IN THE SENATE OF THE UNITED STATES.

JUNE 21, 1890.—Ordered to be printed.

Mr. DANIEL, from the Committee on Indian A-ffairs, submitted the following

REPORT:

[To accompany H. R. 8947.] .

Your committee, to whom was referred H. R. 8947, for the relief of the estate of Bluford West, deceased, have carefully considered the same and respectfully report the bill, with the recommendation that it

do pass.

This bill passed the House of Representatives on the 5th of May, 1890, and, having been the subject of careful examination by the House Committee on Indian Affairs, we avail ourselves of the report of that committee as a clear history and explanation of the case, and your committee adopting said report, beg leave to incorporate it as a part of their own. It is appended hereto.

S. Rep. 8-43

House Report No. 1205, Fifty-first Congress, first session.

APRIL 2, 1890.—Committed to the Committee of the Whole House and ordered to be printed.

Mr. PEEL, from the Committee on Indian Affairs, submitted the following

REPORT:

[To accompany H. R. 8947.]

Your committee, to whom was referred the bill (H. R. 5713) for the relief of the estate of Bluford West, deceased, having had the same under consideration, beg leave to submit the following report:

This is a claim against the Cherokee Nation for valuable saline (saltworks) belonging to the deceased in his life-time, and which was appropriated to the use of the Cherokee Nation by act of the Cherokee council in 1843. For a perfect understanding of this claim it is well to say that in an early day about one-third of the Cherokee people then residing east of the Mississippi River emigrated to the west and settled

in the then Territory of Arkansas.

In 1828 this branch of the Cherokees entered into a treaty with the United States in which they relinquished their home in Arkansas and accepted an undivided interest with their brethren (who were still east) to what is now the Cherokee country, where they now live; in other words, the Cherokee country by the treaty of 1828 was given to all the Cherokees both east and west jointly. Those that came first were and are yet called "Old Settlers or Western Cherokees," of which Bluford West was one, and being well advanced in civilization, and being ambitious and energetic, he made large and valuable improvements on saline or salt wells in the Cherokee country. In the meantime the remainder of the Cherokees sold their possessions east of the Mississippi River and joined their kindred in the Cherokee Nation, where they have remained ever since.

This last lot were called the Eastern Cherokees, and being much more numerous, soon took control of the Cherokee government. Bluford West, the claimant, being an Old Settler, or Western Cherokee, was in the minority, but had bestowed a large amount of labor and money in developing this valuable salt mine, and was in a fair way to amass a large fortune out of this property, when in 1843 the Cherokee council passed an act declaring all salines in their nation to be the common property of all, and ordered that the nation take possession of them, have them valued, and paid for. Upon that authority Bluford West with others was dispossessed and deprived of his entire estate in this valuable saline. West, doubtless feeling that great injustice had been done him, came at once to Washington and laid his grievances

before the Government, and whilst here sickened and died, but in response to his complaint General R. Jones, U.S. Army, issued the following order:

FORT GIBSON, January 8, 1845.

Capt. N. BOONE, First Dragoons:

SIR: You will repair, without unnecessary delay, to the two salines formerly occupied by Capt. John Rogers and Bluford West, for the purpose of making such examination of the premises as may enable you to estimate and report to the Commissioners the value of the improvements at each saline, about the time that they were dispossessed of the premises in 1844, under the provisions of the Cherokee laws relative to the reservation of salines as national property. You will please to make your report so as to make your estimate of valuation under separate heads, as follows:

I. Improvements of the farm, as—

(1) Dwelling-house and out-houses.

(2) Clearing wood land.(3) Fencing of fields.

(4) Breaking up prairie land.(5) Digging and walling fresh-water wells.

- II. Improvements and materials necessary for erecting and carrying on salt-works,
 - (1) Troughs or cisterns for holding water. (2) Digging and walling the furnaces.

(3) Sheds over furnaces. (4) The salt-kettles.

(5) Wagons, etc. (6) Necessary buildings attached to the salt establishments. (7) The digging and boring for water, if not a natural saline.

(8) Pipes for conveying the same.

Take special care to ascertain whether either saline reservation be natural or artificial, and, if the latter, whether without the obtaining of water by the process of boring by private enterprise (late occupants) the saline could in equity have been claimed as a national reservation under the Cherokee laws.

You will also please to report whether Mr. West's premises have been taken possession of by the Cherokee authorities or whether they be still occupied by himself or his

family, and if so, ascertain the reason.

Please let your report be submitted with as little delay as possible.

I think it expedient a second officer should accompany you, and have accordingly directed Lieutenant Kirkham to report to you.

I am, sir, very respectfully, your obedient servant,

R. JONES, U. S. A., Commissioner.

Captain Boone, of the First Dragoons, being prevented by sudden sickness from proceeding to execute the above instructions, Capt. S. Woods, Sixth Infantry, was substituted. For his very satisfactory report, see Appendix U, paper No. 5, relative to "salines."

(See pp. 75 and 76, report Secretary of War, and Appendix U, paper No. 5, relative to salines, Vol. 8, Senate Doc., second session Twenty-

eighth Congress.)

In obedience to said order Captain Woods and Lieutenant Kirkham, of the Army, submitted the following report:

FORT GIBSON, January 13, 1845.

GENERAL: In obedience to instructions received from you, dated Fort Gibson, January 8, 1845, Lieutenant Kirkham and myself proceeded to the salines formerly occupied by Messrs. Bluford West and John Rogers, and made the examinations and valuation of improvements required by our instsuctions; the result of which is submitted to you, and is as follows, viz:

Mr. West's improvements.

(1) One dwelling-house a story and a half high, built of hewn logs; two goodsized rooms with a passage between them; porches in front and rear; one room handsomely ceiled, and the whole house well finished. Considering the cost of lumber and building-materials in that part of the country, and the price of labor, I think the cost of this house has been about

 (2) One dining-room and kitchen adjoining, both good, hewn-log buildings, valued at. (3) Smoke-house, root-house, negro-house, a large log building, built for poutry, the whole valued at (4) A spring, about two hundred yards from the house, with slight improvements, valued at 	\$500 200 25
 (5) A well 30 feet deep. (They stopped digging before they reached water, in consequence of the law of 1843). This was valued at	50 300
whole amounting to (8) Thirty-five acres of cleared wood land, fencing, etc., at \$10 per acre. (9) Yard about the dwelling-house, potato patch, garden, grass plat, etc., about 9 acres in all cleared land, valued at (10) Fruit trees, 200 in number, 37½ cents each.	435 350 190 75
The total of the valuation of the improvements on the farm amounts to.	4, 125

Improvements on the "saline."

(1) The shed for the furnace is 90 feet in length. The trough or cistern is 64 feet in length, 4½ feet in diameter. It was a solid log hollowed out. This trough supplied fifty-two kettles with water. There was considerable excavation and walling required for the adjustment of the furnace. A salt-house stands adjoining the shed, the whole of which was valued at \$300.

(2) Eight hundred feet of pipes for conveying water, valued at \$200.

(3) Close to the well there are two buildings that are intended for the residences

of workmen, with the out-houses about them; a blacksmith's shop; a building that was used as a salt-house; a large shed, the whole valued at \$250.

(4) The well is dug 125 feet deep, 10 feet from the top through gravel, and the remaining 115 feet was made by boring through solid rock. The first 10 feet of the well is 10 feet square, walled up with logs, and then a frame set in, leaving a space between it and the logs filled up with dirt. The boring through the rock was 2½ inches in diameter.

Some of the workmen are now there. The blacksmith says they were employed the greater part of two years in completing it, with generally four hands employed to work at the well and a blacksmith to keep the augers and boring apparatus in repair. When they struck the vein of water that supplies the well, a pipe was fitted tightly in the rock, extending above the level of the ground around the well 15 feet, a point to which the water rises and issues in a jet of an inch in diameter.

Mrs. West and many gentlemen of whom we made inquiry, say that Mr. West has frequently declared, in their presence, that his expenditures on these salt-works were

at feast \$6,000.

Everything about the well and furnace is in a decayed condition, from being left unoccupied, and no care being taken of them; no doubt in consequence of the law preventing Mr. West from continuing the manufacture of salt.

The well itself is in a good condition; the pipes are also good—many of them

thrown out of place. Everything shows that the works were once complete and in

full operation.
In 1841 Mr. West sold the kettles that had been in use, in consequence of an engagement for a partnership between himself and Mr. David Vann in carrying on the west was expecting. Mr. Vann had gone to the east to purchase new metal, and this Mr. West was expecting. Mr. Vann, however, changed his mind, and refused to engage in the business with Mr. West, and did not purchase the kettles. Mr. West then made arrangements to purchase the kettles and continue the work himself, when the law passed, in 1843, prohibiting private individuals from working salt-works that were made by law the property of the nation, this saline being one.

We think it would be fair to estimate the labor, money expended, and what Mr.

West has been deprived of in not working this saline, at \$5,000.

We have examined the grounds about this well, and see nothing to induce the belief that this saline would have been of any value but for the improvements that Mr. West has made. There is nothing that would have shown it a saline, but a "lick," which was probably a resort for numerous herds of cattle, which, to an almost equal extent, is found in many other parts of the country. Mr. West's labor and enterprise has made valuable what before was of no value. When he first commenced he dug four wells to the depth of 10 feet and struck the rock; he succeeded in getting some water, but not sufficient to justify much expenditure; but patient, persevering industry developed a valuable spring that we do not think the nation had any right to appropriate, and that in taking it away from Mr. West he should be allowed for it what it is worth, without regard to cost.

The percentage of salt in this water is not known, nor have we any means of estimating it; but we have been informed how it compares with the water of other salines. The water at the Union Mission is considered superior, but the water at the Grand

Saline, occupied by Mr. Lewis Ross, inferior.

Mr. Ross gives a rent, for the Grand Saline, of \$1,600 per year, for ten years. Many persons have told us that Mr. West's saline would have rented for the same, had it been in the market. We therefore think that in dispossessing him of the benefits of his own labor, he should be allowed \$15,000 for his claim on this saline. Wo had reported to us that Mr. West had cut for his furnace, 900 cords of wood, that had rotted, and been of no service to him; this we did not examine, as it was spread about over the country, and we thought we could safely allow him for 600 cords; this, at 50 cents a cord, what it cost, would be \$300.

Our estimate of the value of his improvements on the farm and the actual expenditure on the well would be \$9,425; and if the value which we consider has been given to the saline by Mr. West's labor—and without this it had no value—be added, which we have put down at \$10,000, our valuation, including everything, will amount to

\$19,425.

We found Mr. West's family occupying the improvements on the place, but seemed to be under the constant expectation of being removed under the provisions of the law of 1843. The agent for the nation appointed to value the improvements on salines went to this place in 1844 to make a valuation, in order to remunerate the owner, take possession, and lease the saline, but neither valued, took possession, nor leased the saline. We are told that he gave as a reason why he did not that the improvements were too valuable to be paid for by the Cherokee Nation, and this we have had from too many and too good authority to doubt. This saline has a good body of land immediately around it and a great abundance of wood, and is within 14 miles of Grand River.

Respectfully submitted.

S. Woods, Captain, Sixth Infantry.

General R. Jones, Commissioner, Fort Gibson, Cherokee Country.

(See pp. 107-109, Report Secretary of War, Senate document, vol. 8,

second session, Twenty-eighth Congress.)

From the foregoing it will be seen that General Jones ordered the improvements of the farm to be appraised first and separately from the saline. From the report it will be seen that Captain Wood and Lieutenant Kirkham did appraise the improvements on the farm first and separately from the saline proper; that they appraised the improvements on the farm at \$4,125. And it will also be seen that said Army officers appraised the saline proper with its appurtenances at \$15,300, aggre-

gating \$19,425.

At this time, or soon thereafter, there was great disturbance amongst these people, growing out of demands that both factions, i. e., the "Old Settlers," or Western Cherokee, and the Eastern Cherokees had against the Government, and conflicting demands and interest between themselves. So great was this disturbance that many lives were lost and much property destroyed. In order to quiet these people and to settle these various and conflicting interests the treaty of 1846, which treaty is a memorable one in the history of these people, was called. Amongst other things, the seventh article provides that all salines, the private property of individual Western Cherokees, of which they had been dispossessed, should be returned or paid for by the Cherokee Nation. (See 9 Stat. L., 874.)

Your committee have carefully examined all the papers and records to be had in the case, and have heard the delegates of the Cherokee Nation in behalf of the nation, and there is no claim or pretense on their part that the saline property or any part thereof was ever returned to either Bluford West in his life-time or to his legal representatives since his death, and all the payment we find was made to Nancy Markham.

the widow of the said West, deceased, amounting to \$12,000, for her home improvements adjoining the West saline. Under the laws of the Cherokee Nation, upon the death of the husband, the widow, if any survives, to the home improvements, Nancy Markham, formerly Nancy West, as the widow of Bluford West, deceased, was entitled to recover from the

Cherokee Nation pay therefor, which it seems she collected.

The delegates seem to think that the \$12,000 paid the widow was intended to be in full for the entire estate, but the records and the evidence show conclusively that such was not the case. West having died when General Jones issued his order to have the home farm improvements appraised separately, and they being appraised separately within themselves show that the home improvements were treated as the separate property of the widow, and in keeping with this, the account of the widow against the nation upon which this payment was made is for her improvements, adjoining the West saline, following the appraisement made by Captain Wood and Lieutenant Kirkham; besides we find the sworn statement of the claimant (Nancy Markham, as administratrix of the estate of Bluford West, deceased), Joel M. Bryan, an old and respected citizen of that country, and Dennis W. Bushyhead, ex-chief of the nation, and now a delegate before this Congress, showing conclusively that not one dollar has ever been paid on the Bluford West saline proper, which sworn statements are herewith appended, marked Exhibit A.

It will be observed that the farm improvements for which the widow was paid \$12,000 was only appraised by Wood and Kirkham at \$4,125. The appraisement and account of the widow agree, but differ greatly in the amount. Claimant accounts for this by saying that several years had elapsed from the date of appraisement and date of payment, and that a large young orchard had become grown, bearing trees, and uncompleted barns had been finished by her, and that her settlement was based upon the valuation of her separate property when payment was made. If this be true, and we find nothing to contradict it, at least the evidence and records show conclusively that nothing was paid on the saline proper, which was separately appraised by Wood and

Kirkham at \$15,300, it must be so.

And as all claims against the Government growing out of the treaty of 1846, as well as individual claims of Western Cherokees against their own nation, have borne 5 per cent. interest, your committee could well find that the Cherokee Nation should pay to the estate of Bluford West, deceased, the sum of \$15,300, the appraised value of the saline proper, as made by Captain Wood and Lieutenant Kirkham, with 5 per cent. interest from date of award; and, if what your committee has recited was all the evidence in the case, we could find nothing else; but it appears from the sworn statement of one Bluford Alberty and H. D. Reese, both being very worthy men, and the latter a very prominent one, that the agent of the Cherokee Nation, who was appointed by the nation under the acts of their council to take possession and appraise the various salines appropriated to the public use, did himself appraise the saline in controversy at \$24,000.

Your committee have concluded to adopt the nation's own appraisement and then allow them the full benefit of the \$12,000 paid the widow, thus leaving a balance of \$12,000 instead of \$15,300 due the estate. The sworn statement of Alberty and Reese is herewith appended and marked Exhibit B. This gives the nation full credit for all they claim they have ever paid and fixes the value of the entire property at what their own agent said it was worth, five per cent. interest being the

rate the Government has always paid the Cherokees on their trust fund; and inasmuch as the Cherokee Nation has been receiving 5 per cent. interest from the Government on the very money they should have paid Bluford West, they can not complain at paying that rate on this long-deferred debt; in other words, by withholding the balance due West on their own appraisement, they have received from the Government the same amount of interest that the substitute requires them to pay on this demand. Besides, under the treaty of 1846, out of which this claim grows, interest has been allowed by Congress and by the Departments on all claims, both public and private, at that rate.

Finding that the legal representatives of Bluford West, deceased, have diligently prosecuted this claim against the Cherokee Nation at all proper times and upon all proper occasions, as admitted by the delegates of said nation, we see no reason why this long-deferred demand should not be paid with interest, as above stated. Therefore we report the accompanying substitute for the bill referred to us and recommend

that it do pass.

CHEROKEE NATION, IND., T. Tahlequah District:

Personally appeared before the undersigned, Mrs. Nancy Markham, to me well known, who, being duly sworn, deposes and says: I was present when the United States Government officers (Captain Wood and Lieutenant Kirkham) valued the Bluford West saline.

John W. West never put in his appearance before the valuing agents, to there claim any interest in said Bluford West saline.

I was paid for my home improvements adjoining the Bluford West, saline; but there was not paid to me or any one else one dollar for the saline proper.

NANCY MARKHAM. Administratrix of the estate of Bluford West, deceased.

Sworn to before me this 19th November, 1889. SEAL.

ALLEN Ross, Clerk, T. D. C. N., Ind. T.

EXECUTIVE DEPARTMENT, CHEROKEE NATION. Tahlequah, November 19, 1889.

I hereby certify that Mr. Allen Ross, whose name is affixed to the within as clerk of Tahlequah, Cherokee Nation, is and was at the time of signing the same, the duly elected and acting clerk of said district, and that the signature is in his own handwriting, and as such clerk all his acts are entitled to credit.

Witness my hand and seal of the Cherokee Nation.

[SEAL.]

JOHN L. ADAIR, Executive Secretary.

CHEROKEE NATION, IND. T.,

Tahlequah District:

Personally appeared before the undersigned, clerk for the above district, J. M. Bryan,

who makes the following statement:

I am now over eighty years old; have been a bona fide citizen of this nation fifty-seven years. I have lived near the Bluford West saline over fifty years, and personally knowing to the operation of said saline by Bluford West in his life-time; and I never heard of John W. West having any claim or interest in the Bluford West saline until many years after the death of Bluford West.

Nancy Markham (now) was the widow of Bluford West, deceased, and she was paid \$12,000 for her home improvements, adjoining the Bluford West saline, by the

Cherokee Nation; but in that payment not one dollar was valued or paid for the saline proper, as under the Cherokee laws, at the death of a husband, the home improvements belong to the widow; and there never has been one dollar paid by the Cherokee Nation, to Nancy Markham, or to Nancy Markham, administratrix of the estate of Bluford West, deceased, or to any one else for the Bluford West saline.

J. M. BRYAN.

Sworn to before me this 19th November, 1889. SEAL.

ALLEN ROSS, Clerk, T. D. C. N., Ind. T. EXECUTIVE DEPARTMENT, CHEROKEE NATION, Tahlequah, November 19, 1889.

I hereby certify that Mr. Allen Ross, whose name appears to the within affidavit, is and was, at the time of signing the same, the duly elected and acting clerk of Tahlequah district, in the nation aforesaid, and that his signature is in his own handwriting, and that all his official acts as such clerk are entitled to credit.

Witness my hand and seal of the Cherokee Nation.

[SEAL.]

JOHN L. ADAIR. Executive Secretary.

CHEROKEE NATION, Tahlequah District:

Personally appeared before me, Allen Rose, clerk of said district, Dennis W. Bushy-Personally appeared before me, Allen Ross, clerk of said district, Dennis W. Bushyhead, ex-chief of the Cherokee Nation, who, being qualified, makes the following statement, to wit: That he was treasurer of the Cherokee Nation in 1873, when council made an appropriation of \$12,000 for the benefit of Mrs. Nancy Marcum, which amount she was paid in full. After he became principal chief of the Cherokee Nation he found on file in the executive office a schedule of property adjoining the Bluford West saline, for which council made the appropriation of \$12,000 for the benefit of Mrs. Nancy Marcum. He served as treasurer of the Cherokee Nation eight years, fron 1871 to 1879. He also served as principal chief from 1879 to 1887, during which time he knows of no payment being made for the Bluford West saline proper. While principal chief he appointed D. W. C. Duncan to act for the nation as commissioner, with the Hon John O. Tuffs, United States agent, to investigate the saline claim of with the Hon. John Q. Tufts, United States agent, to investigate the saline claim of Bluford West, deceased.

Pending the investigation J. M. Bryan, attorney for the estate of Bluford West, deceased, preferred charges against Commissioner Duncan, alleging that he and one Allen Gilbert were trying to prove that the heirs of John W. West had an interest in said saline. Mr. D. W. C. Duncan was notified of said charges, but no investigation

was had in the matter.

D. W. BUSHYHEAD.

Sworn to before me this 19th November, 1889. [SEAL.]

ALLEN ROSS. Clerk T. D. C. N., Ind. T.

EXECUTIVE DEPARTMENT, CHEROKEE NATION, Tahlequah, November 19, 1889.

I hereby certify that Mr. Allen Ross, whose name is affixed to the within affidavit. is, and was at the time of signing the same, the duly elected and acting clerk of Tahlequah district, in the nation aforesaid, and that his signature is in his own handwriting, and that as such clerk all his official acts are entitled to credit.

Witness my hand and the seal of the Cherokee Nation.

SEAL.

JOHN L. ADAIR. Executive Secretary.

DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR, Office of Indian Affairs, Washington, D. C., March, 1890.

I, T. J. Morgan, Commissioner of Indian Affairs, do hereby certify that the papers hereto attached are true and literal copies of the affidavits of B. W. Alberty, sworn to May 24, 1880, and of H. D. Reese, sworn to December 16, 1880; and of a copy of a statement made November 24, 1873, by J. M. Bryan, certified December 22, 1882, by John L. Adair, assistant executive secretary of the Cherokee Nation, all concerning the saline of Bluford West, in Cherokee Nation, and the valuation placed thereon, as the same appear on file in this office.

T. J. MORGAN. Commissioner.

CHEROKEE NATION, Tahlequah District:

Personally came before me, Allen Ross, a clerk in and for said district, Bluford Alberty, who, being duly sworn, deposeth and saith that he has been acquainted with Mrs. Nancy Marcum for many years, who was the widow of Bluford West, who owned a saline in the Cherokee Nation prior to 1843, with extensive improvements; that in 1843 a law of the Cherokee Nation made and declared all salines the property of said nation, and provided that the improvements made by private parties upon the said salines should be paid for by the Cherokee Nation; that in accordance with the provisions of the said law Madison Payne was appointed agent on the part of said nation to take possession of all the salines of the nation and cause them to be valued; that the said West saline was duly taken possession of by the said agent, and the improvements were valued at \$24,000; and that the said amount, or any part of it, was not paid until after the late war, when a partial payment was made thereon; and that the above-mentioned Mrs. Nancy Marcum is the only surviving heir of the said Bluford West and wife, and is the lawful administratrix upon the said Bluford West's estate. Further he saith not.

B. W. ALBERTY.

Sworn to and subscribed before me on this the 24th day of May, 1880. I SEAL. 7 ALLEN ROSS. Clerk Tahlequah District, Cherokee Nation.

CHEROKEE NATION, Tahlequah District:

Personally came before the undersigned, clerk for the above district, H. D. Reese, who, being duly sworn, makes the following statement in relation to the Bluford West saline:

I am about fifty-nine years old; am a Cherokee reside in the Cherokee Nation; was living here when the Cherokee Nation took possession of all salines by an act of the National Council in 1843.

James M. Payne was the agent of the nation. Bluford West's saline was taken

with the others.

The said agent was instructed to value all salines and make his report. Payne told me that he had valued West's saline to \$24,000, but that the nation could not afford to take it as money would be lost by it, the valuation being so high. The saline was not taken by the nation at that time, nor was it returned to Bluford West, and all those valuable improvements went to waste.

H. D. REESE.

[SEAL.]

ALLEN Ross. Clerk Tahlequah District, C. N.

I hereby certify that I have been personally acquainted with H. D. Reese for a good many years; he has held the office of school superintendent, treasurer of the nation, clerk of the senate, judge of Tahlequah district, and several other offices of trust in the Cherokee Nation.

Given under my hand and seal of office at Tahlequah, Cherokee Nation. [SEAL.] ALLEN ROSS. Clerk T. D., C. N.

DECEMBER 6, 1880.

Statement.

TAHLEQUAH, November 24, 1873.

I am and have been well acquainted with the Bluford West lick for forty years, In its original state it was a dry lick, but was improved and the water obtained by

think that the treaty of 1846 provided for the payment of these salines.

I think that the West saline was valued about \$20,000 or upwards, as provided for

by said treaty.

I think that all other salines were settled for by the nation except this; the saline I was interested in was paid for. I received \$1,050 for myself in the Lewis Rogers

J. M. BRYAN.

EXECUTIVE DEPARTMENT, CHEROKEE NATION, Tahlequah, December 22, 1882.

I hereby certify that the above is a correct copy of the statement of J. M. Bryan in reference to the Bluford West lick.

[SEAL.]

JOHN L. ADAIR, Assistant Executive Secretary.