

L E T T E R

FROM

THE SECRETARY OF WAR,

TRANSMITTING,

In response to Senate resolution of January 28, 1890, reports relative to the treatment of certain Apache Indians.

MARCH 17, 1890.—Referred to the Committee on Indian Affairs and ordered to be printed.

WAR DEPARTMENT,
Washington, March 17, 1890.

The Secretary of War has the honor to transmit to the Senate a report from the Adjutant-General of the Army, dated January 30, 1890, together with a copy of Senate Executive Document No. 117, Forty-ninth Congress, second session; a printed copy of notes of a conference held at the War Department July 26, 1886, between Hon. William C. Endicott, Secretary of War, and Chatto, chief of the Chiricahua Apache Indians; a copy of Senate Executive Document No. 35, Fifty-first Congress, first session; a report from Capt. J. H. Dorst, Fourth Cavalry, dated February 28, 1890, and a report from Capt. John G. Bourke, Third Cavalry, dated March 10, 1890, the same being furnished in response to a resolution of the Senate, dated January 28, 1890, as follows:

Resolved, That the Secretary of War be directed to communicate to the Senate all the evidence in his possession in regard to the seizure and imprisonment of Chatto and other Apache Indians, and especially whether said Chatto or any other of his tribe were induced by the Government to visit Washington upon assurances from the President of the United States or the Secretary of War of safe conduct; and whether said assurances were violated and said Chatto or any other of said Indians seized and confined as prisoners; and whether the United States is in good faith bound to indemnify said Chatto; and to state all the circumstances which will enable the Senate to judge as to the propriety of such indemnity, and what should be the amount of the same.

REDFIELD PROCTOR,
Secretary of War.

The PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE,
United States Senate.

ADJUTANT-GENERAL'S OFFICE,
Washington, January 30, 1890.

SIR: I have the honor to return herewith Senate resolution of the 28th instant, referred from the War Department to this office, calling for certain evidence in the possession of the Department in regard to the seizure and imprisonment of Chatto and other Apache Indians, and especially as to whether said Chatto or any others of his party were in-

duced by the Government to visit Washington upon assurances from the President of the United States or the Secretary of War of safe conduct, etc.; and in reply thereto to inclose herewith Senate Executive Document No. 117, Forty-ninth Congress, second session, and to invite particular attention to part 3 of said document (pages 49 to 75 inclusive) which contains such information of record in this office as bears upon the case of Chatto and his party, brought to this city by Capt. J. H. Dorst, Fourth Cavalry, under Field Orders No. 74, Headquarters Department of Arizona, July 13, 1886 (see page 53 of document).

In this connection I also beg leave to call attention to notes of an interview recently had at Mount Vernon barracks, Ala., between Maj. Gen. George Crook, U. S. Army, and Chatto and other Apache chiefs, as contained on pages 6 and 7, Senate Executive Document No. 35, Fifty-first Congress, first session, herewith.

Very respectfully,

J. C. KELTON,
Adjutant-General

The SECRETARY OF WAR.

Part III, Senate Ex. Doc. 117, Forty-ninth Congress, Second Session.

Copy of telegraphic and other correspondence regarding the disposition of the Warm Springs and other Chiricahua Apache Indians near Fort Apache, Ariz., and those under Chief Chatto, brought East by Capt. J. H. Dorst, Fourth Cavalry, and also in regard to the capture of Chief Mangus and party and their final disposition.

[Prepared in the office of the Adjutant-General, U. S. Army, in compliance with Senate resolution of February 11, 1887.]

Official copy.

R. C. DRUM,
Adjutant-General

ADJUTANT-GENERAL'S OFFICE,
February 24, 1887.

[Telegram.]

HEADQUARTERS DIVISION OF THE PACIFIC,
Presidio of San Francisco, Cal., June 4, 1886.

ADJUTANT-GENERAL U. S. ARMY,
Washington, D. C.:

The following telegram received:

"FORT APACHE, ARIZ., July 3, 1886.

"My object in coming to this reservation was to see the Apache and Warm Spring Indians here. There are the strongest military reasons why these Indians should be located outside of Arizona, and it should be done peaceably if possible. There are several places east of New Mexico where they could be located, and I respectfully request authority to send a few of the tribe to Washington, under charge of two officers, and to locate such land as the Government may be willing to grant them. Mr. Lamar, who is here from Interior Department, concurs with me as to the advisability of the measure. I would request that Captain Baldwin, Fifth Infantry, be ordered to report to me for duty in this connection.

In absence of General Howard:

"MILES,
"Commanding"
C. MCKERVER,
Assistant Adjutant-General

[Telegram.]

FORT APACHE, ARIZ., July 5, 1886.

ADJUTANT-GENERAL,
Washington, D. C. :

Request that my telegram of Saturday regarding Apaches and Warm Springs Indians be considered strictly confidential. Ten principal men have agreed to go, and I believe it will result in much good.

MILES,
Commanding.

[Indorsement on the foregoing telegrams from General Miles of July 4 and 5, 1886, respectively.]

HEADQUARTERS OF THE ARMY,
Washington, July 7, 1886.

Respectfully submitted to the Secretary of War with copy for the information of the Interior Department.

The whole history of Indian wars in this country shows that they are generally directly traceable to the action of the Government in moving tribes from the locality where they had become established, and which they are always averse to leaving, to other ground in the selection of which they had no part. In the case of these Apaches, this is directly illustrated by their removal some years ago from Tularosa, N. Mex., to Fort Apache. They were opposed to the change, and when they were compelled to go by military force they yielded, but protested that though they would go they would be bad Indians, and bad Indians they have been nearly ever since.

Their removal from Arizona would undoubtedly be a relief to the people in that section, but would unquestionably be equally distasteful to the inhabitants of any section east of New Mexico where they might be sent, who would probably make every effort to prevent its accomplishment. Every section of country should control the bad element of its own population, not endeavor to foist them upon other more fortunate districts, and this is especially true of the Indians, who should, as far as possible, be controlled where they now are. I see no objection to the delegation of Apaches coming to Washington, but do not consider it necessary or advisable to make, as requested, the detail of Captain Baldwin (now in Montana), who neither knows these Indians nor their language, and is no more fitted for this duty than many other officers now under General Miles's command. Detaching two officers to bring ten Indians to Washington, at a time when we are sending to Arizona all the troops that can be spared from other departments, also appears to me inappropriate, and does not meet with my approval.

P. H. SHERIDAN,
Lieutenant-General, Commanding.

[Telegram.]

ADJUTANT-GENERAL'S OFFICE,
Washington, July 7, 1886.

COMMANDING GENERAL DIVISION OF THE PACIFIC,
Presidio of San Francisco, Cal. :

Please inform General Miles that the Lieutenant-General declines to order Captain Baldwin to report to him, and while he approves of a delegation of Apaches coming to Washington, he does not wish two officers sent with them.

J. C. KELTON,
Acting Adjutant-General.

[Telegram.]

FORT APACHE, ARIZ., July 7, 1886.

ADJUTANT-GENERAL OF THE ARMY,
Washington, D. C. :

My object in requesting that Captain Baldwin be ordered to report to me was on account of his successful management and arrangements of the Moses or Columbia River Indians under similar circumstances. I believe there is an opportunity to locate the Chiricahua Indians where they will no longer be a disturbing element, and my purpose is to secure a permanent peace for this Territory. I therefore hope that my request will be granted.

MILES,
Commanding Department.

FORT APACHE, ARIZ., July 7, 1886.

SIR: Soon after being assigned to this Department, in April last, I became convinced that there were two problems to solve before any permanent peace could be fully established in the Territories of Arizona and New Mexico. One was the subjugation of the hostile Indians; the other the control of the Apache Indians camped near Fort Apache, Ariz. The first has absorbed much of my attention, and the prospects of ultimate success are favorable. The last mentioned has been fully considered, and early in May last I adopted measures to bring about a change which, if accomplished, will result in lasting good.

There are now at Fort Apache 198 Warm Springs Indians, that were several years ago forcibly removed from New Mexico, and 236 Chiricahua Apaches. These two bands have for years affiliated under the leadership of Mangus Colorado, Cochise, Victorio, Chatto, Geronimo, and others, and the Apache tribe has raised the settlements of New Mexico, Arizona, and Old Mexico for hundreds of years. Certain promises have been made them and very great privileges have been granted them. The 440 men, women, and children now living on the military reservation of Fort Apache are nominally prisoners of war, yet they have never been disarmed or dismounted and are in better fighting condition to-day than ever before, and yet without arms they would, in their present position, be in danger of being raided by any hostile Indians. To hold this tribe under restraint and close military surveillance has required a strong force of troops. They were located in the heart of the most remote, mountainous, and inaccessible region of the United States; remote from the fact of its being 100 miles south of the Atlantic and Pacific Railway and 130 miles north of the Southern Pacific.

Raiding parties from this tribe at Apache, and from Geronimo's camp in Old Mexico, have for years committed the most serious depredations in the belt of country (200 miles wide) between Fort Apache and the Mexican boundary. The hostile element under Geronimo and Natchez will be worn down, and in time destroyed or captured by the troops, yet this result could not produce a lasting peace so long as the Apache tribe remains in the rugged and almost inaccessible mountains of Arizona. Their boys of to-day will become the Geronimos of a few years hence. They are the remnant of a once powerful and warlike tribe that has contended against civilization for three hundred years. All their traditions perpetuate the spirit of war. By their conflicts with the Spanish or Mexican forces and those of the United States they have become greatly reduced in numbers, but the feeling of animosity towards the white race has only been intensified.

After fully considering the subject in all its bearings, and, with Mr. Lamar, of the Interior Department, personally examining their condition, I believe they can be moved away from the mountain regions of Arizona and New Mexico and placed within the control of the Government, where they will no longer be a disturbing element or a menace to the scattered settlements. To do this with their consent would be most advisable and desirable, and after visiting their camps and talking with their leaders I have induced eleven of the principal men to go to Washington, under charge of Captain Dorst, Fourth United States Cavalry, to see the authorities and learn what the Government would do for them, and what it would expect them to do, and to see any lands that the Government can grant them. I presume it is not the purpose of the Government to keep permanently the seventy-two Apaches, mostly women and children, in Florida, where they were recently sent. They are a mountain race, accustomed to high altitudes, and would in a short time, most likely, die if kept in the lowlands of Florida. Should the Apaches in Arizona and Florida be permanently located in some place healthful and suited to their natural requirements, I believe the hostile element would surrender. They have several times evinced a disposition to do so; but if not, they could soon be overcome.

There is no one act that the Government could do to give greater satisfaction, confidence, and relief to the people of Arizona and New Mexico than the removal of these Indians. In order that it may be arranged without difficulty or violence, I respectfully recommend that an arrangement or settlement be made, similar to the one effected in the case of the Moses or Columbia River Indians in 1882 and 1883. It now costs the Government at least \$40,000 per annum to feed these Indians, and it takes hundreds of thousands of dollars annually (over and above the ordinary expense in time of peace) to keep the troops in the field actively campaigning against hostiles and to protect settlements scattered over a vast area of country. Aside from this, the detriment to the material interests of these Territories, caused by frequent outbreaks and raids of the Apache Indians, cannot well be estimated.

In view of these facts I have the honor to respectfully recommend that, in consideration of their good conduct and loyalty, the Indians in question be allowed to locate on the southeast side of the Wichita Mountains, on the Kiowa, Comanche, and Apache Reservation, in the Indian Territory. They would then be with a band that was formerly of the same tribe and speaking the same language. They would be more than a thousand miles away from the mountains of Arizona and where they could be easily controlled. At the same time the clear water of the mountains, the climate;

and the fertile soil would be congenial and beneficial to them. In order to satisfy them and make them self-sustaining, each family should have \$100 worth of farming utensils and \$200 worth of domestic stock the first year, and \$300 worth of stock the second year. When they were all brought together there should be 100 families; these would require \$30,000 the first year and \$30,000 the second year; after that they would require no further assistance. I would also recommend that \$5,000 be given the principal men in stock animals that would be useful to the tribe, and in such valuables as they would most require or appreciate. I am aware that there are legal objections to their being at once moved to the Indian Territory, but should this recommendation receive the approval of the Executive Department of the Government, I believe that Congress would be convinced of the importance and necessity of removing any legal objections to a measure that would secure peace to a very large section of the country.

Until they can be located with the Apaches, now in the Indian Territory, they could occupy the high lands on the military reservation at Fort Riley, Kans. I recommend that this delegation be allowed to see both places, and sufficient inducements granted them to insure their willing consent to the change. One of the most difficult things to do with Indians is to change their location, as they cling to their native country with great tenacity, and the effort has often caused Indian wars; hence I recommend that most liberal terms be granted them.

Very respectfully, your obedient servant,

NELSON A. MILES,
Brigadier-General, U. S. A.

The ASSISTANT ADJUTANT-GENERAL, DIVISION OF THE PACIFIC,
Presido of San Francisco, Cal.

[Indorsements on the foregoing letter of General Miles, dated July 7, 1886.]

HEADQUARTERS DIVISION OF THE PACIFIC,
Presido of San Francisco, Cal., July 19, 1886.

Respectfully forwarded to the Adjutant-General of the Army.
In the absence of the division commander:

C. MCKEEVER,
Assistant Adjutant-General.

HEADQUARTERS OF THE ARMY,
Washington, July 30, 1886.

Respectfully submitted to the Secretary of War. There are now on the reservation, near Fort Apache, seventy-one Chiricahuas and Warm Springs adult male Indians. These Indians are exclusive of those in this city. It is my belief that if the delegation which is now here goes back to the reservation without having received what they may deem the most satisfactory promises on the part of the Government, a large number of those that are now peaceable will endeavor to join Geronimo. I therefore recommend that authority be granted me to direct General Miles to immediately arrest all the male Indians now on the Chiricahua Reservation, near Fort Apache, and send them as prisoners to Fort Marion, Fla.; that the delegation now here be sent there also, and that they be held at that point as prisoners of war until the final solution of the Geronimo troubles.

P. H. SHERIDAN,
Lieutenant-General, Commanding.

[Telegram.]

ADJUTANT-GENERAL'S OFFICE,
Washington, July 8, 1886.

Brig. Gen. N. A. MILES,
Prescott, Ariz.:

The Lieutenant-General authorizes you to select one officer of your command to accompany the delegation of Apaches to Washington, D. C.

J. C. KELTON,
Acting Adjutant-General.

WAR DEPARTMENT,
Washington City, July 9, 1886.

SIR: I have the honor to transmit herewith, for your information, a copy of a telegram from the commanding general of the Department of Arizona of the 4th instant, relative to the removal of the Apache and Warm Springs Indians from Arizona and the sending

of a few of them to Washington, in charge of two officers of the Army, on the business of the location of such lands as the Government may be willing to grant to them, and also requesting that Captain Baldwin be ordered for duty in connection with this matter.

Attention is invited to the accompanying copy of a telegram of the 7th instant to the commanding general of the Department of Arizona, showing the action taken by the Lieutenant-General of the Army upon this request. I beg also to inclose herewith a copy of the remarks of the Lieutenant-General of the 7th instant, submitting this matter to the Department, and in regard to the same beg to request that you favor me with your views relative to the mode of bringing the party of Indians to Washington, should such action be decided upon, and whether officers of the Army will be required or not.

Very respectfully, your obedient servant,

WM. C. ENDICOTT,
Secretary of War

The SECRETARY OF THE INTERIOR.

DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR,
Washington, July 10, 1886.

SIR: I have read your letter of the 9th instant, inclosing copies of correspondence relative to the suggestion of General Miles, to send a few of the Apache and Warm Springs Indians from Arizona to Washington, and inviting my attention to the views of the Lieutenant-General of the Army on the subject, who is not favorable to the project of removal of Indians from Arizona, but thinks that they should be controlled where they now are. He, however, sees no objection to the delegation of Apaches coming to Washington, but does not consider it necessary that two officers should be detached to accompany them. In view of these remarks you request my views relative to the mode of bringing the party of Indians to Washington.

The Indians around Fort Apache have for a long time been under the control and management of the military branch of the service, and in my opinion any movement of any portion of them from the reservation for any purpose should be under the direction and management of officers of that branch of the service having control of them, and to whose supervision they are accustomed.

This Department does not read the Lieutenant-General's remarks as meaning that the delegation should not be accompanied by one officer, but rather that two officers are not necessary for that purpose.

I have the honor, therefore, to respectfully request that such instructions, if any are necessary, be communicated to General Miles as will enable him to carry out his suggestion relative to bringing a delegation of the Indians mentioned to this city.

Their coming here will, I believe, have a good effect, aside from any question regarding their removal to any other part of the country.

I have the honor to be, very respectfully,

L. Q. C. LAMAR,
Secretary.

The SECRETARY OF WAR.

[Telegram.]

HEADQUARTERS ARMY OF THE UNITED STATES,
Washington, D. C., July 13, 1886.

General NELSON A. MILES,
Fort Apache, Ariz.:

Send ten of the Apache and Warm Springs Indians to Washington under charge of one good officer from your department who knows them and upon arrival report them to the Secretary of the Interior.

P. H. SHERIDAN,
Lieutenant-General.

FIELD ORDERS }
No. 74. }

HEADQUARTERS DEPARTMENT OF ARIZONA,
Wilcox, Ariz., July 13, 1886.

[Extract.]

2. In compliance with telegraphic authority from the Lieutenant-General of the Army Capt. J. H. Dorst, Fourth Cavalry, now at Albuquerque, N. Mex., will take charge of the party of Indians upon his arrival at that place and conduct them to

Washington, D. C., and report with them to the Secretary of the Interior, also reporting his arrival to the Adjutant-General of the Army.

Upon the completion of this duty he will return with the party of Indians in charge to Fort Apache, Ariz., and then rejoin his proper station.

The journey, as directed, is necessary for the public service.

By command of Brigadier-General Miles.

J. A. DAPRAY,
Second Lieutenant Twenty-third Infantry, A. D. C.

Official.

M. BARBER,
Assistant Adjutant-General.

[Telegram.]

HEADQUARTERS DIVISION OF THE PACIFIC,
Presidio of San Francisco, Cal., July 13, 1886.

ADJUTANT-GENERAL,
Washington, D. C.:

Following telegram just received from General Miles, dated Fort Apache, July 12: "In order to secure a permanent peace in Arizona and New Mexico, it is of the highest importance that the Statutes, paragraph 313, chapter 87, Forty-fifth Congress, be so far modified as to authorize the President to locate a small band of Apaches, not exceeding 500, in the Indian Territory. A part of the tribe are already there. If this can be done it will save to Government at least \$300,000 annually, besides many lives. If this meets the approval of the Department, I earnestly request that the subject be laid before Congress with as little delay as possible."

In absence of division commander.

C. MCKEEVER,
Assistant Adjutant-General.

[Indorsement on the foregoing telegram.]

HEADQUARTERS OF THE ARMY,
Washington, July 14, 1886.

Respectfully submitted to the Secretary of War, with copy for the Department of the Interior.

P. H. SHERIDAN,
Lieutenant-General, Commanding.

[Extract from Statutes at Large, Forty-fifth Congress, third session, chapter 87, page 313.]

CHAP. 87.—AN ACT making appropriations for the current and contingent expenses of the Indian Department, and for fulfilling treaty stipulations with various Indian tribes, for the year ending June thirtieth, eighteen hundred and eighty, and for other purposes.

Approved, February 17, 1879.

* * * * *

REMOVAL, SETTLEMENT, SUBSISTENCE, AND SUPPORT OF INDIANS.

* * * * *

Collecting and subsisting Apaches and other Indians of Arizona and New Mexico: For this amount to subsist and properly care for the Apache and other Indians in Arizona and New Mexico who have been or may be collected on reservations in New Mexico or Arizona, three hundred and twenty thousand dollars. And the President of the United States is hereby directed to prohibit the removal of any portion of said tribes of Indians to the Indian Territory unless the same shall be hereafter authorized by act of Congress.

* * * * *

WAR DEPARTMENT, Washington City, July 14, 1886.

DEAR SIR: I have the honor to inclose herewith a copy of a telegram from General Miles, dated at Fort Apache, Ariz., July 12th instant, touching the importance of a modification of the act of Congress of February 17, 1879 (chapter 87, Forty-fifth Congress), so as to authorize the President to locate a small band of Apaches in the

Indian Territory, together with an extract from the act referred to, which prohibits the course indicated.

We have no information at this Department upon the subject, except what is contained in this telegram, and, of course, there are no provisions of law under which the removal of these Indians to the Indian Territory could be made.

The only possible means by which such result could be accomplished would be through an act of Congress, and the question whether endeavor should be made to obtain such an act is one for your consideration and judgment. An early reply is desired that the telegram of General Miles may be answered.

Very truly yours,

WM. C. ENDICOTT,
Secretary of War.

Hon. L. Q. C. LAMAR,
Secretary of the Interior.

[Telegram.]

HEADQUARTERS ARMY OF THE UNITED STATES,
Washington, D. C., July 15, 1886.

General NELSON A. MILES,
Wilcox, Ariz.:

The Secretary of War directs me to say, after consultation with the President and the Secretary of the Interior, that it will be impossible at this time to procure legislation in regard to the removal of the Apaches to the Indian Territory, and all hope of so doing must be abandoned. The military movements must therefore proceed in view of the present arrangements in regard to these Indians.

P. H. SHERIDAN,
Lieutenant-General, commanding.

[Telegram.]

ALBUQUERQUE, N. MEX., *July 15, 1886.*

Lieutenant-General SHERIDAN,
Washington, D. C.:

Party of thirteen Indians, with interpreter, were on the road by rail before your telegram fixing number at ten was received. They are under charge of Captain Dorst, Fourth Cavalry; should reach Washington Saturday night.

MILES,
Commanding.

[Telegram.]

FORT BOWIE, ARIZ., VIA WILCOX, *July 20, 1886.*

General P. H. SHERIDAN,
Commanding Army, Washington, D. C.:

Owing to my absence your telegram July 15 just received. Military movements have at no time ceased against the hostile Indians. The settlement with Moses or Columbia River Indians was not confirmed by Congress or appropriation available until a year after. If the small band of Apaches can be induced to permanently locate in Indian Territory I believe they would require only the assurance of the authorities that all obstructions would be removed and the necessary appropriations made on their guaranty that they should be returned in case of failure; in the mean time they could move and remain at Fort Riley, Union, or such place as you deem advisable, if this suggestion meets your approval.

MILES,
Brigadier-General.

[Telegram.]

HEADQUARTERS ARMY OF THE UNITED STATES,
Washington, D. C., July 31, 1886.

General NELSON A. MILES,
Wilcox, Ariz.:

The proposition to remove the Chiricahua and Warm Springs Indians to any reservation or military post west of the Missouri River can not be entertained.

The President wishes me to ask what you think of the proposition to forcibly arrest all on the reservation and send them to Fort Marion, Fla., where they can be joined by the party now here.

P. H. SHERIDAN,
Lieutenant-General, Commanding.

[Telegram.]

WILCOX, ARIZ., August 1, 1886.

Lieutenant-General SHERIDAN,
Washington, D. C. :

There would be some advantage, but some serious objections occur to me, which I will explain fully by letter; the favorable reports have evidently excited feeling against that delegation and frightened and broken their confidence. There is no hurry about this matter. I recommend that Captain Dorst take them to Carlisle under his and Captain Pratt's influence; their confidence will be restored so that some of that number go to Florida to visit those there and return to Carlisle. By that time I hope runners, who started for Geronimo's camp the same time they started for Washington, will return. We will then know disposition of all and can take definite action.

MILES,
Commanding.

HEADQUARTERS DEPARTMENT OF ARIZONA,
Wilcox, Ariz., August 2, 1886.

GENERAL: In answer to your inquiry as to the advisability of forcibly removing the Chiricahua and Warm Springs Indians now on the military reservation of Fort Apache, together with the delegation from these tribes now in Washington, to Fort Marion, Fla., I have the honor to reply that the advantages and objections appear to me as follows: First. It would be a great relief to the citizens of Arizona to know that they were all out of this mountainous country, and it would avoid trouble with those tribes in future. Second. It would relieve a strong force of troops that are now keeping watch over them or guarding the settlements against any outbreaks. If relieved the troops could occupy the Mexican frontier or be available for any service.

The objections to the measure appear to be serious. First. As the delegation went to Washington by authority of the Government with a view of making some permanent arrangement for their future, I fear it would be charged that the Government had taken advantage of them, and believe the Indians would consider it an act of bad faith. Second. It would be known by all other Indian tribes in the southwest, and they might in future hesitate about sending any of their number to Washington, even at the request of the Government. Third. I think it would necessitate a war of extermination against those that are down in Old Mexico, for if banishment were the fate of those that have been peaceable they would expect theirs to be much worse, and I think all would have to be killed before any more would surrender.

The difficulty of dealing with those Indians, I believe, has arisen from hostile feeling excited toward them since they arrived in Washington. They are wild, suspicious Indians, and their confidence is easily broken.

Although attached to their native country, I believe before leaving Fort Apache they were prepared to make any fair and reasonable arrangement to conform to the wishes of the Government, and still think their confidence can be restored by the means suggested in my telegram of yesterday.

The charge that Chatto, the leading spirit and bravest of the tribes, has committed serious crimes, is undoubtedly true, as it is of every other representative of the wild Indians that has appeared in Washington from the days of Red Jacket to the present time. That he was present or concerned in the murder of Judge McComas and family is a matter of some doubt, as he is said to have been in another place at the time. This is not a local, county, or Territorial affair; the Government has assumed the responsibility of dealing with them, and has had them under punishment ever since war was commenced on the tribes as a body, and it appears to me that the Government is fully justified and warranted in making final disposition of them as wards of the nation, as it has of every other tribe.

Another embarrassment which the Government is obliged to meet is the fact that the people of Arizona and New Mexico are loud in their appeals for the removal of these Indians. At the same time part of the press of Texas and Kansas has raised a protest against their being sent east, and especially to the Indian country; and yet, should nearly six hundred mountain Indians, accustomed to live in altitudes thousands of feet above the level of the sea, be sent to Florida permanently, it might excite equal opposition from the Eastern press, and result in their being returned in a few years, the same as was done with the seventy-five Indian murderers sent there in

1875. The status of the Indians is this: Those at the agency have been kept under a close military surveillance by Lieutenant-Colonel Wade, a very efficient officer, and have not been allowed to render assistance to the hostiles. The followers of Geronimo and Natchez have been so closely pursued by the troops that they have had scarcely two nights' rest in the same place since they commenced hostilities—April 27. They have killed but fourteen persons in the Territories of the United States, the last one June 5, and were on our soil but twenty-three days before they were driven out. In five encounters with the troops they have lost in numbers, and also by desertion. The latest information was that they were much reduced, and that there was great disaffection among them, and measures that are now being taken will add still more to their discomfiture.

In view of these facts, I am convinced that if a fair and just arrangement can be made with those on the military reservation, near Fort Apache, to move from 500 to 1,000 miles east, and those in Florida and the hostiles that surrender be sent to join them, the desired end will be reached. There must be some safe place where the Government can locate these wards away from the cañons and mountains of Arizona that would be agreeable to them. There certainly can be no harm or violation of law in allowing them to visit the eastern part of the Indian Territory. They would see how other Indians prosper, and I believe the effect would be good. (For some reasons, what is known as "No Man's Land" might be the most available ground, as it would be entirely free from State or Territorial interference and the Government would have them under absolute control.) Whatever locality may be selected, I believe this method would speedily result in a peace most desirable and permanent.

Very respectfully, your obedient servant,

NELSON A. MILES,
Brigadier-General, Commanding,

Lieutenant-General SHERIDAN,
Commanding the Army, Washington, D. C.

[Indorsement on the foregoing letter of General Miles to the Lieutenant-General, dated August 2, 1886.]

HEADQUARTERS OF THE ARMY, August 9, 1886.

Respectfully submitted to the Secretary of War.

P. H. SHERIDAN,
Lieutenant-General, Commanding.

WAR DEPARTMENT,
Washington City, August 2, 1886.

SIR: The Secretary of War directs that the necessary instructions be given for the return of Captain Dorst and the party of Apache Indians and interpreters to Camp Apache via Carlisle, Pa. Orders will also be given for the pay of the interpreters and for the subsistence of the Apache Indian scouts on their way home.

Very respectfully, your obedient servant,

JOHN TWEEDALE,
Chief Clerk.

The ADJUTANT-GENERAL.

[Transcript from the Edt. Book, A. G. O.]

3827, A. G. O., 1886, August 2, 1886. Secretary of War directs that necessary instructions are to be given for the return of Captain Dorst and the party of Apache Indians and interpreters to Camp Apache via Carlisle, Pa. Orders will be also given for the pay of the interpreters and for the subsistence of the Apache Indian scouts on their way home.

Official copy respectfully referred to the Quartermaster-General, who will furnish the necessary transportation for the return journey from this city via Carlisle, Pa., to Fort Apache, Ariz., of Capt. J. H. Dorst, Fourth Cavalry, and of the party of Apache Indians, interpreters, and Indian scouts; also furnish funds for the pay of the interpreters. The matter of subsistence has been attended to.

By order of the Secretary of War.

R. C. DRUM,
Adjutant-General.

WAR DEPARTMENT, August 2, 1886.

Official copy respectfully referred to the Commissary-General of Subsistence, who will furnish the party of Apache Indian scouts referred to within with \$1.50 each for their subsistence while *en route* from this city via Carlisle, Pa., on their way home to Fort Apache.

By order of the Secretary of War.

R. C. DRUM,
Adjutant-General.

WAR DEPARTMENT, August 2, 1886.

[Telegram.]

HEADQUARTERS ARMY OF THE UNITED STATES,
Washington, D. C., August 3, 1886.

General NELSON A. MILES,
Wilcox, Ariz.:

Your telegram of August 1 received and submitted to the Secretary of War and the President for their information.

P. H. SHERIDAN,
Lieutenant-General.

[Telegram.]

CARLISLE, PA., August 4, 1886.

General SHERIDAN, U. S. A.,
Washington:

Arrived last night and reported for further orders. Can find means to keep the Indians interested for four or five days, if necessary, and they will be more contented than they were in Washington.

DORST, Captain.

HEADQUARTERS OF THE ARMY,
Washington, August 4, 1886.

Respectfully submitted to the Secretary of War, recommending that Captain Dorst be authorized to remain at Carlisle with this delegation of Indians for five days, and that he then return with them to Fort Apache, Ariz.

P. H. SHERIDAN,
Lieutenant-General, Commanding.

[Telegram.]

ADJUTANT-GENERAL'S OFFICE,
Washington, August 4, 1886.

Capt. J. H. DORST,
Fourth Cavalry, Carlisle, Pa.:

The Secretary of War, approving the recommendation of the Lieutenant-General, commanding, authorizes you to remain at Carlisle with the delegation of Indians for five days; after expiration of that time you will return with them to Fort Apache, Ariz.

J. C. KELTON,
Assistant Adjutant-General.

[Telegram.]

WILCOX, ARIZ., August 5, 1886.

ADJUTANT-GENERAL OF THE ARMY,
Washington, D. C.:

As I am responsible for sending that delegation of Indians to Washington, I request that they remain at Carlisle until my letters are received in Washington and until such time as I recommend their return.

MILES,
Commanding.

[Indorsements on the foregoing.]

ADJUTANT-GENERAL'S OFFICE,
Washington, August 6, 1886.

Respectfully submitted to the Lieutenant-General commanding the Army.

R. C. DRUM,
Adjutant-General.

HEADQUARTERS OF THE ARMY,
Washington, D. C., August 6, 1886.

Respectfully submitted to the Secretary of War. The orders already issued in this matter should be adhered to.

P. H. SHERIDAN,
Lieutenant-General, Commanding.

WILCOX, ARIZ., August 5, 1886.

Mr. L. Q. C. LAMAR, Jr.,
Washington, D. C.:

Understand Indians are ordered back in five days. I had requested they remain in Carlisle until my letters were received in Washington and until runners return from Geronimo's camp, and I hope it may be done. Will write you to-day.

NELSON A. MILES.

[Telegram.]

ADJUTANT-GENERAL'S OFFICE,
Washington, August 6, 1886.

COMMANDING GENERAL DEPARTMENT ARIZONA,
Wilcox, Ariz.:

The Secretary of War will not comply with request to retain Indians at Carlisle, for reasons stated in your dispatch of yesterday, without further information upon this subject.

R. C. DRUM,
Adjutant-General.

[Telegram.]

WILCOX, ARIZ., August 6, 1886.

ADJUTANT-GENERAL OF ARMY,
Washington, D. C.:

Secretary of War will receive further information upon receipt of my letter now on the way to Washington. Should Indians return without anything being accomplished and insist upon remaining in the mountains of Arizona in defiance of recommendation of military authorities and the appeals of the people of the Territories, outbreaks and disturbances may be expected for next twenty years. Their presence has been a menace to the people of this country ever since they were placed there. The military reasons are sufficient and the opportunity favorable for making an arrangement with them by which they may be located outside of the Territories of Arizona and New Mexico, and I can see no objection to a handful of Indians remaining at Carlisle, where some of them have children, until a question which involves the lives, property, and peace of the people of this section can be satisfactorily decided.

MILES,
Commanding.

[Indorsement on the foregoing.]

HEADQUARTERS OF THE ARMY,
Washington, August 7, 1886.

Respectfully submitted to the Secretary of War.

P. H. SHERIDAN,
Lieutenant-General, Commanding.

DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR,
Washington, August 7, 1886.

SIR: I have the honor to inclose herewith a telegram from General Nelson A. Miles to Mr. L. Q. C. Lamar, jr., the special agent of this Department, recently sent to confer with him at the San Carlos Indian Reservation, Ariz., requesting the further detention of the delegation of Apache Indians now at Carlisle en route to their reservation.

The telegram indicates that the early return of the delegation of Indians to their reservation may affect or interfere with some of General Miles's plans for securing possession of Geronimo and his hostile band of Indians, which may be avoided by a few days further delay, which I think is greatly to be desired.

The matter is respectfully forwarded for the action of your Department.

I have the honor to be, very respectfully,

L. Q. C. LAMAR,
Secretary.

The SECRETARY OF WAR.

[Telegram.]

ADJUTANT-GENERAL'S OFFICE,
Washington, August 9, 1886.Capt. J. H. DORST,
Fourth Cavalry, Carlisle, Pa. :

The Secretary of War directs you to delay at Carlisle with Indians until you receive further orders.

R. C. DRUM,
Adjutant-General.

[Telegram.]

ADJUTANT-GENERAL'S OFFICE,
Washington, August 9, 1886.COMMANDING GENERAL DEPARTMENT ARIZONA,
Wilcox, Ariz. :

Secretary of War has consented to the delay of Captain Dorst with Indians now at Carlisle until further orders. Dorst so advised.

J. C. KELTON,
Assistant Adjutant-General.

NOTE.—Owing to failure of telegraph lines, this dispatch was not received by Captain Dorst, and commanding general Division Missouri was directed to find where telegram could reach him. (See telegram to commanding general Division Missouri from Adjutant-General, dated August 11, 1886, at head of next page.)

DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR,
Washington, August 10, 1886.

SIR: I have the honor to return herewith the inclosed papers relating to the subject of the removal of the Chiricahua and Warm Springs Apache Indians from Arizona to some point in the east.

The point suggested in the telegram of the Lieutenant-General of the 31st ultimo, for the consideration of General Miles, as a place to which they may be removed as prisoners of war, is Fort Marion, Fla., while General Miles considers that some safe place, from 500 to 1,000 miles eastward of their present locality, somewhere in the Indian Territory or in the neutral strip of public land west of that Territory and north of the Pan Handle of Texas, more suitable for the purpose and more agreeable to the Indians.

If they are to be kept in close confinement, where they can have little or no opportunities of doing mischief, I think Fort Marion offers the best advantages. It is not suited for training the Indians in the industries, but there they can be kept and disciplined until it shall be safe and proper to place them upon a reservation where they may be allowed more liberties.

The existing law is against the removal of these Indians to any part of the Indian Territory.

The strip of public land referred to above is not a suitable place for them, at this time at least, as there is no organization for an agency there, no houses for stores or shelter for employes, and there are no funds that can be used by this Department for the establishment and equipment of such an agency as would be necessary for the proper management of those Indians on that strip of "public land."

It would also require the presence of quite a large force of troops properly stationed in that locality to keep the Indians from leaving and going back to the mountains of New Mexico and Arizona.

It seems to me that their removal to Fort Marion as prisoners of war is at the present time the most practicable solution of the matter if they are to be removed from their present locality.

I have the honor to be, very respectfully,

L. Q. C. LAMAR,
Secretary.

The SECRETARY OF WAR.

[Telegram.]

ADJUTANT-GENERAL'S OFFICE,
Washington, August 11, 1886.

COMMANDING GENERAL DIVISION OF THE MISSOURI,
Chicago, Ill.:

Please ascertain where you can reach Captain Dorst, Fourth Cavalry, who is in charge of Apache Indians returning to Arizona, and direct him, by order of the Secretary of War, to take Indians to Fort Leavenworth, Kans., and remain there with them until further orders. Acknowledge receipt,

R. C. DRUM,
Adjutant-General.

(Telegraph same to Maj. Chas. W. Foster, in charge of the quartermaster's depot, Turner building, No. 304 N. Eighth street, St. Louis, Mo. Same to station master at Kansas City, Mo.

[Telegram.]

ST. LOUIS, MO., August 11, 1886.

ADJUTANT-GENERAL,
Washington, D. C.:

Your telegram regarding Captain Dorst and Indians just received. Have telegraphed Secretary's order to Captain Dorst, and expect it to reach him at Topeka before his train leaves there at 1.20 to-day.

FOSTER,
Quartermaster.

[Telegram.]

ST. LOUIS, MO., August 11, 1886.

Capt. DORST, U. S. ARMY,
In Charge Apache Indians, on No. 1 west-bound Express, Topeka, Kans.:

The Secretary of War directs me to telegraph you to take the Indians now under your charge to Fort Leavenworth, Kans., and remain there with them until further orders. Please acknowledge receipt.

C. W. FOSTER,
Quartermaster, U. S. A., Depot Quartermaster.

[Telegram.]

CHICAGO, ILL., August 11, 1886.

ADJUTANT-GENERAL U. S. ARMY,
Washington, D. C.:

Your dispatch relating to Captain Dorst and Apache Indians received. Please inform me from what point and at what time Captain Dorst starts with the Indians and the route by which he is expected to travel.

ALFRED H. TERRY,
Major-General, Commanding.

[Telegram.]

ADJUTANT-GENERAL'S OFFICE,
Washington, August 11, 1886.

COMMANDING GENERAL DIVISION MISSOURI,
Chicago, Ill.:

Dispatch received. I have probably reached Captain Dorst through Major Foster, quartermaster, St. Louis, who telegraphs that instructions will reach Dorst at 1.20 p. m. to-day at Topeka, Kans.

R. C. DRUM,
Adjutant-General.

[Telegram.]

KANSAS CITY, MO, August 11, 1886.

R. S. DRUM,

Adjutant-General, Washington, D. C.:

Party left here this morning; have wired W. F. White, of Santa Fé road, to have them returned here. Will advise you later.

DEPOT MASTER.

DEPOT QUARTERMASTER'S OFFICE,
St. Louis, Mo., August 12, 1886.

The ADJUTANT-GENERAL U. S. ARMY,
Washington, D. C.:

SIR: The following is a copy of a telegram sent you yesterday afternoon:

"Captain Dorst acknowledges from Emporia, Kans., the receipt of instructions to proceed with Indians to Fort Leavenworth. Will change back at Newton, Kans., at 4.40 to-night."

Very respectfully, your obedient servant,

C. W. FOSTER,
Quartermaster, U. S. Army, Depot Quartermaster.

[Telegram.]

ALBUQUERQUE, N. MEX.,
August 13, 1886.

ADJUTANT-GENERAL, *Washington, D. C.:*

I request that Captain Dorst be directed to leave those Indians temporarily under charge of an officer at Fort Leavenworth, Kans., and report to me in person at Albuquerque; on completion of this duty to return to Fort Leavenworth.

MILES,
Commanding.

[Telegram.]

ADJUTANT-GENERAL'S OFFICE,
Washington, August 14, 1886.

COMMANDING GENERAL, DIVISION MISSOURI,
Chicago, Ill.:

Upon request of General Miles, the Acting Secretary of War directs that you give the necessary orders for Capt. J. H. Dorst, Fourth Cavalry, now at Fort Leavenworth, Kans., in charge of Apache Indians, to report to General Miles in person at Albuquerque, N. Mex., and on completion of that duty to return to Fort Leavenworth. During his absence the Indians will be left in charge of an officer at that post.

O. D. GREENE,
Acting Adjutant-General.

[Telegram.]

ADJUTANT-GENERAL'S OFFICE,
Washington, August 14, 1886.

COMMANDING-GENERAL, DEPARTMENT ARIZONA,
Albuquerque, N. Mex.:

Captain Dorst has been instructed to report to you in person at Albuquerque, as requested in your dispatch of yesterday.

O. D. GREENE,
Acting Adjutant-General.

[Special Orders No. 88.]

HEADQUARTERS DEPARTMENT OF THE MISSOURI,
Fort Leavenworth, Kans., August 14, 1886.

Pursuant to directions from the Acting Secretary of War, Capt. J. H. Dorst, Fourth Cavalry, now at Fort Leavenworth, Kans., in charge of a party of Apache Indians, will report in person to Brig. Gen. Nelson A. Miles, U. S. Army, at Albuquerque, N. Mex., and upon completion of the duty connected therewith he will return to this point.

During the absence of Captain Dorst, First Lieut. J. O. Mackay, Third Cavalry, will assume charge of the Indians, and Captain Dorst will turn over to this officer such instructions as he may have concerning them.

The travel enjoined is necessary for the public service.

By order of Brigadier-General Potter :

R. G. HILL,
Aide-de-Camp.

[Telegram.]

WAR DEPARTMENT,
Washington City, August 14, 1886.

Captain DORST,
Fourth Cavalry, Fort Leavenworth Kans. :

Please communicate for the information of the President the frame of mind of the Indians under your charge, especially as to their reception here, and whether it is of a nature that would add to existing complications should they return to their agency.

R. C. DRUM,
Acting Secretary of War.

[Telegram.]

FORT LEAVENWORTH, KANS., *August 14, 1886.*

ADJUTANT-GENERAL, U. S. ARMY,
Washington, D. C. :

After leaving Carlisle the Indians appeared convinced they were to remain undisturbed at Fort Apache. Chatto had not received written assurance he requested, but the present of a medal from Secretary Interior, the possession of an unimportant certificate from Captain Bourke and Secretary of War, and the fact he had not been told he would have to move seemed to satisfy him. The detention here causes much uneasiness because only surmises can be offered in explanation. I have tried to quiet their fears, but Chatto has just told me they believe their families will be moved here to meet them. Interpreter Bowman says that if some reasonable explanation is given and they are allowed to proceed home at once, no trouble due to present circumstances need be apprehended. His opinion is entitled to consideration, but since their suspicion is aroused, I hesitate to say they can be so completely removed that the recollection of them will cause no lurking uneasiness. Whether they return or stay here, I would like to have something to tell them coming from high authority.

DORST, *Captain.*

[Telegram.]

WAR DEPARTMENT,
ADJUTANT-GENERAL'S OFFICE,
Washington, August 16, 1886.

Capt. JOSEPH H. DORST,
(Care commanding general,)
Fort Leavenworth :

Your telegram received and confirmed apprehensions here. The removal of the Indians from Fort Apache is now so probable that you must arrange to get along with those with you until removal is effected. In the mean time something is expected from your interview with General Miles at Albuquerque.

R. C. DRUM,
Adjutant-General.

[Telegram.]

ALBUQUERQUE, N. MEX.,
August 20, 1886ADJUTANT-GENERAL, U. S. ARMY,
Washington, D. C. :

Captain Dorst reports that the Indians that are now at Fort Leavenworth received some kind of certificate in Washington that appeared to give them great assurance, and that when he parted with them their conduct was defiant and insolent. Should they return with the feeling that they were entirely independent of the military authorities as well as the civil Government, their control would be most difficult and their presence more dangerous to the peace of this country. I have directed him to inform them on his return that they can be either *treaty Indians* or that they must be regarded as prisoners of war and must abide by what disposition the Government deems best for the welfare of all concerned. I have given him a memorandum to propose to them as the just and liberal terms of the Government, practically as stated in my letter of July 7, viz: to move to such place as the Government deems best and await such time as reservation or a place of residence shall be provided for them outside of Territories of Arizona and New Mexico. Should they accept it, a part can remain at Leavenworth and a part return to accompany the balance of the tribe. Colonel Wade, commanding Fort Apache, who is now here, informs me that he can move those at Apache without difficulty, and arrangements have already been considered. The discomfiture of the hostiles renders the time favorable, and, as the measure is of vital importance, I pray that it may receive the approval of the Government.

MILES,
Commanding Department Arizona.

[Indorsement on foregoing.]

HEADQUARTERS OF THE ARMY,
Washington, August 21, 1886.

Respectfully submitted to the Acting Secretary of War, with copy for the information of the Department of the Interior.

P. H. SHERIDAN,
Lieutenant-General, Commanding.

The above dispatch from General Miles was telegraphed by the Acting Secretary of War to the Secretary of War, Salem, Mass., August 21, 1886, and to the President, Saranac Inn, Bloomingdale, Essex County, N. Y., August 21, 1886.

WAR DEPARTMENT,
Washington City, August 24, 1886.

SIR: Having transmitted by telegraph to the President and the Secretary of War General Miles's telegram of the 20th instant, the inclosed are their replies. As it is of importance that General Miles should have the President's views at the earliest practicable moment, I beg to request your opinion as to the President's views as soon as you can conveniently furnish it.

Very respectfully, your obedient servant,

R. C. DRUM,
Acting Secretary of War.

The SECRETARY OF THE INTERIOR.

[Extract of a letter from the Secretary of War to the Adjutant-General and Acting Secretary of War.]

Now, as to the telegram you have sent the substance of, from Miles. I understand him to say that there is no trouble now at Fort Apache, and arrangements have already been considered—that is, he can capture them all and send them away from the Territories of Arizona and New Mexico, and those on their way from here, now at Leavenworth, can, a portion, remain at Leavenworth, and the balance be taken away with the others; but he does not say where he proposes to take them, though he must have been informed by Captain Dorst what the views of the President were in that regard, viz, that the place of confinement should be Fort Marion, Fla. The only hesitation the President had in regard to this course arose from his desire to be assured by General Miles that all of this dangerous band could be secured and successfully conveyed away; for if a few should escape and take to the war-path the results would be altogether too serious. If, therefore, General Miles can accomplish

this, and take them to Fort Marion from Arizona, the course approved by the President can be carried out so far as that part of the band at Fort Apache is concerned.

As to Chatto and those with him, it was thought proper that he should be taken back to Arizona, to be sent to Marion with the others, and not taken directly there.

As before stated to General Miles, there is no other place available, the Indian Territory being out of the question for many reasons. They are to be treated as prisoners of war, and no hopes can be held out to them in regard to the Indian Territory.

General Sheridan and Mr. Lamar, or both, I presume are in Washington. I wish you would show them the above, so far as the Apaches are concerned, and unless some suggestion of disapproval is made by them I think a final order to carry out the original intention should issue—to take the whole band of Chiricahuas at Fort Apache, and Chatto's people on their return, and convey them to Fort Marion to join those already there.

[Indorsement on foregoing.]

HEADQUARTERS OF THE ARMY,
August 24, 1886.

I concur with the views of the Secretary of War.

P. H. SHERIDAN,
Lieutenant-General, Commanding.

WAR DEPARTMENT,
Washington City, August 24, 1886.

SIR: Seeing that Fort Marion appeared to be agreed upon as the place at which to hold the Apaches on their capture or surrender as prisoners of war, and having no data here from which to judge of its capacity, etc., I sent the following telegram to the commanding officer at St. Augustine, Fla.:

"What number of Indians—men, women, and children—can, in addition to the number now at St. Augustine, be accommodated there? Should it be determined to increase the number by some four or five hundred, what preparation would be necessary and what probable expenditure required?"

In reply I received the following:

"Can accommodate seventy-five men, women, and children in addition to those now here. Fort Marion is a small place; all must live in tents. Have tentage by taking battery tents. Need no particular preparation, but will have to expend \$200 for additional tent floor, privies, and lavatories. Would recommend no more Indians be sent here. More details by mail."

Very respectfully,

R. C. DRUM,
Acting Secretary of War.

The LIEUTENANT-GENERAL OF THE ARMY.

DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR,
Washington, August 25, 1886.

SIR: I have the honor to acknowledge the receipt of your Department letter of 24th instant, inclosing copy of a telegram of 20th August, 1886, addressed to the Adjutant-General, U. S. Army, Washington, by General Miles, concerning report made to him by Captain Dorst of the feeling manifested by the Apache prisoners now at Fort Leavenworth, and urging that the disposal of the Chiricahuas, now in the hands of the Government as heretofore determined may be adhered to; also inclosing copy of a dispatch from the President and extract of a letter from the honorable Secretary of War relative to the disposal of these Indians and the others of the Chiricahuas who may hereafter surrender or be captured by the military.

I concur in the views expressed by the Secretary of War and the President. The imperative necessity for taking some measure to remove those Indians from their present locality seems to be agreed upon by General Sheridan and General Miles. Their removal to Fort Marion, with the lights before me, is the only present practicable disposition to be made of them.

I have the honor to be, very respectfully,

L. Q. C. LAMAR,
Secretary.

The SECRETARY OF WAR.

[Telegram.]

PRESIDIO OF SAN FRANCISCO, CAL.,
August 25, 1886.

ADJUTANT-GENERAL,
Washington, D. C.:

The Associated Press dispatches declare that the President has determined upon the removal of San Carlos Indians to Florida or elsewhere. Have instructions been issued to General Miles to take proper precautions against the possible flight of all these Indians to join the hostiles as soon as the news of the said removal shall reach them? No word of such decision has passed through me.

O. O. HOWARD,
Major-General, Commanding Division.

[Indorsements on foregoing.]

Respectfully submitted to the Lieutenant-General commanding.

J. C. KELTON,
Assistant Adjutant-General.

ADJUTANT-GENERAL'S OFFICE, August 26, 1886.

The Adjutant-General will inform General Howard that the Acting Secretary of War has directly communicated with General Miles on this matter, and the Lieutenant-General has no directions to give.

By command of Lieutenant-General Sheridan:

M. V. SHERIDAN,
Assistant Adjutant-General.

HEADQUARTERS OF THE ARMY, August 27, 1886.

[Telegram.]

ADJUTANT-GENERAL'S OFFICE,
Washington, August 27, 1886.

COMMANDING GENERAL,
Division Pacific, Presidio of San Francisco, Cal.:

Dispatches of 25th received. The orders of the President on the question of removal of the San Carlos Indians are as follows:

"I do not think the Apache Indians should be treated otherwise than as prisoners of war. As it is quite certain they will not agree with the Government as to their location, which I am satisfied should be Fort Marion, and since we are informed that their removal can now be successfully accomplished, I think it should be done at once, and that the state of feeling reported as existing among them at Fort Leavenworth justifies us in preventing the return of any of them to the reservation."

J. C. KELTON,
Acting Adjutant-General.

[Telegram.]

HEADQUARTERS ARMY OF THE UNITED STATES,
Washington, D. C., August 25, 1886.

The Secretary of the Interior has shown me your telegram to Lamar, jr., of August 25. The President will not entertain the proposition of moving these Indians at this time to any reservation west of the Missouri River. The President, the Secretary of War, the Secretary of the Interior, and myself all agree that as a preliminary step they must go to Fort Marion, Fla.

P. H. SHERIDAN,
Lieutenant-General.

General NELSON A. MILES,
Wilcox, Ariz.

[Telegram.]

HUACHUCA, ARIZ., August 25, 1886.

ADJUTANT-GENERAL,
Washington, D. C.:

Satisfactory arrangements have been made with those Indians at Leavenworth with the distinct understanding that a part remain there until the arrangement is carried out, and I request that Captain Dorst be ordered to send two to Wilcox Ariz., and take four, with two interpreters, to Holbrook, Ariz., without delay. Please answer at Wilcox.

MILES,
Commanding.

(The above information was telegraphed by the Acting Secretary of War to the Secretary of War, Glen House, White Mountains, N. H., August 26, 1886.)

[Telegram.]

GLEN HOUSE, N. H.,
August 26, 1886.General R. C. DRUM,
Washington, D. C.:

Telegram received. Let order issue to Dorst as requested by General Miles. I presume it is to be part of the arrangement having in view the removal to Fort Marion. Your suggestion that the Quartermaster-General take immediate action in providing quarters is approved.

* * * * *
W. C. ENDICOTT,
Secretary of War.

WILCOX, ARIZ., August 26, 1886.

Lieutenant-General P. H. SHERIDAN,
Commanding the Army, Washington, D. C.:

Your telegram received. Please see my telegram to Adjutant-General, August 6th, regarding Indians being sent back to Apache without anything being accomplished; also my telegram, August 20th, regarding independent and insolent manner of Indians. Telegraph line to Apache has been down three days, and should the reports published all over the country about Fort Marion, or any assurances from Mexico of protection and privilege to raid American settlements, reach Indians at Apache before my order for their removal does, they are all liable to be on the war-path. Yesterday I requested that Captain Dorst be ordered to take four Indians and interpreters from Leavenworth to Holbrook, and send two to Wilcox.

MILES,
Commanding.

[Telegram.]

WAR DEPARTMENT, ADJUTANT-GENERAL'S OFFICE,
Washington, August 26, 1886.COMMANDING GENERAL,
Division of the Missouri, Chicago, Ill.:

The Acting Secretary of War directs you to instruct Captain Dorst, Fourth Cavalry, in charge of Apaches at Fort Leavenworth, to send two of the Indians in his charge to Wilcox, Ariz., and to take four of the Indians, with two interpreters, to Holbrook, Ariz., without delay.

J. C. KELTON,
Acting Adjutant-General.

[Telegram.]

ADJUTANT-GENERAL'S OFFICE,
Washington, August 26, 1886.

General N. A. MILES,
Commanding Department Arizona, Wilcox, Ariz.:

Acting Secretary of War has approved your telegraphic request of yesterday, and orders given through Division Missouri for Dorst to send two of his Indians to Wilcox, and take four of them, with two interpreters, to Holbrook, Ariz.

J. C. KELTON,
Acting Adjutant-General.

DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR,
Washington, August 26, 1886.

General R. C. DRUM,
Adjutant-General, U. S. A., Washington, D. C.:

DEAR SIR: I have just read the dispatch of General Miles, commanding, dated August 25, at Huachuca, stating that satisfactory arrangements have been made with the Indians at Fort Leavenworth, with distinct understanding that a part remain there until arrangement is carried out, and requesting that Captain Dorst be ordered to send two to Wilcox, Ariz., and take four with two interpreters to Holbrook, Ariz., without delay; and wants an answer at Wilcox.

I think it is the wish of the President that the Indians who came to Washington should, none of them, return to Arizona within reach of communication with those at Fort Apache until transfer to Fort Marion has been consummated.

Very truly yours,

L. Q. C. LAMAR,
Secretary.

[Telegram.]

HEADQUARTERS ARMY OF THE UNITED STATES,
Washington, D. C., August 27, 1886.

General N. A. MILES,
Wilcox, Ariz.:

Your confidential telegram of 26th received. Your telegrams have all been forwarded to the Secretary of War, and replies have been sent to you direct.

As the matter seems to have been taken out of my hands, I have no further instructions to give relating to the disposition of the Chiricahua and Warm Springs Indians.

P. H. SHERIDAN,
Lieutenant-General, Commanding.

[Telegram.]

HEADQUARTERS DIVISION OF THE MISSOURI,
Chicago, Ill., August 27, 1886.

ADJUTANT-GENERAL, U. S. ARMY,
Washington, D. C.:

Telegram relative to Captain Dorst and Apache Indians received and necessary orders given.

ALFRED H. TERRY,
Major-General, Commanding.

[Special Orders, No. 96.]

HEADQUARTERS DEPARTMENT OF THE MISSOURI,
Fort Leavenworth, Kans., August 27, 1886.

In compliance with instructions of the Acting Secretary of War, Capt. J. H. Dorst, Fourth Cavalry, in charge of the Apache Indians at Fort Leavenworth, Kans., will without delay send two of the Indians in his charge to Wilcox, Ariz., and take four of the Indians, with two interpreters, to Holbrook, Ariz.

The remaining Indians will be turned over to the commanding officer at Fort Leavenworth, Kans.

The Quartermaster's Department will furnish the necessary transportation.

The travel enjoined is necessary for the public service.

By order of Brigadier-General Potter.

R. G. HILL,
Adj.-de-Camp

[Telegram.]

WAR DEPARTMENT,
Washington, D. C., August 27, 1886.HON. WM. C. ENDICOTT,
*Secretary of War,
Glen House, White Mountains, New Hampshire:*

Secretary Lamar, Interior Department, referring to General Miles' dispatch of August 25, stating satisfactory arrangements have been made with Indians at Fort Leavenworth, with distinct understanding that part remain there and others go to Arizona, says that he thinks it is the wish of the President that the Indians who came to Washington, should, none of them, return to Arizona within reach of communication with those at Fort Apache until transfer to Fort Marion has been consummated.

R. C. DRUM,
Acting Secretary of War.

[Telegram.]

GLEN HOUSE, N. H., August 27, 1886.

General R. C. DRUM,
Washington, D. C.:

Mr. Lamar is quite right. It was thought proper that the Indians now at Leavenworth should return to Arizona instead of being sent direct to Fort Marion, but they were not to arrive until those at Fort Apache had been secured, and then all should go to Florida. It is very important that the two bands should not meet until everything is arranged for their removal by General Miles.

W. C. ENDICOTT,
*Secretary of War.*WAR DEPARTMENT,
Washington City, August 28, 1886.

GENERAL: I communicated by telegraph to the Secretary of War the following letter from Mr. Lamar, Secretary of the Interior, and have this morning received the following reply, which is respectfully furnished for your information and such action as may seem to you necessary:

"DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR,
" Washington, August 26, 1886."General R. C. Drum,
" *Adjutant-General, U. S. Army, Washington, D. C.:*

"DEAR SIR: I have just read the dispatch of General Miles, commanding, dated August 25, at Huachuca, stating that satisfactory arrangements have been made with the Indians at Fort Leavenworth, with a distinct understanding that a part remain there until arrangements are carried out, and requesting that Captain Dorst be ordered to send two to Wilcox, Ariz., and take four with two interpreters to Holbrook, Ariz., without delay, and wants answer at Wilcox.

"I think it is the wish of the President that the Indians who came to Washington, should, none of them, return to Arizona within reach of communication with those at Fort Apache until transfer to Fort Marion has been consummated.

"Very truly, yours,

"L. Q. C. LAMAR,
" *Secretary.*"

[Telegram.]

"GLEN HOUSE, N. H.; "August 27, 1886.

"General R. C. DRUM,
" *Washington, D. C.:*

"Mr. Lamar is quite right. It was thought proper that the Indians now at Leavenworth should return to Arizona instead of being sent direct to Fort Marion; but they

were not to arrive until those at Fort Apache had been secured, and then all should go to Florida. It is very important that the two bands should not meet until everything is arranged for their removal by General Miles.

“W. C. ENDICOTT,
“Secretary of War.”

Very respectfully, your obedient servant,

R. C. DRUM,
Acting Secretary of War.

The LIEUTENANT-GENERAL OF THE ARMY.

[Indorsement on foregoing.]

HEADQUARTERS ARMY OF THE UNITED STATES,
Washington, D. C., August 28, 1886.

After a consultation with the Secretary of the Interior, I am of opinion that the authority sending the Indians from Leavenworth to Wilcox and Holbrook, Ariz., should be immediately withdrawn, and these Indians returned to Leavenworth, if they have already started.

P. H. SHERIDAN,
Lieutenant-General, Commanding.

WAR DEPARTMENT,
Washington City, August 28, 1886.

GENERAL: Referring to your communication of this date indorsed on the copy of correspondence relative to the return of the Apache Indians to Arizona, in which you express the opinion that the authority sending the Indians from Leavenworth to Wilcox and Holbrook, Ariz., should be immediately withdrawn, and these Indians returned to Leavenworth if they have already started, I have the honor to inform you that in deference to that opinion, I have telegraphed the commanding general of the Department of the Missouri at Fort Leavenworth that if the Indians in question have not left the post to retain them there until further orders, and that if they have already started they be recalled to Fort Leavenworth.

Very respectfully, yours,

R. C. DRUM,
Acting Secretary of War.

The LIEUTENANT-GENERAL OF THE ARMY.

[Telegram.]

WAR DEPARTMENT,
Washington, D. C., August 28, 1886.

To Hon. W. C. ENDICOTT,
Secretary of War, Glen Mountain House, White Mountains, N. H.:

The Lieutenant-General, after consultation with the Secretary of the Interior, has given as his opinion that the instructions authorizing the sending of the Indians at Leavenworth to Wilcox and Holbrook, Ariz., be withdrawn. I have therefore telegraphed the commanding general there that if the Indians have not left to retain them there until further instructions are sent him, and that if they have left to recall them to Fort Leavenworth.

R. C. DRUM,
Acting Secretary of War.

[Telegram.]

WAR DEPARTMENT,
Washington, August 28, 1886.

COMMANDING GENERAL,
Fort Leavenworth, Kans.:

If the Apache Indians have not yet left for Arizona delay their movement until receipt of further instructions. If they have left order their return to Fort Leavenworth.

R. C. DRUM,
Acting Secretary of War.

APACHE INDIANS.

[Telegram.]

HEADQUARTERS DEPARTMENT OF THE MISSOURI,
Fort Leavenworth, Kans., August 28, 1886.

ACTING SECRETARY OF WAR,
Washington, D. C.:

Telegram received. Captain Dorst and Indians stop at Emporia, Kans. They will return here in absence of further instructions.
In absence of General Potter,

R. G. HILL,
A. D. C.

[Telegram.]

FORT LEAVENWORTH, KANS., August 28, 1886.

ACTING SECRETARY OF WAR,
Washington, D. C.:

Two telegrams about Indians received together, the one directing their return received at Kansas City first. Telegram direct to Emporia, Kans., will reach Captain Dorst before 3.30 p. m. He is en route with Indians; have ordered to stop there for further orders by telegraph.

In absence of General Potter,

R. G. HILL,
Aid-de-Camp.

[Telegram.]

WILCOX, ARIZ., August 29, 1886.

ADJUTANT-GENERAL,
Washington, D. C.:

I understand that Captain Dorst was turned back from Emporia, Kans., yesterday. As I gave my word that the Apaches would meet some of their friends at Albuquerque or Holbrook, I ask that Captain Dorst be directed to start at once with four or six Indians and await orders at Albuquerque.

MILES,
Commanding.

[Indorsement on foregoing.]

Respectfully forwarded to the Secretary of War disapproved.

P. H. SHERIDAN,
Lieutenant-General, Commanding.

HEADQUARTERS OF THE ARMY,
Washington, August 30, 1886.

[Telegram.]

WAR DEPARTMENT, Washington, August 29, 1886.

General NELSON A. MILES,
Commanding Department Arizona, Prescott, Ariz.:

The Lieutenant-General having expressed the opinion that none of the Apache Indians at Fort Leavenworth should be permitted to go to Arizona, the orders to send some to Wilcox and others to Holbrook, Ariz., have been suspended, and the Indians will remain at Leavenworth until further orders.

R. C. DRUM,
Acting Secretary of War.

[Telegram.]

PRESIDIO OF SAN FRANCISCO, CAL., August 30, 1886.

ADJUTANT-GENERAL,
Washington, D. C.:

General Miles telegraphs under date of 20th instant, that Lieutenant-Colonel Wade has the camp of the Chiricahuas and Warm Springs Indians under control, and

the men all under guard; that he will move the main camp to Holbrook, thence east by rail; that dispatches from Lawton are that his command is in close proximity to hostile camp.

O. O. HOWARD,
Major-General, Commanding.

[Indorsement on foregoing.]

HEADQUARTERS OF THE ARMY,
Washington, August 31, 1886.

Respectfully submitted to the Acting Secretary of War, with copy for the information of the Department of the Interior.

P. H. SHERIDAN,
Lieutenant-General, Commanding.

[Telegram.]

WAR DEPARTMENT,
Washington, D. C., August 30, 1886.

Hon. W. C. ENDICOTT:

Secretary of War, Glen House, White Mountains, New Hampshire:

A dispatch from General Miles, dated yesterday, from Wilcox, Ariz., says:

"I understand that Captain Dorst has turned back from Emporia, Kans. As I gave my word that the Apaches would meet some of their friends at Albuquerque or Holbrook, I ask that Captain Dorst be directed to start at once with four (4) or six (6) Indians and await orders at Albuquerque."

The Lieutenant-General does not approve of this request.

I have sent the above dispatch to the President, whose address is Saranac Inn, Bloomingdale, Essex County, N. Y.

R. C. DRUM,
Acting Secretary of War.

(The above information was telegraphed the President at above address, August 30, by the Acting Secretary of War.)

[Telegram.]

WAR DEPARTMENT,
Washington, August 31, 1886.

The PRESIDENT,

Saranac Inn, Bloomingdale, N. Y.:

The following telegram is just received from General Howard, commanding Division of the Pacific:

"General Miles telegraphs, under date of twenty-ninth (29th) instant, that Colonel Wade has the camp of the Chiricahuas and Warm Springs Indians under control and the men all under guard; that he will move the main camp to Holbrook; thence east by rail; that dispatches from Captain Lawton are that his command is in close proximity to hostile camp."

R. C. DRUM,
Acting Secretary of War.

(The above information was telegraphed to the Hon. Wm. C. Endicott, Secretary of War, on August 31, 1886; at Glen House, White Mountains, New Hampshire.)

[Telegram.]

GLEN HOUSE, N. H., *August 31, 1886.*

General R. C. DRUM,

Washington, D. C.:

Yours of to-day received. I hope it means that the Chiricahuas are to go to Florida. I did not reply to yours of yesterday in which General Miles still objected to taking

them to Florida,* because you properly sent the same to the President. His action I knew would be taken adhering to the original plan, without doubt.

W. C. ENDICOTT,
Secretary of War.

[Telegram.]

WAR DEPARTMENT, ADJUTANT-GENERAL'S OFFICE,
Washington, September 1, 1886.

General N. A. MILES,
Commanding Department Arizona, Wilcox, Ariz.:

Your request to have a certain number of Indians from Fort Leavenworth meet you at Albuquerque or Holbrook was disapproved by the Lieutenant-General and forwarded to the President; but the latter is now beyond the communication of this Department, and will not probably be heard from respecting your request.

R. C. DRUM, A. G.

[Telegram.]

HEADQUARTERS DIVISION OF THE PACIFIC,
Presidio of San Francisco, Cal., September 6, 1886.

ADJUTANT-GENERAL,
Washington, D. C.:

Following telegram just received from Captain Thompson, A. A. A. G., Department of Arizona, dated Fort Bowie, September 5:

"General Miles left here three days ago to meet hostiles. Nothing has been received officially up this hour. Heard unofficially all was progressing favorably. My instructions are to keep you thoroughly informed, which I will do, and will telegraph at once when anything definite is received."

O. O. HOWARD,
Major-General, Commanding.

[Telegram.]

WAR DEPARTMENT,
Washington, D. C., September 10, 1886.

COMMANDING GENERAL,
Department of the Missouri, Fort Leavenworth, Kans.:

Did General Miles make any arrangements for Indians at Fort Leavenworth to be sent to Florida?

R. C. DRUM,
Acting Secretary of War.

[Telegram.]

HEADQUARTERS DEPARTMENT OF THE MISSOURI,
Fort Leavenworth, Kans., September 10, 1886.

General R. C. DRUM,
Acting Secretary of War, Washington, D. C.:

Nothing known here of any arrangements by General Miles to send Indians here to Florida.

POTTER,
Brigadier-General.

*See dispatch of General Miles to Acting Secretary of War, dated Wilcox, Ariz., August 28, 1886, on page 11, Part I.

[Telegram.]

WAR DEPARTMENT,
Washington, D. C., September 10, 1886.Hon. WILLIAM C. ENDICOTT,
Secretary of War, Salem Mass.:

I have not been able to ascertain whether General Miles made arrangement for the Apache Indians under Captain Dorst, and who recently visited Washington, to be sent to Florida. Had I not better have them sent to Florida at once?*

R. C. DRUM,
Acting Secretary of War.

[Telegram.]

WAR DEPARTMENT,
Washington, D. C., September 12, 1886.COMMANDING GENERAL, DIVISION OF THE MISSOURI,
Chicago, Ill.:

You will cause the Apache Indians now at Fort Leavenworth to be sent under charge of Captain Dorst, Fourth Cavalry, by the most direct and expeditious route to St. Augustine, Fla., and upon arrival to be turned over to the commanding officer at that post for confinement with other Indian prisoners now there.

The journey of Captain Dorst above enjoined is necessary for the public service, and upon completion of the same he will be directed to report to headquarters Department Arizona for further instructions.

Acknowledge receipt and report action.

R. C. DRUM,
Acting Secretary of War.

[Telegram.]

WAR DEPARTMENT,
Washington, D. C., September 12, 1886.COMMANDING GENERAL, DIVISION OF THE ATLANTIC,
Governor's Island, New York:

I have to-day instructed General Terry to send to St. Augustine, Fla., under charge of Captain Dorst, Fourth Cavalry, the Apache Indians now held at Fort Leavenworth, and upon arrival to be turned over to the commanding officer for confinement with other Indian prisoners now there. Please instruct Colonel Langdon accordingly.

Acknowledge receipt and report action.

R. C. DRUM,
Acting Secretary of War.

[Telegram.]

HEADQUARTERS DIVISION OF THE ATLANTIC,
*Governor's Island, New York City, September 12, 1886.*ADJUTANT-GENERAL,
Washington, D. C.:

Dispatch of Acting Secretary of War of this date, concerning Apache Indians now held at Fort Leavenworth, received and attended to.

WHIPPLE,
Acting Adjutant-General.
(In absence of division commander.)

* The reply of Secretary of War, W. C. Endicott, to this telegram will be found on page 14 of this document.

APACHE INDIANS.

[Telegram.]

HEADQUARTERS DIVISION OF THE MISSOURI,
Chicago, Ill., September 13, 1886.

General R. C. DRUM,
Acting Secretary of War, Washington, D. C.:

Telegram of yesterday, conveying instructions regarding Apache Indians, now at Fort Leavenworth, received, and necessary orders telegraphed the commanding general Department Missouri.

ALFRED H. TERRY,
Major-General, Commanding.

[Telegram.]

PRESIDIO OF SAN FRANCISCO, CAL., September 14, 1886.

ADJUTANT-GENERAL,
Washington, D. C.:

General Miles reports that Lieutenant-Colonel Wade, with ten car-loads of Apache Indians, with guards, passed Albuquerque at 2.30 this morning.

O. O. HOWARD,
Major-General, Commanding.

ADJUTANT-GENERAL'S OFFICE.

Submitted to the Lieutenant-General, September 15, 1886, and by him submitted to the Secretary of War, September 15, 1886.

HEADQUARTERS DIVISION OF THE MISSOURI,
Chicago, Ill., September 15, 1886.

ADJUTANT-GENERAL, U. S. ARMY,
Washington, D. C.:

General Potter telegraphs that Captain Dorst, with Apache Indians, left for St. Augustine last evening.

ALFRED H. TERRY,
Major-General Commanding

[Telegram.]

GOVERNOR'S ISLAND, NEW YORK, September 20, 1886.

ADJUTANT-GENERAL, ARMY,
Washington, D. C.:

Colonel Langdon has reported arrival of Captain Dorst, Fourth Cavalry, with sixteen Indians, including three interpreters. He says he will need services of interpreters for at least two months, and asks if all three can be retained. Their names are Micky Free, Bowman, and Conception. I ask instructions.

J. M. SCHOFIELD,
Major-General.

Senate Ex. Doc. No. 35, Fifty-first Congress, first session.

Message from the President of the United States, transmitting a letter of the Secretary of War and reports touching the Apache Indians at Governor's Island.

JANUARY 20, 1890.—Read, referred to the Committee on Indian Affairs, and ordered to be printed.

To the Senate and House of Representatives :

I transmit herewith a letter from the Secretary of War, relating to the condition and needs of the band of Apache Indians now held at Mount Vernon Barracks and at Governor's Island. The reports of General Crook and Lieutenant Howard, which accompany the letter of the Secretary, show that some of these Indians have rendered good service to the Government in the pursuit and capture of the murderous band that followed Natchez and Geronimo. It is a reproach that they should not, in our treatment of them, be distinguished from the cruel and bloody members of the tribe now confined with them.

I earnestly recommend that provision be made by law for locating these Indians upon lands in the Indian Territory.

BENJ. HARRISON.

EXECUTIVE MANSION,
Washington, January 20, 1890.

WAR DEPARTMENT,
OFFICE OF THE SECRETARY,
Washington, January 13, 1890.

To the PRESIDENT :

In my annual report I referred to the Apache Indians held as prisoners at Mount Vernon Barracks, Ala., and stated that after further investigation more definite suggestions would be submitted for your consideration.

I have received, and transmit herewith, a report by General Crook, and a report by Lieut. Guy Howard with indorsements by Generals Howard and Schofield. I have also consulted with many officers who are conversant with Indian affairs or who have special knowledge in regard to this band; and have had the views of the Commissioner of Indian Affairs, of the Indian Rights Association, the Indian Citizenship Committee of Boston, and of many citizens interested in this question. There has certainly been no lack of "a multitude of counselors."

Some of these Indians have rendered good and loyal service to the Government, and great as were the outrages committed by the others, they are now thoroughly subdued.

Two are confined at Governor's Island, 70 are at the Carlisle School, and 309 women and children and 79 men are at Mount Vernon; total, 460. Thirty of these men only are able-bodied, 25 more are able to do more or less work, and the rest are old or crippled.

Before they were moved from Arizona, both the men and women were accustomed to work the land to quite an extent. In their present location there is no opportunity for them to engage in agriculture or other useful work. It is the duty of the Government to remove them to some other point where they can have permanent homes, and pursue some employment tending to their civilization and self-support.

There have been two feasible plans submitted:

1st. The purchase, if authorized by Congress, of a tract of land in the mountainous region of western North Carolina, or in one of the adjacent States.

2d. Their removal to some point in the Indian Territory.

However, section 3, chapter 87, of the Laws of 1879, provides: "And the President of the United States is hereby directed to prohibit the removal of any portion of said tribe of Indians [Indians of New Mexico and Arizona] to the Indian Territory, unless the same shall be hereafter authorized by act of Congress."

Either plan would be fairly satisfactory. The latter is the more economical, and I am inclined to believe would be the most beneficial to the Indians. It has the approval of General Crook.

If Congress will grant the necessary authority, I recommend, therefore, that these Indians be transferred to Fort Sill in the Indian Territory, with a view to their final settlement on the Kiowa, Comanche and Apache Reservation, provided satisfactory negotiations can be consummated with these confederated tribes to that end. The military reservation of Fort Sill comprises 36 square miles and is located within this Indian reservation.

I have the honor to be, yours, respectfully,

REDFIELD PROCTOR,
Secretary of War.

WASHINGTON, D. C., *January 6, 1890.*

SIR: I have the honor to report that in compliance with your instructions, I proceeded on the 28th ultimo, in company with Senator Z. B. Vance, to visit certain lands in the State of North Carolina, which have been reported to be suitable for a reservation for the Chiricahua band of Apache Indians.

Incessant and heavy rains during the whole of our stay in North Carolina rendered it impracticable to go over all the lands in question, but enough was seen of them and of the neighboring country to satisfy me that in climate and general characteristics it is more like the reservation in Arizona from which the Chiricahuas were taken than any other tract available in the eastern part of the country. It seems to be fairly well adapted to the needs of these Indians; they could do here a little general farming, raise grain, and keep a moderate amount of stock. The country is rough, mountainous, and wooded, and it would require at least 60,000 acres of such land, or not less than 500 acres to a family, to enable the Indians to make a living on it.

Leaving Senator Vance at Asheville, N. C., I proceeded to Mount Vernon Barracks, Alabama. Here I had an interview with the captive Chiricahuas, notes of which are hereto appended. I invite attention to them, and especially to the statements of Chatto and Ka-e-te-na.

From my own knowledge I know that most of the statements contained in these notes are correct. I have reason to believe that some of their own statements are not as strong as the facts would warrant. A reference to the reports of the Secretary of War and of the Lieutenant-General of the Army for the year 1886, will throw light on many otherwise obscure remarks in the notes.

With regard to the present condition of these Indians, they appeared, with a few exceptions, to be healthy and strong. There has, however, been a great number of deaths among them. This mortality has been much more than normal, and would seem due to home-sickness, change of climate, and the dreary monotony of empty lives. They need something to do, something to occupy their heads and hands.

There is among them a general and earnest desire to possess farms of their own, on which they can work out a future for themselves. From my personal knowledge of them I can attest to their ability to become entirely self-sustaining in a very short time, provided care be taken that they are started aright. Their past experience has been very far from encouraging to them, and their recent history strikingly illustrates the difficulties under which the Indian labors in attempting to live the life of the white man and to follow his ways. Among many similar ones, I beg leave to call attention to the case of Chatto.

In 1883, he was brought from the Sierra Madres of Old Mexico, and was placed with the rest of his tribe upon a reservation in Arizona. At first he was wild and savage as any of his people, but having been induced to settle upon a farm which was assigned to him, he set about earnestly to learn the ways of the white man. In the outbreak of 1885, he was approached by Geronimo and others who wanted him to fly with them back to their Mexican haunts. They threatened to shoot him if he did not go, but he said he had promised not to go on the war-path and he would keep his word. Not only this, but he exerted his influence to prevent others from going, and to such purpose that of the one hundred and twenty men who had surrendered in 1883 only about fifty-three could be induced to leave the reservation for the war-path.

In the operation against the hostiles, Chatto and others of his band were enlisted as scouts in the service of the United States and rendered invaluable services in that capacity. It is not too much to say that the surrender of Natchez, Chihauhua, Geronimo, and their bands could not have been effected except for the assistance of Chatto and his Chiricahu scouts.

The final surrender of Geronimo and his small band to General Miles was brought about only through Chiricahuas who had remained friendly to the Government.

When his services were no longer required Chatto received an honorable discharge and returned to his farm. He planted wheat and barley, raised sheep and owned horses and mules. Before his crops had ripened he was summoned to Washington. After an interview with the President he left the capital expecting to return to his farm at Camp Apache. On the way he was stopped at Fort Leavenworth, Kans., and kept there for two months. At the end of this time he was taken to St. Augustine, and placed in confinement with the captive hostiles, whose surrender he had been so largely instrumental in securing. Ever since he has

been continued in confinement on the same terms with them, and with the yet more guilty band of Geronimo, which subsequently joined them.

His farm was taken from him. It is true his stock and crops were sold at some sort of a figure and the money forwarded to him, but this could not compensate him for the loss of his home, his country, and of all the results of his efforts to create a future for himself. His three years of earnest endeavor have been rewarded by three years of discouraging and unmerited captivity. During my interview with him at Mount Vernon Barracks Chatto took from his breast a large medal that had been presented to him by President Cleveland, and holding it out, asked, "Why was I given that to wear in the guard-house? I thought that something good would come to me when they gave it to me, but I have been in confinement ever since I have had it." I submit that this Indian has received but scant encouragement from the Government in his efforts to become a self-sustaining citizen.

And Chatto is not alone in this experience. By far the greater part of the tribe remained true to the Government in the outbreak of 1885, and the most valuable and trustworthy of the Indian scouts were taken from among them. For their allegiance all have been rewarded alike—by captivity in a strange land.

The most ordinary justice would seem to demand a different course of procedure with men not only innocent of offense against the Government, but to whom the Government is largely indebted for services of the very greatest value, and which they alone could have rendered. They have a right to demand such of the Government, but they demand nothing. Discouraged and homeless they ask only an opportunity to work for themselves, and I believe that it is the duty of the Government to give them such an opportunity. Their farms have been taken from them, and others should be given to them. I can not too strongly urge that immediate steps be taken to secure a reservation for them where they could be settled on farms of their own, to work for themselves, and to receive for themselves the full benefit of their labors, for with red people as well as white self-interest is the mainspring of progress. With such an incentive there can be little doubt of their future.

It would not be wise, in my opinion, to send them back to their own country. Trouble might perhaps ensue if this were done, and did they again take the war-path in that country it would be utterly impossible ever to get them to surrender again, and to exterminate them in war would cost thousands of lives to say nothing of the loss of property which such a war would entail. But I am satisfied that there will be no more law-abiding community than these Indians, no matter in what part of the United States they may be placed.

Taking into consideration what I believe to be the pressing necessity for early action in the case of these Chiricahuas, I would recommend that if possible they be sent as soon as practicable to some point in the Indian Territory. I should prefer this country to that in North Carolina, as the climate and local conditions there are more nearly like that of the country to which they are accustomed, and, considering everything, would be better suited to them.

Before closing my report I wish to refer to a matter which I believe to be important enough to deserve serious consideration. It would seem to be a mistake to send the children of these Indians to the school at Carlisle, a place which, from whatever cause it may be, proves so fatal to them. Many of the children die there, and those who return to their people seem peculiarly liable to contract consumption, the disease

that has taken off so many of them since their removal to the East. The Apaches are fond of their children and kinsfolk, and they live in terror lest their children be taken from them and sent to a distant school.

I am, sir, very respectfully, your obedient servant,

GEORGE CROOK,
Major-General, U. S. Army.

The SECRETARY OF WAR.

NOTES OF AN INTERVIEW BETWEEN MAJ. GEN. GEORGE CROOK, U. S. ARMY, AND CHATTO, KA-E-TE-NA, NOCHE, AND OTHER CHIRICAHUA APACHES.

MOUNT VERNON BARRACKS, ALA., *January 2, 1890.*

Present: Major-General Crook, U. S. Army, First Lieut. L. W. V. Kennon, Sixth Infantry, A. D. C.; Maj. William I. Kellogg, Nineteenth Infantry; Second Lieut. Arthur B. Foster, Nineteenth Infantry; George Wrattan, interpreter.

General Crook asked what took place the night the party under Natchez and Geronimo broke away in March, 1886.

NATCHEZ replied: When we left there, so far as I was concerned I didn't know anything; I didn't know how to work, I didn't know how to dig up roots, or break ground or break rock, and I thought I wouldn't like it. I was afraid I wouldn't like to work. All of us thought that way.

General CROOK. How did you come to leave that night?

NATCHEZ. I was afraid I was going to be taken off somewhere I didn't like; to some place I didn't know. I thought all who were taken away would die. Since then I have found out different. I have worked much since then. Nobody said anything to me that night; I worked it out in my own mind.

General CROOK. Didn't the Indians talk about among themselves?

NATCHEZ. We talked to each other about it. We were drunk.

General CROOK. Why did you get drunk?

NATCHEZ. Because there was a lot of whisky there and we wanted a drink, and took it. The other didn't want to go out. I don't know why the others didn't know of it; I thought they all did.

General CROOK. Why did you kill people after promising me you would not?

NATCHEZ. Because we were afraid. It was war. Anybody who saw us would kill us, and we did the same thing. We had to if we wanted to live.

General CROOK. How did you come to surrender. Were you afraid of the troops?

NATCHEZ. We wanted to see our people.

General CROOK. Did troops force them to surrender?

NATCHEZ. We were not forced to do it. We talked under a flag of truce. We all said we had had enough and wanted to surrender.

General CROOK. How many of your party were killed?

NATCHEZ. No man was killed; one woman was killed by Mexicans.

General CROOK. How long did the flag of truce last under which the surrender was made?

WRATTAN, the interpreter, stated that two Chiricahua Indians went to the hostiles on the night of August 24, 1886. On August 26 Lieutenant Gatewood, Wrattan, and Jose Maria met the hostiles on the Bavispe-River. The next day they had a talk with Lawton, in which they decided to see General Miles. They were told they would get no more conditions from him than from Gatewood and Lawton. Miles was to meet them at Skeleton Cañon on the 3d of September and they had a talk.

General CROOK. Could the surrender have been made without the scouts?

WRATTAN. I do not think so. The two Indians traveled with the flag of truce. The hostiles moved to Terras Mountains; the scouts went into their camp and talked with them.

General CROOK. What were the conditions of the surrender?

WRATTAN. The conditions were that they should give up their arms and surrender; that they would not be harmed but would be taken to their people in St. Augustine.

General CROOK. Did all the Indians come in?

NATCHEZ. Near Fort Bowie two men, one boy, and some women left the party and have never been heard from since.

General CROOK. How many people came in with Lawton?

NATCHEZ. Seventeen altogether, but two broke away, leaving fifteen bucks, four children, and eleven women.

General CROOK. How many went out with Natchez?

NATCHEZ. I don't remember. I have no way of keeping count. About thirty, I think.

CHIHUAHUA said he wasn't afraid of anything, troops or scouts. For what you said to me I am much obliged; I have it in my head yet. You wanted me to be good and I have tried to be.

KA-E-TE-NA said: When you asked me to go down with you to talk to the hostiles I went with you and talked good to them. I talked your talk to them and your mind to them. I told them all you said to me. I told them: "This is the way General Crook wants you to do. He wants you to talk and think as he thinks."

You told me to look out for them and take good care of them. I went along with them to San Bernardino. I was with them the night some of them left. I didn't know why they left. I think it was on account of some women. My brother stayed there the next night and came on home the next day. (The events Ka-e-te-na speaks of here occurred in March, 1886. See General Crook's communication of December 26, 1886, viz: "Resume of Operations in Arizona," L. W. V. K.)

CHATTO stated: I was working on my farm and had one field planted in wheat and another in barley. (This was in the summer of 1886). My sisters had other fields planted. Just as the crops were getting ripe I left them and went to Washington. When they were sold it didn't bring what it was worth. I didn't get as much for it as if I had stayed to look after it. I had a wagon and could make a good deal of money with that hauling hay, supplies, etc. I didn't leave these of my own accord. I had sheep, about thirty head, that were increasing all the time; I had to leave them. I made money by shearing them and selling the wool; I had horses and mules which were worth a good deal of money, \$150 to \$200. I received some \$10 for the horses and \$29 for the mules. The sheep sold for about the right price, \$2 a piece. You told us about farms; I got a plow and took good care of everything. When I got word to go to Washington I went. I never left of my own accord.

General CROOK. How many Chiricahua scouts were enlisted when Geronimo went out?

CHATTO. Twenty-five scouts were enlisted; nineteen of these had farms. The rest were young men or boys.

CHIHUAHUA said: All who went to Florida had horses and mules, the same as Chatto.

KA-E-TE-NA said: He had a wagon for which nothing had been given him.

General CROOK. Why did the scouts come here?

CHATTO. When I left Camp Apache to go to Washington they talked good to me and said I could make a living. I came back a little way and stopped at Carlisle and stayed there seven days. When we were about two days travel from Camp Apache we were turned back. We didn't go back as far as Carlisle, but stopped at a place where there were soldiers (Fort Leavenworth, Kans.), and stayed there about two months; I didn't know what was wrong. When I left Washington I expected to go back to Camp Apache. While we were there a letter came from Arizona from General Miles, stating that it was a bad place for Indians at Camp Apache. All the white people were down on us and the other Indians also. He told us one part of the country belonged to Washington, the other part on the other side was Arizona, so he would put us on the Washington side where there were good people. He told us also: "You have good farms at Apache, You have good water, etc., but this is not enough. Go to the Washington country and you can get \$20 to \$50 a month." It was some lieutenant who read this letter to us. It was a long letter. He told us he would like us to do as we did when we signed the pay-roll, and we all touched the top of the pen, except three women, who did not sign. We thought it was good to get \$20 to \$50 a month, and I agreed to those terms. That don't make any difference. I have in my head now what you said to me at Camp Apache. When I walk I walk right along and see as far as I can. When I come to something I step over it. I couldn't understand why I was brought down here. From Fort Leavenworth we were taken to a place where Chihuahua was (St. Augustine). On the paper we signed was also a reservation spoken about, that was to be thirty miles each way from the center. We were to be put on this reservation. The letter said also that we could raise lots of horses, cattle, etc.; that there would be plenty of room on it for all their stock. It said also: "When you get on the reservation you may think you have no relatives, but when on it you will increase." The letter spoke of Chihuahua, Geronimo, Chatto, and of some of their people who were down in Old Mexico, and that they would all be brought together on this reservation. It said: "When you get on this reservation I will bring them all back to you." It talked very much as General Crook talked.

Chatto here took from his breast an Arthur medal that had been presented to him by President Cleveland, and asked, "Why did they give me that, to wear in the guard-house? I thought something good would come to me when they gave me that, but I have been in confinement ever since I have had it."

KU-NAY said: The Indians at Camp Apache were getting drunk all the time and killing each other. I don't know any other reason why they were sent down here. I don't know what was wrong. One day near noon they told me they wanted to count the Chiricahuas. They surrounded us with scouts and soldiers. Five of us

scouts were mounted. All they did to us was they took our guns away from us and told us to go home. They told us that where we were going it was the same as it was there. We were scouts in one place and would be in the other. When they had surrounded us, the White Mountain Indians drove off our horses and cattle; they went to our farms and took what they wanted while we were surrounded. There was an Indian, a chief Sanchez, had a talk with the officers and he said the Chiricahuas were no good. He did not want us there and wanted us taken away.

They told us that we were going to be taken off, but not very far away, about a day's travel by railway. They told us the Indians who had gone on to Washington (Chatto, etc.) were there waiting for us.

TO-KAN-Y said: I can tell only the same thing that Ku-nay does. It was on the counting day and just as we were giving the tickets some cavalry was going along as if it were going somewhere, but it turned and joined with the infantry and scouts and surrounded the Chiricahuas. After they had counted us and given us tickets, they sent the women home, and told the men they wanted to talk and we went to a tent. They told us nobody would be harmed, but that we were going to be sent away. The White Mountain Indians said that the Chiricahuas were bad. Their chiefs had been talking against us. We were told not to be afraid, nobody would be harmed. The night before the count some of the White Mountain Indians got drunk and killed a man and laid it upon our people and said we had done it. The officers told us we would be sent to a good country and we would have more houses and farms than we had at Camp Apache. "You have plenty here," they said, but you will have more there and better stock. Do not be afraid, you will not be hurt. You are going to a good country."

We did just as they told us. The day they rounded us up at the post all the men, women, widows and poor of the tribe that had stock had it driven off by the White Mountain Indians, who stole it. That is all I know about it.

NOCHE. I want to say that after General Crook left, General Miles talked to me at Fort Bowie. He talked a good deal the same as General Crook talked. I remember all General Crook told me, and also all that General Miles told me. He told me how to behave myself. He told me to go back to Camp Apache. I had a farm there. He told me to go back and take care of it. I went back there and made a big farm and worked it there with a Mexican on shares. I got a contract for wood, and got out some wood with this same man and got a good deal of money from it, each getting half. General Miles told me, "Now I've given you a farm and you have worked it, but it seems for nothing. They gave it to you for nothing and now I'll have to send you away. People don't seem to like you." I told him there was lots of wood here, and I wanted to stay. He said, "The Indians at San Carlos and Camp Apache are talking about you all the time, and I had better send you away from here. We will take the train, and in one and a quarter days we will go to the place we were talking about and look at it." We didn't see that land. We were four days on the train and stopped only when we reached Washington. I saw the President and shook hands with him. He told us, "Do not be afraid to come amongst us; I am the great father of you all. Go back to your farms at Camp Apache and settle down quietly. There nobody will harm you, nobody will say anything to you. Go back there and do just as the commanding officer tells you. Do as he tells you and he will write good letters to me about you." He told us when we got in the cars it would be about a week before we got home, but when we had been on two days we were stopped (at Fort Leavenworth), and they told us we would not go back to Camp Apache. We were there two months and they told us we would not go back to our homes any more, but would go to some place on the coast.

On the evening of the third day after we got to St. Augustine our people came there from Camp Apache. We were told then we would be in confinement. They told us to wait awhile. They didn't know what was to be done with us. We would be in confinement as long as we remained at St. Augustine. I asked what would be done to us, but the commanding officer didn't know. Afterwards we were moved up here.

(Wrattan stated that the people from Píkens, i. e. Geronimo and his band, left there in April, 1887, and reached Mount Vernon barracks in the latter part of April.)

We were told we would have our stock; we were told this after we had reached the east. What horses we had were finally sold and we got what few dollars were received for them. I had four horses and three mules and received \$127 for them. I received pay for my horses but not for the wood I had piled up there. I had about 90 cords of wood for which I never received anything.

I thought that we were coming to a place that was healthy, but you can see for yourself that we are not so many as when you saw us last. A great many have died. We lost more than a hundred. More than fifty have died since leaving St. Augustine. About thirty children have died at Carlisle. Between fifty and a hundred have died here. Chatto had a son and nephew to die at Carlisle.

(Wrattan stated that the Indians died principally from consumption, which he thought was due to the damp climate. They took a cold and strong, stout men went

right down. In two months they would be dead. A great many children and little ones die.)

They told me about that big reservation that General Miles told him about, where all the Indians should be together. He said, "When you get there you will have good farms, horses, cattle, and they will belong to you. Nobody will have anything to do with them but yourself. I am telling you the truth; I am telling you no lie." When he told me that I shook hands with him two or three times and said, "Thank you."

KA-TE-TE-NA. I want to say what I think, what I want to. When I first saw you you talked to me and said we were brothers from now on. You told me to think as you thought, to follow in your footsteps. He still thinks of it as if you had said it only yesterday morning. Six years ago I went away among the white people. They took me a long way off. I was there about 18 months. Six years ago I was what you call an Indian. I wore moccasins and had long hair. When I went among the whites they told me to put these away and adopt the white man's dress, and I did so. Since then I haven't seen much country; I haven't been very far away. I have been to very few places since then. That's why I can't tell much. There are lots of trees about here. I don't go any place except to the railway. I don't know anything of this country. I don't know how it is. I would like to work; I would like to farm. I had a farm but had to leave it, and leave all that behind. Four years ago I came back again and had another farm, a big one, and worked it. I don't know what was the matter. They took me away from it. If I could have stayed there I could have made a good crop. I never did anything wrong and never went on the war-path since I saw you. I tried to think as you told me to and was very thankful to you, and was very glad to see you again this morning; all the Indians were, even to the little children.

You told me I would have sheep and I did have some, and a wagon too. I had horses too, but never had any pay for my wagon or farm. I got paid for my horses. I didn't know what was wrong or why I was brought down here. General Miles told me to go and see a farm that was talked about. He deceived me; he told me it was about a day's journey away. We started to see the farm and got on the train and staid on four days and got to Washington. We were there 18 days and didn't know what was going on at home. When we talked to the President he talked good, He said we had heard of the Great Father, and said he was the Great Father of us all and was very glad to see us.

We left Washington and went to Carlisle, and got about two days' travel from home; we went in to get something to eat and the train passed out, leaving us on the track. Then we went back to post and were there for two months. We were there for two months, and then some were left back; four men and three women were left at Fort Leavenworth and the rest were sent in. They told us we were going to have a reservation near the Rio Grande, about a day's travel from Fort Leavenworth. Our people would all be there from Camp Apache. The party that went on returned at the same time next day; returned next day to Fort Leavenworth. The officer traveling with us left at Fort Leavenworth and went to the Rio Grande. He was gone seven days, but did not say what he had gone for or anything at all to us.

A letter came from General Miles stating that Chatto and Ka-e-te-na were to be killed, and that is why they returned back. The letter said that there were \$500 reward for either one of us. I wondered if that was what they confined us for. We were told we would be scouts and draw pay; Chatto and I were to get \$50 a month, the others \$20. I saw the letter. I don't know to whom or by whom it was written, but I think it was by direction of General Miles.

I was taken to St. Augustine, but tried to be as I always was, and do what I said to you I would. I like you. I like your talk and try to follow in your footsteps. What do you think of me? I started to work six years ago, and I am working yet. I help build roads, dig up roots, build houses, and do work all around here. Leaves fall off the trees and I help to sweep them up. I was working this morning when you came here. I don't know why I work here all the time for nothing. I never did anything wrong after I talked with you. I have children and relatives, lots of them, and I would like to work for them before I get too old to work. I'd like to have a farm well, and would like to have a farm long enough to see the crops get ripe. I like to farm and like to work, and shall always try and be what I have been since I talked with you.

CHIHUAHUA. I am getting so my limbs feel as if they were asleep. I would like to have some place better than this. I would like to have a place where I could have a farm and go right to work so that my children can have plenty to eat; and I would like to have tools to go right to work with. I have a daughter away at school and two other near relatives. I want to see them soon. Won't you make it so I can see them very soon? I didn't get any of the money that was to be sent to me; I never said anything about it. Sam Bowman knows about it. I thought when I saw you I would tell you about it. I never said anything about it. I am just the same now as when I saw you last going along the same road. There are trees all about. I would like to go where I can see.

HEADQUARTERS DIVISION OF THE ATLANTIC,
Governor's Island, New York City, December 23, 1889.

The ADJUTANT-GENERAL, U. S. ARMY,
Washington, D. C.:

(Through military channels.)

SIR: Pursuant to instructions received from General Howard, commanding the Division of the Atlantic, and subsequent additional directions from the Secretary of War, I have the honor to submit the following facts relating to the Chiricahua Apache Indian prisoners now in this division and to make certain recommendations relative to them.

Between April 13 and November 7, 1886, 498 Indians (99 men, 399 women and children) were received as prisoners of war from Arizona, where the greater portion had been captured while engaged in active hostilities. The rest, though on a reservation, were deemed fit subjects for removal from that Territory, and the honor of the Government was pledged to them and to the citizens that they should never be returned.

Seventeen men without their families were placed in confinement at Fort Pickens, near Pensacola, Fla.

The remainder were kept in camp at Fort Marion, St. Augustine, Fla., until April, 1887, when, on account of the small space available for them there, and also for sanitary reasons, the families of the prisoners were sent to them at Fort Pickens and the others were transferred to Mount Vernon Barracks, near Mobile, Ala.

Those at Fort Pickens were moved into camp with the others at Mount Vernon Barracks, Ala., in May, 1888.

One hundred and twelve of the Indian youth and children have been, from time to time, sent to the Indian school at Carlisle, Pa.; 12 have been returned on account of ill health, 30 have died, and 70 are now there in fairly good physical condition and making good educational progress.

MORTALITY.

Among the Indians remaining in the South the following deaths have occurred:

In 1886, at St. Augustine, Fla.	18
In 1887, at St. Augustine, Fort Pickens, and Mount Vernon Barracks, Ala.	31
In 1888, at Mount Vernon Barracks, Ala.	14
In 1889, at Mount Vernon Barracks, Ala., to November 30.	26

	89
Add to this the deaths at Carlisle, Pa.	30

Total deaths in three and one-half years.	119
--	-----

There have been numerous births, so that the present number of Apache prisoners is—

At Mount Vernon Barracks, 79 men, 167 women, 142 children; total.	388
At Governor's Island, N. Y., 2 men (undergoing punishment).	2
At Carlisle school.	70

Total.	460
-------------	-----

Of the men, whose total number, not including those who are growing to manhood at Carlisle school, is 81, probably 30 are able-bodied, viz, would be fit for military service; 25 able to do a fair day's work, but not in good condition, and the rest old men and cripples. It can not be made too emphatic that at the present time the Chiricahua Apache Indians would furnish only 30 good warriors, and there are 430 old men, cripples, youths at school, and women and children. These

people are in our possession as prisoners of war. Those at Carlisle need nothing except to finish their course there. They can then care for themselves.

CONDITION OF PRISONERS AT MOUNT VERNON BARRACKS.

The three hundred and eighty-eight (seventy-nine men, three hundred and nine women and children) at Mount Vernon Barracks are now in a condition which needs prompt action to avoid positive inhumanity.

The normal death rate of civilized people is less than 2 per cent. per annum. That of these people, including those at school, is more than three times as great, or 6.8 per cent.

A number equal to one-quarter of those brought east has died in three and a-half years. Consumption has fastened itself among them, and has been rapid and always fatal where it has attacked.

A great death rate must be expected, one-half of the deaths being of young children whose disease was aggravated by their parents' neglect of the simplest instructions of physicians, and the murderous quackery of old squaws. But the excessive death rate is due to consumption, as have been most of the deaths at Carlisle, where proper sanitary precautions have always been taken.

The condition of health and mind of these Indians other than those at Carlisle precludes the possibility of their improvement and civilization where they now are, for the following reasons :

1st. They are prisoners. Though well fed and well clothed, their labor is prison labor.

2d. Only the men are required to work, and that, of course, without remuneration. Were they paid it would only give the power of purchasing intoxicants, and add to their degradation. The women have not enough to do, and are without incentive to improvement.

3d. There has been and is much sickness and many deaths, with resultant depression.

4th. They have been told that good behavior would secure action towards permanent homes of their own, and this promise so long deferred has increased their hopeless feeling. Each year's delay is a greater injury to them.

5th. They are a people who have been bred in mountains and who, as well as the medical officers of the Army who have attended them, believe their rapid dying off is due, in great part, to their location in the moist atmosphere of the sea-coast.

6th. So many of their children have died away at school that not only have those been grief-stricken who have lost their absent ones but all are constantly fearful of the taking from them for death at school of others of their children.

To summarize then: We are holding as prisoners, with women in idleness tending to vice, a band of savages till they die, in a place and in a manner that their death is possibly increased by local causes, though we are not now taking their children away from them for school.

THE MOUNT VERNON BARRACKS RESERVATION FOR A CAMP.

The camp at Mount Vernon Barracks is as good as a prison camp can be, but can not be made a home. No military reservation east of the Mississippi River has any better facilities. As there is no arable land for them to cultivate in that vicinity, farming is impossible. The en-

ployment of the scattered white population is in the manufacture of cypress shingles and pine lumber, for which the Indians are not fitted.

The post is on a sand ridge in a pine forest, and is surrounded by swamps. Heretofore it has been healthy. The reservation is a strip of land running several miles from the river bank to the high ground where the post and Indian camp is. Liquor is sold by citizens on their own property on the border of the reservation. The freedom of the Indians from its use is phenomenal. It is due to the small amount of money they have (they make some by selling trinkets) and their earnest endeavor to behave well with the hope of getting homes of their own. Two missionary lady teachers have a small day school for children and teach a few of the men, but the good of these short steps towards education is not apparent without giving the Indian child some better outlook for the future than he now has.

LAND LEFT IN ARIZONA.

Under the "severalty act" of February 8, 1887, these Indians would have been entitled, had they been kept on the White Mountain Reservation in Arizona, whenever they should be settled in severalty, to about 40,000 acres of farming or 80,000 acres of grazing land, for which the United States will receive \$50,000 to \$100,000 in money as well as the more rapid industrial development of that territory by the more skillful labor of white immigrants. The Chiricahua Apaches are merely one of the wilder tribes of a farming people, and even they have always been accustomed to do some farming, raising crops by irrigation. They have never, as the chief means of subsistence, lived by hunting wild game. For making progress then towards what we call civilization, if their attachment to homes and land of their own and knowledge of farming be taken advantage of, they can be started from a point far in advance of that from which they could start in any other employment.

RECOMMENDATIONS.

I therefore make the following recommendation: That application be made to Congress for the provision of a suitable tract of land and the fitting out of these people with materials and tools to build cabins, with simple farm utensils, cattle, and seeds, and that they be put on such land by the 1st of March, 1890. Another year's delay would be criminal.

Land, a portion of which may eventually become each Indian family's own, including the means of going on it, is the fundamental need. That obtained, an industrial school is necessary with school farm and hospital.

Very respectfully, your obedient servant,

GUY HOWARD,
First Lieutenant Twelfth Infantry, Aide-de-Camp.

[First indorsement.]

HEADQUARTERS DIVISION OF THE ATLANTIC,
Governor's Island, December 23, 1889.

Respectfully forwarded to the Adjutant-General of the Army for the information of the Secretary of War.

It is believed that the within report contains a clear account of the causes of the present condition of the Apache prisoners of war. It might be added, when they first came in the feeling was so strong against

the leaders and their depredating followers that at Fort Marion, and subsequently at Fort Pickens, they were subjected to conditions of imprisonment, in which the women and children shared, that rendered them weak and liable to disease. The innocent have suffered with the guilty, and I see no possible way of relieving the situation than by adopting the course within recommended, and, I hope, in the interest of justice, as well as of humanity, that speedy action may be taken. Should a school be set in operation it could be permanently used for educating Indian children of the vast Southwest.

OLIVER O. HOWARD,
Major-General, Commanding,

[Second indorsement.]

Respectfully submitted to the Major-General Commanding the Army.

SAMUEL BRECK,
Assistant Adjutant-General.

ADJUTANT-GENERAL'S OFFICE,
December 26, 1889.

[Third indorsement.]

HEADQUARTERS ARMY OF THE UNITED STATES,
Washington, December 30, 1889.

Respectfully submitted to the Secretary of War, concurring in the recommendation of the division commander.

J. M. SCHOFIELD,
Major-General, Commanding.

TRANSCRIPT OF STENOGRAPHER'S NOTES OF A CONFERENCE
BETWEEN HONORABLE WILLIAM C. ENDICOTT, SECRETARY
OF WAR, AND CHATO, CHIEF OF THE CHIRICAHUA APACHE
INDIANS, HELD AT WAR DEPARTMENT BUILDING, WASHING-
TON, D. C., JULY 26, 1886.

Present: Hon. William C. Endicott, Secretary of War; John Tweedale, chief clerk War Department; Charles S. Sweet, stenographer; Capt. John G. Bourke, Third Cavalry, U. S. Army; and Capt. Joseph H. Dorst, Fourth Cavalry, U. S. Army.

Interpreters.—Apache-Spanish, "Mickey Free" and Concepcion; Spanish-English, Victor Gomez, Sam. Bowman, and Capt. John G. Bourke.

Chiricahua Apaches.—Chato, Kawtenné, and Charlie.

Chato's remarks were made in Apache, and were translated, through the Spanish, into English, as follows:

When he left Fort Apache he was very poor. He started to see all his friends and to see you. All the people he has met were to him as his fathers—were his friends. All those he has seen so far have given him great pleasure; and to see you now it has given him great pleasure; and when he shook hands with you it was as if his body was refreshed. When he came here it was to see his friends, and even though at times his head aches he goes to see them, and when he goes to see his friends all pain goes away.

He has come here, and it appears to him that the people he speaks to, that in addressing them, he speaks to them as if speaking to the Father God. In coming here it is to him as if he looked from above down on the world and saw his father, though he has no father now any more; but it seems to him as if a father was given back to him when he sees you. It is to him as if he saw his father.

What he came to look here for was good words, good advice—he is looking for the words as if God is speaking. He has come, too, because he wants to take a paper with him, so as to remember the words that have been told him here, and all the things that he says here. All those things he wants to remember when he goes back. He says he goes about now as the men do that he sees here. They go the right way, and so he goes the right way.

By the SECRETARY: "You may tell him that I am very friendly to him, and want him to be friendly to us, and if he has got anything to ask, anything that he wants, I wish him to tell it to me now."

He says he wants to ask you about his country, his land; he does not want to ask too much, and after that he will speak of other things. He came here to ask for his country; to ask for his land, where he lives now; to ask that is why he has traveled so far. At Camp Apache what he plants grows up very well; the water that runs there is very good; that is why he wants to stay there; that is why he wants to have that land; and from the place where he lives it is only a half a mile to where there is grass, and with that he can earn 5 cents, and with that he can take care of his land and his people.

By Captain BOURKE: "He is here referring to the policy which General Crook instituted at Camp Apache, that these Indians should be compelled to work for their living, and should also be paid for everything they raise. General Crook has bought from the Apaches at Camp Apache all the fuel needed for the garrison; all the hay needed for the horses' food, for the horses' beds, and for the men's beds; all the corn they could raise, and any vegetables they could produce, paying for them in cash. The Indians were thus stimulated to work hard, because their cash market was right under their noses; and they were certain that their future depended upon themselves, and they knew how much the garrison needed."

The favor he wants to ask of you, is to ask for his land as if he was asking a favor from God, and he hopes that you won't forget his words. It is to him as if God were listening; it is to him as if God had said that he and you had come together to exchange words; and he thinks now that God is listening to what he says.

He says to you now: Brother, this is the word, the favor I have to ask, and do not forget my words. You may have some children. Everybody loves his son, loves him

dearly; holds him in his arms and to his heart. For the sake of those children, as if it were for them, he asks this favor.

He says he wants to speak about his family. General Crook knows all about them. He has spoken to him about them; but he knows that you are bigger than he, because he has told him that you are the biggest one of all, and now he wants to speak to you about them.

He says, certainly, they don't take back anything. If any great chief says anything they don't take it back, and the great chiefs in Washington don't take back anything because they put down their words. If a great chief makes a promise, says anything, it is not going to be taken away from him.

He says he has a wife and two children in Chihuahua; that Captain Bourke knows it; that he has seen their pictures over there; and he asks a favor for them. The favor he asks is that these children may be given back into his hands, so he can take them to his heart again, and have them with him at Camp Apache. He has feelings just like the white people, and for that reason he wants to have his people once more with him. He can not make big houses like this, but can only take small sticks and make a house; but still, even if his hands ache, he wants to live that way.

By Captain BOURKE: "In response to Chato's petition to have the children and wives of himself and the other Chiricahuas restored to him when he gave up his prisoners (which petition was duly forwarded by General Crook, through the War Department), the Mexican Government replied that they would not give the women up, because they were better off in Mexico than they could be with Chato, and because it was alleged that they did not want to go back, and that they had better stay where they were.

"In speaking of his house, Chato means that no matter how poor a man is, his home, when it is the best he can offer, is the place for his wife and children to be.

"When he says I have seen their pictures, he is speaking of the photographs which were sent by the Mexican authorities to General Crook to induce Chato to believe that his wife and children were better off where they were in Chihuahua than they were on the reservation."

He says they have a very good commanding officer at Camp Apache.

By Captain BOURKE: "It is Lieutenant-Colonel Wade of the 10th Cavalry."

He gives them great pleasure and often goes to see them. He goes around every day and shakes hands with them.

He says he has a house at Camp Apache. Sam has seen it and knows about it.

By Captain BOURKE: "Sam. Bowman, one of the interpreters, present."

May be, after awhile, they can make him a house that is larger and better. Three years ago they gave him wagons, and tools, picks, and shovels; but they are now worn out and broken, and he has nothing to work with now. You, in your feeling and judgment, will know what to do. What he wants, also, is to see if you won't give him another wagon and some implements to work with. Also, he has seen them give cows; though, to be sure, they eat some of them; they don't eat cows when they have calves, young steers; they don't eat cows, because it is through them they get more.

By Captain BOURKE: "He means that they keep the cows, except the old, worn-out ones, for breeding purposes, to raise stock."

What he wants now are implements to work with, plows and cultivators to work with. The words you have said he has heard well. The words he has spoken to you he hopes you have also heard well.

By the SECRETARY: "You may say to him that I can not promise to return his wife and children to him; but will make every endeavor and try to get them back for him, by a demand upon the Mexican Government for them. You may also say to him that I should like to know whether he knows where they are; and if he can give us any assistance in ascertaining where they are."

He says that about a year ago a woman came (this Lucia) and said those children were in Chihuahua; and said that General Crook got a photograph of them; but did not know where he got it from."

By the SECRETARY: "I will consider what he says in regard to wagons, tools, plows, and other things that he wants, and, if possible, will see that they are supplied."

He says that very often when wagons and such things have been ordered there they have taken the best things and have hidden them away, and given them others in their place. Instead of sending them to San Carlos, he wants to have them sent to the commanding officer at Camp Apache. They have sent those things down to San Carlos, and there they have been stolen, and he don't get them.

By Captain BOURKE. "They are alluding here to the dishonesty of Tiffany, their last agent but one, who stole their supplies of blankets, flour, salt, and other

* See statement by Captain Bourke, ante.

things by the wagon load and sent them to the mining town of Globe and sold them. The interpreter here, Mickey Free, in reply to a question from me just now, said that was what Chato meant; and Mickey told the Secretary that Tiffany put him in the guard-house, and kept him there fifteen days, because he had endeavored while a sentinel on duty to arrest men who were carrying those things away from the store-house in broad daylight. In speaking of the cows they are alluding to those which the Government promised to the Apache Indians three years ago. The Government promised them 1,000 good breeding cows with some good bulls; but only 596 indifferent, over-old and over-young, animals were turned over to the Apaches. The other 404 were withheld by the contractor, in collusion with the agency clerk, Beaumont, during the time of Agent Wilcox. The whole thing was developed in the Crawford court of inquiry, the record of which must be on file in the War Department."

He says what do you think about what he has said? He is not an old man and he is not a boy, and hereafter you will find how he is.

By the Secretary: "I am very much pleased with what he has said, and with the good feeling and good intentions he has expressed."

He says that what he has said to you are his own thoughts and ideas. No one has told him to say them. During the day and at night he thinks over them, and what he has said those are his own ideas. Now, when he is at Fort Apache you will hear this, and you will hear that, but only listen to the words that Chato himself says, and that is the truth. General Crook, too, has told them that very often people will say that Chato did this and did that, but he told them that he would not allow that to trouble them. General Crook, also, has never believed those things, if they have said this or that about him. He did not believe it if they have talked badly about him.

From this out the best way is to speak the plain truth. That is what General Crook has often told them. That is the advice General Crook has always given them, and very often General Crook and he have talked in plain words as he is talking to you now. That is what he has thought and this is what he has told you now.

He says he has had his picture taken here, and that is a thing he wants to ask about, too—if he can't be presented with some of those pictures, and if they can't be sent to him; and he wants to have some of them sent to the man with whom his family is in Chihuahua.

By the SECRETARY: "You may tell him that he shall have some of those pictures that he can send to his family in Chihuahua."

By Captain BOURKE: "The best way to get Chato's pictures to Chihuahua, to the man who has his people, would be to send them to General Crook, at Omaha, and ask him to forward them. He has been in correspondence with persons in Chihuahua who knows exactly where these relatives of Chato's are. The Mexican Government has persistently denied that they are there."

He wants to have his name, Chato, put on the picture, so that his wife will know.

By the SECRETARY: "You may tell him we shall have the name put on them. You may also say to him that, if he wishes, I will present him to the President, so that he can shake hands with the President, and it will not be necessary for him to go through all this talk."

[Captain Bourke explained to Chato, through the interpreter, Mickey Free, that Secretary Endicott was one of the great council of the President, and that everything said to him would be read to the President, and it would be unnecessary to repeat to the Great Father what has been said here, and take up his time, because he was now very busy. All that Chato would do was to shake hands with him and leave when Secretary Endicott was ready to take him away.]

He says he would be glad to see his Great Father, and to shake hands with him.

He wants to have a paper so he can take it back with him to Camp Apache.

By Captain BOURKE: "I presume he means a paper such as they always get from any high official, certifying that he has seen him."

He says he wants the name "Washington" put at the head of the paper, showing that he has been in Washington.

By the SECRETARY: "You may say to him that he shall have such a paper, with the name "Washington" at the head; and that while he is friendly to us we shall be friendly to him.

[They then talked about going to Carlisle, Pa., to visit the Indian school there, where some of them have relatives.]

WEST POINT, N. Y., *February 28, 1890.*

SIR: Referring to a resolution of the United States Senate, dated January 28, 1890, directing the Secretary of War to furnish all evidence in his possession concerning the imprisonment of Chatto and other Apache Indians, etc., which has been referred to me with accompanying papers for report, I have the honor to state the following:

About the 1st of July, 1886, I was ordered by telegraph to proceed from Fort Huachuca, Ariz., to Albuquerque, N. Mex., to report in person to Brig. Gen. N. A. Miles, commanding Department of Arizona, and there meet a delegation of Chiricahua and Warm Spring Apache Indians from Fort Apache, Ariz., and conduct them to Washington.

I arrived at Albuquerque a day or two before the Indians. The latter belonged to the same band as the Indians then on the war path under Geronimo. They had remained at peace and had served as scouts, but for a long time there had been a strong conviction in the minds of officers who were serving in the field that all or nearly all members of this band were unreliable, and that there could never be any certainty of peace with them as long as they remained at liberty in Arizona or New Mexico, from whence they could easily flee to their favorite haunts in Old Mexico.

The territory frequented by them in the latter country is, for the most part, one mass of exceedingly rough, rocky, and difficult mountains, of which the greater portion was unsettled and almost unknown, and the whole is of an area probably as great as that of New York and Pennsylvania combined.

After having taken command of the Department, General Miles had also become convinced of the necessity of removing this band. He told me that he had had a talk with them at Fort Apache, and while they had shown a strong indisposition to move they had consented that a delegation, headed by Chatto, should go to Washington to talk about removal, and he considered this as a favorable point gained. Congress was then in session, and he hoped that any legislation, necessary for the removal and settlement of the Indians elsewhere would not be neglected nor deferred. None of them had been employed in the field by General Miles. It was suspected that if the opportunity offered they would give information and supplies to the hostiles; and as prisoners of war located on the *military* reservation at Fort Apache they were entitled only to the treatment of prisoners, and had no legal claim for special consideration. Still, they had never been disarmed and had served as scouts, and the general considered that under such circumstances it would be fairer and more humane to follow the precedents established in dealing with other Indians in the United States, and try to induce them to move of their own accord, by giving them a reservation adapted to their requirements, with the necessary tools, implements, etc., to make them capable of becoming self-sustaining, and by giving each of the chiefs and head men a certain sum of money annually for a specified time.

When the Indians arrived at Albuquerque I got aboard the train with Mr. L. Q. C. Lamar, jr., of the Interior Department, and then conducted them to Washington. The party consisted of ten Indian men, including Chatto, three Indian women, Victor Gomez and Sam Bowman, who were English and Spanish interpreters, and Concepcion and Mickey Free, who were Spanish and Apache interpreters. I was ordered to return with the Indians to Fort Apache when my duty should be completed in Washington. There was apparently no question about their returning and they expected it. On their way to Washington they said nothing about the journey being much longer than they had been told it would be. They seemed to know how long it would take and apparently were satisfied. In fact one of the party, Concepcion, I think; but possibly one of the Indians, Loco or Charley, had been to Washington before and knew about how many days the journey would last.

Upon reaching Washington I reported, in compliance with my orders, to the Secretary of the Interior and to the Adjutant-General of the Army. I also called upon General Sheridan and the Secretary of War, and explained the object of my visit to both.

One morning, the one after our arrival I think, the Indians were received by the Secretary of the Interior and had a formal talk. I forget the substance of it—possibly it is on file in the Interior Department. At any rate no attempt was made to come to a decision with them, and the talk was of no special importance.

I discovered that it was the conviction of both the Secretary of War and Secretary of the Interior that no legislation concerning the relocation of the Indians could be obtained at that session of Congress, and I also found that no one in authority would take the responsibility of assuring them that if they should consent to move without legislation the conditions upon which they would consent would be ratified in the future. I was in constant communication with General Miles, and under such circumstances he proposed that they should be taken to Fort Riley, or perhaps Fort Leavenworth, or, as a last resort, to Fort Union, where he believed they could be controlled by troops, and where they should be kept only until a permanent home could be selected for them. General Sheridan told me that one reason why this was

impracticable was the opposition it would receive from the governors of Kansas, Colorado, and Texas, and the members of Congress from those States, and the location of the Indians at Fort Union would be opposed by the people of New Mexico. He and the Secretary of the Interior were satisfied of the propriety of moving them, but the Secretary of War said nothing to me to indicate his opinion. General Sheridan said he believed that the Chiricahua and Warm Spring scouts would follow the hostiles and try to induce them to surrender, if the terms were not too severe, but they would not kill or wound any of the hostiles nor guide troops close enough to them to allow the troops to hurt them. He was sorry the delegation had come to Washington, for it was not at all probable that any terms could be made, and as wild Indians are an exceedingly suspicious people, and the subject of their removal had been agitated to such an extent as might arouse their suspicions, he thought it would be dangerous to take them back to Fort Apache and set them at liberty. In his opinion it was best to move the whole band then at Fort Apache to Fort Marion, and keep them there till a suitable place could be provided for them. I then alluded to the fact that as they had never been disarmed and had been employed as scouts it might be considered an act of bad faith to move them to Fort Marion. He answered that it was absurd to talk of keeping faith with those Indians. The foregoing conversation took place some days after I arrived at Washington.

One day while in the War Department building, in the afternoon, I saw a number of the delegation enter the building, accompanied by Capt. J. G. Bourke, Third Cavalry, to whom the Indians were known. I went out to meet them and to learn what they had come there for. Captain Bourke told me the Secretary of War had directed him to bring Chatto to him, and that he (Captain Bourke) had been looking for me to tell me about it, but could not find me. On that occasion the talk with the Secretary of War took place that is recorded in the accompanying paper headed "Transcript of stenographer's notes of a conference between Hon. William C. Endicott, Secretary of War, and Chatto, chief of the Chiricahua Apache Indians, held at War Department Building, Washington, D. C., July 26, 1886."

A day or two afterward the Indians were received by the President. Captain Bourke was also present on this occasion. The Indians had been told that everything they had said to the Secretary of the Interior and to the Secretary of War had been written and the President would read it, but that he was too busy to take time for a talk and would only see them and shake hands. Chatto was the first presented and the President said "I am very glad to see him." Captain Bourke then turned to the interpreter, Concepcion, and said in Spanish about this: "He says he is the Great Father of all the people, and he is their Great Father as well as the Great Father of every one else, and that he feels towards Chatto and his people like a father does towards his children, and is interested like a father in their comfort and welfare." Captain Bourke then turned to the President and told him in English the substance of what he had said to the interpreter. The President said slowly, "Well, that will do." The others were then presented, after which all retired. Nothing else was said by the President and they never saw him again, nor did they ever receive anything or any communication from him.

In the meantime I learned from Secretary Lamar that the matter of the removal of the Apaches was to be considered at a cabinet meeting, and I requested him to try and obtain permission for me to see the President. This he succeeded in doing.

I went to the White House with Mr. L. Q. C. Lamar, jr., and met there the Secretary of the Interior and the Secretary of War; the latter had with him Captain Bourke. All of us were received by the President, who opened the conversation by asking what would be the result of moving this particular band of Apaches from their country. Captain Bourke answered by describing the condition of the Indians at Fort Apache, as to their raising crops, their attachment to their home, etc., most of which I have forgotten, and finally explained the hardships and difficulties experienced by recruits, unaccustomed to high altitudes and to mountain climbing, in trying to overtake the Indians. "That," said the President, "is an argument for their removal." He then asked what would be the effect on the Indians left on the reservation. Captain Bourke replied that while those Indians were divided into several bands, and each band had its own jealousies and animosities, and might, perhaps, have many individuals unfavorably disposed towards the Chiricahuas, still they were connected by intermarriages and were all Apaches, and had a tribal feeling for each other, and while the removal of the Chiricahuas might not be followed by any immediate dissatisfaction, yet it might become exaggerated into a grievance or seized upon as a pretext for a grievance for any outbreaks that might occur hereafter.

Upon this I said about as follows: "Mr. President, there is not a single band of the other Indians but what has a very unfriendly feeling for the Chiricahuas. Each one of them has had some of its members killed by them. The White Mountain band was friendly to them, but last winter the Chiricahuas killed a number of them on their reservation. The Indian scouts from other bands have said to me and to other

officers that they wanted those Indians removed; that there was no hope for permanent peace as long as they were allowed to remain in Arizona; that no faith could be placed in them; that the white people did not know the difference between them and the good Indians; that they gave the reservation a bad name, and made the white people unfriendly to all of them; and in their own interest, and for their own reputation, they wanted the Chiricahuas removed, and," I added, "there is hardly an officer in Arizona that does not think the same."

Captain Bourke had mentioned Ka-e-te-na (in printed account of the conference with the Secretary of War his name is spelled *Kawtenné*), an Indian who had been confined about a year at Alcatraz Island and released in the spring of 1886. He was a member of the delegation, and I stated that the interpreters had overheard a conversation since their arrival in Washington, in which Ka-e-te-na had boasted that he knew of places in the Sierra Madre Mountains where the troops could never find him. (*Some weeks after this, while at Fort Leavenworth, the interpreters said this was a mistake.*) Then I added that so long as those Indians were near the Mexican frontier, any one of them would take advantage of its proximity to fly to it when fearful of punishment for misbehavior, and a few such would form a nucleus in old Mexico for other individuals whenever they should feel discontented or fancy they had a grievance.

The President asked why General Miles wished to give the chiefs and head men money for moving. I replied that it was because it had been the policy of the Government in other cases to purchase the influence of such men by giving them money directly, or by giving them an extravagant price for land they had improved, and cited the case of Chief Moses as one instance, and that of Chief Ouray as another. In the latter case, in 1881, the Uncompahgre Utes received \$75,000 for their old reservation, and Ouray received for his farm several times its real value, and other head men were similarly compensated, all for the purpose of retaining their good will and their good influence with their people. The President asked Captain Bourke whether General Crook made any promises to the Chiricahuas when they returned from Mexico and surrendered in 1883, or whether their surrender had been based on any conditions that would make it a breach of faith for the Government to transfer them elsewhere. Captain Bourke seemed to know of none. At any rate, he mentioned none. He described General Crook's trip to the Sierra Madres, and conference with the Chiricahuas, and stated that the Indians came to the reservation slowly; that the conference took place in the early summer of 1883, and that Geronimo himself did not come in until April, 1884. When the President was told that Geronimo left again in May, 1885, he said: "He staid on the reservation, then, only thirteen months."

Secretary Endicott then took me aside and, after telling me that the question of the advisability of arresting all of the band that were on the reservation had been considered, he asked me some questions about the size and location of their camp, after which the conference ended.

The next day I was ordered to leave Washington and return with the Indians to Fort Apache, stopping en route for a few days at the Indian school at Carlisle, Pa., where there were some Apache children.

No propositions had been made to the Indians looking to their removal, and so far as I knew no definite steps to that end had been decided upon. I knew that General Sheridan was anxious to have them all sent to Florida, but as the members of the delegation had understood when they left Fort Apache that they were to return there, which he learned from me, he preferred that this understanding should be adhered to, and that they should be arrested after their arrival at that place. The Indians themselves were anxious to return, as they had finally decided among themselves they would not consent to change their reservation. For a few days after their arrival in Washington they seemed willing to discuss the matter, but I was informed by the interpreters that they never once thought of consenting to move to any place remote from the Mexican boundary. As I knew one member of the delegation was acquainted with the country as far east as Fort Sill, where General Miles thought of having them located, and as many of the band were familiar with southwestern Texas and the contiguous portion of Mexico, this fact seemed to me to signify that they wished to be always near a country to which they could fly to escape punishment, and from which they could safely make incursions into our territory. It also made me very reluctant to leave Washington without having arrived at some result concerning them, and I expressed my reluctance to General Sheridan just before I left. He made no reply, but ordered me to telegraph my arrival when I reached Carlisle.

The Indians seemed to be satisfied, for they had conceded nothing, and I learned subsequently that Chatto, after receiving a silver medal from Secretary Lamar and a certificate from Secretary Endicott, felt confident that these gifts were in a measure a guaranty that he and his people should remain as they were. The medal was given him by Secretary Lamar a few days before we left, and is such a one as it is usual to give to chiefs of Indian delegations visiting Washington. So far as I have known, it is merely a customary act of courtesy, and carries with it no significance. I forget

what was in the certificate furnished by Secretary Endicott. As I remember, it was to the effect that Chatto had visited Washington and seen the President and Secretary. It was in Captain Bourke's handwriting and I think was signed by him as well as by the Secretary. Another Indian, I have forgotten which one, but think Ka-e-te-na, was given one somewhat similar. I think, however, it was signed by Captain Bourke alone.

As Captain Bourke had become somewhat prominent in connection with this delegation and had made several visits to Chatto at his lodging house, and as he was a warm personal friend of General Crook, and had for many years been on that officer's staff, and as I was representing General Miles who had relieved General Crook of the command of the Department of Arizona, and whose methods were different from those of General Crook, I did not understand why Captain Bourke should have anything to do with it. I spoke to him about it, and he said that when Secretary Endicott heard Chatto was coming to Washington the Secretary sent for him to get information about Chatto's wives and children in Mexico, and that all he had done in connection with the delegation was by the Secretary's order, and he assured me that he had not spoken with any of the Indians about their removal.

Capt. D. M. Taylor, Ordnance Department, U. S. Army, who was on duty in the office of the Secretary of War, told me he had mentioned Captain Bourke to the Secretary as an officer who could inform him correctly about the Apache women and children who were in Mexico.

Upon arriving at Carlisle I telegraphed to General Sheridan that I could find means to keep the Indians entertained there for five days, and I received instructions to remain that length of time and then proceed with them to Fort Apache. In explanation of the foregoing I have to say that the Indians had become impatient at being so long delayed in Washington (about two weeks) and were anxious to return home. Their nature was such that it was thought dangerous to do anything to displease them, and then set them at liberty again at Fort Apache. They had to be humored, or on their return there would be danger of their going on the war path. As long as they could be interested in what they saw at Carlisle they would remain good-natured, but after that they would chafe at further delay, get sulky and perhaps suspicious. I have no doubt that the delicate handling these men required had something to do with the final resolution to send them to Florida, it being considered unwise to put much trust in such a wild, touchy, and suspicious lot of Indians.

While they were in Washington, Mr. L. Q. C. Lamar, jr., made arrangements to take them down the Potomac on an excursion boat, but after they had reached the landing something or other (the time of departure, I believe) did not suit Chatto, so he sulkily refused to go and the whole party returned. I refer to this as showing their disposition.

General Miles was very much opposed to their return to Fort Apache without anything being accomplished, and wished them kept East longer, hoping something could be done. I understood that it was in deference to his wishes that I was allowed to remain five days at Carlisle.

At the end of the five days I started on my return to Apache. I had reached some place in eastern Kansas when I received a telegraphic order to take the Indians to Fort Leavenworth and remain there till further orders. This I complied with, reaching Fort Leavenworth on August 12. On the 14th I received a telegram from the Adjutant-General, which is the first on page 63, Executive Document No. 177, second session Forty-ninth Congress, and my reply follows it. They are as follows:

"WAR DEPARTMENT,
"Washington City, August 14, 1886.

"Captain DORST, *Fourth Cavalry, Fort Leavenworth, Kans.:*

"Please communicate, for the information of the President, the frame of mind of the Indians under your charge, especially as to their reception here, and whether it is of a nature that would add to existing complications should they return to their agency.

"R. C. DRUM,
"Acting Secretary War."

—

"FORT LEAVENWORTH, KANS., August 14, 1886.

"ADJUTANT-GENERAL U. S. ARMY, *Washington, D. C.:*

"After leaving Carlisle the Indians appeared convinced they were to remain undisturbed at Fort Apache. Chatto had not received written assurance he requested, but the present of a medal from Secretary Interior, the possession of an unimportant certificate from Captain Bourke and Secretary of War, and the fact he had not been told he would have to move, seemed to satisfy him. The detention here causes much uneasiness because only surmises can be offered in explanation. I have tried

to quiet their fears, but Chatto has just told me they believe their families will be moved here to meet them. Interpreter Bowman says that if some reasonable explanation is given and they are allowed to proceed home at once no trouble due to present circumstances need be apprehended. His opinion is entitled to consideration, but since their suspicions are [printed *suspicion is*] aroused, I hesitate to say they can be so completely removed that the recollection of them will cause no lurking uneasiness. Whether they return or stay here, I would like to have something to tell them coming from high authority.

"DORST, Captain."

To this I received the following reply :

"WAR DEPARTMENT, ADJUTANT-GENERAL'S OFFICE,
"Washington, August 16, 1886"

"Capt. JOSEPH H. DORST,
"(Care Commanding General,)
"Fort Leavenworth :

"Your telegram received and confirmed apprehensions here. The removal of the Indians from Fort Apache is now so probable that you must arrange to get along with those with you until removal is effected. In the mean time something is expected from your interview with General Miles at Albuquerque.

"R. C. DRUM,
"Adjutant-General."

I had learned in the mean time that the detention at Fort Leavenworth had been brought about by General Miles's efforts to have the Indians kept in the east till some arrangement looking to their removal could be effected. In compliance with an order from the War Department, I then proceeded to Albuquerque to confer with General Miles. This order was issued at his request. Before leaving the Indians I told them where I was going, and that I would return in a few days, and if they wished me to say anything to General Miles for them, I would carry their messages. Upon making this communication to them, Chatto became very angry, and asked me "whether General Miles was a greater man than Washington" (the Indians use the word "Washington" to designate the President), and made other remarks to the same effect. I repeated, very quietly and without temper, what I was going to do, and reminded him that I came to him in a friendly spirit, only offering to do him a favor. He then said, very insolently and sarcastically, "How many years will it be before you come back?" Seeing that it was useless to try to pacify him, I withdrew and said nothing more to him. Chiefs Loco and Noche seemed to deplore this outburst of Chatto, but said nothing to me. I then proceeded to Albuquerque and saw General Miles, who was still anxious to have some amicable arrangements made with the Indians, and their consent obtained to move of their own will. I learned that the Governor of New Mexico had issued a proclamation offering a reward for the apprehension of Chatto and others for crimes committed in that Territory, and also that indictments against them had been found. I knew the feeling against them was very strong, both in New Mexico and Arizona. In taking the Indians east, I had been careful not to divulge their identity while traveling through New Mexico, for fear some violence would be offered them. General Miles directed me to explain to the Indians, on my return to them, the strong feeling against them and the probable result to them if they fell into the hands of the civil authorities. He hoped to secure an arrangement for them with the Government similar to that contained in a memorandum inclosed in a letter he had addressed to me at Carlisle, but which I did not receive until after my arrival at Fort Leavenworth.

That letter and memorandum were as follows :

"WILCOX, ARIZ., August 5, 1886.

"Capt. J. H. DORST,
"Fourth U. S. Cavalry, Carlisle, Pa. :

"CAPTAIN: I send you the inclosed proposition of what appears to me to be a fair arrangement to be made between the Government and those Indians. Should it receive the approval of the executive authorities, the Indians, in my judgment, should accept it, as it would be just and liberal to them. They at present have no reservation, very little property, and are living practically as prisoners of war, and the feeling against them on the part of the White Mountain Indians is very strong and on the part of the citizens of Arizona it is intense, and it is for the interest of all the Apaches that they move to some place where they would be at peace and have homes and property of their own.

"They could make this proposition to the Government, or if approved, the Government could offer them the terms as stated in the inclosed memorandum.

"Of course, if any better plan can be devised, it would be equally desirable and satisfactory to all concerned. The inclosed terms would certainly be a generous con-

sideration on the part of the Government and would be accepted in good faith by the Indians. They should sign an agreement to that effect; otherwise they would revert to their former status and would be obliged to abide by any disposition the Government might deem best for the general peace and welfare of this country. To make opposition or resistance to the power of the Government would be useless, as has been fully demonstrated. There is not a corner of this country tenable for hostile Indians, and it is better for them to now avail themselves of the opportunity to improve their condition and benefit their people for all time.

"Very truly, yours,

"NELSON A. MILES,
"Brigadier-General, Commanding."

"Memoranda suggested for a settlement and agreement between the Chiricahua and Warm Springs Indians and the Secretary of the Interior:

"That the Government grant them a reservation of 600 square miles of land; that each family receive \$300 in domestic animals, farming utensils, etc., the first year; the same the second year. The recognized chiefs to have comfortable abodes, with such valuables as may be granted them; in all not to exceed in value \$5,000. Such prominent men of the tribe as may be selected, to superintend and govern the tribes and preserve good order among the Indians, and friendly and peaceable relations with all others. Said chiefs to receive, say: One to receive \$50 per month—\$600 per year; one to receive \$40 per month—\$480 per year; one to receive \$30 per month—\$360 per year; four to receive \$25 per month—\$1,200 per year; eight to receive \$20 per month—\$1,920 per year; total, \$4,560.

"That the Apaches now in Florida be sent to the reservation, and those that the Government may decide to send there of the hostiles who surrender. Also that measures be taken to restore any of the Apaches that may now be in captivity in Mexico to their relatives."

He directed me to draw up a formal paper in duplicate for their signature, based on the above memorandum. The Indians were to be told that if they agreed to the conditions mentioned, and signed the paper, that efforts would be made to have those conditions ratified by the Government, though such ratification could not be positively assured. Until that time the band should go to some place selected by the Government, perhaps Fort Reilly or Fort Union, and remain there. A few of the delegation could remain at Fort Leavenworth, and a few return to Apache to move with their people, after which the former would join them.

I also received additional instructions, of which I made a memorandum. The following is a verbatim copy of that memorandum:

"(1). See interpreters; explain importance of Indians moving; make it to interest of interpreters to use influence to make move.

"(2). Talk separately with Ka-e-te-na and Chatto; that although they have committed crimes, one sentenced to Alcatraz, yet they were selected to go to Washington because it was believed they could use their influence to get their people to move where they would be prosperous and comfortable. If they persist in declining liberal terms of government, they will be ignored and negotiations opened with others of more sense and reason. There is no doubt that tribe will be moved anyhow, and it will better their condition as tribe and individuals if they will conform in good faith to wishes of the Government. It is not the design or purpose of any officials to use harsh measures or do them injustice, but only to separate them from people who have every reason to feel very hostile towards them, and at the same time better their own condition. Those who have been hostile have been hunted for last four months, until they are worn out and crippled, and they are trying to make terms with a government that will not give them one-tenth part as much as the United States. While Indians may think they can raid and hide, there is not a mountain range they can seek where they can have any feeling of security. The terms that the Government will be willing to give them are most liberal and generous, and they should accept them in good faith.

"The millions of white men in this country are subservient to Government authorities, and it is foolish for them to expect they will not have to be also.

"No harm will come to them. Explain civil government of New Mexico and Arizona and military authority also. Reservation outside of New Mexico and Arizona is outside of jurisdiction of authorities of those Territories."

I returned to Fort Leavenworth and did as directed. The Indians seemed to be impressed when they learned of the hostile feeling of the citizens of New Mexico and Arizona and the action of the civil authorities. They agreed to the conditions contained in the memorandum of General Miles and signed a paper, in duplicate, to that effect. The signatures were witnessed by First Lieut. C. H. Murray, Fourth Cavalry, and the paper was sent to General Miles. They were willing to go wherever General Miles wished to send them.

In Ex. Doc., No. 117, second session, Forty-ninth Congress, I notice on page 64 an extract from a letter of the Secretary of War, in which it is stated that on my visit to Albuquerque I must have informed General Miles that the views of the President were that the place of confinement should be Fort Marion, Fla.

In that the Secretary was mistaken. I know only what I have before related, viz that the matter of arresting all the band had been under consideration by the President, as the Secretary told me, and that General Sheridan was in favor of sending them to Fort Marion. I did not know what was intended or had been decided till I received orders to take the Indians to Fort Marion. General Miles was therefore ignorant of the views of the President when I left Albuquerque.

A day or two after the Indians had signed the paper, I received orders to start with six of them and two interpreters for Arizona, taking four with me to Holbrook and sending two to Wilcox. I understood these were to accompany their people to some place selected by General Miles, probably Fort Union, as had been intended should the Indians agree to the conditions proposed. Chatto was not one of the party. I was stopped at Emporia, Kans., and ordered to return with them to Fort Leavenworth. That was on August 28th. After this the Indians remained quietly at Fort Leavenworth until September 14th, about one month after their arrival there, when, in obedience to orders from the War Department, I proceeded with them to the military post at St. Augustine, Fla., and turned them over to the commanding officer, upon which my connection with them ceased.

So far as I can recollect, the foregoing is a full account of what took place while the Indians were under my charge. My memory has been assisted by reference to the printed papers referred to me. I have no notes nor memoranda in my possession except a copy of the letter from General Miles, dated August 5, 1886, the memorandum accompanying it and my memorandum of instructions made at Albuquerque, all of which are quoted in full.

I was not personally acquainted with members of this band of Indians, though I had seen them casually at Fort Apache and once in the field. With the exception of Captain Crawford and perhaps two or three other officers, I knew that officers who had been with them in the field when they were employed as scouts against Geronimo's band, distrusted them and had about the same opinion of them as scouts as had General Sheridan. It was believed that the hostiles could and did get supplies and information from the Chiricahua scouts and those who remained on the reservation. Geronimo himself went to the reservation in October, 1885, and took one of his wives from the camp of those who were peaceable.

In May, 1886, I was at Fort Apache for about two weeks and met Chatto. Of course I saw some of the Indians every day, and knew the location of their camp. From ordinary conversation with officers of the post, I learned that the band had no ground of their own, but were allowed to use land on the military reservation for their camps and crops; and that the White Mountain Indians, who hold the land in the vicinity of Fort Apache, were very careful to see that the Chiricahuas did not pass beyond the limits of the military reserve and thus use land belonging to the White Mountains. In the same way I heard that the Indians themselves did very little work, but the actual tilling of the soil was done by Mexicans who worked for them on shares. The above matters were not within my personal knowledge, but I mention them here as I believe they were known in the same way to General Sheridan, and perhaps to other officials in Washington, and affected their views and recommendations. They can be verified by calling upon Col. J. F. Wade, Fifth Cavalry, who was at that time in command of Fort Apache. I was affected by them myself, and believed then and believe now that it would have been criminal neglect on the part of the authorities not to remove the entire band to some place where they would be powerless to do harm; and that particularly after my conversation with Chatto, just before I left Fort Leavenworth to go to Albuquerque, he could not have been trusted. Since the imprisonment of those Indians, I have never heard, from any one engaged in the Geronimo campaign, the slightest question raised as to the propriety or wisdom of removing them in that way. Chatto could have been taken back to Fort Apache, but if his arrest followed, such a course would have been a mere form. Had he been set at liberty, I am sure there would have been such results that the people of Arizona and New Mexico, and the Government of Old Mexico, and not Chatto, would undoubtedly have had the most justifiable grounds for believing that they were entitled to an indemnity now.

Since the above was written I have recalled other things that may be of interest. To relate them will show more fully the views of officers who were closely in contact with those Indians, and, judging from printed accounts I have seen of testimony given before the Senate committee, I think the Secretary of War will consider their relation pertinent and proper.

Just after the outbreak in 1885 I was at Fort Bayard, N. Mex. There I saw General Crook, who placed implicit confidence in Chatto, and said it was to Chatto's interest to keep faith with us, for the Mexicans held one or two wives and some children of his, and his prospect of recovering them depended on his good behavior. I also heard

then, and afterwards learned positively, that Chatto and Geronimo were not on the best terms, and on that account Chatto would not be likely to go on the war path if he had to place himself under the leadership of Geronimo. Many believed that these things, and not love of peaceful pursuits nor fear of the whites, were the controlling influences that kept him from becoming hostile. This theory was advanced some time after the outbreak, after the conduct of Chatto's scouts had caused unfavorable comment. Chatto had no quarrel with the other hostiles—his own people—who followed Geronimo; and most, if not all, the officers who served with troops in commands to which Chatto's scouts belonged, believed the scouts delayed and misled them when following the hostiles. This opinion was also held by Indian scouts who were not of the same band as the hostiles. Most officers who were on duty with the Chiricahua scouts distrusted them. General Sheridan said that it was on account of his lack of faith in them that he ordered General Miles to make prominent use of the regular troops of his command. No one doubted the loyalty of all other Indian scouts.

When I was at Fort Apache, in May 18, 1886, General Miles had dispensed with the services of the Chiricahua scouts, and there was a feeling among the officers there, that as the Indians were thus rendered idle they would grow restless, and if the hostiles did not soon meet with some decided reverse, the Indians at Apache would join them. Theoretically they were not idle, but performing manual labor in their fields, while in reality, with few exceptions, that labor was done by Mexicans and some women. Many were in the habit of getting drunk, and Ka-e-te-na particularly was regarded with suspicion. I did not take the trouble to investigate these things, but they were alluded to as matters of course, that every one knew, and with no attempt on the part of the speakers to produce an impression. The distrust of the Chiricahuas was so general that no one thought of placing stress on such subjects.

While we were in Washington, an interpreter, Sam Bowman, reported to me the conversation I have mentioned, when Ka-e-te-na boasted he knew of places in Mexico where troops could not find him. He reported that then it had also leaked out that just before General Miles went to Apache to see about sending the delegation to Washington Ka-e-te-na was contemplating an outbreak. A great number were drunk, or were just recovering from a spree, when General Miles arrived, and his arrival caused them to delay action till they had seen him. Afterwards Bowman told me this story (except as to the drunkenness) was not true. He got it from Concepcion, who afterwards claimed it was a mistake, and that he had misunderstood the Indians. I do not remember the story distinctly, but it was so straight that I was surprised when Concepcion retracted it. When I spoke about it, his manner made me believe that he was withholding something, and the story was true, but that he had some reason for contradicting himself. Ka-e-te-na had spent nearly all his life in Mexico, and the story accorded with the opinion of him, held by those who knew him well.

Very respectfully, your obedient servant,

J. H. DORST,
Captain Fourth Cavalry.

The ADJUTANT-GENERAL U. S. ARMY,
Washington, D. C.

WAR DEPARTMENT,
Washington City, March 10, 1890.

GENERAL: I have the honor to make the following report, in obedience to your reference, received by mail this a. m., transmitting copy of Senate resolution in regard to the seizure of Chato and members of his band of Chiricahua Apaches, etc.

I make my report as succinct as possible, fearing to overburden the record with matter not strictly connected with the case and not comprehended in the Senate inquiry. I had known the Arizona Apaches, in peace and war, since 1869; had been a member of General Crook's staff during the campaign which reduced six thousand of them to submission and put them to work; had accompanied that officer on his expedition into the heart of the Sierra Madre, Mexico, in 1883, and had been by his side at the moment when Geronimo surrendered to him in the Cañon de los Embudos, Sonora, in March, 1886.

I had been consulted by Hon. William C. Endicott, then Secretary of War, in regard to these Indians and the general history of the tribe, of which I have made a special study, going back to the first acquaintance of the white man with them.

I had been asked by Chato to confer with the Secretary of War, with a view to the restitution of Chato's children, then held, and still held, prisoners in Mexico. Chato had restored thirteen white captives to General Crook, and he had been promised the fullest interposition possible to secure the return of his family. Of these facts I was the only man in Washington, and possibly the only man in the world, excepting General Crook, who had any knowledge or memoranda. The minutes of that conference with the Secretary of War have been printed, and are to be

found among the papers referred from your office. They were printed at my urgent request upon my telling Mr. Endicott that my experience had taught me no conversation of an official nature should ever be held with Indians, unless at once reduced to writing.

Secretary Endicott was kind and courteous, and when the party broke up, asked me to prepare for his signature, a paper which he gave to Chato. Chato had with him discharge papers, certifying to the excellence of his character as a scout, signed by Capt. Emmet Crawford, Third Cavalry, and Lieut. Britton Davis, Third Cavalry, two of the ablest and most experienced Indian fighters the service has ever had.

Chato further received from the Secretary of the Interior (L. Q. C. Lamar) a silver medal; the records of the Interior Department can be consulted to determine whether these medals are given to ordinary Indians or for trivial considerations; my own experience, running back twenty-one years, assures me that they are only bestowed as a mark of special honor and confidence.

Chato, during the whole time of his stay in the capital, seemed to be in good humor and spirits, although he complained of severe headache brought on by an ulcerated tooth.

The President received the deputation kindly, but, as previously arranged, he (Mr. Cleveland) merely shook hands and said he would carefully consider all that had been said between them and Hon. Mr. Endicott.

A day or two after this I accompanied Mr. Endicott to the White House where a Cabinet meeting was in progress. I was questioned concerning the terms under which the Chiricahuas had surrendered to General Crook in Sierra Madre, Mexico, in 1883. I replied that they were to cease from raids upon both Mexicans and Americans and go to work upon farms which should be provided for them in some suitable place on the White Mountain Reservation, Ariz., and that so long as they behaved themselves they should be protected in the homes thus provided; but I stated that as I had been taken very violently ill during the latter part of the Sierra Madre campaign and might for that reason have failed to record some item or stipulation, I ventured to suggest that General Crook himself should be telegraphed for, it being natural to suppose that he could furnish all the information desired.

General Crook, however, was not sent for.

President Cleveland seemed to confound the two bands of Geronimo and Chato; and alluded to the fact that Geronimo had not remained much more than a year at the White Mountain Reservation before returning to the war-path. I was an apologist for Geronimo, and believed then, as I believe now, that he was a and is depraved rascal whose neck I should like to stretch; but, I submitted that there was a marked difference between his case and that of Chato, who from the hour of his surrender to General Crook in 1883, had abided faithfully by every promise made, and who not only kept his own people from going out with Geronimo, but had headed the scouts, taken from his own band, and had hunted him (Geronimo) from rock to rock until Captain Crawford was killed in a meeting with Mexican irregular troops, just after the village of Geronimo had been surprised and destroyed.

I explained, too, that Chato and Geronimo were personal enemies, and that Geronimo had endeavored to exculpate himself to General Crook for his outbreak from the reservation in 1885, by saying that he feared Chato was plotting to kill him.

In the month of March, 1887, I accompanied Mr. Herbert Welsh, Secretary of the Indian Rights Association, to St. Augustine, Fla., to examine into the condition of these Indians, then in confinement in the moldy casements of the old Spanish Fort, San Marco. Mr. Welsh's report has already been published and is deserving of the most careful consideration. As copies of it can be obtained from that gentleman, I will add nothing more to my report than the bitter complaint Chato made of treachery with which he had been treated; that the Government which employed him as a scout against Geronimo had given him the very same treatment given to Geronimo; that his people were dying and had no chance to work, and had been robbed of the farms and little belongings, horses, etc., of no great consequence in our eyes, perhaps but of considerable value to them. He appealed to me to say whether I had seen him and his people upon their farms near Fort Apache, which I told him I certainly had. Among the Indians in confinement were Ki-e-ta and Martinez, who had been induced to go out and coax Geronimo to come in. Geronimo did come in under the assurance as they stated, that he was to be allowed to return to Fort Apache; not all of his band remained with the troops after meeting them; there was a small number who preferred to return to the recesses of the Sierra Madre, where they still are. Immediately after effecting this important mission for the Government of the United States, and without receiving the reward promised them Ki-e-ta and Martinez were hurried off to prison with Geronimo and the rest.

Another Indian whom I met was Gout-kli, who is not an adherent of either Chato or Geronimo, in any sense, not being a Chiricahua at all; he is a San Carlos Apache, married to a Chiricahua squaw, had never lived with the Chiricahuas.

at all until just before his seizure, had for years been a scout, and was favorably considered by the officers in charge at Fort Marion. There was another case exactly similar, but the name escapes me (it was Tzil-gan) and, again, there was another in the case of To-Klanni, a White Mountain Apache, similarly married, who with Pa-na-o-tizn had led General Crook so faithfully and so ably into the heart of the Sierra Madre in 1883. None of these imprisoned scouts were mustered out of service for weeks after arriving at Fort Marion.

"Sam Bowman (the interpreter) stated to Mr. Welsh in my presence that if he had known that the Government contemplated treating Chato as it had been doing, he, Bowman, would never have come with the Chiricahuas to Florida." (Personal note-book, March 8, 1887, St. Augustine, Fla. Bowman was one of the interpreters who had accompanied Chato to Washington in the summer of 1886. J. G. B.)

I have the honor to be, general, very respectfully, your obedient servant,

JOHN G. BOURKE,
Captain, Third Cavalry.

The ADJUTANT-GENERAL, U. S. ARMY,
Washington, D. C.

