

MESSAGE

FROM THE

PRESIDENT OF THE UNITED STATES,

TRANSMITTING

A letter of the Secretary of War and reports touching the Apache Indians at Governor's Island.

JANUARY 20, 1890.—Read, referred to the Committee on Indian Affairs, and ordered to be printed.

To the Senate and House of Representatives :

I transmit herewith a letter from the Secretary of War, relating to the condition and needs of the band of Apache Indians now held at Mount Vernon Barracks and at Governor's Island. The reports of General Crook and Lieutenant Howard, which accompany the letter of the Secretary, show that some of these Indians have rendered good service to the Government in the pursuit and capture of the murderous band that followed Natchez and Gerouimo. It is a reproach that they should not, in our treatment of them, be distinguished from the cruel and bloody members of the tribe now confined with them.

I earnestly recommend that provision be made by law for locating these Indians upon lands in the Indian Territory.

BENJ. HARRISON.

EXECUTIVE MANSION,
Washington, January 20, 1890.

WAR DEPARTMENT,
OFFICE OF THE SECRETARY,
Washington, January 13, 1890.

To the PRESIDENT :

In my annual report I referred to the Apache Indians held as prisoners at Mount Vernon Barracks, Ala., and stated that after further investigation more definite suggestions would be submitted for your consideration.

I have received, and transmit herewith, a report by General Crook, and a report by Lieut. Guy Howard with indorsements by Generals Howard and Schofield. I have also consulted with many officers who are conversant with Indian affairs or who have special knowledge in regard to this band; and have had the views of the Commissioner of Indian Affairs, of the Indian Rights Association, the Indian Citizenship Committee of Boston, and of many citizens interested in this question. There has certainly been no lack of "a multitude of counselors."

Some of these Indians have rendered good and loyal service to the Government, and great as were the outrages committed by the others, they are now thoroughly subdued.

Two are confined at Governor's Island, 70 are at the Carlisle School, and 309 women and children and 79 men are at Mount Vernon; total, 460. Thirty of these men only are able-bodied, 25 more are able to do more or less work, and the rest are old or crippled.

Before they were moved from Arizona, both the men and women were accustomed to work the land to quite an extent. In their present location there is no opportunity for them to engage in agriculture or other useful work. It is the duty of the Government to remove them to some other point where they can have permanent homes, and pursue some employment tending to their civilization and self-support.

There have been two feasible plans submitted:

1st. The purchase, if authorized by Congress, of a tract of land in the mountainous region of western North Carolina, or in one of the adjacent States.

2d. Their removal to some point in the Indian Territory.

However, section 3, chapter 87, of the Laws of 1879, provides: "And the President of the United States is hereby directed to prohibit the removal of any portion of said tribe of Indians [Indians of New Mexico and Arizona] to the Indian Territory, unless the same shall be hereafter authorized by act of Congress."

Either plan would be fairly satisfactory. The latter is the more economical, and I am inclined to believe would be the most beneficial to the Indians. It has the approval of General Crook.

If Congress will grant the necessary authority, I recommend, therefore, that these Indians be transferred to Fort Sill in the Indian Territory, with a view to their final settlement on the Kiowa, Comanche and Apache Reservation, provided satisfactory negotiations can be consummated with these confederated tribes to that end. The military reservation of Fort Sill comprises 36 square miles and is located within this Indian reservation.

I have the honor to be, yours, respectfully,

REDFIELD PROCTOR,
Secretary of War.

WASHINGTON, D. C., *January 6, 1890.*

SIR: I have the honor to report that in compliance with your instructions, I proceeded on the 28th ultimo, in company with Senator Z. B. Vance, to visit certain lands in the State of North Carolina, which have been reported to be suitable for a reservation for the Chiricahua band of Apache Indians.

Incessant and heavy rains during the whole of our stay in North Carolina rendered it impracticable to go over all the lands in question, but enough was seen of them and of the neighboring country to satisfy me that in climate and general characteristics it is more like the reservation in Arizona from which the Chiricahuas were taken than any other tract available in the eastern part of the country. It seems to be fairly well adapted to the needs of these Indians; they could do here a little general farming, raise grain, and keep a moderate amount of stock. The country is rough, mountainous, and wooded, and it would require at least 60,000 acres of such land, or not less than 500 acres to a family, to enable the Indians to make a living on it.

Leaving Senator Vance at Asheville, N. C., I proceeded to Mount Vernon Barracks, Alabama. Here I had an interview with the captive Chiricahuas, notes of which are hereto appended. I invite attention to them, and especially to the statements of Chatto and Ka-e-te-na.

From my own knowledge I know that most of the statements contained in these notes are correct. I have reason to believe that some of their own statements are not as strong as the facts would warrant. A reference to the reports of the Secretary of War and of the Lieutenant-General of the Army for the year 1886, will throw light on many otherwise obscure remarks in the notes.

With regard to the present condition of these Indians, they appeared, with a few exceptions, to be healthy and strong. There has, however, been a great number of deaths among them: This mortality has been much more than normal, and would seem due to home-sickness, change of climate, and the dreary monotony of empty lives. They need something to do, something to occupy their heads and hands.

There is among them a general and earnest desire to possess farms of their own, on which they can work out a future for themselves. From my personal knowledge of them I can attest to their ability to become entirely self-sustaining in a very short time, provided care be taken that they are started aright. Their past experience has been very far from encouraging to them, and their recent history strikingly illustrates the difficulties under which the Indian labors in attempting to live the life of the white man and to follow his ways. Among many similar ones, I beg leave to call attention to the case of Chatto.

In 1883, he was brought from the Sierra Madres of Old Mexico, and was placed with the rest of his tribe upon a reservation in Arizona. At first he was wild and savage as any of his people, but having been induced to settle upon a farm which was assigned to him, he set about earnestly to learn the ways of the white man. In the outbreak of 1885, he was approached by Geronimo and others who wanted him to fly with them back to their Mexican haunts. They threatened to shoot him if he did not go, but he said he had promised not to go on the war-path and he would keep his word. Not only this, but he exerted his influence to prevent others from going, and to such purpose that of the one hundred and twenty men who had surrendered in 1883 only about fifty-three could be induced to leave the reservation for the war-path.

In the operation against the hostiles, Chatto and others of his band were enlisted as scouts in the service of the United States and rendered invaluable services in that capacity. It is not too much to say that the surrender of Natchez, Chihauhua, Geronimo, and their bands could not have been effected except for the assistance of Chatto and his Chiricahu scouts.

The final surrender of Geronimo and his small band to General Miles was brought about only through Chiricahuas who had remained friendly to the Government.

When his services were no longer required Chatto received an honorable discharge and returned to his farm. He planted wheat and barley, raised sheep and owned horses and mules. Before his crops had ripened he was summoned to Washington. After an interview with the President he left the capital expecting to return to his farm at Camp Apache. On the way he was stopped at Fort Leavenworth, Kans., and kept there for two months. At the end of this time he was taken to St. Augustine, and placed in confinement with the captive hostiles, whose surrender he had been so largely instrumental in securing. Ever since he has

been continued in confinement on the same terms with them, and with the yet more guilty band of Geronimo, which subsequently joined them.

His farm was taken from him. It is true his stock and crops were sold at some sort of a figure and the money forwarded to him, but this could not compensate him for the loss of his home, his country, and of all the results of his efforts to create a future for himself. His three years of earnest endeavor have been rewarded by three years of discouraging and unmerited captivity. During my interview with him at Mount Vernon Barracks Chatto took from his breast a large medal that had been presented to him by President Cleveland, and holding it out, asked, "Why was I given that to wear in the guard-house? I thought that something good would come to me when they gave it to me, but I have been in confinement ever since I have had it." I submit that this Indian has received but scant encouragement from the Government in his efforts to become a self-sustaining citizen.

And Chatto is not alone in this experience. By far the greater part of the tribe remained true to the Government in the outbreak of 1885, and the most valuable and trustworthy of the Indian scouts were taken from among them. For their allegiance all have been rewarded alike—by captivity in a strange land.

The most ordinary justice would seem to demand a different course of procedure with men not only innocent of offense against the Government, but to whom the Government is largely indebted for services of the very greatest value, and which they alone could have rendered. They have a right to demand such of the Government, but they demand nothing. Discouraged and homeless they ask only an opportunity to work for themselves, and I believe that it is the duty of the Government to give them such an opportunity. Their farms have been taken from them, and others should be given to them. I can not too strongly urge that immediate steps be taken to secure a reservation for them where they could be settled on farms of their own, to work for themselves, and to receive for themselves the full benefit of their labors, for with red people as well as white self-interest is the mainspring of progress. With such an incentive there can be little doubt of their future.

It would not be wise, in my opinion, to send them back to their own country. Trouble might perhaps ensue if this were done, and did they again take the war-path in that country it would be utterly impossible ever to get them to surrender again, and to exterminate them in war would cost thousands of lives to say nothing of the loss of property which such a war would entail. But I am satisfied that there will be no more law-abiding community than these Indians, no matter in what part of the United States they may be placed.

Taking into consideration what I believe to be the pressing necessity for early action in the case of these Chiricahuas, I would recommend that if possible they be sent as soon as practicable to some point in the Indian Territory. I should prefer this country to that in North Carolina, as the climate and local conditions there are more nearly like that of the country to which they are accustomed, and, considering everything, would be better suited to them.

Before closing my report I wish to refer to a matter which I believe to be important enough to deserve serious consideration. It would seem to be a mistake to send the children of these Indians to the school at Carlisle, a place which, from whatever cause it may be, proves so fatal to them. Many of the children die there, and those who return to their people seem peculiarly liable to contract consumption, the disease

that has taken off so many of them since their removal to the East. The Apaches are fond of their children and kinsfolk, and they live in terror lest their children be taken from them and sent to a distant school.

I am, sir, very respectfully, your obedient servant,

GEORGE CROOK,
Major-General, U. S. Army.

The SECRETARY OF WAR.

NOTES OF AN INTERVIEW BETWEEN MAJ. GEN. GEORGE CROOK, U. S. ARMY, AND CHATTO, KA E-TE-NA, NOCHE, AND OTHER CHIRICAHUA APACHES.

MOUNT VERNON BARRACKS, ALA., *January 2, 1890.*

Present: Major-General Crook, U. S. Army, First Lieut. L. W. V. Kennon, Sixth Infantry, A. D. C.; Maj. William I. Kellogg, Nineteenth Infantry; Second Lieut. Arthur B. Foster, Nineteenth Infantry; George Wrattan, interpreter.

General Crook asked what took place the night the party under Natchez and Geronimo broke away in March, 1886.

NATCHEZ replied: When we left there, so far as I was concerned I didn't know anything; I didn't know how to work, I didn't know how to dig up roots, or break ground or break rock, and I thought I wouldn't like it. I was afraid I wouldn't like to work. All of us thought that way.

General CROOK. How did you come to leave that night?

NATCHEZ. I was afraid I was going to be taken off somewhere I didn't like; to some place I didn't know. I thought all who were taken away would die. Since then I have found out different. I have worked much since then. Nobody said anything to me that night; I worked it out in my own mind.

General CROOK. Didn't the Indians talk about among themselves?

NATCHEZ. We talked to each other about it. We were drunk.

General CROOK. Why did you get drunk?

NATCHEZ. Because there was a lot of whisky there and we wanted a drink, and took it. The other didn't want to go out. I don't know why the others didn't know of it; I thought they all did.

General CROOK. Why did you kill people after promising me you would not?

NATCHEZ. Because we were afraid. It was war. Anybody who saw us would kill us, and we did the same thing. We had to if we wanted to live.

General CROOK. How did you come to surrender. Were you afraid of the troops?

NATCHEZ. We wanted to see our people.

General CROOK. Did troops force them to surrender?

NATCHEZ. We were not forced to do it. We talked under a flag of truce. We all said we had had enough and wanted to surrender.

General CROOK. How many of your party were killed?

NATCHEZ. No man was killed; one woman was killed by Mexicans.

General CROOK. How long did the flag of truce last under which the surrender was made?

WRATTAN, the interpreter, stated that two Chiricahua Indians went to the hostiles on the night of August 24, 1886. On August 26 Lieutenant Gatewood, Wrattan, and Jose Maria met the hostiles on the Bavispe River. The next day they had a talk with Lawton, in which they decided to see General Miles. They were told they would get no more conditions from him than from Gatewood and Lawton. Miles was to meet them at Skeleton Cañon on the 3d of September and they had a talk.

General CROOK. Could the surrender have been made without the scouts?

WRATTAN. I do not think so. The two Indians traveled with the flag of truce. The hostiles moved to Terras Mountains; the scouts went into their camp and talked with them.

General CROOK. What were the conditions of the surrender?

WRATTAN. The conditions were that they should give up their arms and surrender; that they would not be harmed but would be taken to their people in St. Augustine.

General CROOK. Did all the Indians come in?

NATCHEZ. Near Fort Bowie two men, one boy, and some women left the party and have never been heard from since.

General CROOK. How many people came in with Lawton?

NATCHEZ. Seventeen altogether, but two broke away, leaving fifteen bucks, four children, and eleven women.

General CROOK. How many went out with Natchez?

NATCHEZ. I don't remember. I have no way of keeping count. About thirty, I think.

CHIHUAHUA said he wasn't afraid of anything, troops or scouts. For what you said to me I am much obliged; I have it in my head yet. You wanted me to be good and I have tried to be.

KA-E-TE-NA said: When you asked me to go down with you to talk to the hostiles I went with you and talked good to them. I talked your talk to them and your mind to them. I told them all you said to me. I told them: "This is the way General Crook wants you to do. He wants you to talk and think as he thinks."

You told me to look out for them and take good care of them. I went along with them to San Bernardino. I was with them the night some of them left. I didn't know why they left. I think it was on account of some women. My brother stayed there the next night and came on home the next day. (The events Ka-e-te-na speaks of here occurred in March, 1886. See General Crook's communication of December 26, 1886, viz: "Resume of Operations in Arizona," L. W. V. K.)

CHATTO stated: I was working on my farm and had one field planted in wheat and another in barley. (This was in the summer of 1886). My sisters had other fields planted. Just as the crops were getting ripe I left them and went to Washington. When they were sold it didn't bring what it was worth. I didn't get as much for it as if I had stayed to look after it. I had a wagon and could make a good deal of money with that hauling hay, supplies, etc. I didn't leave these of my own accord. I had sheep, about thirty head, that were increasing all the time; I had to leave them. I made money by shearing them and selling the wool; I had horses and mules which were worth a good deal of money, \$150 to \$200. I received some \$10 for the horses and \$29 for the mules. The sheep sold for about the right price, \$2 a piece. You told us about farms; I got a plow and took good care of everything. When I got word to go to Washington I went. I never left of my own accord.

General CROOK. How many Chiricahua scouts were enlisted when Geronimo went out?

CHATTO. Twenty-five scouts were enlisted; nineteen of these had farms. The rest were young men or boys.

CHIHUAHUA said: All who went to Florida had horses and mules, the same as Chatto.

KA-E-TE-NA said: He had a wagon for which nothing had been given him.

General CROOK. Why did the scouts come here?

CHATTO. When I left Camp Apache to go to Washington they talked good to me and said I could make a living. I came back a little way and stopped at Carlisle and stayed there seven days. When we were about two days travel from Camp Apache we were turned back. We didn't go back as far as Carlisle, but stopped at a place where there were soldiers (Fort Leavenworth, Kans.), and stayed there about two months; I didn't know what was wrong. When I left Washington I expected to go back to Camp Apache. While we were there a letter came from Arizona from General Miles, stating that it was a bad place for Indians at Camp Apache. All the white people were down on us and the other Indians also. He told us one part of the country belonged to Washington, the other part on the other side was Arizona, so he would put us on the Washington side where there were good people. He told us also: "You have good farms at Apache. You have good water, etc., but this is not enough. Go to the Washington country and you can get \$20 to \$50 a month." It was some lieutenant who read this letter to us. It was a long letter. He told us he would like us to do as we did when we signed the pay-roll, and we all touched the top of the pen, except three women, who did not sign. We thought it was good to get \$20 to \$50 a month, and I agreed to those terms. That don't make any difference. I have in my head now what you said to me at Camp Apache. When I walk I walk right along and see as far as I can. When I come to something I step over it. I couldn't understand why I was brought down here. From Fort Leavenworth we were taken to a place where Chihuahua was (St. Augustine). On the paper we signed was also a reservation spoken about, that was to be thirty miles each way from the center. We were to be put on this reservation. The letter said also that we could raise lots of horses, cattle, etc.; that there would be plenty of room on it for all their stock. It said also: "When you get on the reservation you may think you have no relatives, but when on it you will increase." The letter spoke of Chihuahua, Geronimo, Chatto, and of some of their people who were down in Old Mexico, and that they would all be brought together on this reservation. It said: "When you get on this reservation I will bring them all back to you." It talked very much as General Crook talked.

Chatto here took from his breast an Arthur medal that had been presented to him by President Cleveland, and asked, "Why did they give me that, to wear in the guard-house? I thought something good would come to me when they gave me that, but I have been in confinement ever since I have had it."

KU-NAY said; The Indians at Camp Apache were getting drunk all the time and killing each other. I don't know any other reason why they were sent down here. I don't know what was wrong. One day near noon they told me they wanted to count the Chiricahuas. They surrounded us with scouts and soldiers. Five of us

scouts were mounted. All they did to us was they took our guns away from us and told us to go home. They told us that where we were going it was the same as it was there. We were scouts in one place and would be in the other. When they had surrounded us, the White Mountain Indians drove off our horses and cattle; they went to our farms and took what they wanted while we were surrounded. There was an Indian, a chief Sanchez, had a talk with the officers and he said the Chiricahuas were no good. He did not want us there and wanted us taken away.

They told us that we were going to be taken off, but not very far away, about a day's travel by railway. They told us the Indians who had gone on to Washington (Chatto, etc.) were there waiting for us.

TO-KAN-Y said: I can tell only the same thing that Ku-nay does. It was on the counting day and just as we were giving the tickets some cavalry was going along as if it were going somewhere, but it turned and joined with the infantry and scouts and surrounded the Chiricahuas. After they had counted us and given us tickets, they sent the women home, and told the men they wanted to talk and we went to a tent. They told us nobody would be harmed, but that we were going to be sent away. The White Mountain Indians said that the Chiricahuas were bad. Their chiefs had been talking against us. We were told not to be afraid, nobody would be harmed. The night before the count some of the White Mountain Indians got drunk and killed a man and laid it upon our people and said we had done it. The officers told us we would be sent to a good country and we would have more houses and farms than we had at Camp Apache. "You have plenty here," they said, but you will have more there and better stock. Do not be afraid, you will not be hurt. You are going to a good country."

We did just as they told us. The day they rounded us up at the post all the men, women, widows and poor of the tribe that had stock had it driven off by the White Mountain Indians, who stole it. That is all I know about it.

NOCHE. I want to say that after General Crook left, General Miles talked to me at Fort Bowie. He talked a good deal the same as General Crook talked. I remember all General Crook told me, and also all that General Miles told me. He told me how to behave myself. He told me to go back to Camp Apache. I had a farm there. He told me to go back and take care of it. I went back there and made a big farm and worked it there with a Mexican on shares. I got a contract for wood, and got out some wood with this same man and got a good deal of money from it, each getting half. General Miles told me, "Now I've given you a farm and you have worked it, but it seems for nothing. They gave it to you for nothing and now I'll have to send you away. People don't seem to like you." I told him there was lots of wood here, and I wanted to stay. He said, "The Indians at San Carlos and Camp Apache are talking about you all the time, and I had better send you away from here. We will take the train, and in one and a quarter days we will go to the place we were talking about and look at it." We didn't see that land. We were four days on the train and stopped only when we reached Washington. I saw the President and shook hands with him. He told us, "Do not be afraid to come amongst us; I am the great father of you all. Go back to your farms at Camp Apache and settle down quietly. There nobody will harm you, nobody will say anything to you. Go back there and do just as the commanding officer tells you. Do as he tells you and he will write good letters to me about you." He told us when we got in the cars it would be about a week before we got home, but when we had been on two days we were stopped (at Fort Leavenworth), and they told us we would not go back to Camp Apache. We were there two months and they told us we would not go back to our homes any more, but would go to some place on the coast.

On the evening of the third day after we got to St. Augustine our people came there from Camp Apache. We were told then we would be in confinement. They told us to wait awhile. They didn't know what was to be done with us. We would be in confinement as long as we remained at St. Augustine. I asked what would be done to us, but the commanding officer didn't know. Afterwards we were moved up here.

(Wratton stated that the people from Pikens, i. e. Geronimo and his band, left there in April, 1887, and reached Mount Vernon barracks in the latter part of April.)

We were told we would have our stock; we were told this after we had reached the east. What horses we had were finally sold and we got what few dollars were received for them. I had four horses and three mules and received \$127 for them. I received pay for my horses but not for the wood I had piled up there. I had about 90 cords of wood for which I never received anything.

I thought that we were coming to a place that was healthy, but you can see for yourself that we are not so many as when you saw us last. A great many have died. We lost more than a hundred. More than fifty have died since leaving St. Augustine. About thirty children have died at Carlisle. Between fifty and a hundred have died here. Chatto had a son and nephew to die at Carlisle.

(Wratton stated that the Indians died principally from consumption, which he thought was due to the damp climate. They took a cold and strong, stout men went

right down. In two months they would be dead. A great many children and little ones die.)

They told me about that big reservation that General Miles told him about, where all the Indians should be together. He said, "When you get there you will have good farms, horses, cattle, and they will belong to you. Nobody will have anything to do with them but yourself. I am telling you the truth; I am telling you no lie." When he told me that I shook hands with him two or three times and said, "Thank you."

KA-TE-TE-NA. I want to say what I think, what I want to. When I first saw you you talked to me and said we were brothers from now on. You told me to think as you thought, to follow in your footsteps. He still thinks of it as if you had said it only yesterday morning. Six years ago I went away among the white people. They took me a long way off. I was there about 18 months. Six years ago I was what you call an Indian. I wore moccasins and had long hair. When I went among the whites they told me to put these away and adopt the white man's dress, and I did so. Since then I haven't seen much country; I haven't been very far away. I have been to very few places since then. That's why I can't tell much. There are lots of trees about here. I don't go any place except to the railway. I don't know anything of this country. I don't know how it is. I would like to work; I would like to farm. I had a farm but had to leave it, and leave all that behind. Four years ago I came back again and had another farm, a big one, and worked it. I don't know what was the matter. They took me away from it. If I could have stayed there I could have made a good crop. I never did anything wrong and never went on the war-path since I saw you. I tried to think as you told me to and was very thankful to you, and was very glad to see you again this morning; all the Indians were, even to the little children.

You told me I would have sheep and I did have some, and a wagon too. I had horses too, but never had any pay for my wagon or farm. I got paid for my horses. I didn't know what was wrong or why I was brought down here. General Miles told me to go and see a farm that was talked about. He deceived me; he told me it was about a day's journey away. We started to see the farm and got on the train and staid on four days and got to Washington. We were there 18 days and didn't know what was going on at home. When we talked to the President he talked good. He said we had heard of the Great Father, and said he was the Great Father of us all and was very glad to see us.

We left Washington and went to Carlisle, and got about two days' travel from home; we went in to get something to eat and the train passed out, leaving us on the track. Then we went back to post and were there for two months. We were there for two months, and then some were left back: four men and three women were left at Fort Leavenworth and the rest were sent in. They told us we were going to have a reservation near the Rio Grande, about a day's travel from Fort Leavenworth. Our people would all be there from Camp Apache. The party that went on returned at the same time next day; returned next day to Fort Leavenworth. The officer traveling with us left at Fort Leavenworth and went to the Rio Grande. He was gone seven days, but did not say what he had gone for or anything at all to us.

A letter came from General Miles stating that Chatto and Ka-e-te-na were to be killed, and that is why they returned back. The letter said that there were \$500 reward for either one of us. I wondered if that was what they confined us for. We were told we would be scouts and draw pay; Chatto and I were to get \$50 a month, the others \$20. I saw the letter. I don't know to whom or by whom it was written, but I think it was by direction of General Miles.

I was taken to St. Augustine, but tried to be as I always was, and do what I said to you I would. I like you. I like your talk and try to follow in your footsteps. What do you think of me? I started to work six years ago, and I am working yet. I help build roads, dig up roots, build houses, and do work all around here. Leaves fall off the trees and I help to sweep them up. I was working this morning when you came here. I don't know why I work here all the time for nothing. I never did anything wrong after I talked with you. I have children and relatives, lots of them, and I would like to work for them before I get too old to work. I'd like to have a farm well, and would like to have a farm long enough to see the crops get ripe. I like to farm and like to work, and shall always try and be what I have been since I talked with you.

CHIHUAHUA. I am getting so my limbs feel as if they were asleep. I would like to have some place better than this. I would like to have a place where I could have a farm and go right to work so that my children can have plenty to eat; and I would like to have tools to go right to work with. I have a daughter away at school and two other near relatives. I want to see them soon. Won't you make it so I can see them very soon? I didn't get any of the money that was to be sent to me; I never said anything about it. Sam Boyinan knows about it. I thought when I saw you I would tell you about it. I never said anything about it. I am just the same now as when I saw you last going along the same road. There are trees all about. I would like to go where I can see.

HEADQUARTERS DIVISION OF THE ATLANTIC,
Governor's Island, New York City, December 23, 1889.

The ADJUTANT-GENERAL, U. S. ARMY,
Washington, D. C.:

(Through military channels.)

SIR: Pursuant to instructions received from General Howard, commanding the Division of the Atlantic, and subsequent additional directions from the Secretary of War, I have the honor to submit the following facts relating to the Chiricahua Apache Indian prisoners now in this division and to make certain recommendations relative to them.

Between April 13 and November 7, 1886, 498 Indians (99 men, 399 women and children) were received as prisoners of war from Arizona, where the greater portion had been captured while engaged in active hostilities. The rest, though on a reservation, were deemed fit subjects for removal from that Territory, and the honor of the Government was pledged to them and to the citizens that they should never be returned.

Seventeen men without their families were placed in confinement at Fort Pickens, near Pensacola, Fla.

The remainder were kept in camp at Fort Marion, St. Augustine, Fla., until April, 1887, when, on account of the small space available for them there, and also for sanitary reasons, the families of the prisoners were sent to them at Fort Pickens and the others were transferred to Mount Vernon Barracks, near Mobile, Ala.

Those at Fort Pickens were moved into camp with the others at Mount Vernon Barracks, Ala., in May, 1888.

One hundred and twelve of the Indian youth and children have been, from time to time, sent to the Indian school at Carlisle, Pa.; 12 have been returned on account of ill health, 30 have died, and 70 are now there in fairly good physical condition and making good educational progress.

MORTALITY.

Among the Indians remaining in the South the following deaths have occurred:

In 1886, at St. Augustine, Fla.	18
In 1887, at St. Augustine, Fort Pickens, and Mount Vernon Barracks, Ala.	31
In 1888, at Mount Vernon Barracks, Ala.	14
In 1889, at Mount Vernon Barracks, Ala., to November 30.	26

	89
Add to this the deaths at Carlisle, Pa.	30

Total deaths in three and one-half years.	119
--	-----

There have been numerous births, so that the present number of Apache prisoners is—

At Mount Vernon Barracks, 79 men, 167 women, 142 children; total.	388
At Governor's Island, N. Y., 2 men (undergoing punishment).	2
At Carlisle school.	70

Total.	460
-------------	-----

Of the men, whose total number, not including those who are growing to manhood at Carlisle school, is 81, probably 30 are able-bodied, viz, would be fit for military service; 25 able to do a fair day's work, but not in good condition, and the rest old men and cripples. It can not be made too emphatic that at the present time the Chiricahua Apache Indians would furnish only 30 good warriors, and there are 430 old men, cripples, youths at school, and women and children. These

people are in our possession as prisoners of war. Those at Carlisle need nothing except to finish their course there. They can then care for themselves.

CONDITION OF PRISONERS AT MOUNT VERNON BARRACKS.

The three hundred and eighty-eight (seventy-nine men, three hundred and nine women and children) at Mount Vernon Barracks are now in a condition which needs prompt action to avoid positive inhumanity.

The normal death rate of civilized people is less than 2 per cent. per annum. That of these people, including those at school, is more than three times as great, or 6.8 per cent.

A number equal to one-quarter of those brought east has died in three and a-half years. Consumption has fastened itself among them, and has been rapid and always fatal where it has attacked.

A great death rate must be expected, one-half of the deaths being of young children whose disease was aggravated by their parents' neglect of the simplest instructions of physicians, and the murderous quackery of old squaws. But the excessive death rate is due to consumption, as have been most of the deaths at Carlisle, where proper sanitary precautions have always been taken.

The condition of health and mind of these Indians other than those at Carlisle precludes the possibility of their improvement and civilization where they now are, for the following reasons :

1st. They are prisoners. Though well fed and well clothed, their labor is prison labor.

2d. Only the men are required to work, and that, of course, without remuneration. Were they paid it would only give the power of purchasing intoxicants, and add to their degradation. The women have not enough to do, and are without incentive to improvement.

3d. There has been and is much sickness and many deaths, with resultant depression.

4th. They have been told that good behavior would secure action towards permanent homes of their own, and this promise so long deferred has increased their hopeless feeling. Each year's delay is a greater injury to them.

5th. They are a people who have been bred in mountains and who, as well as the medical officers of the Army who have attended them, believe their rapid dying off is due, in great part, to their location in the moist atmosphere of the sea-coast.

6th. So many of their children have died away at school that not only have those been grief stricken who have lost their absent ones but all are constantly fearful of the taking from them for death at school of others of their children.

To summarize then: We are holding as prisoners, with women in idleness tending to vice, a band of savages till they die, in a place and in a manner that their death is possibly increased by local causes, though we are not now taking their children away from them for school.

THE MOUNT VERNON BARRACKS RESERVATION FOR A CAMP.

The camp at Mount Vernon Barracks is as good as a prison camp can be, but can not be made a home. No military reservation east of the Mississippi River has any better facilities. As there is no arable land for them to cultivate in that vicinity, farming is impossible. The em-

ployment of the scattered white population is in the manufacture of cypress shingles and pine lumber, for which the Indians are not fitted.

The post is on a sand ridge in a pine forest, and is surrounded by swamps. Heretofore it has been healthy. The reservation is a strip of land running several miles from the river bank to the high ground where the post and Indian camp is. Liquor is sold by citizens on their own property on the border of the reservation. The freedom of the Indians from its use is phenomenal. It is due to the small amount of money they have (they make some by selling trinkets) and their earnest endeavor to behave well with the hope of getting homes of their own. Two missionary lady teachers have a small day school for children and teach a few of the men, but the good of these short steps towards education is not apparent without giving the Indian child some better outlook for the future than he now has.

LAND LEFT IN ARIZONA.

Under the "severalty act" of February 8, 1887, these Indians would have been entitled, had they been kept on the White Mountain Reservation in Arizona, whenever they should be settled in severalty, to about 40,000 acres of farming or 80,000 acres of grazing land, for which the United States will receive \$50,000 to \$100,000 in money as well as the more rapid industrial development of that territory by the more skillful labor of white immigrants. The Chiricahua Apaches are merely one of the wilder tribes of a farming people, and even they have always been accustomed to do some farming, raising crops by irrigation. They have never, as the chief means of subsistence, lived by hunting wild game. For making progress then towards what we call civilization, if their attachment to homes and land of their own and knowledge of farming be taken advantage of, they can be started from a point far in advance of that from which they could start in any other employment.

RECOMMENDATIONS.

I therefore make the following recommendation: That application be made to Congress for the provision of a suitable tract of land and the fitting out of these people with materials and tools to build cabins, with simple farm utensils, cattle, and seeds, and that they be put on such land by the 1st of March, 1890. Another year's delay would be criminal.

Land, a portion of which may eventually become each Indian family's own, including the means of going on it, is the fundamental need. That obtained, an industrial school is necessary with school farm and hospital.

Very respectfully, your obedient servant,

GUY HOWARD,
First Lieutenant Twelfth Infantry, Aide-de-Camp.

[First indorsement.]

HEADQUARTERS DIVISION OF THE ATLANTIC,
Governor's Island, December 23, 1889.

Respectfully forwarded to the Adjutant-General of the Army for the information of the Secretary of War.

It is believed that the within report contains a clear account of the causes of the present condition of the Apache prisoners of war. It might be added, when they first came in the feeling was so strong against

the leaders and their depredating followers that at Fort Marion, and subsequently at Fort Pickens, they were subjected to conditions of imprisonment, in which the women and children shared, that rendered them weak and liable to disease. The innocent have suffered with the guilty, and I see no possible way of relieving the situation than by adopting the course within recommended, and, I hope, in the interest of justice, as well as of humanity, that speedy action may be taken. Should a school be set in operation it could be permanently used for educating Indian children of the vast Southwest.

OLIVER O. HOWARD,
Major-General, Commanding.

[Second indorsement.]

Respectfully submitted to the Major-General Commanding the Army.
SAMUEL BRECK,
Assistant Adjutant-General.

ADJUTANT-GENERAL'S OFFICE,
December 26, 1889.

[Third indorsement.]

HEADQUARTERS ARMY OF THE UNITED STATES,
Washington, December 30, 1889.

Respectfully submitted to the Secretary of War, concurring in the recommendation of the division commander.

J. M. SCHOFIELD,
Major-General, Commanding.