once, not twice, but fourteen times. He patiently takes the students, element by element, through a skill building exercise in listening discernment. He shows them how these devices are used in pop culture, like TV sitcoms, to "play with our expectations." At this point, he even sings the theme to "The Brady Bunch" for an Asian student who never saw the sitcom as other students laughingly join in. He shares some of Haydn's life story with the students, making the composer more real and not just some romantic, wigged figure from the past. He tells them that Haydn, although brilliant, came from a humble, working class background. Joseph helps the students relate to Haydn as a living, breathing being who was a product of his age but also transcended the times in which he lived through his music. Joseph illustrates Haydn's great sense of humor by playing the "Surprise Symphony" because it lulls with its soft, simple, lightly

textured melody and then sounds a very loud single chord that makes us jump out of our chairs. Joseph describes Haydn's place in the 18th century Austrian Ester hazy as that of a musical servant.

Joseph shares his passion for music and serves the students by awakening their perceptions, employing his methodology, patiently helping each student understand the music in its cultural context, and repeating things over and over in order to live sincerely in service to the truthfulness of the discipline. These are just part of the composition of the merciful art of teaching. Mercy is the step beyond justice and is kin to compassionate love. Joseph is a masterful musician and could focus completely on his own serious proficiency. Instead, he chooses to go back to step one again and again so that each student can begin to share in the power and beauty of aesthetic responsibility. Living this paradox of being free to share his love of music while working within the constraints presented by novices in the art form requires a tremendous generosity of spirit. And yet, after an hour and a half, Joseph is even more enthusiastic than he was at the beginning of class. His spirit seems to resonate with a transcendent energy. When I ask him about this, he says:

> I think there is something about music because the objective of artistic expression, whether it is musical or other, is transcendent. It's transcendent because it's about engaging who we are for a greater realization. It's about contributing your individual part, which is essentially mundane. Can you play the right pitches, play the right articulations? Can you be expressive at all? But ultimately the result is transcendent of that individual contribution. And so the idea is to express something that is not about me. Music has been the thread throughout my

maturity; there is something about music that allows me to access a reality that isn't present in most other phases or aspects of my life.

Joseph's description of music with its corresponding yet paradoxical elements of transcendent freedom and individual expression has implications for human life and society. Music as a system of both possibility and practice becomes an anagram for building global community that requires the ability to envision a good society while acting each day with discipline and dedication. It seems to be in cadence with the expressions of one of my greatest teachers, Winston Weathers, an English literature professor in my graduate humanities program. Dr. Weathers recognizes the power of music to stir the imagination and promote healing in the face of suffering. He is particularly fond of Beethoven who overcame deafness and thoughts of suicide to create his transcendent *9th Symphony*. In 1984, as Weathers reflected on Beethoven's life story and the creative power of his music, he wrote a small book of poems called *Beethoven Meditations* from which the following excerpt is taken:

We search among the ruins for some sign
that life is worth our suffering
in Vietnam, Cambodia, Lebanon . . . .
We piece together the symphonic sound
and pray that, truly, it is a truth,
that somewhere in the mind of man
there is such bicameral light,
the passionate structure within our human art
as we perform the "Eroica" in prison camps,

arrange for the “Ninth” within the asylum walls,

play the “Moonlight” in the darkest summer rooms,

the third floor back, on player pianos

that only half distort the pure idea

he tried to catch on its tenuous wing,

the angel that flamed in the sky

across the inconsolable landscape of his heart. (p. 6)

The awesome mysteries of aesthetic expression and its ability to awaken our imaginations and devotion are always elusive, yet we attempt to understand and share them with others. Joseph believes, “Music is not just abstract sound that may in some way alter consciousness. It is also a discipline for me.” His active participation and proficiency elevates the experience into something “really amazing.” For him, it is so important that he is willing to come back every semester to share some small part of it with his students because, “One of the great miracles of music is that people can sit and listen or dance or whatever they do and understand on some level.” He wants to deepen that level of appreciation so that music can become more meaningful for them as it has for him. This requires living within the tension of the finite characteristics and the infinite possibilities of sound and silence.

When my visual art students encounter a painting or sculpture, they must learn to see and then live within the ambiguity of meanings that exists between the lines and spaces of the artists’ creative endeavors. Likewise, any person who is growing in global citizenship must develop the attitude and aptitude for living in a filigree of complex human realities. Joseph once said, “The arts are an essential source of beauty in our lives

and are indispensable for their role in providing meaning to our increasingly chaotic existence. They are central to who we are as people."

In spite of the challenges, Joseph likes teaching because he hopes a few students will look back on his classes and feel that they learned valuable things. He finds it sustaining to teach the arts and humanities because they are of ultimate value, transcending popularity and fads:

> I always start out by posing the ideas of the big questions because everyone knows what they are. What are we doing here? How did we get here? What happens when we die?" It is never going to go out of style to ask who we are and why we do what we do. Pursuing those questions and positing possible answers is infinitely interesting . . . . The idea of introducing students to important subjects, experiences, and ideas ─ it is kind of a privilege, in a sense, to be the first one to challenge them to think about really important concepts and notions. And that just leads down the path. It doesn't matter if you're talking about the ancient Mesopotamians, the Chinese, or Western Europeans in the 20th century. We all have the same questions. It's exciting when the students start seeing the world from a different sort of model.

Although the power of Joseph's teaching spirit in musical aesthetic action transcends my orienting framework of global consciousness, he does inspire me to live in the wonder and tension of new questions and possibilities.

One of the biggest problems I face as a teacher is that the students come to me with little or no curiosity about the world. They are provided with answers before they have the chance to formulate any questions. Joseph's story illustrates how education in

the arts can reawaken their wonder about the awesome and dynamic possibilities in their lives and the world. Van Manen (1994) addressed this saying:

> In every experience of meaning there is a certain orientedness to the transcendent, something that is not immediately given and that escapes to a certain extent cognitive clarity . . . . An ordinary musical melody may sometimes be charged with a certain vitality and significance so that it touches and speaks to us with special meaning. We experience this meaning as the evocation of deeper significance or richer understanding of life. (p. 17)

Artistic expressions can inspire the students to new quests for meaning. When wonder is awakened they begin to move, to question, and to take their own creative journeys. In reflecting on the importance of awesome aesthetic experience, Joseph said, "The arts express those thoughts, visions, ideas, and ideals that are central to the human experience regardless of place and time. It is the timeless and timely content of artistic expression that accounts for its intrinsic value." Awe and wonder go beyond the abstraction of the phenomena into the specific "awareness of individuality ─ its subjectivity, its existence, and, consequently, our existence. Wonder is a form of participating with the time and being of the other" (Huebner, 1959/1999, pp. 6-7). Reawakening the capacity for wonder in students may be the most important challenge a college teacher faces today. And because this visionary quality challenges abstract theorizing, I turn to my wise teacher, Winston Weathers:

> And what is this creativity? What are we to do?
>
> We are to invest ourselves, our personality, in the world around us. To write our signature in the "guest book" of the universe. To leave our fingerprints on the

glassy surfaces of passing days. To **listen** to the Pieta, to **touch** a Schumann sonata, to **dance** the color blue and the color red, to **fill our eyes** with fragrances of oleander, to **drink** the thunder of evening clouds, to **talk** with stars. (1975, p. 8)

CHAPTER 6

A REORIENTING FRAMEWORK OF GLOBAL CONSCIOUSNESS

> Such passages, such a dialogue, such a cross-cultural inquiry, does not intend to achieve consensus but aims at a deeper and richer understanding of each, providing space for multiplicity and contradiction which can further generate more . . . passages.
>
> Hongyu Wang (2004, p. 16)

Learning about Joseph through his life story has been an honor and a privilege. It has also challenged me to reflect on my own worldviews and teaching practices. Joseph is still in his first decade as a faculty member and reminds me of what it is like when starting out in the teaching profession. He also has many personal qualities and experiences, especially in his life as an accomplished musician that I do not. Our work on this project in global consciousness has provided me with new insights, served as a venue for shared knowledge, and informed my professional practice in the arts and humanities (Marshall, 2006, p. 5). Although we as teachers cannot hope to understand all the aspects of globalization, we can know it better and we can be a better part of it.

In beginning this process, I realized that I could not attempt to understand someone else without coming to a more conscious awareness of myself and my own

paradigm or "way of breaking down the complexities of the real world" (Lincoln & Guba, 1985, p. 15). So, I narrated my story of global consciousness through an orienting framework of eight stages in order to understand my paradigm of meaning-making better. This allowed me to meet my fellow teacher with more integrity and discernment, and it has provided many new insights into the differences in our development, even in childhood. Whereas my experience in global consciousness began in my adolescence in the early 1960s as a slow, sequential growth over many years with Experiential Awakening, then Interactive Comprehending, and later Global Immersing, Joseph's began with his birth in 1959 into an international Jewish energy system that involved all three of these stages simultaneously. He came from an extended international family of disrupted relationships due to holocaust. Whereas I, as a member of a white majority, always had a choice of whether or not to participate in interculturalism, Joseph had no such option. African-American poet, Lucille Clifton (2006), described the importance of cross-cultural childhood experiences:

> Every human, and every child particularly, needs a window through which he can see the world and a mirror in which he can see himself. In those days when it was primarily black and white in our culture, white children had mirrors and that's all they had. They were disadvantaged because they didn't see anything but mirrors. Children of color had only windows so they didn't see anything but others . . . . I think it's important for everybody to have a view of themselves as part of this world and a view of others in this world. (p. 16)

As we live out our lives in the presence of one another globally, we must be able to see ourselves, see others, and be seen as well; then perhaps patriotism will involve a more

enlightened treatment of others, and children will grow up in a world in which they do not have to choose between being destroyed and becoming the destroyer.

Hershock (1994) wrote, "The gathering with which we identify ourselves is actually a learned process of simply divorcing that over which 'I' cannot exercise direct control" (p. 691). Becoming conscious of this tendency to divorce others has become an everyday challenge for me. How many people or groups of people do I dismiss and why? Do I see them, hear them? Is my class only a mirror of myself? Are there windows? What am I saying to the students about the peoples of the world when I plan our class time together, choose a textbook, create a lesson, or make a list of topics for them? Who do I include? Who is left out? And how do individual students experience my choices? Every day is a milestone on the journey of global consciousness.

Perhaps the most important lesson that has emerged for me in this process is the lesson on humility. I had never thought about humility as receptivity before. Joseph's wisdom about the importance of humility and his willingness to receive whatever came from the storytelling process in this project modeled academic humility. I realize that I must add humility to my understanding of Reflective Incubating, and that it is the very centerpiece of meditation, prayer, aesthetic responsibility, and the teaching/learning community itself. Much is given to us as academic professionals in the world, but are we open to receiving it? The key characteristic that we must foster in ourselves is the receptivity of humility, yet many academics seem to be lacking in this important quality. Indeed, many academics seem to confuse humility with humiliation and then spread this through the system of administrators, teachers, students, and the wider community. Sharing our various stories with each other throughout the educational system can help us

develop a healthier sense of humility which will in turn result in a healthier, less arrogant global citizenry. The very term "humility" is related to the word *humus* and points to our connectedness with the earth and those who inhabit it. "Humble people are down to earth; they are not alienated from their own nature. They accept their origins and are content" (Casey, 2001, p.1). Humility is an important part of sharing the story of globalization because it involves the ability to really listen to and acknowledge the importance of others. Newman (2006) writing about the current role of America in global economic affairs for the *U. S. News and World Report* said, "For all the talk about what to do ─ which is likely to get louder in the years ahead – it may simply take a national dose of humility before America musters its famed resolve and strives once again for global leadership" (p. 56). Arrogance is a national disease that we, as Americans, must address in all aspects of life, but especially in education. We must realize that we cannot impose the same set of rules on different world markets, educational institutions, eco-systems, cultures, and socio-political systems. One size does not fit all.

Although the stage of Critical Analyzing remains basically intact after this research project (probably because there is such a strong emphasis on this in European and American education), I have gained insights into how the critical study of aesthetic expressions from the past can be a springboard into the present. Observing Joseph as he worked to help the students break through their prejudices was very illuminating. I like his written assignment so much that I have adapted it, with his permission, for my own classes. The students relate to the young Antigone and see the hubris in King Creon's close-minded ruling. The play ends in the tragic death of not only Antigone, but also

Creon's own son and heir. Thus, the students learn that there are implications to close-mindedness, not only in the present but for the future as well. I can see why some faculty members never move beyond examples from the Western tradition because they are helpful and less threatening, but the students need more because the prejudices of nations have global implications. Paul (1990) observed:

> The deep-seated problems of environmental change, new complex health problems, worsening human relations, diminishing resources, overpopulation, rising expectations, global competition, and ideological conflict increasingly interact with each other to produce a host of multidimensional, logically messy problems. Our survival as a species demands that the higher potential of human critical thought be significantly tapped. The ability to recognize national prejudice and prejudiced thinking requires cultivation. (p. 167)

Critically analyzing our own personal and cultural prejudices is an important step in global consciousness. How we respond to the complex realities of our times will determine the fate of America and the world. As Diamond (2006) pointed out, history warns us that once-powerful societies have quickly collapsed because of the damage people have inflicted on the environment, climate changes, enemies, changes in friendly trading partners, and society's responses to political, economic, and social change (p. 30). Because of advances in technology, we have the ability to learn from the mistakes and successes of societies in the past as well as those geographically removed from us in the present.

The stage of Paradoxical Synthesizing has been greatly enriched through my talks with Joseph. He has given me a better understanding of the roles of humor and aesthetics

in the development of global citizenship. Humor is both/and thinking and is a strong antidote to arrogance and fear. Humor allows us to play with the power of paradox. Helitzer (1987) wrote, "It's psychologically impossible to hate someone with whom you've laughed" (p. 2). He also taught how a person can learn the art of humor because it has structure, and its mechanics include a list of formulae, a wide variety of techniques, and practice (p. 5).

Not only humor, but all of the arts are important vehicles through which both/and thinking can develop. Living within the various tensions that exist in aesthetic compositions can provide important lessons in Paradoxical Synthesizing. The practice of and response to such artistic contrasts as pattern and variation, sound and silence, perception and reality, can lead to a greater capacity for whole-system thinking. This may be the best way to teach the arts and humanities ─ from the starting point of paradox. I realize now that I have been including more international content in my classes but in many cases have not really changed my Western foundational approach. Global consciousness is not about homogeneity towards Americanization and its ways of thinking and doing things. True, Americans have a great deal to offer the world, but the peoples of the world have much to offer as well. By participating in these more complicated multiplicities and worldviews, we are transformed into global citizens. Studies in revelatory aesthetics can prepare students to live in the tensions of paradox and multi-directional flow. I realize that creative artistic expressions, like this narrative storytelling with Joseph, can take us beyond our everyday existences and into greater appreciation for and understanding of the lives and cultures of others.

Stories fire global imagination, and when combined with critical reflection, can deepen self-understanding and counteract dominating power centers. Personal narration can provide opportunities for wonder, deepening relationships, new global insights, compassionate judgment, and the creation of shared intercultural knowledge and meanings in educational practice. Stories and narratives attach us to others and to our own histories, providing "belonging in our lives" (Witherell & Noddings, 1991, p. 1). These are very important activities for academic professionals as we grapple with the challenges of understanding, living in, and belonging to international world systems while creating connectedness across difference.

Friedman (2000) wrote about how the understanding of international systems changes over time. He described how his father's generation, one that also included Joseph's father and mine, experienced "foreign affairs" as the disintegration of the balance-of-power in Europe and the beginning of World War II. Since then, there have been two subsequent international world systems. The first was the Cold War system that dominated international affairs from 1945 to 1989 and was slow, fixed, and divided with its power structure revolving around the balance between the United States and the U. S. S. R. Every country was either in the communist camp, Western camp, or neutral. Ideologically, this was a clash between communism and capitalism that limited the movement of people, especially from east to west, and its main technologies were nuclear weapons and the second Industrial Revolution (p. 7). Friedman identified division as its main characteristic, and this was symbolized most dramatically by the Berlin Wall. When the Wall fell in 1989, the new international system of globalization began with its overarching feature of integration as driven and represented by the World Wide Web.

Globalization, unlike the slow, frozen Cold War system, is a dynamic, ongoing process that integrates markets, nation-states, and technologies around the world. Friedman believes its dominant cultural feature is the tension created by the Americanization of the world through its defining technologies of computerization, digitization, satellite communications, fiber optics, and the internet. To survive in this techno-centric age, cultures must use these technologies. However, this does not mean that they wish to embrace American values. Friedman pointed out, "Once a country makes the leap into the system of globalization, its elites begin to internalize this perspective of integration, and always try to locate themselves in the global context" (2000, p. 8). Whereas the people of other countries have been forced to live within the heterogeneity presented by the rapid spread of globalization and its technologies, Americans have lived in a place of privilege as the sole global superpower and generators of this culture shock. Former Vice-chair of the National Intelligence Council at CIA in global strategic forecasting, Fuller (2006), observed:

> Our governmental culture, society, and even academia in recent decades have shown greater and greater reluctance to actually get to know foreign cultures firsthand ─ meaning the hard disciplines of going to unstable places, learning difficult foreign languages, and acquiring detailed knowledge of foreign cultures, including their history, literature, political culture, and psychology. . . . This kind of knowledge requires active interaction or dialogue with a culture, and even demands a degree of empathy if it is to be successful. Yet this process has somehow become increasingly foreign, distasteful, complicated or exotic to

> Americans over time who prefer a one-way "scientific" examination ─ as through a microscope ─ of other cultures that might impact us. (p. 8)

This "immaculate process of information acquisition, free of the entangling and messy need of interaction" (p. 8) is no longer productive as other countries appropriate American technologies to their own purposes and processes. Americans are affected in all of our social systems including politics, the economy, education, and science, and can no longer distance ourselves as remote observers of those who we perceive to be foreign, extreme, mysterious, irrational, or strange. Learning from other cultures is important is we are to go beyond ourselves to promote global consciousness.

Like Friedman, Joseph and I were in our 30s when this new system of globalization began. Like most Americans who grew up in the Cold War era, we were not educated in this global perspective of interaction, integration and its inherent ambiguities. After all, most people had never even heard of the internet in 1990. Friedman said that it took a long time for leaders and analysts of the Cold War era to grasp its nature and dimensions, and it will also take a long time to understand today's systems of globalization. This process also requires a great deal of retraining. Friedman confessed that "like everyone else trying to adjust to this new globalization system and bring it into focus, I had to retrain myself and develop new lenses to see it" (2000, p. 17). Addressing how he came to understand and explain this incredibly complex system, he said, "I learned you need to do two things at once ─ look at the world through a multilens perspective and, at the same time, convey that complexity to readers through simple stories, not grand theories" (p. 19). After 20 years as a college teacher struggling with the complexities of cultural studies, I agree; learning to look at the world from different

perspectives and then telling the stories of those perspectives are the most effective ways to help faculty and students alike understand the many dimensions of globalization.

To become a "globalist," Friedman said he has had to educate himself in six global areas: financial markets, politics, national security, environmentalism, technology, and culture. The contributions that Joseph and I are making to the development of a well-educated global citizenry are in the area of culture with its many diverse expressions and stories of human endeavor. And like Friedman, we have had to educate ourselves to look through "multilenses" in order to understand the cultures of globalization and the many "patterns of difference emerging in the responses of countries to global forces" (Currie, 2004. p. 43). One of the best ways to understand this is to look at ourselves and attempt to see ourselves through the eyes of others. To do this, we and all Americans who wish to be globally aware must be able to listen to and learn from peoples around the world. Thus, we work "at the intersection between the autobiographical and the global" (Wang, 2006, p. 10) because globalization is not only a techno-centric, complex world system. It is also a way of being for each person who wants to contribute to a more humanistic, healthy, and just world by living responsibly in the dynamic energy and interplay of forces. Howard (1999) wrote in his book, *We Can't Teach What We Don't Know*, that "honesty begins when . . . we learn to question our own assumptions and acknowledge the limitations of our culturally conditioned perceptions of truth" (p. 69). This quality of honesty is part of Enlightened Valuing, and sharing our stories helps us find ourselves in the world with more integrity.

Joseph read every chapter of this project, including chapter two wherein I share some of my personal stories of global consciousness. To my request that he write about

his reactions to this experience of life history narrative and its processes of exchange, he responded:

> It is interesting to reflect on things; to have someone ask you questions and devise a response that has some meaning for you and for them. I think that's a valuable thing to do. Every once in a while it is a good thing to figure out if you are doing anything that is worthwhile. The reflection and dialogue generated by the process has been of value to me at many levels. Her analyses and interpretations of my discussion and responses have been revelatory in allowing me to view my own responses through the filter or lens of one with a different set of experiences. This realization has been useful in the way studying a foreign language sheds light on the way we understand our own native tongue. Identifying "idiomatic" features of my life history appear clearer to Prof. Malloy than they might have for me, were I asked to do so. Nonetheless, I cannot deny that the perceptions she describes in her discussion seem valid and true, even though uniquely hers. Reflection on one's own life, goals, experiences, and/or career often leads to insight that is valuable for continuing development and growth. Realizations about the potential significance of seemingly mundane events can allow for the opportunity to perceive events as critical, necessary, or pivotal. As a teacher, finding and recognizing opportunities that may affect the lives and experiences of students is the essence of the teaching experience. That which seems commonplace or insignificant to the student usually is of greater import than the student perceives at the time. The role of the teacher is, in part, helping them recognize those things that they experience every day that can be opportunities for

learning and growth. My involvement with Prof. Malloy's life history narrative has reinforced in me the value of both personal reflection and the need to sensitively encounter the students' experiential reality.

Participation with Joseph in this collegial exchange has extended my vision of responsibility as a teaching professional, and this expanded vision enriches my understanding of how I will interact with others in global context in the future. This understanding was particularly enhanced by Joseph's reference to trust as the key ingredient to developing relationships with people whom we perceive as "other." He said that "not trusting doesn't really get you anywhere" and that awareness is what is important. If you are aware of what is going on, you can act appropriately. "Fear is a reaction, a visceral response to something that's not known, and so knowledge is the answer, awareness." Perhaps trust and courage develop, not only in others but in ourselves, as we practice living in the dynamic tensions of the paradoxes. For Joseph, practicing the arts of humor, humanities, music, and teaching strengthens him for the challenges of making enlightened value decisions in the complex world of inter and intra-culturalism. I believe that music strengthens his global soul, but I do not pretend to fully understand how this works. He explained:

> I think the power of art is its ability to convey truth, whatever that happens to be, and so it may be a refuge from fear. Being in the presence of ultimate truth is a very reassuring kind of experience. Ultimately there is no fear. In communal engagement, being involved with other people, there are certain ultimate truths that come out as well. It works with musicians. We don't write the music, we play it. There's certainly ample opportunity to disagree about what should

> happen, but there is a subjugation of your ego that has to take place. You are having to surrender to the expressive will of the composer. And so at some level you have to take yourself out of that and say that we are working together to create this greater level of realization.

Creating this greater level of realization involves both receiving and expressing at the same time, indicating the transformative power of aesthetic experiences. Joseph's words tell us that by participating in musical community, he learns confidence, compassion, courage, trust, tolerance, sincerity, love for justice, and dedication to living in truthfulness. This experience is a kind of meditation that transcends all national, religious, and ethnic boundaries, and is part of who Joseph is as teacher, global citizen, and life historian. This transcendence is indescribable, but I believe that it involves the quality of servant-leadership. Greenleaf (1998) said, "True leadership emerges from those whose primary motivation is a deep desire to help others" (p. 4). He believes that a servant-leader is servant first and is concerned with these questions: "Do those served grow as persons; do they, while being served, become healthier, wiser, freer, more autonomous, more likely themselves to become servants?" (p. 4). He emphasized that there are no shortcuts to developing this "way of being" because it is a long-term, transformational approach to life and work. Joseph's narrative illustrates how he is concerned with the well-being of others as a servant-leader, and his life story reveals how he has become a person who can help bring about understanding and positive reactions to change in an era of globalization. In his "way of being," there are certain aspects of Universalizing Loving.

As I present my emergent re-orienting framework of global consciousness (See Epilogue as Prologue), I do so with the full recognition that I am an ever-changing work in progress. I also realize, however, that there must be a starting place from which to illuminate this very important aspect of the human condition, global consciousness. I recognize that global thinking does not necessarily reinforce the values and definitions of progress found in an American market-driven society and that the consequences of the processes of globalization are very different between the world's nations, cultures, and individuals. Because "global transformation and self-transformation are mutually dependent upon each other" (Wang, 2006, p. 9), the changes and consequences of such interdependence are reflected in education, research, communication, the environment, commerce, and in all other aspects of the world's societies. Therefore, recognizing my own conditions of global consciousness is essential when preparing students to participate in global citizenship. How well do I live in the choices, ambiguities, and uncertainties presented by the world in accelerated motion and flow? How well do I listen to and learn from others?

Chittister (1999) of the Benedictine order in Erie, Pennsylvania, said, "We are to listen to one another. We are to reach across boundaries and differences in this fragmented world and see in our differences distinctions of great merit that can mend a competitive, uncaring, and foolish world" (p. 176). This can be very difficult because it involves struggle and hard work. The Lakota poet, Dreamwalker (2000), reflected on the challenge in this excerpt from *The Eagle's Cry:*

To hear the Eagle's cry

circling overhead

Remember to be

as thankful for the struggle

as for the dream.

With this wisdom in mind, I will come to my next collegial engagement in global meaning-making with gratitude, humility, and greater understanding about how I may become a more visionary teacher. Globalization is a continuous, ever-changing process, and there is no way of understanding it from a single perspective. Therefore, every new engagement in my life history narrative as well as in Joseph's provides further meanings in the global story as well as new dimensions to the metonymy of the teacher as vessel. The musical instrument, so important to Joseph, is an entirely different kind of vessel through which to sound the transformative and transcendent possibilities.

In sharing my own life history, I have come to realize that my perspective is embedded in my language, culture, religion, gender, and life history and that I bring this to my students and colleagues everyday. By reflecting on Joseph's life history in global consciousness-making, I have found both a window and mirror through which to understand my own journey better.

In summary, as Joseph and I constructed this life history narration together, we discussed the first research question of how he understands himself and his world and how his life experiences as the son of first generation Jewish Americans have contributed to his identity as a global citizen. The effects of holocaust and diaspora in his family as a result of World War II are an important part of his story, as are his marriage and educational studies. These have contributed to his ability to see and critique himself and the world in a larger sense, beyond the boundaries of nation, religion, and ethnicity. His

life experiences are very different from mine and provide a window through which I can understand the triumph of the human spirit over suffering, injustice, and death.

In exploring the second research question about his growth in global consciousness, we discussed how music and the humanities have proven helpful because they require the ability to live creatively in the tensions of difference, ambiguity, and paradox. The passion and proficiency that are required by musicians in orchestral concert have given Joseph a glimpse of the joyful and transcendent possibilities to be found in those rare moments when communities of people create harmony out of discord, understanding across difference. Thus, mutual creative interactions can counteract the powers of domination and dehumanization, and studies in aesthetics as human endeavor become metonymies for the processes of globalization in motion and flow.

Finally, we explored how he expresses this global consciousness to awaken the students to wondrous world possibilities and foster their abilities to live creatively in the tensions inherent in the homogeneity and heterogeneity of globalization. Joseph's story reflects how his knowledge, insight, humor, passion, training, and aesthetic abilities contribute to his efforts to teach for a more just and caring society. Teaching for global citizenship requires critical thinking, self-awareness, patience, humility, and the sincere belief that education is a viable alternative to force, fear, and violence in the world. Joseph shares his life history with others along the way as they journey toward healthy and sustainable global community.

The orienting framework which I identified as my lens on the world proved very helpful as I journeyed with Joseph. Having an awareness of my own realities gave me a systematic viewpoint through which to consider Joseph's life, consciousness, and work

with his students. Thus, I was able to identify more clearly the many intersections in Joseph's life as well as those that developed between us as we created this narrative exchange.

After this brief, explanatory narrative related to my three research questions, I will highlight the implications of this study for global education. I acknowledge that these suggestions are drawn from a community college setting and that they cannot be generalized to all higher education institutions. However, they may provide heuristic inspirations for others to think about in higher education at large.

Currently, globalization can be understood as a techno-centric system that affects the people, economies, and socio-political situations of every country and culture in the world. Each individual attempts to find a place in this dynamic and complicated energy. The development of global consciousness for each person is complex because there are many different ways to make meaning in the world and these are influenced by culture and each person's situatedness in life. Learning about the diversity of human perspectives is essential if Americans are to play responsible leadership roles in the world.

Although global consciousness develops from life experiences in the home, teachers play an important part in fostering this way of being in the world. Before helping the students view the world through multiple perspectives, however, teachers must look honestly and reflectively in the mirror in order to understand their own conditions of global consciousness. My narrative journey in this project began with a question from one of my colleagues as we met in a humanities curriculum meeting. After I had presented a talk on the importance of intercultural, international understanding, she

asked, “How do you become a global thinker?” I realized that this was the essential question I wanted to address.

I believe the first step is to become self-reflective of one’s own journey. Everyone is different. For me, Fowler’s (1981) stages of faith provided the beginning theory of psycho-spiritual growth from which I began to define my own framework of awareness as I engaged in the materials and experiences of globalization. However, not every person will relate to this framework. Each teacher must come to terms with the experiences and frameworks that personally resonate. A teacher’s journey in life is not a simple, smooth continuity; it is full of complexity and counterpoint, but assistance can be provided through mentors. My journey was enriched by four experts: a teacher/researcher in educational studies; an administrator interested in innovation and change; a graduate college writing expert; and a professor in curriculum studies who has an evolved global spirit. Trusted spiritual mentors outside of the collegial environment were also very important.

The next part of the journey involves sharing life history narratives in higher education because each person’s journey contributes to the wisdom of the whole human story. This kind of interaction can be difficult in a competitive academic environment because teachers are afraid to be forthcoming. However, for institutions that value teaching and learning, honest collaborative interchange is essential if faculty members are to grow in praxis. I have become a better person as a result of this journey, and the ways in which I engage the students have changed as a result of my growing self-awareness.

I find that I am now providing students with more questions and allowing them to live in the tension of finding the answers. This semester I have been asking them to share

their own stories with each other, and the stories they have told have been very powerful because they have been describing the transformations they have experienced as a result of their own life experiences. This approach is creating an ongoing dialogue between the ancient visions of life which we are studying in class and the contemporary challenges the students are facing as they journey in intercultural understanding. I have been turning off the lights and leading the students in reflective meditations about what life was like thousands of years ago and what it may be like in the near and distant future. Sometimes, we dance because some cultures do not create philosophy, they dance. I am able to lead the students in better skill-building exercises in visual art after watching Joseph work with his music appreciation class. I am more aware of the socio-centric and egocentric conditions of my own soul and how I am projecting these in my daily interactions with the students and my colleagues.

I have come to believe that teachers can play an important role as agents of change in developing global consciousness. In order to encourage teachers to engage personal and cultural transformation, there must be supportive networks, including teachers' professional development, administrative incentives, and curriculum change. Professional development traditionally focuses on content in training, but as my study shows, it must focus on the processes through which each person develops global consciousness as well as on the information related to international, intercultural studies.

Administrators in faculty development must realize that honesty is very important and that each person's journey is different. If the college environment is competitive, it may be necessary to protect the privacy of faculty members who wish to embark on honest research projects by providing financial incentives, sabbaticals, and private

oversight meetings. The teacher should make the determination of how, when, and with whom to share the research experience. If the college environment is collaborative, however, the teacher/researcher may be able to involve teams of people who can learn together. If the teachers in a particular college have had few international experiences, the college may need to provide financial support for travel, conference attendance, and exchange programs, because awareness begins with experiences of meaning. How research journeys are shared, however, will be determined by the conditions of the college environments in which the teachers live.

The academic disciplines of music, the arts, and the humanities help in the development of global consciousness because they promote awareness of other cultures and involve the ability to live gracefully with ambiguity and multiple interpretations of human experience. The arts are revelatory because our perspectives shift as we make meaning from the interactions of the compositional elements. Thus, we strengthen *upaya*, our abilities to sensitively and critically respond to the constantly changing human experiences and expressions of the 21st century. Because aesthetic experiences are transformative in the development of global consciousness, the arts should be an important part of educational curricula and praxis.

I realize that this study involves only two community college teachers. Further studies at other levels of higher education, such as research universities, with more participants from diverse backgrounds, may reveal more aspects of cultivating global consciousness. If more people enter the discussion, more intersections of understanding can be created. There are many meanings in every view if we are willing to open ourselves to the global landscape. When people from diverse backgrounds share their

experiences, feelings, and ideas, there are infinite possibilities for human growth. Thus, this kind of research in teaching community becomes an orchestral synergy that reveals and generates wondrous possibilities through professional passion and proficiency.

It is my hope that this exercise in life history narrative may serve as an inspiration for other college professionals as they encounter the teacher within and share their stories of growth in global consciousness. Journeys are revelatory because, in the process, we encounter others, we encounter ourselves, and we find identity. When we shape experience into language, we create understanding about the meanings and significance of our journeys. Coming face to face with each other in mutual recognition does require courage, and I am deeply grateful to Joseph for so generously sharing his story and enriching mine.

EPILOGUE AS PROLOGUE

A Re-orienting Framework of Global Consciousness

Experiential Awakening: Opening to the possibilities of larger world adventures through meaningful experiences, insights, inspirations, imagination, and aesthetics. This may involve falling in love, suffering, discovering, wondering, and significant questioning in search of solutions to difficulties that may arise in diversity and global conditions. This involves the emergence of possibilities and may happen at any life stage.

Interactive Comprehending: Actively participating in an intercultural context with awareness. This involves thoughtfully seeking and receiving information through investigation, listening, reading, questioning, recognizing, studying, aesthetic engagement, and entering into relationships of mutual influence. This requires initiative and attentiveness and becomes an increasingly self-directed search for knowledge and understanding.

Global Immersing: Cultivating interpersonal relationships with people of all religions, nationalities, and ethnicities. This means finding and applying global examples, adapting, communicating with others and processing signifying systems like, art, music, language, economics, politics, science, human relations, business, and religion in global contexts. This involves the shaping and re-

shaping of life with responsibility, creativity, flexibility, respect, assimilation, desire, and civility.

Reflective Incubating: Patiently contemplating with humility, devotion, reverence, and responsive receptivity. This may involve meditating, reflecting, praying, chanting, beholding, waiting in unknowing, pondering, acknowledging the sacred, spiritual practicing, self-monitoring, and resonating with global variations.

Critical Analyzing: Organizing and processing more international, intercultural, and intra-cultural complexity with fair-mindedness. This involves deep focus thinking, comparing and contrasting, either-or thinking, consciously relating to higher level goals and taking a stand based on one's beliefs and understanding in the midst of plurality, multiplicity, and the dynamic interplay of global forces. It requires comparative judgment based on independent standards in order to break through cultural prejudices that protect our viewpoints, actions, and institutions from unsettling criticism.

Paradoxical Synthesizing: Whole system thinking, living within the paradoxes without losing integrity, living in reciprocity and attunement, creating expressions like humor, stories, art, music, social systems, etc. This involves hypothesizing, composing, both-and thinking and feeling, and cross-cultural negotiating in the midst of the commotion of homogeneity and heterogeneity. This energy is thinking and feeling beyond borders, including those of nationality, religion, ethnicity, gender, politics, corporate and special interests while understanding the interdependence of all and acting accordingly.

Enlightened Valuing: Caring and valuing through trust, courage, tolerance, honesty, gratitude, forbearance, cooperation, and empathy for "the other" beyond the politics of location and difference. This involves collaborating, seeking justice, integrating, persevering, and balancing reality's spiritual and material dimensions while welcoming ambiguity in human relationships.

Universal Loving: Consistently exercising compassion and mercy and living transformative relationships in faithful, just covenant. This involves healing, mediating, reconciling, joy, sacrificing for the sake of others, self-forgetting, and the radical relinquishing of self-consciousness.

REFERENCES

Adler, P. A., & Adler, P. O. (1994). Observational techniques. In N. K. Denzin & Y. K. Lincoln (Eds.), *Handbook of qualitative research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Allende, I. (1998). *Aphrodite*. New York: Harper-Collins.

American Council for International Intercultural Education & The Stanley Foundation. (1996). *Educating for the global community: A framework for community colleges.* Washington, DC.

Apple, M. W. (1993). Introduction. In K. Casey, *I answer with my life*, (pp. xv-xvii). New York: Routledge.

Bakhtin, M. (1981). *The dialogic imagination*. Austin: The University of Texas Press.

Baars, B. J. (1997). In the theatre of consciousness: Global workspace theory. *The Journal of Consciousness Studies, 4* (4), 292-309.

Belenky, M. F., Clinchy, B. M., Goldberger, N. R., & Tarule, J. M. (1986). *Women's ways of knowing*. New York: Basic Books.

Benedict, St., Abbott of Monte Cassino (1982). *The Rule of St. Benedict in English* (T. Fry Ed.). Collegeville, MN: The Liturgical Press. (Original work published ca. 520 C.E.)

Berman, M. (2000). *The twilight of American culture*. New York: W. W. Norton.

Bertaux, D. (1981). *Biography and society: The life history approach in the social sciences*. London: Sage Publications.

Block, A. A. (2001). Ethics and curriculum. *Journal of Curriculum Theorizing, 17* (3), 23-28.

Bloom, B., Mesia, B.B., & Krathwohl, D. R. (1964). *Taxonomy of educational objectives*. New York: David McKay.

Bloom, D. (2002, September 19). *Mastering globalization: From ideas to action on higher education reform.* Paper presented at the 2002 Conference on Globalisation: What Issues Are At Stake for Universities? Retrieved June 15, 2005, from http://www.bi.vlaval.ca/Globalisation-Uniiversities/pages/actes/BloomDavid.pdf/

Bloom, L. B. (2002). From self to society: Reflections on the power of narrative inquiry. In S. B. Merriam (Ed.), *Qualitative Research in Practice* (pp. 310-313*)*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.

Breton, G. (2002, September 19). *Higher education: From internationalization to globalization.* Paper presented at the 2002 Conference on Globalisation: What Issues Are At Stake for Universities. Retrieved June 15, 2005, from http://www.bi.vlaval.ca/Globalisation-Universities/pages/actes/Gilles-Breton-ang.pdf/

Casey, M. (2001). *A guide to living in the truth*. Liguori, MO: Liguori/Triumph.

Chittister, J. (1999). *The rule of Benedict: Insights for the ages*. New York: Crossroad.

Chua, A. (2002, Autumn). A world on the edge. *Wilson Quarterly, 26* (4), 62-77.

Clifton, L. (2006, Spring). And I still rise. In H. Winn (Ed), *Interview, 24* (2), 1, 14-17. Oklahoma City, OK: Oklahoma Humanities Council.

Cohen, R. (2005, March 18). *The ethicist.* Lecture presented for Town Hall, Tulsa, OK.

Cross, W.W., Jr. (1995). The psychology of Nigrescence: Revising the cross model. In J. G. Ponterrotto, J. M. Casas, L. A. Suzuki, & C. M. Alexander (Eds.), *Handbook of multicultural counseling* (pp. 98-115). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Currie, J. (2004). The neo-liberal paradigm and higher education: A critique. In J. K. Odin & P. T. Manicus (Eds.), *Globalization and higher education* (pp. 42-62). University of Hawaii Press.

Diamond, J. (2006). The ends of the world as we know them. In R. M. Jackson (Ed.), *Global issues 06/07* (pp. 30-33). Dubuque, IA: McGraw Hill Contemporary Learning Series.

Denzin, N. (1970). *The research act in sociology: A theoretical introduction to sociological methods*. Chicago: Aldine.

Denzin, N. (1989a). Interpretive biography. *In Qualitative Research Methods (Vol. 17*). Newbury Park, CA: Sage.

Denzin, N. (1989b). *The research act: a theoretical introduction to sociological methods* (3rd ed.). Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.

De Sousa, R. (1990). *The rationality of emotion*. Cambridge, MA: M.I.T. Press.

De Waal. E. (1984). *Seeking God*. London: Fount Paperbacks and Faith Press.

De Waal, E. (1998). *Living with contradiction*. Harrisburg, PA: Morehouse.

Dewey, J. (1938). *Experience and education*. New York: Collier Books.

Dimmick, C., & O'Donoghue, T. A. (1997). *Innovative school principals and restructuring.* London: Routledge.

Dollard, J. (1935). *Criteria for the life history*. New York: Libraries Press.

Dreamwalker. (2000). The eagle's cry. In *Crys the Tears.* Lakota Pub. Retrieved May 11,

2006, from http://www.gem-of-r.com/nativevoices/Poems/dreamwalker.htm.

Durant, W. (1963). *The story of civilization: Vol. 1, our Oriental heritage*. New York: MJF Books.

Edman, I. (1967). *Arts and man*. New York: W. W. Norton and Company.

Edwards, B. (1986). *Drawing on the right side of the brain*. New York: Simon and Schuster.

Erikson, J. M. (1988). *Wisdom and the senses: The way of creativity*. New York: Norton.

Estes, C. P. (1992). *Women who run with the wolves*. New York: Ballantine Books.

Evans, D. (2002). The search hypothesis of emotion**.** *The British Journal for the Philosophy of Science, 53* (4)*,* 497-509.

Fox, M. (1990). *A spirituality named compassion*. San Francisco: HarperCollins.

Fowler, J. W. (1981*). Stages of faith*. San Francisco: Harper and Row.

Freire, P. (1972a). *Pedagogy of the oppressed.* Harmondsworth: Penguin.

Freire, P. (1972b). *Cultural action for freedom*. Harmondsworth: Penguin.

Friedman, T. (2000). *The Lexus and the olive tree*. New York: Anchor Books.

Friedman, T. (2005). *The world is flat.* New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux.

Fuller, G. E. (2006, July). *America's uncomfortable relationship with nationalism*. In The Stanley Foundation Policy Analysis Brief. Available from http://reports.stanleyfoundation.org

Gandhi, A. (2004, March 11). *A season for non-violence*. Lecture by Arun Gandhi quoting his grandfather, Mahatma Gandhi, presented at Tulsa Community College for the Asian Week Lecture Series, Tulsa, OK.

Gilmore, L. (1994). *Autobiographics: A feminist theory of women's self-representation*.

Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press.

Goleman, D. (1995). *Emotional intelligence*. New York: Bantam Books.

Goodson, I. (Ed.). (1992). *Studying teachers' lives*. New York: Teachers College Press.

Greenleaf, R. K. (1998). *The power of servant leadership*. San Francisco: Berrett-Koehler Publisher, Inc.

Hart, L. A. (1998). *Human brain and human learning*. Kent, WA: Books for Educators, Inc.

Havel, V. (1994, November 28). In K. L. Woodward, On the road again. *Newsweek, 124* (22), 61-62.

Helitzer, M. (1987). *Comedy writing secrets.* Cincinnati, OH: Writer's Digest Books.

Hershock, P. (1994, October). Person as narration: The dissolution of 'self' and 'other' in Ch'an Buddhism. *Philosophy East and West, 44* (4), 685-710.

Hildegard of Bingen, (12th century AD). Praise for the mother. [Recorded by Angel Records]. On *Vision* [Medium of recording: CD]. Hollywood, CA: Capitol Music. (1994).

Hill, P. (1991, July/August). Multi-culturalism. *Change*, *23* (4), 38-47.

Ho, L. (1996). *Cross-cultural swinging: A handbook for self-awareness and multicultural living*. Covina, CA: Pacific Asia Press.

Howard, G. R. (1999). *We can't teach what we don't know*. New York: Teachers College Press.

Huebner, D. E. (1999). The capacity for wonder and education. In V. Hillis (Ed.), *The Lure of the Transcendent: Collected Essays by Dwayne E. Huebner*. London: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates. (Original work published 1959).

Ikeda, D. (2005). Foreword. In. N. Noddings (Ed.), *Educating citizens for global awareness.* New York: Columbia University Teachers College Press.

Ivanhoe, P. (2006, March 19). *The values of spontaneity*. Lecture presented at the National Conference of the Asian Studies Development Program, Belmont University, TN.

Lamm, R. C. (1996). *The humanities in western culture*. London: Brown and Benchmark.

Lerner, G. (1993). *The creation of feminist consciousness*. London: Oxford University Press.

Li, Xin. (2002). *The Tao of life stories*. New York: Peter Lang Publishers.

Linde, C. (1993). *Life stories*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Lincoln Y. S., & Guba, E. G. (1985). *Naturalistic inquiry*. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.

Mandelbaum, D. G. (1973). The study of life history: Gandhi**.** *Current Anthropology*, *14* (3), 177-206.

Marshall, S. M. (Ed.). (2006). *Stories of inspiration: Lessons and laughter in student affairs* (pp. 1-8). US: National Association of Student Personnel Administrators.

Marxsen, P. M. (2005). About the Boston Research Center. In N. Noddings (Ed.), *Educating citizens for global awareness* (p. v). New York: Teachers College Press.

Mbilinyi, M. (1989). I'd have been a man. In Personal Narrative Group (Eds.), *Interpreting women's lives*, Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

McDonald, B. L. (1997). *A comparison of Mezirow's transformation theory with the process of becoming an ethical vegan*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Georgia.

McIntosh, P. (2005). Gender perspectives on educating for global citizenship. In N. Noddings (Ed.), *Educating citizens for global awareness* (pp. 22-39). New York: Columbia University Teachers College Press.

Merriam, A. (1964). *The anthropology of music*. Evanston, ILL: Northwestern University Press.

Merriam, S., & Caffarella, R. (1999). *Learning in adulthood*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Mertens, D. M. (1998). *Research methods in education and psychology: Integrating diversity with quantitative and qualitative approaches*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Merton, T. (1955). *No man is an island*. San Diego: Harvest/Harcourt Brace, Jovanovich.

Merton, T. (1965). A letter to Pablo Antonio Cuadra concerning giants. In *Emblems of a Season of Fury*. New York: New Directions.

Meyer, S. (2006, March 27). Job hunt 2020. *U.S. News and World Report, 140* (11), 54.

Mezirow, J. (1998). On critical reflection. *Adult Education Quarterly, 48* (3), 185-198.

Michelson, E. (1996). Usual suspects: Experience, reflection and the (en)gendering of knowledge. *International Journal of Lifelong Education, 15* (6), 438-454.

Ming-Dao, D. (1992). *365 Tao*. San Francisco: Harper San Francisco.

Munro, P. (1998). *Subject to fiction*. Buckingham: Open University Press.

National Conference of Catholic Bishops (1983). *The challenge of peace: God's promise and our response*. Washington D.C: The United State Catholic Conference.

Newman, R. J. (2006, March 27). Can America keep up? *U.S. News and World Report, 140* (11), 48-56.

Nisbett, R. E. (2003). *The geography of thought*. Free press: New York.

Noddings, N. (1984). *Caring: A feminine approach to ethics and moral education.* Berkeley: University of California Press.

Noddings, N. (2002). *Starting at home: Caring and social policy*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Noddings, N. (2005). *Educating citizens for global awareness*. New York: Teachers College Press.

Palmer, P. (1998). *The courage to teach*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Patton, M. Q. (1990). *Qualitative evaluation and research methods*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage.

Patton, M. Q. (2002). *Qualitative evaluation and research methods* (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Paul, R. (1990). *Critical thinking*. Rohnert Park, CA: The Center for Critical Thinking and Moral Critique.

Pew Research Center for the People and the Press. (2003). [Pew Global Attitudes Project]. *Views of a changing world: How global publics view war in Iraq, democracy, Islam and governance, globalization*. Washington D.C: Author. Available from http://people-press.org/reports/

Polinska, W. (2006, March 18). *Christian-Buddhist dialogue on loving the enemy*. Lecture from the Asian Studies Development Program National Conference, Nashville, TN.

Popper, S. H. (1994). *Pathways to the humanities in administrative leadership* (4th ed.). The University Council for Educational Administration.

Reid, T. R. (2004, Autumn). The Atlantic widens. *The Wilson Quarterly, 28* (4), 13-23. Washington, D.C.: The Woodrow Wilson International Center for Scholars.

Richardson, J. N. (Ed.). (1979). *The Homeric hymn to Demeter*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.

Rumi, J. (1972). He comes. In *Persian Poems* (R. A. Nicholson, Trans.). J. Arberry (Ed.). Everyman's library [Electronic version]. Available From http://www.khamuch.com/poems.html. (Original work Published 13 century C. E.)

Sachs, J. D. (2005, January 10). The class system of catastrophe**.** *Time, 165* (2), 86.

Schwandt, T. A. (2001). *Dictionary of qualitative inquiry* (2nd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Senge, P., Kleiner, A., Roberts, C., Ross, R., Roth, G., & Smith, B. (1999). *The dance of change*. New York: Doubleday.

Sheridan, M., & Salaff, J. W. (1984). *Lives: Chinese working women*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

Singer, P. (2002, October 11). Navigating the ethics of globalization. *The Chronicle of HigherEducation, 49* (7), B7-B10.

Smith, D. G. (1999). *Pedagon*. New York: Peter Lang.

Sophocles, (1957). Antigone. *In ten Greek plays in contemporary translations* (S. O'Sheel, Trans.). L. R. Lind (Ed.). The Estate of Shaemus O'Sheel. (Original work published ca. 440 B.C.E.).

Starratt, R. J. (1994). *Building an ethical school: A practical response to the moral crisis in schools*. Washington D.C: Falmer Press.

Tagore, R. (1995). *Creative unity*. Delhi: Macmillan India Limited press. (Original work

published 1922)

Taylor, E. W. (1994). Intercultural competency: A transformative learning process. *Adult Education Quarterly, 44* (3), 154-174.

Thomas, L. E. (1994). Cognitive development and transcendence; an emerging transpersonal paradigm of consciousness. In M.E. Miller & S. R. Cook-Greuter, (Eds.), *Transcendence and mature adult thought: The furthest reaches of adult development*. London: Rowman and Littlefield.

Usher, R., Bryant, I., & Johnston, R. (1997). *Adult education and the postmodern challenge: Learning beyond the limits*. New York: Routledge.

Van Manen, M. (1994). Pedagogy, virtue, and narrative identity in teaching [Electronic version]. *Curriculum Inquiry, 4* (2), 135-170.

Wallis, H. (Producer), & Glenville, P. (Director). (1964). *Becket* [Motion Picture]. United States: E & M Enterprising.

Walsh, S. (2002). AAUP will review impact of 9/11 on academic freedom [Electronic version]. *The Chronicle of higher Education, 49* (4)*,* A16.

Wang, H. (2004). *The call from the stranger on a journey home*. New York: Peter Lang.

Wang, H. (2006, February). Globalization and curriculum studies: Tensions, challenges, and possibilities. *Journal of the American Association for the Advancement of Curriculum Studies 2*, 1-17. Available from http://www.uwstout.edu/soe/jaaacs/vol2/wang.htm

Weathers, W. (1975). *The creative spirit*. Tulsa: OK: John Nichols Publishers.

Weathers, W. (1984). *Beethoven meditations*. Tulsa, OK: The Riverrrun Press.

Weiland, S. (1995). Life history and academic work: The career of professor G. In R.

Josselson & A. Lieblich (Eds.), *Interpreting experience: The narrative study of lives,* 59-99. London: Sage.

Westley, D. (1988*). A theology of presence*. Mystic, CT: Twenty-third Publications.

Wilber, K. (1982). *A sociable god*. New York: McGraw-Hill.

Wilber, K. (1983). *Eye to eye*. New York: Doubleday.

Wilber, K. (1990). Two patterns of transcendence: A reply to Washburn. *Journal of Humanistic Studies, 30* (3), 113-136.

Wilson, R., & Cox, A. (2001). Terrorist attacks put academic freedom to the test [Electronic version]. *The Chronicle of Higher Education, 48* (06), A12.

Witherell, C., & Noddings, N. (1991). *Stories lives tell*: *Narrative and dialogue in education*. New York: Teachers College Press.

Appendix A

Interview Questions

These questions are designed for semi-structured interviews so that there is a degree of flexibility in how they may be used.

Research question: What life experiences have contributed to how a community college professor understands himself and the world?

Interview questions:

Please describe your family background in terms of where you were born, your parents, siblings and extended family.

How have these affected your sense of personal identity?

How has your family background affected your definition of home?

How would you describe your academic training?

What are your international experiences?

What are the powers with which you align yourself?

Who were the most important teachers in your life? How did they influence you?

Research question: How has global consciousness developed through these experiences?

Interview questions:

How do you describe a global perspective?

How would you describe global citizenship?

What were the most important influences, people, or events in moving you into an intercultural perspective?

What has changed as a result of your working from a global perspective rather than from a Western or Eastern point of view?

How do you respond to this statement by Peter Hershock from the East-West Center when he says, "The gathering with which we identify ourselves is actually a learned process of simply divorcing that over which "I" cannot exercise direct control" (1994, p. 691)?

What are the powers with which you have aligned yourself in the past? Have the powers with which you align yourself changed? How?

Research question: How does a community college professor express this consciousness through his college teaching?

Interview questions:

What is your philosophy of teaching?

Why did you agree to be a faculty sponsor for a minority student association?

What paradoxes have you experienced as a result of this involvement?

What problems have your encountered?

What successes have you experienced?

What has been your favorite part of this experience?

What has made you the most uncomfortable about this commitment?

What sustains you in your teaching life?

Appendix B

IRB Approval Letter

Oklahoma State University Institutional Review Board

Date: Tuesday, February 07, 2006

IRB Application No ED0673

Proposal Title: Fiery Formations of Global Citizenship in Higher Education: The Teacher as Vessel

Reviewed and Processed as: Expedited

Status Recommended by Reviewer(s): Approved Protocol Expires: 216/2007

Principal Investigator(s_1/

Ann Marie Malloy
1448 E. 55th St.
Tulsa, OK 74105

Hongyu Wang
239 Willard
Stillwater, OK 74078

The IRB application referenced above has been approved. It is the judgment of the reviewers that the rights and welfare of individuals who may be asked to participate in this study will be respected, and that the research will be conducted in a manner consistent with the IRB requirements as outlined in section 45
CFR46.

[7, The final versions of any printed recruitment, consent and assent documents bearing the IRB approval stamp are attached to this letter. These are the versions that must be used during the study.

As Principal Investigator, it is your responsibility to do the following:

1. Conduct this study exactly as it has been approved. Any modifications to the research protocol must be submitted with the appropriate signatures for IRB approval.
2. Submit a request for continuation if the study extends beyond the approval period of one calendar year. This continuation must receive IRB review and approval before the research can continue.

3. Report any adverse events to the IRB Chair promptly. Adverse events are those which are unanticipated and impact the subjects during the course of this research; and
4. Notify the IRB office in writing when your research project is complete.

Please note that approved protocols are subject to monitoring by the IRB and that the IRB office has the authority to inspect research records associated with this protocol at any time. If you have questions about the IRB procedures or need any assistance from the Board, please contact Beth McTernan in 415 Whitehurst (phone: 405-744-5700, beth.mcternanc~okstate.edu).

Sincerely,

Sue C. Jacobs,~~i~
Institutional Re~w Board

INFORMED CONSENT AGREEMENT

A. AUTHORIZATION

I _____, hereby authorize Ann Malloy to perform the following procedure.

B. DESCRIPTION OF RESEARCH AND ASSOCIATED RISKS AND BENEFITS.

Name of Research Project: Fiery Formations of Global Citizenship in Higher Education: The Teacher as Vessel

The Relationship between the Project and Oklahoma State University: This is in fulfillment of the dissertation research project requirement for the researcher's doctorate in Educational Leadership.

Purpose of the Research Study: The purpose of this study is to better understand the experiences of college faculty members who actively engage global inter-culturalism throughout their lives and their teaching. The participants are identified as exhibiting global awareness by a minority student organization. The data being sought will be provided through life stories and observations and reported in narrative text.

Procedures:
(1) You will be interviewed by the researcher using audio tape recordings with the option of replying to some questions in writing. You have the right to withdraw at anytime. The process is mainly storytelling and there is absolutely no experimental element in the procedures. Each interview will be an hour in length; and three to five interviews will be required. Extra interviews may be scheduled if needed.
(2) At least two classroom observations will also be required. Each will be an hour in length. They are naturalistic observations that do not interfere with the participants' work.
(3) You are invited to provide syllabi or other artifacts.
(4) The arrangements will be devised according to your preference of time and place with a deadline of data collection before May 1, 2006.

Risks: There are no known risks associated with this project which are greater than those ordinarily encountered in daily life. Participants may choose not to answer any questions.

Benefits: There are no direct benefits to you for participating in this study. The public at large may be helped to understand more about global understanding and college teaching, and particularly you may contribute to the continuous efforts of rethinking faculty development in intercultural education.

Confidentiality: The information that you give in the study will be handled confidentially.
(1) Your information will be assigned a code number. The list connecting your name to this number will be kept locked in a file in my private office. Nobody else will have access to this locked site.
(2) When the study is completed and the data analyzed, the list will be destroyed. The audio tapes will also be destroyed upon completion of the project.
(3) Your name will not be used in any report or conversation, and pseudonyms will be used in the researcher's writings.

The OSU IRB has the authority to inspect consent records and data sites to assure compliance with approved procedures.

Compensation: There is no compensation to be offered for participation.

Researcher Contact Information: Ann Malloy
918 747-1830

Who to contact if your have questions about the study (besides the researcher):
Dr. Hongyu Wang, Dept. of Teaching and Curriculum Leadership, 239 Willard Hall, Oklahoma State University, Stillwater, Ok. 74074
405-744-4675

Who to contact about your rights in the study:
The IRB contact person, Dr. Sue Jacobs, IRB Chair, Oklahoma State University, Stillwater, 415 Whitehurst Hall, OK. 74078 405-744-1676

C. PARTICIPANT RIGHTS

I understand that participation is voluntary and that I will not be penalized if I choose not to participate. I also understand that I am free to withdraw my consent and end my participation in this project at any time without penalty after I notify the researcher.

D. SIGNATURES

I have read and fully understand the consent form. I sign it freely and voluntarily. A copy of this form has been given to me.

_____ _____
Signature of Participant **Date**

I certify that I have personally explained all elements of this form to the participant.

_____ _____
Signature of Researcher **Date**

OSU
Institutional Review Board
Approved 2/7/06
Expires 2/6/07

VITA

Ann Marie Malloy

Candidate for the Degree of

Doctor of Education

Dissertation: FIERY FORMATIONS OF GLOBAL CITIZENSHIP IN HIGHER EDUCATION: THE TEACHER AS VESSEL

Major Field: Higher Education

Biographical:

Education: Received a Bachelor of Arts degree in Letters from the University of Oklahoma in 1973. Graduated with a Master of Arts degree in Humanities from the University of Tulsa in 1986. Completed the requirements for the Doctor of Education degree at Oklahoma State University in 2006.

Experience: Employed on the fulltime faculty of Tulsa Community College since 1987 in the fields of humanities, film, and art.

Professional Associations: East-West Center for Asian Studies, The Tulsa Opera, Community College Humanities Association, Oklahoma Global Education Consortium

Name: Ann Marie Malloy Date of Degree: December, 2006

Institution: Oklahoma State University Location: Stillwater, Oklahoma

Title of Study: FIERY FORMATIONS OF GLOBAL CITIZENSHIP IN HIGHER EDUCATION: THE TEACHER AS VESSEL

Pages in Study: 148 Candidate for the Degree of Doctor in Education

Major Field: Higher Education

Scope and Method of the Study: The purpose of this qualitative study was to explore how college faculty members develop global consciousness and how they express this way of being in their classes and academic work. In this study, a life history approach was used as the major theoretical framework. However, critical social theory and developmental theory were also used. The methodology involved several lengthy interviews and observations that contributed to understanding a community college professor's emotional and intellectual career in intercultural, international awareness.

Findings and Conclusions: The findings reflect the importance of personal family history, aesthetics, music, and the humanities in the development of global consciousness.The study also shows the power and possibilities of the narrative life history approach for research into teaching and learning if teachers choose to share their stories of growth and transformation. Teachers coming together in mutual recognition is an important strategy for faculty development as the complexities of globalization present new and increasingly difficult challenges for academics in higher education.

Advisor's Approval Dr. A. Hyle