72-14,102

FORTENBERRY, Edward L., 1926-
  PROCEDURES USED IN ORGANIZATIONAL STAFFING OF
  MANAGERIAL POSITIONS BY SELECTED INDUSTRIES IN
  OKLAHOMA.

  The University of Oklahoma, Ed.D., 1971
  Business Administration

University Microfilms, A XEROX Company, Ann Arbor, Michigan

THE UNIVERSITY OF OKLAHOMA

GRADUATE COLLEGE

PROCEDURES USED IN ORGANIZATIONAL STAFFING

OF MANAGERIAL POSITIONS BY SELECTED

INDUSTRIES IN OKLAHOMA

A DISSERTATION

SUBMITTED TO THE GRADUATE FACULTY

in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the

degree of

DOCTOR OF EDUCATION

BY

EDWARD L. FORTENBERRY

Norman, Oklahoma

1971

PROCEDURES USED IN ORGANIZATIONAL STAFFING

OF MANAGERIAL POSITIONS BY SELECTED

INDUSTRIES IN OKLAHOMA

APPROVED BY

DISSERTATION COMMITTEE

PLEASE NOTE:

Some pages have indistinct print. Filmed as received.

UNIVERSITY MICROFILMS.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES

PROCEDURES USED IN ORGANIZATIONAL STAFFING

OF MANAGERIAL POSITIONS BY SELECTED

INDUSTRIES IN OKLAHOMA

CHAPTER I

THE PROBLEM

Introduction

During the past few years of economic prosperity,

the decentralization of operations, and the proliferation of

mergers, conglomerates, and other forms of expansion by

industry have created an increased demand for capable ex-

ecutives. This increased demand has thrown a burden on the

administrative framework of many industries, and has brought

to light the need for well designed staffing procedures that

can more effectively identify and select those people who

have the potential for becoming capable managers.

The staffing procedures must regulate the activities

of business that are concerned with identifying and select-

ing people to fill the manpower needs of the firm. Longenecker[1]

defines these activities to include the recruitment and develop-

ment of managers who will fill their assigned positions capably

---

[1]Justin G. Longenecker, Principles of Management and
Organizational Behavior, (Columbus, Ohio: Charles E. Merrill,
1969), p. 310.

1

and possess the qualities needed to advance through higher administrative positions.

Although the staffing procedure has been refined within the last few years, much remains to be done in order to effectively place the right person on the proper job. The problem of proper placement of the individual is compounded by the difficulty which is encountered in trying to measure intangible human qualities. This difficulty is best described by Shuman as follows:

> The proper selection of executives, either as original material or for promotion, is severely hampered by lack of quantitative measurements for the more important but intangible of human qualities. This lack constitutes the chief limitation to the practical application of the idea of rating scales. Almost all such scales to date require evaluation of human qualities in speculative and intensely subjective terms. When the complexity of character of executive material is borne in mind, the seriousness of the problem is given added significance.[1]

A continued effort must be made, however, to design a staffing procedure that will identify the person who will best fit a particular job, and will also meet the needs of the individual. During the past several years, the work of Maslow and other behavioral scientists has shown that there is a tendency toward increased productivity when one is placed in a job that can satisfy his hierarchy of needs. Staffing procedures should reflect this phenomena.

---

[1]Ronald B. Shuman, The Management of Men, (Norman, Oklahoma: University of Oklahoma Press, 1948), p. 184.

Organizations are more efficiently run when people are effectively placed in positions which fit their abilities. In fact, when there is a good fit of the individual to the job, a basis for efficient operation of the organization will be formed.

Although more and more attention is now being given to comparing the personality characteristics of the individual with the job specifications of the job, this process has been greatly ignored in the past. Haimann maintains that executives, until recently, often have shied away from a systematic executive replacement and development program, sometimes for the simple reason that they themselves did not believe that management could be developed. Another reason for their reluctance probably stems from the implications of the subject. To many executives, the certainty of a fixed retirement date, the certainty of death, and the probability of disability and sickness--all factors to be considered in planning for competent management successors--are unpleasant thoughts. Although lack of interest due to these causes is understandable, it is not excusable.[1]

The problems of staffing are usually analyzed by only a small number of people since only a small number are responsible for the application of the staffing procedure in an organization. Haimann believes, however, that although the

---

[1]Theo Haimann, Professional Management, (Boston, Mass.: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1962), p. 335.

number of people involved is small, the magnitude of the consequences can be formidable since, obviously, the quality of executives selected will greatly influence the ultimate success of the enterprise.[1]

Certainly, industry in Oklahoma cannot escape this universal problem. Industries in the Oklahoma City area are believed to be reasonably representative of typical operations in the South Central states. Although this region is not as highly industrialized as some other areas of the United States, a number of the companies represented in the Greater Oklahoma City Metropolitan Area are national in scope, and some even have extended international operations. Moreover, most of the college graduates in Oklahoma who will be going into the labor force for the first time will move into company positions through the staffing procedures used in this general area. Therefore, the managerial staffing procedures used in this area are a pertinent factor worthy of study.

Statement of Problem

The problem of this study was to determine how selected industries in the Oklahoma City area staffed their managerial positions. The purpose of this study was to identify and to analyze the procedures used by these industries in staffing managerial positions in order to reach conclusions which may be helpful in understanding the nature of managerial staffing.

---

[1]Ibid., p. 338.

Definitions

For the purpose of this study, the following impor-

tant terms are defined:

Managerial Staffing: Securing people with appropriate
managerial skills and placing them in the organization.

Procedure: A series of related tasks that make up
the chronological sequence and the established way of
performing the work to be accomplished.[1]

Job Analysis: A job study to determine the charac-
teristics of the job.

Job Description: Written description of an indi-
vidual job which includes the duties, responsibilities,
work performed, and the equipment used.[2]

Job Specifications: The human requirements of
the job.

Merit Appraisal: An employee evaluation based
on work performance characteristics and personality
characteristics.

Transfer: A lateral job change by an individual
into a similar job with comparable pay, authority,
and responsibility.

Promotion: Reassignment of an employee to a position
having higher pay, more privileges, increased benefits,
or greater potential, or all these advantages.

Management Depth: A reservoir of managerial talent
for each managerial position in the organization.

Limitations

The population of this research report was limited

to representative industries in the Greater Oklahoma City

Metropolitan Area. To be included in the population, the

companies had to have a minimum of 300 employees and a

---

[1]George R. Terry, Principles of Management, (Homewood
Illinois: Irwin, Inc., 1964), p. 222.

[2]Ibid., p. 711.

personnel executive located in the research area. There was
no limitation placed on the maximum number of employees which
a company had to have in order to be included in the study.

The conclusions drawn from this study are applicable
to the geographical area designated in the study. No attempt
was made to generalize beyond these boundaries.

Hypothesis

The hypothesis to be tested was: The steps in the
managerial staffing procedures used by selected industries
can be identified and analyzed.

Assumptions

1. A well designed organizational staffing procedure
is the basis for obtaining a proper fit of the new managerial
employee to the job.

2. The greater the knowledge of the staffing procedure
by the managerial applicant, the better the opportunity for
the aspiring manager to move into a position of his choice.

Significance and Need for Study

The significance and need for the study of managerial
staffing is supported by many leaders in the field of manage-
ment. Opinions from several of these leaders are stated in
this study in order to give credence to the need for research
on staffing.

For instance, Koontz and O'Donnell feel that the un-
certainties in the selection and direction of people create

baffling problems in general management and as such will probably continue to be not only a source of intense frustration to managers everywhere, but also of prime importance when measured by the cost of failure.[1] Because of the difficulty involved in the proper evaluation of an individual's charac- teristics, some companies use "rule of thumb" or haphazard techniques in staffing.

The staffing of the organization with capable and efficient executives is of such great importance to the success of the enterprise that periodic studies should be made of the staffing procedure in order to keep it effective and relative to dynamic job specifications and the current labor market. In reference to this subject, Terry states:

> If the need for the discovery and development of immediate subordinates and key men under the guidance of the executives is to be met, the adoption of an adequate program, specifically designed for such purposes, seems entirely appropriate. Capable execu- tives represent one of the greatest assets of any enterprise. The maintenance and replacement of this important asset can be viewed in the same investment light as that of other assets.[2]

Wortman notes that the organization has been a field thought by many to have known too few new developments in the last twenty years.[3] Managerial positions have become more complex and demanding and, as a result, the need for an efficient staffing procedure should become a matter of top

---

[1]Harold Koontz and Cyril O'Donnell, Principles of Management, (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1968), p. 443.

[2]Terry, op. cit., p. 543.

[3]Max S. Wortman, Jr., Creative Personnel Management, (Boston, Mass.: Allyn and Bacon, Inc., 1969), p. 93.

priority. Understandably, the degree of concern and uncertainty on the part of those responsible for staffing managerial positions in an organization has intensified in the past few years. Possibly, management is finally discovering the fact that its most valuable asset is its people, to the degree that they are productive for the organization.

A particular weakness in the staffing procedure is often found in the practice of "using what we have." Recognizing that it is impossible to get a perfect fit in the position, efforts toward systematic selectivity may be abandoned, and the easy way out taken, namely, to utilize any person who happens to be available and shows no marked drawbacks. This is a sloppy and risky way to develop a staff. McFarland believes the staffing difficulty is aggravated by a general reluctance to remove the less capable individual when a better person is available. Operating by expediency may solve a current problem, but it may also create long-run problem of a more serious nature.[1]

Procedure

The first step in this study was to develop a broad basis for the presentation and analysis of the staffing procedures. This step in the procedure is presented in Chapter 2.

The second step was to develop an interview guide or "instrument" for gathering the data concerning the staffing procedures actually used by business and industry. The interview

[1]Dalton E. McFarland, MANAGEMENT: Principles and Practices, (New York: The Macmillan Company, 1970), p. 503.

guide, as exhibited in the Appendix, was used as a basis for collecting information from executives who were responsible for the staffing procedures in the representative companies.

The third step was to study, to classify, and to analyze the collected data, and this is presented in Chapter 4. The information collected became the basis for the conclusions and recommendations of the study, which are presented in Chapter 5.

The final step of the study was the preparation of the research report.

CHAPTER II

REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

The review of literature as presented in this study was arranged along the lines of the various factors which were of major significance to the managerial staffing procedure. This arrangement lends itself to giving a cohesive overview of the research activity in this area with a broad perspective.

There seems to be a consensus in current literature concerning the steps to be used in the procedural design in staffing managerial positions from the outside. Jucius lists the steps as the screening interview, application form, employment tests, reference checks, comprehensive interview, and the physical examination.[1] French gives the steps as the application blank, tests, interview, physical examination, reference checks, and then the employment decision.[2] There is some disagreement, however, on the

---

[1]Michael J. Jucius, Personnel Management (7th ed.; Homewood, Ill.: Irwin, 1971), p. 141.

[2]Wendell French, The Personnel Process (2d ed.; Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1970), p. 220.

10

number and sequence of these steps and on how rigid they should be.

In the literature reviewed, there is greater significance being given to the fact that organizations are beginning to realize that capable executives represent one of the greatest assets of the firm, therefore, the adoption of an adequate program to discover and train these people is a significant factor in the standard operating procedure of the company.

Lotz, however, states in a recent research study that there might be a trend toward companies using executive search firms in staffing managerial positions since a search firm can do a better job than the company.[1] Possibly, search firms can provide expert service in staffing managerial positions. Research studies indicate that some companies evidently are solving the problem of managerial staffing by turning to executive search firms to do the job for them. On this point, Lotz observes:

> A search consultant is merely an extension of the company organization who provides an opportunity to increase recruiting efforts when the recruiting load hits a peak while still maintaining an optimum size permanent staff. The use of a professional recruiter is no reflection on the competence of the personnel department. Rather, it represents the same kind of professional assistance that is supplied by an insurance or pension expert, a labor lawyer, a safety expert,

---

[1]R. James Lotz, Jr., "The What, Why, When, and How of Executive Recruiting Today," Personnel Journal, XLVIII, No. 7 (July, 1969), pp. 508-512.

tax specialist, public relations consultant,
market research analyst, etc.[1]

The growth of executive search firms is best illus-
trated by the fact that the American Management Association
lists over 100 executive recruiting consulting firms as members
of its organization. There are 24 firms which have been
admitted as members of the Association of Executive Recruit-
ing Consultants under their rigid standards of admittance.

Along the same line, an article in Newsweek several
years back stated:

> Executive Search Consultants have gained wide
> acceptance; hardly a major firm in the U. S. has
> not used them at one time or another and hardly
> a top executive alive has not been approached at
> least once with an offer to switch jobs.[2]

This trend toward the use of executive search firms,
however, does not help the situation in the long run. Current
research still presents the executive staffing process as one
beset with many problems. Chowdhry sums up the situation
by stating that existing research in selection of execu-
tives has been essentially an analysis of the job requirements
of the individual's skills, abilities and knowledge, and a
prediction of the "fit" between the individual and the job
with a theoretical framework of fitting a round peg in a
round hole. He further states that current research has been

---

[1]Ibid., p. 509

[2]Osborn Elliott, "Headhunters by any other Name,"
Newsweek, (January, 1966), pp. 44-46.

largely concerned in measuring the characteristics of "pegs"
and "holes," identifying predictor variables and criteria,
and in problems relating to the validity and reliability
of measures. Chowdhry reached the conclusion that over the
years this type of research has not yielded any useful results.
There is no significant improvement in our ability to predict
who will make a better executive, and who will rise faster
in the organization.[1]

There is evidence available to indicate that research
in managerial staffing has been of two types. First, it
analyzes senior executives in terms of their ability, per-
sonality, interpersonal relations and values.

Second, it analyzes what the job demands, identifying
some of the relevant dimensions of a job, and then finding
ways to measure these dimensions. Chowdhry reaches a similar
conclusion in his researches.[2]

Research of this type is significant, however, in that
ultimately the man who is recruited for the job must be
able to effectively play the role which the job creates.
Research findings indicate the enormous complexity of execu-
tive selection problems in an organization. The point that
emerges clearly is that there are no "models" of what con-
stitutes a "successful executive," and therefore, it is

---

[1]Kamla Chowdhry, "Selection of Executives and Ad-
ministrators: Implications of Recent Research", Personnel
Journal, XLVIII, No. 2 (Feb., 1969), pp. 102-107.

[2]Ibid., p. 105.

impossible to have criteria which are applicable to most situations.

It is evident that current research brings out the fact that managerial staffing of an organization requires a mix of many different kinds of executives whose common characteristics may defy description and who fill executive roles which are dynamic rather than static. Therefore, the proper fit of the person to the managerial role must remain a difficult task.

In any event, there are indications which show some recruiters are attempting to move away from the "round peg" in a "round hole" concept in managerial staffing. Guetzkow and Forehand, whose findings were analyzed by Chowdhry, suggested a segmental approach to the study of executive selection. Chowdhry concludes that if a prediction cannot be made through long chains of variables to fuzzy, poorly defined criteria, at least some progress can be made by studying segments of the total process which are judged important on a priori grounds by those who are responsible for selecting executives.[1]

In a review of research literature to determine the effectiveness of predictors of managerial success, the findings indicate that research in this area did not add much to the efficiency of the managerial staffing procedures. Wade in an article published in the Personnel Journal gave an evaluation of recent attempts to obtain predictions of

[1]Ibid., p. 104.

managerial success in the managerial staffing process as

follows:

1. Psychometric Prediction: Objective Person-
   ality and Interest Inventories: The author
   found little significant research in this
   area. Such tests have not generally shown
   predictive ability.

2. Psychometric Prediction: Personal History Data.
   This type of data has been used with increasing
   frequency in recent years. According to this
   summary, the approach has some promise, but
   to date few studies have proved valuable beyond
   first-line supervisors.

3. Psychometric Prediction: Cognitive Ability
   Tests. Most of these tests were verbal abili-
   ties scales. This classification seemed to
   show little usefulness above the first-line
   supervisory level.

4. Psychometric Prediction: "Leadership Ability",
   Tests. These tests are generally considered by
   their constructors to combine cognitive and
   non-cognitive characteristics. The findings
   indicated that this type of test was generally
   speaking not effective in measuring leadership
   behavior in an industrial situation.

5. Judgmental Prediction: Executive Assessments.
   This procedure typically includes first, an
   assessment of an individual on a variety of
   test and non-test predictors, including usually
   an extended interview by a psychologist and,
   second, a prediction of the degree of job
   success expected of the assessee. Among
   several promising studies were the following:
   Albrecht, Glaser, and Marks (1964); Grant
   (1965); Dicken and Black (1965); Pehlan
   (1962); Meyer (1956); Handyside and Duncan
   (1954); and Vernon (1950). The author noted
   that while the numbers of subjects in the
   foregoing studies were small, the correla-
   tions were "constantly at a usefully high
   level".

6. Judgmental Prediction: Peer Ratings. In
   this sort of rating the information generally
   available consists of impressions gained from

interaction between peers. Additional research was found to be required in order to determine predictive validity and general character- istics of those persons who are judged to have success potential in peer rating forms.[1]

The consensus in research seems to support the tradi- tional procedures in managerial staffing with evidence of a variation in the sequence and in the number of steps to be included. Witkin makes the following comment concerning the traditional means of managerial staffing:

In brief, there are four basic ways of find- ing out about managerial job applicants, none of which can function alone. They are:

1. Review of background data through application blanks, credit checks, field investigations and other documentary sources.

2. Opinions of past supervisors, most practically through the telephone reference check procedure, skill- fully conducted.

3. The Personal Interview.

4. A battery of psychological tests-- professionally designated and interpreted.

Whether these four steps are undertaken within the organization by its own staff personnel psy- chologists or by outside consultants, all four are essential.[2]

_____

[1]Marilyn Wade, "Personnel Research," Personnel Journal, XLVIII, No. 2 (February, 1969), p. 145.

[2]Dr. Arthur A. Witkin, "Executive Selection: Short Cuts That Short Circuit--A Psychologist"s Reply," Personnel Journal, XLVIII, No. 2 (February, 1969), p. 140.

The personnel department, as a general rule, plays a significant role in managerial staffing. One source indicates that the personnel department's responsibility includes recruitment, selection, and induction into the organization. The personnel department must develop and maintain adequate sources of labor. It must also set up and operate the employee selection system, which include interviews, selection tests, a medical examination, and reference checks.[1]

Thomas is more specific as he summarizes the duties of the personnel department in managerial staffing as follows:

> The successful personnel manager instead of waiting for requisitions ordering him to fill jobs, will go out into the community and develop referral contacts for "instant" recruiting. That may mean visiting the agencies, contacting minority organizations or taking part in "career" conferences at the local college.
>
> Instead of relying on the "subjective" decisions of department managers on hiring applicants, he will research and implement an effective testing and screening program designed to furnish the decision maker with some concrete and meaningful guidelines.[2]

Ideally, the personnel department is a staff department composed of personnel specialists. These specialists can offer expert staffing service to other departments in the organization.

---

[1]Dale S. Beach, Personnel (2d ed.; New York: The Macmillan Company, 1970), p. 238.

[2]William C. Thomas, "Image of the Personnel Department," Personnel Administration, XXXII, No. 3 (May-June, 1969), pp. 36-39.

The Role of Manpower Planning in Managerial Staffing

A review of current literature revealed the impor-
tance of good manpower planning in building an efficient man-
agerial staffing procedure. The findings indicate that pre-
dictions of future managerial needs are very basic in estab-
lishing long range manpower objectives. Greenlaw and Smith
state that organizations are concerned with predicting future
managerial manpower requirements in light of a number of vari-
ables such as: their existing manpower; the loss of this
manpower overtime due to resignations, retirement, etc.;
the promotability of present personnel and future plans for
organizational expansion.[1]

Cassell states that the Research Institute of America
recently reported that management is not only the most urgent
calling of the future but it will be the most critically
short resource of all which will put a greater emphasis on
a need for manpower planning being a basic policy to guide
managerial recruiting procedures.[2]

Jucius emphasizes the critical nature of the need
for good manpower planning in his statement as follows:

> Increasingly, interest is turning to prede-
> termined technical and managerial manpower needs
> waiting for vacancies to occur before seeking
> replacements of higher level employees is too
> risky in this highly competitive and complex age.

---

[1]Paul S. Greenlaw and Robert D. Smith, "Manpower
Planning Models," Personnel Management, (Scranton: Inter-
national Textbook Co., 1970), p. 85.

[2]Wortman, op. cit., p. 85.

So both small and large companies have turned
their attention to filling future needs for
executives and technicians.[1]

Advanced manpower planning according to recent re-
search, makes the managerial staffing procedure more meaning-
ful, logical, and gives lead time to managerial recruiting.
Lead time, in most instances, is necessary so that the prospec-
tive executive may be initiated into a training program which
will improve his performance capabilities. As one author has
stressed:

> An analysis of the present and projected organi-
> zation structures makes it possible to determine
> the need for replacements as present managers
> retire or are transferred or promoted to other
> positions. This information is essential in
> planning for future recruitment for managerial
> positions, including management trainees.[2]

The Role of Job Descriptions and Job Specifications in Managerial Staffing

Research indicates that job descriptions and job
specifications, which reflect the proper demands of the
managerial job, are basic necessities in the managerial staffing
procedure. There seems to be a consensus in current liter-
ature on the importance of job specifications in making the
managerial staffing procedure basically sound. The role of
the managerial position must be properly described so that
it will logically dictate the charactistics of the man sought.

---

[1]Jucius, op. cit., p. 115.

[2]Paul Pigors and Charles Myers, Personnel Administration
(5th ed.; New York: McGraw-Hill, 1965), p. 53.

French believes that job specifications translates the job description into terms of human qualifications and sometimes level of performance required for successful performance of the job. As an aid in hiring, they serve as a partial guide to the characteristics sought in the application blank, testing, the interview, and checking references.[1]

Terry is very emphatic about the necessity of having man specifications for each management job which includes what is generally considered necessary for satisfactory performance of the job.[2] All details such as education, experience, personal qualities, and the ability deemed necessary to fill the job should be specifically listed.

In one recent survey of more than 1000 professional and managerial applicants, 25 per cent refused the job because of four main objections one of which was inadequate job information provided by the job description.[3] Along the same line, one company found that as many as 47 per cent of those who turned jobs down, did so because the duties of the job and its potential were not fully outlined.[4]

Research is providing basic information which can be woven into job specifications to help provide a better picture

---

[1]French, op. cit., p. 181.

[2]Terry, op. cit., p. 502.

[3]Salvatore V. Didato, "Some Reminders About Selecting Good Managers," Personnel Journal, XLIX, No. 6 (June, 1970), pp. 489-491.

[4]Ibid.

of the man sought. Mandell gives emphasis to a study which

adds to the job specifications of first-level supervisors those

characteristics which were common to all who were successful.

This study was conducted with 153 successful first-level

supervisors. Such personal characteristics and qualities

as good communication ability, energy and enthusiasm, reliabil-

ity, and possession of a high degree of job knowledge and tech-

nical skill were the common factors which indicated success

on the job.[1]

Harrell cites a research study based on an annual

survey of the Young President's Organization where some

observations were made on the personality of the young presi-

dents. The following characteristics were found to be neces-

sary for presidents to become successful in their jobs:

1. Getting along with people.
2. Talent for analyzing, organizing and delegating
   work.
3. Enthusiasm, honesty, sincerity.
4. Influencing people.[2]

In any event, there is enough evidence available

through research to indicate that certain human character-

istics may be added to job specifications of various manageri-

al positions to give a more composite picture of the man

sought.

---

[1]Milton M. Mandell, "How to Pick Better Front-Line
Managers," Readings in Organization and Management, (New York:
Holt, Rinehart & Winston, 1963), pp. 334-339.

[2]Thomas W. Harrell, Manager's Performance and Person-
ality, (Cincinnati: South-Western Publishing Co., 1961), p. 83.

The Role of the Application Blank
in Managerial Staffing

Current research indicates that the application blank should be one of the first basic steps to be used in the managerial staffing process. Research in this area presents a great variety of application forms including preliminary applications used for quick initial screening of applicants, selective applications which include special questions to provide clues for suitability for certain types of work, and weighted applications giving scoring values of different questions designed to single out specific managerial types.

Research reveals two schools of thought on the role the application blank plays in the managerial staffing procedure. One recent source states that one school feels the blank should ask only those questions which are pertinent to employment in the company; their application form lists only minimum questions. Others believe there is value to interspersing necessary questions with general and possibly irrelevant questions on the theory that everybody likes to talk about himself. While the applicant is concentrating on harmless questions, he is unaware of the importance attached to some of the less obvious but more meaningful statements he makes.[1]

---

[1]Wilbert E. Scheer, The Dartnell Personnel Director's Handbook, (Chicago: Dartnell Corp., 1970), p. 166.

The weighted application blank, however, seems to be the most effective application form in predicting managerial efficiency. Enough research has been undertaken in a variety of jobs and by disassociated persons to show that this tool of the management recruiter has value.

There are several research studies which are significant in this area. For example, Hinrichs reported on an analysis of application blanks of 239 chemists and engineers hired over a recent five-year period finding that high-performance men differed significantly on a number of items from others. When items were rated and employees scored, high-performing employees received considerably higher scores than others.[1] Dunnettee and Maetzold had a similar experience with analysis of application blanks for seasonal workers of a food canner, weighting the application blank to see whether it was possible to predict which transient workers would remain through out the season and which would quit. This device proved to be an "effective predictor".[2] Effective weighted application blanks can be designed by most organizations of any size which will enhance the possibility of their executive recruiting procedure being more successful.

---

[1]J. R. Hinrichs, "Technical Selection: How to Improve Your Batting Average," Personnel, XXXVII, (March, 1960), pp. 56-60.

[2]Marvin D. Dunnette and James Maetzold, "Use of a Weighted Application Blank in Hiring Seasonal Employees," Journal of Applied Psychology, XXXIX, No. 5 (October, 1955), pp. 308-310.

Another source presents a significant study on weighted application blanks in which a large retail chain, in choosing store management trainees, found definite correlations with job performance and the following: location of last permanent residence, marital status, father's occupation, health, previous experience in retailing, rank in high school or college class, and compensation of last previous job compared to starting salary of this job.[1]

There seems to be a large amount of research information available on the weighted application blank and a majority of these studies give strong support to the weighted application blank as being most effective. However, a great deal of effort must go into the preparation of the weighted application blank in order to make it effective.

The Role of the Interview in Managerial Staffing

A wide variety of research leaves no doubt as to the significance of the employment interview in the managerial staffing process. In a survey conducted in Wisconsin among all private firms employing 150 or more employees, it was found that interviews ranked as the number one procedure for making the final employment decision at all levels.[2] Spriegel and Dale indicate that the interview has been challenged only by the application blank in terms of frequency of use by

---

[1]Dale S. Beach, op. cit., p. 238.

[2]D. Robertson, Personnel Testing Practices in Wisconsin Industry, The University of Wisconsin, 1965.

employers.[1] The application blank and the interview supplement each other in the managerial staffing procedure.

Research over the last few years, however, has subjected the selection interview to some criticism over its reliability and validity. For instance, Mayfield examined several hundred articles on interviewing and found that the interview as it is normally conducted in recruiting at all levels is of little value.[2]

More criticism seems to be heaped upon the unstructured interview than on any other type. Ash,[3] Webster,[4] and Wentworth[5] all support the conclusion that different interviewers sometimes give different weight to the same information which could contribute to the major cause of the unreliability of unstructured interviews. Material in these types of interviews is not consistently covered and inconsistent techniques of evaluation are used.

---

[1]W. R. Spriegel and A. G. Dale, "Trends in Personnel Selection and Induction," Personnel, XXX (1953), pp. 169-175.

[2]E. C. Mayfield, "The Selection Interview: A Reevaluation of Published Research," Personnel Psychology, XVII (1964), pp. 239-260.

[3]S. Ash, "Forming Impressions of Personality," Journal of Abnormal and Social Psychology, XLI (1946), pp. 258-290.

[4]E. C. Webster, "Decision Making in the Employment Interview," Personnel Administration, XXII (1959), pp. 15-22.

[5]P. Wentworth, "How to Improve Employment Interviews," Personnel Journal, XXXII (1953), pp. 46-49.

The structured interviews seem to give a greater degree of reliability in the managerial staffing process than the unstructured interviews. Wright concludes in his recent survey on the selection interview for recruiting at all levels that the structured or patterned interviewing technique continued to show inter-rater reliabilities, probably because these interviews are easier to systematically evaluate and require the use of trained interviewers.[1] Also, there is evidence from still another survey which indicates that the structured interview shows greater validity in the managerial staffing procedure, and is being increasingly used as a selection and promotional tool.[2]

The interviewer plays a leading role as to the significance and validity of the interview in the managerial staffing process. On this point, Didato pointed out that of more than 1000 professional and managerial applicants who refused a job offer, 25 per cent refused on the basis of indifferent interviewers being a factor. He further states that a good interviewer is vital in making this step of the managerial staffing procedure effective.[3]

---

[1]Orman R. Wright, "Summary of Research on The Selection Interview Since 1964," Personnel Psychology, XXI, No. 1 (Winter, 1969), pp. 391-409.

[2]Life Insurance Agency Management Association, "Career Guidance in the Life Insurance Industry," Personnel Psychology, XXI, No. 1 (1968), pp. 1-21.

[3]Didato, op. cit., pp. 489-491.

Carlson evaluated a study on the effect of the interviewer's experience on the selection decision and reported finding that experienced interviewers rank ordered applicants the same way. The researcher also reported finding a high degree of consistency as to per cent of applicants accepted by individual interviewers who had experience.[1]

Calhoon states that by the mid-1960's very little good research was underway to guide the interviewer in his behavior or to assist him in identifying the qualities to be sought in the interview.[2] Also, The American Management Association reported on the experience of 273 companies and found that there were not even many follow-up studies of the effectiveness of selection and the causes of mistakes in managerial interviewing.[3]

There is an evident trend in industry, however, toward bringing more members in management into the interviewing act. At least two, and often three, interviewers are used in the managerial staffing process. This helps to minimize the danger of bias and misjudgment in the interview itself.

---

[1]Robert E. Carlson, "Selection Interview Decisions: The Effect of Interviewer Experience, Relative Quota Situation, and Applicant Sample on Interviewer Decision," Personnel Psychology, XX, No. 3 (Autumn, 1967), pp. 259-279.

[2]Richard P. Calhoon, Personnel Management and Supervision, (New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1967), p. 93.

[3]Milton Mandell, "The Employment Interview," A.M.A. Research Study No. 47, 1961, p. 8.

Mandell found that, often, top plant management takes part in the interviews of first-line supervisors. At the Armstrong Cork Company, for example, finalists are inter- viewed as a group by the plant manager, the plant personnel manager, and other executives. The plant manager, his assistant, and the production manager make the final selection.[1]

Although a great deal of confusion exists as to what can and cannot be accomplished by the interview, there is not sufficient evidence available to reject its use in the managerial staffing procedure. On this point, Dunnette and Bass state:

> The personal interview is often used to the
> exclusion of far more thoroughly researched and
> validated procedures. Even when the interview
> is used in conjunction with other procedures,
> it is almost always treated as the final hurdle
> in the selection process. In fact, other selec-
> tion methods, e.g., psychological tests, are often
> regarded simply as supplements to the interview.

> The continued uncritical use of the personal
> interview offers a clear illustration of what is
> perhaps personnel management's prime problem--that
> is, the great resistance to carrying out funda-
> mental research on its practices and techniques.[2]

The Role of Testing in Managerial Staffing

Research indicates that various types of tests are widely used in the selection process. Spriegel and Dale

------

[1]Mandell, op. cit., pp. 334-339.

[2]M. D. Dunnette and B. M. Bass, "Behavioral Scientist and Personnel Management," Industrial Relation, II (1963), pp. 115-130.

surveyed 628 companies and asked what type of employee selection program it conducted in recruiting at all levels. Of this number, 248 (or 39.5 per cent) indicated that they used some type of personality or interest test in their staffing procedures.[1] Another survey of personnel practices in business has revealed that 81 per cent of 473 firms having 250 employees or more indicated that they were using one or more tests in hiring.[2] Most smaller firms, however, do not make use of standardized tests, but rely more heavily upon interviews and background checks.

The employment tests as they have been used in the past and as they are being used today, however, are being subjected to a great deal of criticism. Sparks states in a basic research which he conducted that there is a current and growing concern over the use of psychological tests in industry. Behind much of this concern, regardless of how it is expressed, are the numerous instances where measurement psychologists have not demonstrated satisfactorily that the tests are valid for their intended use. In conclusion, Sparks gives a suggestion which should undoubtedly be made and that is to temper tests scores with interview

[1]W. R. Spriegel and A. G. Dale, "Trends in Personnel Selection and Induction," Personnel, XXX (1953), pp. 166-175.

[2]National Industrial Conference Board, Personnel Practices in Factory and Office: Manufacturing, Studies in Personnel Policy, No. 194, New York, 1964, p. 14.

results, experience records, reference checks, etc.[1] The
questionable validity of psychological tests indicates a
need for handling the scores with care.

On the same point, Strauss comments as follows:

> The question of personality testing drama-
> tizes several issues. A number of large companies
> now use tests such as TAT, Rorschach, and MMPI,
> as aids both in selecting new managers and deter-
> mining whom to promote. But it can be argued
> that such tests give over-emphasis to conformity
> and ability to get along with people. They
> are useful chiefly in a negative sense, in elim-
> inating those with abnormalities. However, in
> doing this they also run the risk of eliminating
> the exceptional individual that management most
> needs to attract to high-level jobs. Some of
> the greatest and most creative people in history
> have had emotional troubles of one sort or another
> and were great in spite of them; in fact, the
> driving force behind many executive's ambition
> often originates in psychic imbalance. Some of
> these tests delve too deeply; they tell you about
> a man's basic drives, but not how well he handles
> them.[2]

Longenecker states that tests are often used to assist
in managerial selection, but the validity of such selection
devices often leaves much to be desired.[3] Jucius adds the
weight of his opinion to the subject by emphasizing the fact
that to results of tests on such factors as interests,
emotional stability, general intelligence and personality

---

[1]Charles P. Sparks, "Validity of Psychological Tests,"
Personnel Psychology, XXIII, No. 1 (Spring, 1970), pp. 39-46.

[2]George Strauss, "Organization Man--Prospect for
the Future," Readings in Organizational Theory, (Boston:
Allyn and Bacon, Inc., 1966), pp. 569-586.

[3]Longenecker, op. cit., p. 324.

must be added opinions on such factors as training, experience, social responsibility and relationships, productive records, and hobbies.[1]

Parry conducted a research study to determine the validity of personality tests by correlating test scores with merit ratings on the same employees. This research project involved 24 supervisory trainees. Four tests were administered to the supervisory trainees: Wesman Personnel Classification Test (Form B), How Supervise? (Form A), Adaptability Test (Form A), and the Survey of Interpersonal values. There was no significant relationship found between the test scores and merit ratings.[2]

Guion and Gottier conducted a research study on the significance of testing in the employee selection procedure for management and other positions. They reached the conclusion that a home-made personality or interest measure, carefully and competently developed for a specific situation, is a better bet for predicition than is a standard personality measure with a standard system of scoring. It was also concluded that, taken as a whole, there is no generalizable evidence that personality measures can be recommended as good or practical tools for employee selection. The number of

---

[1]Jucius, op. cit., p. 182.

[2]Mary Ellen Parry, "Ability of Psychologists to Estimate Validities of Personnel Tests," Personnel Psychology, XXI, No. 2 (Summer, 1968), pp. 139-147.

significant tests resulting in acceptable statements of
validity is greater than might be expected by pure chance--but
not much.[1]

Spitzer and McNamara conducted a study in a manu-
facturing division of an electronics firm to determine if
tests could be selected that could be positively related
to managerial success, and thus be useful in selecting employees
who have good managerial potential. Data were obtained from
102 managers, 84 of whom were first-line managers. These
employees were from four plants in various sections of the
United States. The major implication of this study was that
there are predictors which are significantly related to a
measure of managerial success for first-line managers in wide-
ly scattered plants of a single organization. If these tests
(Background and Contemporary Data Form and Otis Test of
Mental Ability) are employed in the selection procedure, there
should be an increase in the number of managers performing in
an above average manner according to present standards. The
results seem clear that a proper use of these instruments can
identify a group of employees who have greater potential to
become successful managers.[2]

There will be more accountability on companies in
the future as they apply employment tests in staffing positions

---

[1]Robert M. Guion and Richard F. Gottier, "Validity of
Personality Measures in Personnel Selection," Personnel Psy-
chology, XVIII, No. 2 (Summer, 1965), pp. 135-160.

[2]Morton Edward Spitzer and Walter J. McNamara, "A
Managerial Selection Study," Personnel Psychology, XVII, No. 1
(Spring, 1964), pp. 19-40.

at all levels in the organization. This is based on the
fact that a recent U. S. Supreme Court case, Grigs Vs. Duke
Power, established by unanimous decision, a ruling that a test
which is used to measure a person for a job must measure the
person for the job and not the person in the abstract. This
ruling indicates that the test must be related to the job.[1]
This decision, in the long-run, may force companies to do
more research and follow-up studies to determine the validity
of their tests.

<div align="center">

The Role of Reference Checks
in Managerial Staffing

</div>

Research bears out the fact that reference checks
have become a very important part of the managerial staffing
procedure. Inquiries are made about prior work experience,
character, education, and whatever else may be considered
necessary to help arrive at a decision to hire and not to
hire an applicant.[2]

Personal references are not used much anymore since
their usefulness is questionable. Friends, relatives, acquaint-
ances, and clergymen are likely to give favorable reports.
Research indicates more of a trend toward checking credit,
police records, military service records, and employer
reference checks.

---

[1]Oklahoma Time, May 13, 1971, p. 44.

[2]Scheer, op. cit., p. 201.

One survey indicated that 99 per cent of reporting

firms checked with the previous employers of applicants.

Checks by telephone apparently are growing in popularity;

in a 1957 survey, written references were obtained by only

about half the firms reporting, whereas in 1930, 82 per cent

reported obtaining written references.[1] Among others, Sheer[2]

and Calhoon[3] support this trend toward the use of the tele-

phone in the reference check. They indicate that checks by

telephone establish greater validity than the written reference.

In another survey, 473 manufacturing firms of 250

employees or more, it was discovered that approximately 90

per cent check work references in some manner or another,

66 per cent check school and personal references, and 35

per cent ask for a credit check.[4] It seems that many organ-

izations are using multiple sources in their reference check

activities.

Flippo gives added significance to the reference check

in his statement as follows:

> When the difficulty of properly evaluating
> personnel is considered seriously it is apparent
> that some type of check on an applicant's past
> history would add to the validity of the process.
> The value of utilizing references should not be
> overlooked or deprecated simply because of poor

---

[1]French, op. cit., p. 243.

[2]Sheer, op. cit., p. 201.

[3]Calhoon, op. cit., p. 108.

[4]National Industrial Conference Board, op. cit., p. 12.

methods used in the past. The companies that
check references properly have proved their real
value to the hiring process.[1]

Flippo's statement seems to put the reference check

in the proper light and leaves no doubt as to its value in

the managerial staffing procedure. The reference check is an

important factor in the evaluation of managerial applicants.

The Role of Training Programs in Managerial Staffing

One major objective of a management training program

is to increase the managerial ability of a candidate hired

to staff a managerial position. This training program is

usually the culminating activity in the managerial staffing

procedure. Programs designed to help train managers are

varied in their makeup and application, and they are more flex-

ible today than ever before. Along this line, Terry states:

> To a great extent the rigid, highly systemized
> developing procedures have been abandoned. In their
> place, management members are performing more inform-
> al training or developing work. There is today more
> realism about what can and cannot be accomplished
> in the classroom. Management courses dealing with
> technological advances together with changes in the
> business environment have expanded; yet there is also
> growth in placing capable men in demanding jobs, for
> it has been found that this develops and tests these
> men faster and at the same time produces profits for
> the enterprise.[2]

Pigors and Myers also believe a management training

program should be varied and flexible because it is impossible

to recommend a managerial training program that would be

---

[1]Edwin B. Flippo, Principles of Personnel Management,
(3rd. ed.; New York: McGraw-Hill, 1971), p. 139.

[2]Terry, op. cit., p. 500.

equally good for every company.[1] A company can individual-
ize a trainining program which is flexible and tailor it to
meet their specific needs.

Executive training has been getting more and more
attention at all levels in the organization, from supervisory
through middle management to the top level. One author states
that the most encouraging trend in personnel management is
the increasing role being given to executive training at all
levels in most organizations.[2]

There is a problem of motivating or encouraging the
employee to participate and to do well in management training
programs. One author states that if programs of training
or development are imposed upon people and are interpreted as
punishment for deficiencies, there will be little enthusiasm
and probably little effective learning and suggested that,
to be effective, training and development must be perceived
as leading to the attainment of need-satisfying goals.[3]

Along the same line, Dhir comments as follows:

> Different types of training will pose the prob-
> lem of motivation in different forms. Therefore,
> one type of technique adopted may prove itself to
> be better or worse than the other, at different
> times, with different people. The most effective
> form of motivation consists of successfully convinc-
> ing the management trainee that the content of

---

[1]Pigors and Myers, op. cit., p. 385.

[2]Jucius, op. cit., p. 264.

[3]French, op. cit., p. 485.

training will be of value to him, and in assisting
him to discharge his duties, when he is on the job.
It is also clear that this type of motivation
is most difficult to produce in the course of a
program of training for the general administrator.[1]

There are many documented studies which note the wide-
spread attention given to formalized managerial training pro-
grams. One study reports that 71 per cent of the responding
firms have classes in foremanship training.[2]

The Bureau of National Affairs found in a survey
conducted with 137 companies that 70 per cent of the smaller
firms and 75 per cent of the larger firms had regularly
scheduled training meetings for supervisors.[3] Another study
concluded that approximately half of the college recruits
going to work for the 240 responding firms were given a period
of special training--typically seven to twelve months--before
being assigned to a specific position.[4]

A recent study conducted by Foreman noted that out
of a total of 49 companies studied, all used one or more

---

[1]Krishna Dhir, "The Problem of Motivation in Management
Development," Personnel Journal, XLIX, No. 10 (October, 1970),
pp. 837-842.

[2]William R. Spriegel, John R. Beishline, and Alfred
G. Dale, Personnel Practices in Industry (Austin: The University
of Texas, Bureau of Business Research, 1958), Personnel Study
No. 8, revised, p. 38.

[3]Bureau of National Affairs, "Supervisory Development,
Part I," Personnel Policies Forum, Survey No. 31, July, 1955,
pp. 1, 2.

[4]National Industrial Conference Board, "Employment of
the College Graduate," Studies in Personnel Policy, No. 152,
1956, p. 33.

types of training techniques in training their management personnel. On-the-job training, conferences, and discussion, and job rotation ranked the highest in the training techniques used.[1]

The Wall Street Journal reported that during 1966 approximately 500,000 American managers participated as students in some form of training or academic courses-- almost twice the number of managers participating five years earlier.[2] This leads one to conclude that formalized management training programs designed to groom candidates for managerial positions are widely used and probably will continue to expand in the future.

Summary

In this chapter, an extensive review of related literature was conducted in order to provide a proper basis for collecting, stating, and analyzing data concerning managerial staffing in the Oklahoma City area. The information was presented with the major steps in the staffing procedure serving as a guide.

Books, periodicals, doctoral dissertations, and other basic research publications were reviewed extensively in order to present a consensus of opinion on each basic factor in the managerial staffing procedure. The information drawn

---

[1]Wayne J. Foreman, "Management Training in Large Corporrations," Training And Development Journal, XXI, No. 5 (May, 1967), pp. 11-17.

[2]Thomas Bray, "Obsolete Executives," Wall Street Journal, January 24, 1966, p. 1.

from this consensus was paramount in the formulation of guide-
lines to be used in the identification of managerial staffing
procedures.

CHAPTER III

METHODS AND PROCEDURE

The method of descriptive research which included
activity analysis was used in the preparation of this paper.
Best states that descriptive research describes and interprets
what is. The researcher does not manipulate the variables
or arrange for events to happen. Descriptive research
involves events that have already taken place. The techni-
que of descriptive research is particularly appropriate in
the behavioral sciences.[1]

Selection of the Method of Collecting Data

The objective of this study was to determine how
selected industries in the Oklahoma City area staffed their
managerial positions. In order to obtain this information,
a valid data-collection instrument was needed. The researcher
designed the instrument shown in the Appendix, which was
validated through the use of a jury of qualified judges, and
by pilot interviews.

As stated in Chapter I, information was desired from
firms representing selected industries in the Oklahoma City
area. To accomplish this, the structured interview guide
was chosen as the method of collecting information. The

---

[1]John W. Best, Research in Education, (2d .ed.; Englewood
Cliffs: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1970), p. 117.

information desired was extensive and could have been construed by the selected firm to be on the fringe of delving into corporate secrets. The interview guide offered the best opportunity to gain the volume of information needed and at the same time relieve the firm from the fear of being associated by name with published information relating to the data gathered.

Best states that the interview is often superior to other data-gathering devices. One reason is that people are usually more willing to talk than to write. After the interviewer gains rapport, or establishes a friendly, secure relationship with the subject, certain types of confidential information may be obtained that an individual might be reluctant to put in writing.[1]

Development of the Interview Guide

In constructing the interview guide, space was provided in the first section for the identity of the company, its location, its size based on number of employees, and the main function of the organization. This information was necessary in order to provide a basis for a follow-up contact in the event further clarification needed to be obtained on the data gathered from a particular firm. Also, the information pertaining to the number of employees and the

----

[1]Ibid, p. 186.

function of the firm was to be used as a basis to insure a significant representative sample.

The next portion of this chapter is devoted to the justification for and to an analysis of the questions used in the data-collection instrument. Each question was designed to obtain meaningful information concerning the actual procedures used by each company.

In Section II of the interview guide, information was needed about the personnel department in order to determine how important this department was in staffing managerial positions. As seen in Chapter II, the personnel department should play an extensive role in the recruiting and training of employees to fill managerial positions. Also in this section, information was needed from the participating firms concerning manpower planning programs in order to determine whether managerial manpower planning was actually a basic part of the managerial staffing procedure as was indicated in Chapter II of this paper.

Another part of Section II contains a question relating to the performance of job analysis of executive positions. This information is needed in order to determine whether representative firms recognize the necessity of identifying the changing role of the executive position. In Chapter II, it was pointed out that, as a general rule, job analysis is a basic part of getting a "good fit" of the executive to the job. It is a basic technique used to identify new job demands brought about by various job changes. The answer

to this question will give an indication as to whether this
is deemed to be of importance to industry in the Oklahoma City
area.

Section III of the interview guide was designed to
obtain information relating to managerial selection from
the outside. This section of the data collecting instrument
is designed to be effective although the company practices
an extensive promotion from within policy. The representa-
tive firm was asked to answer this question in light of the
fact that this procedure would be followed in hiring people
on the bottom level who possessed managerial potential
and who ultimately would be considered for promotion from
within.

The first part of Section III concerns the sources
and the screening devices used by the representative firms in
managerial staffing from the outside. Information pertain-
ing to the sources used in managerial staffing is important
in that significant trends can be determined which have a
direct relationship to the other steps used in the staffing
procedure.

The sources are the basis for the formation of a pool
of people who may have managerial potential to offer the
company. The sources mentioned as being used by the company
were to be ranked on the basis of how effective they serve
each individual company being interviewed. In particular,
the significance of each source and its effectiveness for

the total sample is of great importance in being able to
identify and recognize the most productive sources that
serve the needs of industry in their managerial staffing
procedure.

The questions on the interview guide relating to the
screening devices used in the selection of managerial candi-
dates from the outside are most pertinent. The information
obtained from these questions form a basic part of managerial
staffing. The number of tools or screening devices used and
the sequence in which they are given determine, to a large
extent, the managerial staffing procedure.

Through a study of related research in Chapter II,
trends were noted in the application of the screening devices
used in the managerial staffing procedure which were im-
portant. These trends were as follows: (1) use of a wide
variety of tests, (2) use of multiple reference checks, and
(3) extensive use of multiple interviews. By obtaining
information on this subject from the selected firms in the
Oklahoma City area, it can be determined whether these trends
are evident in this locale.

A large part of the questions in Section III are
designed to identify the characteristics which the repre-
sentative firms deem important in prospective managers. In
effect, the answers to these questions are the human speci-
fications which fit the job specifications for the positions
to be staffed. The answers to these questions will describe
the type of manager whom the firms feel will best fit the job.

In Section IV of the interview guide, questions were designed to identify the occupational areas of the company which were the most significant sources of managerial personnel for promotion from within. In identifying these sources, a basic step in managerial staffing from within can be determined. Questions relating to the techniques used to identify managerial potential from within were included in order to determine what internal evaluative devices are used in the procedure.

Questions relating to the type of managerial training programs and their effectiveness were included in Section IV in order to determine the significance of training in the managerial staffing procedure as practiced by the representative firms. A statement by Nordlie helps validate the need for this section on managerial training in the interview guide. He states that training is one of the most important functions of manpower development. If the goals of an organization are to be attained, its employees must acquire the knowledge, skills, and attitudes required to perform their jobs proficiently. This emphasis upon training extends to all levels of the organization and to all employees, both new and old.[1] Training should be considered as a relative factor in managerial staffing. Several pages

---

[1]David A. Nordlie, "The Competent Trainer," _Training and Development Journal_, XXI, No. 5 (May, 1967), pp. 51-54.

were devoted to managerial training programs in Chapter II
of this paper, which established the fact that training
programs are closely associated with managerial staffing.

In Section V, questions were designed to acquire
information relative to future changes in the managerial
staffing procedure. This information is important in recog-
nizing possible future expectations and trends which may
become a part of managerial staffing.

Validation of Guide and Selection of Sample

A great deal of time was spent by the researcher in
studying managerial staffing procedures and problems before
the interview guide was developed so that questions asked
would be relevant and valid. A widely accepted method of
validating items of a questionnaire and other measuring devices
is that of using a jury of qualified judges to evaluate the
items. Therefore, the interview guide was submitted to
several college professors and business executives who were
well informed on the subject of managerial staffing. These
judges gave a critical evaluation of the guide. The guide in
its final form was written following five pilot interviews in
the Spring of 1971. The pilot interviews served as a basis
to improve and refine the guide as well as to improve the
interviewer's technique.

The population from which the representative firms
were to be selected had to meet certain criteria. A company

had to have a total of 300 or more employees before it could
be considered for inclusion in the population for the study.
In order to have a significant number of executive positions
for staffing and an identifiable managerial staffing procedure
for study, a company will usually need to have 300 or more
employees. Also, the company had to have a personnel department
in the research area or a responsible executive who had the
duties and responsibilities of a personnel officer with the
authority to hire locally.

Several large companies which had operations in the
research area were ruled out of the population because they
had no personnel department operations in the research area.
When these companies hired locally, a visiting team of executives
was brought in from another region to initiate the staffing
procedure. Westinghouse and General Mills are typical companies
among several which could not be included in the population
for the study because of the lack of personnel department
representation in the research area. Although these two companies
had branch office operations in the area, they could offer very
little information relating to company policy on managerial
staffing procedures.

The population was composed of 150 companies which had
300 or more employees with personnel department representation
in the research area. Companies of this size have an appropri-
ate number of managerial positions to be staffed and offer a
better opportunity to study staffing. Fifty companies were
selected at random to represent the various industries in the area.

Administering the Instrument

Personnel executives in the 50 companies represented were contacted by telephone in order to schedule interviews. The interviews were scheduled between May 25, 1971, and July 23, 1971. The interviews were conducted on the company premises with a knowledgeable personnel executive. This setting provided an opportunity for the interviewee to gather pertinent information relating to managerial staffing from other sources within the immediate vicinity.

The interviews ranged from 45 minutes to two hours in length. The personnel executives were very cooperative and enthusiastic in providing the needed data. A structured interview was used with the specific questions listed in the guide forming the basis. After each question was discussed and answered, the information was recorded by the researcher on the interview guide in the space provided. After each interview was completed, additional information was recorded in many cases to insure completeness and validity. These additional comments were to clarify immediately all abbreviations and ambiguous statements while the interview information was still in mind.

Summary

The information in this chapter was centered around the procedure followed in collecting the data for the study. The purpose of this chapter was to present the selection and

analysis of the data collecting instrument, the development of the questions to be included in the instrument, the validation of the instrument, and the design of the sample.

Each part of the interview guide was designed to collect information which was relevant to the managerial staffing procedure as presented in Chapter II along with some expanded investigation in the more pertinent areas of managerial staffing.

The interview guide was presented to a panel of qualified judges for critical analysis. This procedure was followed by five pilot interviews all of which served as a basis for the improvement and refinement of the guide. The guide was used in a structured interview with responsible personnel executives in 50 companies selected from a population of 150 which represented the various specified industries in the research area.

In order to be included in the population, companies had to meet a size requirement of 300 or more people and have a personnel department or a personnel executive in the research area with the authority to initiate the managerial staffing procedure.

A presentation and analysis of the results are presented in chapter IV.

CHAPTER IV

PRESENTATION AND ANALYSIS OF DATA

The intent of this chapter is to present the manage-
rial staffing practices used by personnel men representing
firms from selected industries in the research area. The
information concerning these practices was collected from
50 selected firms in the Oklahoma City area so that the
managerial staffing procedures used by these firms could be
identified and analyzed. The data-collecting instrument (see
Appendix) consisting of five major sections was designed to
obtain this important information.

In this chapter, the data are presented on the find-
ings gathered from interviews with 50 personnel executives
from the selected firms. The procedure of presentation will
follow the design of the interview guide, section by section,
similar to the presentation on the development of the inter-
view guide in Chapter III. The process of descriptive research
is used in this chapter with the data being presented in tabu-
lar form which provides a basis for activity analysis by the
application of percentages.

Company Personnel Department

The personnel department representation was determin-
ed in the selected companies in order to establish various

personnel services which could be brought to bear on the staffing activity. The data are summarized in Table I.

TABLE 1

EMPLOYMENT OF PERSONNEL EXECUTIVES

Type of Executive	Number of Firms	Per Cent of Firms
Personnel Director	50	100
Employment Manager	21	42
Training Director	30	60
Wage and Salary Analyst	21	42
Part-time Employment Manager	2	4
Part-time Wage & Salary	2	4
Part-time Training Director	1	2
Equal Employment Director	1	2
Compensation Administrator of Employee Benefit Plans	1	2

As would be expected, firms employing 300 or more people employ a full-time personnel director. Of the firms surveyed, 100 per cent had a full-time personnel director. The recruitment, selection, training, and utilization of human resources at all levels of the organization structure demand the attention of full-time staff people.

Forty-two per cent of the firms surveyed have a full-time employment manager, 60 per cent have a training director, 42 per cent have a wage and salary analyst. The per cent of companies employing full-time training directors, which was indicated at 60 per cent, is indicative of the admirable responsibility which the companies have assumed in training their employees.

Those firms which do not have full-time specialist in the personnel department to help administer the managerial staffing procedure may be moving in that direction by utilizing part-time specialist at present. Four per cent of the firms had a part-time employment manager, 4 per cent had a part-time wage and salary analyst, and 2 per cent had a part-time training director.

Some new positions in the personnel department became evident from the survey. One company mentioned having an equal employment opportunity director and another company mentioned having a compensation administrator of-employee benefit plans. The greater responsibility of companies to provide equal employment opportunity and the tremendous growth of employee benefit plans may well bring about the demand for more specialist in this area.

In the survey, 42 per cent of the firms have a wage and salary analyst which indicates a significant need on the part of these companies to be completely cognizant of internal and external salary analysis and consistency. In any event, Table 1 presents important evidence as to the extensive staff personnel necessary to administer to the needs of the organization in order to obtain optimum utilization of human resources.

In table 2, information is presented as to the title of the top personnel officer in the representative firms.

TABLE 2

TITLE OF TOP PERSONNEL EXECUTIVE

Title	Number of Firms	Per Cent of Firms
Manager or Director of Personnel	27	54
Vice President of Industrial Relations	13	26
Manager or Director of Industrial Relations	4	8
Vice President of Public Relations	1	2
Vice President of Personnel	3	6
General Manager of Public & Ind. Rel.	1	2
Vice President of Administration	1	2

Manager or director of personnel is the title most often used by 54 per cent of the firms surveyed. Vice president of industrial relations was used by 26 per cent, manager or director of industrial relations ranked third in usage by showing 8 per cent.

An analysis of this information shows an element of consistency in titles given to top personnel executives with over one-half of the firms using manager or director of

personnel. Also, the titles give an indication as to the importance given to this staff function with most titles indicating at or near a vice presidential status level in the organization.

The information in Table 3 supports the data in Table 2 as to the importance of the personnel function in running the firm.

TABLE 3

VERTICAL LOCATION OF TOP
PERSONNEL EXECUTIVE IN THE
ORGANIZATIONAL STRUCTURE

Location	Number of Firms	Per Cent of Firms
Top Management Level	30	60
Middle Management Level	18	36
Lower Management Level	2	4

As indicated in Table 3, 60 per cent of the firms surveyed give top management level status to their chief personnel executive. It should be noted that 96 per cent give at least middle management status and up to this office. In contrast, only 4 per cent were classified as being in the lower or bottom management level.

The work carried on by top personnel executives is of great importance. This is supported by the fact that

the majority of them carry vice presidential status and are located at the top management level.

The data in Table 4 represents the responsibility which the personnel department has in staffing managerial positions as represented by the selected firms.

TABLE 4

RESPONSIBILITY OF PERSONNEL DEPARTMENT
FOR MANAGERIAL STAFFING

Responsibility	Number of Firms	Per Cent of Firms
Staffing responsibility for all mgmt. levels and furnish data to area where vacancy exists.	16	32
All staffing at lower mgmt. levels only and suggest to department head.	5	10
All staffing through middle mgmt. level and suggest to executive where vacancy exist.	10	20
All staffing responsibility at all levels except final decision which is made by president and/or home office executives	10	20
Each branch operation autonomous with manager doing staffing, personnel department assists afterward	8	16
Sole responsibility at all levels except top level, however, assist at top level.	1	2

Of the concerns providing data for this section, 84 per cent of their personnel departments have total managerial staffing responsibility up to various levels of the organization. However, 16 per cent do not utilize personnel except for the final hiring decision which lies with the manager in the vacancy area. Only 16 per cent of the firms surveyed indicated a minor role for the personnel department in the managerial staffing procedure.

In fact, 20 per cent of the firms reporting, indicated sole responsibility for managerial staffing at all levels with the exception of the president and/or the home office making final approval. It can be stated that after being notified of the managerial manpower need, the personnel department, in a large majority of the companies surveyed, has the authority and responsibility to initiate and carry out the managerial staffing procedures so that qualified people may be provided for the organization.

In answer to a question as to whether the company had a managerial manpower planning program for projecting future managerial needs, 86 per cent of the companies answered in the affirmative and 14 per cent gave a negative reply. The information in Tables 5 and 6 is based on the answers given by the 43 companies which do manpower planning.

Tables 5 and 6 give a breakdown as to levels where the planning is carried out and the length of time for the plans.

TABLE 5

PLANNING LEVEL FOR PROJECTING
FUTURE MANAGERIAL NEEDS

Level of Planning	Number of Firms	Per Cent of Firms
Top Management Level	15	34.9
Middle Management Level	9	21.0
Lower Management Level	8	18.6
All Levels	8	18.6
Top & Middle Level	3	6.9

TABLE 6

NUMBER OF FUTURE YEARS COVERED IN
MANAGERIAL MANPOWER PLANNING

Length of Time	Number of Firms	Per Cent of Firms
One Year	5	11.6
Two Years	6	13.9
Three Years	2	4.8
Four Year	0	0
Five or More Years	30	69.8

In an analysis of the data on long range manpower planning, 86 per cent of the firms in the survey practice manpower planning with 34.9 per cent of the planning being done at top level, and 69.8 per cent of the firms making plans for five or more years in advance. As indicated in Table 6, only 30.2 per cent plan for less than five years.

Although 34.9 per cent of the companies in Table 5 do managerial manpower planning at top level, there is evidence that there is some decentralization of this activity. In support of this fact, 21 per cent of the companies do manpower planning at middle management level and 18.6 per cent carry out this function at the lower level.

The fact that 86 per cent of the companies included in this study practice managerial manpower planning seems to indicate a concern for good managerial staffing procedures. They give themselves time to properly plan for staffing positions before the actual vacancy occurs.

In response to a question as to whether the company performed job analysis of executive positions, 66 per cent of the firms surveyed answered yes with 34 per cent giving a negative answer. It seems that a majority of the companies are cognizant of the changing demand of the executive role and are keeping abreast of dynamic job characteristics by the perfomance of periodic job studies. This majority action on the part of the practing firms could indicate a

trend toward being more realistic in identifying the people

who possess the necessary human characteristics to staff

the executive positions effectively.

Managerial Selection--Outside

Although a company applies a promotion from within

policy, the supply of potential managers must be replenished

at the bottom level from the outside. An extensive promotion

from within policy has the effect of pushing the vacancies

down to the bottom level of the organization. As a result,

all companies must finally go to the outside to staff these

vacancies. In practically all cases, the participating compa-

nies indicated that when they hired an individual to fill a

vacancy, he was hired with an evaluation placed on his long

range potential and not just for his initial job.

The sources from which people with managerial poten-

tial are selected is a significant factor in managerial

staffing. The participating firms were asked to list their

most widely used sources and to rank them as to their effective-

ness in providing competent, qualified people for the manage-

rial jobs to be staffed.

The data in Table 7 shows the per cent and number

of firms using the various sources of managerial supply and

their efficiency ranking. The data in Table 7 shows that

each firm was asked to list all the sources which they used

in managerial recruiting. All firms listed multiple sources

and as a result the total of the second column is expected to be more than 50 companies.

TABLE 7

SOURCES OF MANAGERIAL RECRUITS

Source	No. Using Each Source	Per Cent Using Each Source	Effectiveness of Each Source
Employee Referral	40	80	3
Public Employment Agencies	26	52	6
Private Employment Agencies	40	80	1
Advertising	34	68	5
Casual Application Unsolicited	40	80	4
College Recruitment	38	76	2
Others: Direct from other Firms	2	4	No Rank
Military	1	2	No Rank

The participating firms were asked to rank each source as to its effectiveness by ranking them one through seven with one being the most effective. The information in the fourth column was arrived at by using a system of weighted averages in order to get a consensus of the 50 firms.

As indicated in Table 7, private employment agencies are not only the most effective source but is one of the most widely used. Eighty per cent of the firms listed the private employment agency as a major source of managerial recruiting.

College recruiting ranks second in effectiveness along with the fact that 76 per cent of the firms do college recruiting. Employee referrals are used by 80 per cent of the firms and ranks third in effectiveness. Ranking last in effectiveness are public employment agencies with only 52 per cent of the firms using this source. Recruitment direct from other firms and recruitment from military veterans were listed under the other category. Each of these sources, however, is insignificant at this time. As shown in Table 7, 80 per cent of the firms use casual applications as a source which makes it a major source of managerial recruitment, however, it only ranks fourth in effectiveness.

The companies included in the study were asked to list the screening tools which were used in the managerial staffing procedure and to list them in the order in which they were given. Table 8 shows the results of this question.

The data in Table 8 shows that 100 per cent of the companies included in the survey use the application blank and the interview in the staffing procedure. Ninety eight

use the employment reference check. Only 52 per cent of the companies, however, now use tests in the staffing procedure.

TABLE 8

SCREENING DEVICES USED IN
MANAGERIAL STAFFING

Screening Devices	Number Using Each	Per Cent Using Each	Sequence in which Given
Application Blank	50	100	1
Testing	26	52	3
Interview	50	100	2
Character Reference	36	72	4
Employment Reference	49	98	4
Credit Check	30	60	4
Criminal Record Check	36	72	4
Physical Exam.	37	74	5

The criminal record check has gained as much attention as the character reference check with 72 per cent of the firms using each of these devices. Also, the physical examination still retains a high degree of importance as 74 per cent of the companies have this device in their staffing procedure.

It is interesting to note that 60 per cent of the firms include a credit check in the staffing procedure which serves as another valid technique used in checking on the character of the job applicant. The data in Table 8 shows that the employment reference check is used more extensively than the character reference check as we compare 72 per cent of the firms using character references with 98 per cent using the employment reference. The trend is toward the use of multiple reference checks.

The order in which the screening devices were given are listed in the last column of Table 8. The composite order was established by using weighted averages on the data furnished by the companies.

The application blank is given first in the managerial staffing procedure followed by the interview being given second. Testing is third for those companies which give test. All of the reference checks seem to be initiated at approximately the same time. Therefore, the employment check, the character reference check, the credit check, and the criminal record check are given fourth with the physical exam being given last.

Table 9 presents the data obtained in response to a question on the types of tests given to managerial applicants. Twenty six of the 50 firms surveyed use testing in their managerial staffing procedure as indicated in Table 8.

TABLE 9

TYPES OF TEST GIVEN IN
MANAGERIAL STAFFING

Types of Tests	Number of Firms	Per Cent of Firms
General Aptitude	5	19.2
General Mathematics	5	19.2
Verbal Usage	4	15.4
Personality	4	15.4
Learning Ability	2	7.7
General I. Q.	2	7.7
Wonderlic	2	7.7
Vocational Interest	2	7.7
General Business	2	7.7
Clerical Skills	2	7.7
OTIS Employment	1	3.8
Mental Alertness	1	3.8
California Capacity	1	3.8
Practical Judgement	1	3.8
Critical Thinking Appraisal	1	3.8
Watson-Glaser	1	3.8
Future Managerial Ability	1	3.8
School and College Ability Tests	1	3.8
Career Index Test	1	3.8
Sadler Psychological Battery	1	3.8
Sales Attitude	1	3.8

In Table 9, the number of test given by the companies surveyed will add up to more than 26 because of the fact that some companies give more than one test. The names of these tests are listed exactly as given by the responding company and no attempt was made by the researcher to determine the formal name for these tests.

In an analysis of the data in Table 9, it should be noted that there is a great variety of tests given in managerial staffing. The tests which are used most often are general aptitude with 19.2 per cent of the firms using it, general mathematics with 19.2 per cent usage, verbal usage tests with 15.4 per cent usage, and personality tests with 15.4 per cent usage. As the data shows, there are several types of tests which were only mentioned one time by a single company as being used in their testing program. In fact, eleven of the tests were only being used by a single company. Six of the tests mentioned were only being used by two companies each. In making a total analysis of the data in Table 9, it can be noted that the testing situation is extremely varied and lacks uniformity.

All 50 of the companies in the study use the interview in their managerial staffing procedure as was indicated in Table 8. Because this step in the staffing procedure is of such great significance, a further analysis of data on the interview is provided in Table 10.

TABLE 10

THE MANAGERIAL STAFFING INTERVIEW
KINDS, LENGTH, AND NUMBER

Characteristic of Interview	Number Using Each	Per Cent Using Each
1. Kind of Interview		
Guided	21	42
Unguided	29	58
2. Length of Interview		
15-30 Min.	4	8
30 Min. to 1 Hr.	15	30
1-2 Hrs.	30	60
1 day or more	1	2
3. Number of Interviews		
Two	13	26
Three	28	56
Four	8	16
Seven	1	2

The data in Table 10 is based on answers to questions relating to the kind, length, and number of interviews given in the managerial staffing procedure.

The data in Table 10 indicates that 58 per cent of the firms use the unguided interview in the staffing procedure with 42 per cent using the guided. The majority of the firms, 60 per cent, spend one to two hours in each interview with the applicant, 30 per cent spend 30 minutes to an hour, and only 8 per cent use the short interview of 15 to 30 minutes.

The data on the number of interviews conducted before the managerial applicant is hired shows that 56 per cent of the firms use three interviews in the staffing procedure, with 26 per cent using two, and 16 per cent using four. One company, however, uses seven interviews in the managerial staffing procedure. The data in Table 10 reflects a consensus of multiple interviews of one to two hours in length of an unguided nature. These multiple interviews seem to establish more effective evaluation of the applicant.

In order to fully comprehend and identify managerial staffing procedures, ideas on the desirable characteristics and qualifications of managerial applicants must be taken from the philosophy of representative firms. Several questions were asked in the interview relative to characteristics and qualifications of the managerial recruit which the companies deemed important in obtaining a "good fit" for their managerial positions. Most of the tables in the remainder of this section reflect the answers to these questions.

The data in Table 11 represents the answers given by the participating firms to a question on actual minimum education requirements for entry into each level of management. In order to get valid information on educational requirements, emphasis was placed on actual rather than preferred requirements. The data indicates that 80 per cent of the firms surveyed require a college degree

for candidates moving into top level management and 10 per cent of these firms require a graduate degree.

TABLE 11

ACTUAL EDUCATIONAL REQUIREMENT FOR
LOWER, MIDDLE, AND TOP MANAGEMENT

Educational Requirement	Number of Firms	Per Cent of Firms
1. Top Management Level		
Graduate Degree	5	10
Bachelor's Degree	35	70
College degree desirable but not required	10	20
Junior College	0	0
Technical School	0	0
High School	0	0
2. Middle Management Level		
Graduate Degree	0	0
Bachelor's Degree	34	68
College degree desirable but not required	10	20
Junior College	4	8
Technical School	0	0
High School	2	4
3. Lower Management Level		
Graduate Degree	0	0
Bachelor's Degree	16	32
College degree desirable but nor required	10	20
Junior College	4	8
Technical School	0	0
High School	20	40

In looking at the educational requirements for middle management, it can be seen that 68 per cent of the

firms in the survey require a college degree for entry into the middle management level, 8 per cent of the companies require at least junior college, and 4 per cent have a minimum requirement of a high school diploma.

In an analysis of the data for educational requirements for entry into the lower management levels, it can be determined that 40 per cent of the firms have a minimum requirement of a high school education, 32 per cent of the firms require a college degree, and 8 per cent of the firms require at least a junior college degree. It should be noted that 20 per cent of the firms responding indicated that a college degree was preferred at all levels, however, there were no actual educational requirements at any level.

Table 12 shows a tabulation of the responses to a question on degree preferences in recruiting managerial talent. These preferences were viewed relative to staffing non-technical managerial positions.

TABLE 12

DEGREE PREFERENCE IN MANAGERIAL STAFFING

Kind of Degree	Number of Firms	Per Cent of Firms
Liberal Arts	2	4
Business	36	72
Technical or Professional	7	14
Any Degree	5	10

The information in Table 12 shows that 72 per cent of the firms prefer business graduates in staffing managerial positions, 14 per cent prefer professional or technical degrees, 10 per cent will take any degree, and only 4 per cent prefer liberal arts graduate. Many of the companies supported their business degree preference with a statement to the effect that there is a tremendous amount of information which a manager needs today in human relations, decision making, and financial analysis which a business degree provides. The other schools do not give a great deal of emphasis to these areas.

The data in Table 13 represents the answers to a question relating to the desirable college level mathematical requirement for managerial applicants. These preferences were viewed relative to staffing non-technical managerial positions.

TABLE 13

DESIRABLE COLLEGE MATHEMATICS REQUIREMENT
FOR MANAGERIAL APPLICANTS

College Math Requirement	Number of Firms	Per Cent of Firms
0-3 hours of math	10	20
4-6 hours of math	20	40
7-9 hours of math	12	24
10-12 hours of math	5	10
More than 12 hours of math	3	6

The most desirable college math expectation seems to lie between four to six hours as represented by the philosophy of 40 per cent of the firms in the survey. The data in Table 13 indicates that 84 per cent of the firms believe that nine hours of college math is sufficient amount to take care of their managerial needs. It probably should be noted that 6 per cent of the firms represented feel that managerial applicants should have more than 12 hours of college mathematics.

In order to determine the desirable qualifications based on grade point averages, a question was asked relative to the amount of emphasis placed on grade points in managerial staffing. Table 14 presents the data on the emphasis the representative firms place on grade point averages in managerial staffing. An analysis of this data shows that the grade point average is considered in relationship to other variables in the academic world.

Grade point is weighted equally with other factors by 48 per cent of the firms surveyed, 16 per cent will accept a "C" if the average is higher in the major and minor. Six per cent put no great emphasis on grade point unless it is extremely low. Grade point average, however, is important to 20 per cent of the firms with another 10 per cent saying it could be important, but it would depend upon the position to be staffed.

72

TABLE 14

THE SIGNIFICANCE OF GRADE POINT AVERAGES
IN MANAGERIAL STAFFING

Amount of Emphasis On Grade Point	Number of Firms	Per Cent of Firms
No great emphasis unless extremely low.	3	6
Grade point weighted about equally with other factors, i. e., work experience, memberships, amount of self support, and desirable personality characteristics.	24	48
Will accept "C" if average higher in major & minor.	8	16
Depends on position being staffed.	5	10
Grade point average is important and prefer above "C" average.	10	20

Table 15 presents the data relative to the findings on a question pertaining to the desirable amount of computer knowledge managerial applicants should have in order to function effectively. The respondents were asked to answer the questions in terms of very little, some, and great amount. The researcher clarified the meaning of each term. None of the firms in the survey felt that managerial applicants entering into the staffing procedure should have a great amount of computer knowledge.

TABLE 15

AMOUNT OF COMPUTER KNOWLEDGE DESIRABLE
FOR MANAGERIAL APPLICANTS

Amount of Knowledge	Number of Firms	Per Cent of Firms
Great Amount	0	0
Some	20	40
Very Little	30	60

The data in Table 15 shows that 60 per cent of the companies felt that the applicants should have very little computer knowledge and 40 per cent felt that they should have some. Very little computer knowledge was interpreted to mean a general knowledge as to what the computer can do for management and be able to understand common computer terminology. Some computer knowledge was interpreted to mean the ability to understand some minor computer systems and be able to help design some simple decision making computer models. This question was asked relative to the computer knowledge requirements for management personnel in general. The respondents did state, however, that the computer knowledge for executives and personnel staffing computer departments would be of great significance.

A typical comment from the respondents relative to
computer knowledge was a statement to the effect that we
have a computer department which can handle this need for
knowledge through in-house seminars and training programs.
This preparation will meet the demands of the job more specif-
ically.

The participating firms were asked to list the most
important human characteristic or human qualities which they
looked for in applicants who were entering into the managerial
staffing procedure. Table 16 gives a composite picture of
these characteristics and qualities.

TABLE 16

IMPORTANT HUMAN CHARACTERISTICS OR
QUALITIES OF MANAGERIAL APPLICANTS

Characteristic or Quality	Number of Firms	Per Cent of Firms
Getting along with others	30	60
Communicative skill	15	30
Industry	10	20
Leadership skill	12	24
Initiative	10	20
Integrity	10	20
Honesty	8	16
Desire to work and learn	7	14
Maturity	6	12
Dependability	6	12
Ambition	6	12
Perseverance	6	12
Overall intelligence	5	10
Good appearance	5	10

Getting along with others leads the list of important human characteristics for managerial applicants as it was mentioned by most of the companies surveyed. It was mentioned by 60 per cent of the companies and was followed by communicative ability being mentioned by 30 per cent, and leadership skill by 24 per cent. Industry, initiative, and integrity were each mentioned by 20 per cent of the firms as being important. It might be significant that good appearance was mentioned by 10 per cent of the companies.

Along the same line, the companies included in the research were asked to list the greatest weaknesses found in new managerial staff members which would indicate a "poor fit" of the applicant to the job in the past. The data in Table 17 is based upon the list of weaknesses as given by the respondents.

The data in Table 17 represents those weaknesses which were mentioned by three or more companies. There were many other weaknesses not listed in the table which were only mentioned by one or two companies. However, the data in Table 17 can be viewed as being significant in light of the fact that three or more companies agree on the characteristic as being a weakness.

The most common weakness found in new managerial recruits is impatience as it was mentioned by 22 per cent of the firms in the survey. Inability to get along, and lack of ambition and motivation rank second as each were

mentioned by 18 per cent of the firms. These weaknesses could be a basis for future study and analysis in order to determine the real problem here.

TABLE 17

GREATEST WEAKNESSES IN NEW
MANAGEMENT RECRUITS

Weakness	Number of Firms	Per Cent of Firms
Impatient	11	22
Lack of ambition & motivation	9	18
Unable to get along	9	18
Lack of leadership skill	4	8
Theoretical rather than practical	8	16
Poor communication	7	14
Failure to apply themselves	7	14
Immaturity	6	12
Expectation above talent	5	10
Failure to follow instructions	3	6

There is some agreement, as could be expected, between the data presented in Table 16 and the data in Table 17. Getting along with others, communicative skill, leadership skill, and maturity are listed in Table 16 as desirable characteristics, whereas the lack of these same four characteristics are listed in Table 17 as weaknesses.

In Table 18, information was compiled from responses to a question relative to the extent of geographical coverage in seeking managers to staff positions at various levels in the organization. This identified the area of search.

TABLE 18

GEOGRAPHICAL AREA OF SEARCH IN
STAFFING MANAGERIAL POSITIONS
AT VARIOUS MANAGEMENT LEVELS

Geographical Area of Search	Number of Firms	Per Cent of Firms
1. Top Management		
Metropolitan Area	4	8
Statewide Area	6	12
Regional Area	8	16
Nationally	32	64
2. Middle Management		
Metropolitan Area	4	8
Statewide Area	6	12
Regional Area	25	50
Nationally	15	30
3. Lower Management		
Metropolitan Area	12	24
Statewide Area	13	26
Regional Area	15	30
Nationally	10	20

In staffing positions at the lower management level, with the area of vacancy serving as a base, it can be seen that companies cover all geographical areas mentioned with about the same amount of emphasis. Search in the regional area, however, has a slight edge with 30 per cent of the firms extending their search for managers throughout the region. This is followed by 26 per cent of the companies only going statewide, 24 per cent of the companies do not

go beyond the metropolitan area, and 20 per cent will extend their search nationally.

The data in Table 18 relating to search at the middle management level indicates that 50 per cent of the companies extend their search in managerial staffing to the regional area with the area of vacancy serving as a base. Thirty per cent of the firms extend their search at middle management level to the national area, 12 per cent only search state-wide, and 8 per cent restrict themselves to the metropolitan area.

The search data on staffing vacancies at the top management level shows that 64 per cent of the companies extend their search to cover the entire United States. The regional area is the boundary for 16 per cent of the firms with 12 per cent restricting themselves to the statewide area. Only 8 per cent of the firms restrict themselves to the metropolitan area.

In order to determine whether the managerial staffing procedure changed as the economy fluctuated, the companies included in the survey were asked if they changed their staffing procedures during periods of economic fluctuation. In response to this inquiry, 60 per cent of the companies indicated a significant change.

Those companies which indicated a change were asked to identify the changes that were made. The most signifi-cant changes are listed in Table 19.

TABLE 19

MANAGERIAL STAFFING VARIATIONS
DUE TO ECONOMIC FLUCTUATIONS

Economic Changes	Number of Firms	Per Cent of Firms
1. Changes in Bright Economy:		
Stockpile with more management trainees.	20	67
Greater management depth at all levels.	18	60
More aggressive recruitment.	28	93
More college recruitment.	23	77
More willing to take less qualified person.	12	40
2. Changes in a Recession:		
Seek only most qualified.	17	57
More promotion from within.	13	43
Staffing procedure strictly controlled.	26	87
Seek a more versatile applicant.	13	43
Recruiting expense limited.	21	70

The data in Table 19 is based on the responses of 30 companies out of the 50 studied. Several other comments

were made as to changes in the individual firm's staffing
procedure, however, they were not mentioned a significant
number of times to be included in the table.

An inspection of Table 19 reveals that during a
period of a bright economy 93 per cent of the companies
carry on a more aggressive recruiting campaign which might be
accounted for by the fact that 67 per cent of the firms stock-
pile with management trainees and 60 per cent of the com-
panies try to obtain management depth at all levels. The
fact that 40 per cent of the firms are more willing to take
less qualified personnel in a bright economy might indicate
the problem of handling an incompetent during a bright econ-
omy is not as great since there is more employee mobility
during this period.

An inspection of the data relating to staffing changes
made during a recessionary period reveals that 87 per cent
of the companies more strictly control their staffing proce-
dure. This change is made in order to avoid over staffing
which could trigger extensive layoffs. The data reveals
that 57 per cent of the companies feel that they can be more
highly selective in getting better qualified people. The 43
per cent which seek a more versatile employee can be account-
ed for by the fact that as jobs are eliminated in a reces-
sion a versatile employee can be placed somewhere else in
the firm without triggering a layoff. Also, 43 per cent of
the firms practice a more extensive promotion from within

policy during a recession in order to get better utiliza-
tion out of the present staff, therefore, avoid the problem
of adding more people from the outside to the payroll.

In order to determine the most sensitive managerial
areas in relationship to a drop in the economy, the respon-
dents were asked to indicate the functional areas which suffer
a reduction in managerial personnel first as a result of a
severe recession. The information in Table 20 represents
a compilation of the information received on this subject.

TABLE 20

AN IDENTIFICATION OF SENSITIVE AREAS
OF MANAGERIAL STAFFING IN A
SEVERE RECESSION

Functional Area	Number of Firms	Per Cent of Firms
Operations and Production	16	32
Finance	3	6
Sales	11	22
Personnel Department	10	20
Management Trainees and Indirect Labor	5	10
Recession has no effect on any area.	5	10

A study of the data in Table 20 shows operations and
production as being the area which is most sensitive to a
severe recession by experiencing a reduction in managerial
personnel. This fact was mentioned by 32 per cent of the compa-
nies surveyed. Also, it should be noted, at this point,

that managerial staffing would certainly be less in the area
of operations and production than any other area. Sales
seems to be the second most sensitive area with 22 per cent
of the firms mentioning this as a sensitive area. The sales
department is followed by the personnel department with
20 per cent of the firms indicating it as a sensitive area.

The finance area seems to be the least affected
function during recessionary times. Only 6 per cent of the
firms mentioned finance as a crucial area. It seems that
managerial staffing would be more likely to continue in
finance during a period of severe recession.

Ten per cent of the companies stated that their
operations were of such a nature that a severe recession
had no effect on personnel in any area. This can be explain-
ed by the fact that hospitals and some food chains, which
were included in this survey, operate with maximum personnel
during a recession. Their products and services are necessi-
ties and do not necessarily fluctuate with the economy. The
management trainee and indirect labor areas show some sen-
sitivity to a recession by being mentioned by 10 per cent
of the firms.

Managerial Staffing and Training
from Within

Most companies included in this study practice pro-
motion from within. After a managerial candidate is hired
from the outside, as a general rule, he will participate in

some kind of training program and will have an opportunity
to move into a managerial position at a higher level. One
major purpose of college recruiting is to ensure the company
of a supply of managers in the future and usually one recruit-
ed from college starts his managerial training immediately.

In order to determine the functional areas which are
the most preferred entry occupations into management, the
participating firms were asked to identify the preferred
entry occupational areas. The results are summarized in
Table 21.

TABLE 21

PREFERRED OCCUPATIONS FOR
ENTRY INTO MANAGEMENT

Occupational Area	Number of Firms	Per Cent of Firms
Operations and Production	22	44
Finance	9	18
Sales and Advertising	13	26
Legal	1	2
Personnel	5	10

An analysis of the data in Table 21 indicates that
44 per cent of the firms feel that operations and production
offer the best opportunity for promotion into management. A
further analysis of the choices by the firms show 26 per cent
for sales and advertising, 18 per cent for finance, 10 per

cent for personnel, and only 2 per cent for the legal depart-
ment. Looking at the data from the standpoint of combina-
tions, it can be seen that 70 per cent of the companies
polled believe the best entry occupations into management
are operations and production, and sales and advertising.

In order to determine the techniques used in staffing
managerial positions from within, the companies in the survey
were asked to identify the procedure they used. Table 22
presents the data based on the returns from this inquiry.

TABLE 22

PROMOTION FROM WITHIN TECHNIQUES

Technique	Number of Firms	Per Cent of Firms
Formal Merit Appraisal	49	98
Recommendations of immediate superior	49	98
Recommendation of others:		
Upper level executives	10	20
Other department heads	6	12
Personnel department	7	14
Past supervisors	3	6

As may be seen from Table 22, 98 per cent of the firms
use formal merit appraisal and recommendations of immediate
superiors as steps in their promotion from within policy.
Fifty two per cent of the companies require recommendations
from others which include 20 per cent from upper level

executives, 12 per cent from other department heads, 14 per cent from the personnel department, and 6 per cent from past superiors.

In response to a question as to whether the company had a management training program, 86 per cent of the companies answered in the affirmative. Table 23 shows the length of time planned for these training programs.

TABLE 23

TIME VARIATIONS IN MANAGEMENT
TRAINING PROGRAMS

Length of Time	Number of Firms	Per Cent of Firms
Varies 1--3 Months	2	4.5
Varies 6--9 Months	4	9.0
Varies 8-18 Months	4	9.0
Varies 2--5 Years	3	6.7
Varies according to position	5	12.4
Continuous	5	12.4
One Year	11	25.4
Two Years	8	18.6
Three Years	1	2.3

In taking a conceptual look at the data presented in Table 23, it can be stated that the companies offer variable and flexible training programs which are probably tailored to fit their specific needs at the time. This is indicated by the fact that 42 per cent of the companies offer some kind of a variable time length program.

The one year training program, however, leads the group with 25 per cent of the companies having this time plan. The two year program is next with 19 per cent usage. It is noteworthy that 12 per cent of the companies have a continuous training program.

The training techniques used by firms included in this study will give a good indication as to the devices they deem necessary in obtaining meaningful experiences for their managerial candidates. The companies included in this study were asked to list the techniques currently used in their management training programs and to rank them according to their effectiveness. This information is presented in Table 24. The 43 companies listed in Table 24 represent 86 per cent of the total sample of 50 which stated they conducted a training program.

On-the-job training was listed as a training technique used by all of the companies. It was also listed as being first in effectiveness. Job rotation was used by 76.4 per cent of the companies and was ranked second in effectiveness. "Assistant To" positions with 79.1 per cent usage and on-the-job coaching and counseling with 76.4 per cent usage were ranked third and fourth respectively. It should be noted that the tuition refund and outside company programs are widely used by the companies which have training programs but they rank sixth and seventh in effectiveness.

TABLE 24

MANAGERIAL TRAINING TECHNIQUES CURRENTLY USED
AND THEIR EFFECTIVENESS

Training Technique	Number of Firms	Per Cent of Firms	Effectiveness
Job Rotation	33	76.4	2
On-the-job Training	43	100.	1
"Assistant to" positions	34	79.1	3
Multiple Management, Jr. Board, etc.	4	8.8	8
On-the-job Coaching & Counseling	33	76.4	4
In-company Seminars and Classes	36	82.7	5
Tuition Refund Programs	30	69.3	6
Outside Company: Short Courses & Seminars	22	51.1	7

An analysis of the data in Table 24 will show that the training techniques which are ranked as being most effective are all in-company devices. This could be accounted for by the fact that they are specifically designed to meet the needs of the managerial candidate and the particular company. The tuition refund and outside company programs are more general in nature and do not closely relate to specific company objectives.

The academic content in training programs conducted by representative firms in this study should present an overview of the human qualities and characteristics which need

to be strengthened in order to get a better fit of the in-

dividual to the job. The participating firms were asked to

list the academic content in their management training

programs and to rank them according to effectiveness. The

results are shown in Table 25.

TABLE 25

SUBJECT MATTER CONTENT USED IN
MANAGERIAL TRAINING PROGRAMS

Subject Matter	Number of Firms	Per Cent of Firms	Effectiveness
Fundamentals of Management	34	79	1
Personnel Management	32	74.4	6
Human Relations	40	93	2
Motivation	36	82.7	4
Community Relations	21	48.8	7
Communications	39	90.7	3
Problem Solving and Decision Making:			5
Quantitative	14	38	
Non-quantitative	25	69.4	
Computer Usage	7	19.4	

It may be observed in Table 25 that 93 per cent of

the companies which have training programs include human

relations and 90.7 per cent include communications. These

two subjects rank second and third respectively in effective-

ness. A factor of consistency can be noted here in that

data in Table 16 on important human characteristics and

Table 17 which lists weaknesses of new management recruits

both include good human relations and communications as being important characteristics.

Fundamentals of management, however, leads the list in effectiveness with 79 per cent of the firms using this subject in their program. It is interesting to note that community relations has become a part of managerial training programs with 48.8 per cent of the firms offering this subject to their management people although it ranks only seventh in effectiveness.

It should be noted that many of the companies include problem solving and decision making as an integral part of management training. This data was broken down into quantitative, non-quantitative, and computer usage decision making techniques. Several of the firms used more than one decision making technique in their training programs. Most of the firms used the nonquantitative approach.

The techniques used to encourage employees to participate in managerial training programs which will enable the employee to be more effective in managerial positions is a significant factor. In order to identify these motivational and communicative techniques, the companies in the study were asked to list all the activities which they used in providing an opportunity for managerial candidates to develop themselves.

Table 26 presents the data which was gathered on this subject. The information in Table 26 is based on a

compilation of the information gathered from the 43 companies which offered training programs for their employees. Seven of the companies in this study did not offer training programs.

TABLE 26

MOTIVATIONAL, PROMOTIONAL, AND COMMUNICATIVE
TECHNIQUES USED IN OBTAINING EMPLOYEE
PARTICIPATION IN MANAGERIAL
TRAINING ACTIVITIES

Technique Used	Number of Firms	Per Cent of Firms
Employee review performed periodically to evaluate personal development.	39	90.7
Tuition Refund Program	30	69.3
Publicize training activities in company newspapers, in departmental meeting, on company bulletin boards, and other media.	26	60.4
Additional qualifications acquired by employee noted in personnel records.	34	79.0
Pay employees for time spent in training programs.	22	51.1
Participation in training activities a basic factor in considering employees for promotion.	27	62.7
A definite policy on promotion of employees who have completed certain training programs.	11	25.5

Of the 43 responses recorded in Table 26, 90.7 per cent performed merit appraisal periodically to evaluate personal development along with 79 per cent entering additional qualifications in personnel records, and 69.3 per cent having a tuition refund program. It can be noted that 60.4 per cent of the companies publicize their training activities along with 62.7 per cent of the companies making training activities a basic factor in promotion. In taking a conceptual look at the data in Table 26, it may be concluded that 86 per cent of the companies included in this study which have managerial training programs, have a positive promotion of the activities.

Managerial Staffing and the Future

The managerial staffing procedure cannot remain static. It must be constantly studied, evaluated, and changed to meet new demands of the job and at the same time be synchronized with external conditions of the company, i. e., economy, competition, governmental controls and fiscal action, and new technological advances.

The companies in this study were asked to state what courses and/or emphasis colleges and universities should offer to enable their company to recruit more effective managers in the future. Table 27 gives a presentation of the data based on these suggestions.

The recommendations presented in Table 27 include only those which were mentioned three or more times and were

deemed to be significant. There were several recommenda-
tions which were only mentioned once and were not included.
Each firm could make more than one recommendation and as
a result the totals will equal more than 50 firms and 100
per cent.

TABLE 27

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR PREPARATION
OF MORE EFFECTIVE MANAGERS
FOR THE FUTURE

Recommendation for Greater Emphasis	Number of Firms	Per Cent of Firms
Human Relations	15	30
Communications	14	28
Motivation	12	24
Decision Making	10	20
Realistic experiences, i. e., speaker, tours, clubs, business games, case studies, etc.	6	12
Creativity	5	10
Economics	3	6
Community Relations	5	10
Use of the computer	3	6
Supervisory Techniques	4	8
Management by the objectives	3	6
Psychology & Sociology	4	8

An analysis of the data in Table 27. indicates that
human relations, communications, and motivation will continue
to have a greater emphasis in the managerial role of the
future. Decision making was mentioned by 20 per cent of the
companies as needing greater emphasis. Problems of the

future will be more complex and will demand new innovative and creative approaches in their solution.

An overview of the data in Table 27 will give an indication of the most important qualities and characteristics which a manager of the future must have as seen by 50 companies. Increased emphasis in these areas will enable the new manager of tomorrow to perform his role more efficiently.

In answer to a question on managerial manpower shortages for particular areas within the next five to ten years, 25 per cent of the firms surveyed indicated that there would be a shortage and mentioned shortages in the following areas: (1) retail store managers, (2) foremen, (3) middle management, (4) merchandising, (5) accounting, and (6) quantitative areas.

The companies in the survey were asked to list new trends and changes that would be initiated into their managerial staffing procedures in the future. The following trends and changes were mentioned: (1) more flexibility in staffing, (2) more emphasis on what candidate "will do" instead of "can do", (3) putting personnel inventory on computer, (4) more formalized training programs, (5) maintenance of management assessment center for promotion from within, (6) more emphasis on human relations, (7) more effective management manpower planning, (8) more job enrichment, (9) make staffing procedure more in tune with the times, and (10) more emphasis on education.

Summary

The purpose of this chapter was to present and to analyze the findings gained from interviews with 50 personnel executives. The personnel executives represented 50 selected companies as they reported their philosophies and practices on managerial staffing procedures.

The data-collecting instrument provided the basis for the outline and format of the chapter. Information was presented in four specific areas. In the first part of the chapter, data were presented on the company personnel department which included information on the number and titles of personnel specialist in the organization along with the duties and responsibilities of each personnel department in managerial staffing.

Results were presented in the second part of the chapter on managerial selection from the outside which included data on sources of managerial personnel and screening devices. The findings were followed by a presentation of information relative to human specifications for managerial jobs which included education requirements, degree preferences, math requirements, and personality and work performance characteristics.

In the third section of this chapter, information was presented on managerial staffing and training from within. Findings were presented on training techniques and the content of managerial training programs. Also, information was presented

on the steps used to motivate, promote, and publicize train-
ing activities to encourage prospective managerial candidates
to participate in managerial training programs.

The fourth section of this chapter presented data
on managerial staffing and the future. The data in this
section presented information on recommended areas for great-
er emphasis in training future managers. In the last part
of this chapter, new trends and probable changes were identi-
fied which may be significant in future managerial staffing
procedures.

CHAPTER 5

SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The objective of this chapter is to give a summary
of the major findings of the study, to state conclusions
based on the findings presented in Chapter 4, and to give
recommendations for needed changes and additional research.
These conclusion and recommendations are based on an objective
analysis of the data.

Summary

The problem of this study was to determine how select-
ed industries in the Oklahoma City area staffed their managerial
positions. The staffing procedures used as a basis for this
study were representative of the staffing activities in the
research area.

The first major step in this study was to make an
extensive analysis of recent literature in the field for the
purpose of acquiring pertinent information. This information
served as a basis for the formulation of a valid data-collecting
instrument which could be used to gain significant data on
managerial staffing procedures.

The second major step was the formulation of a valid
interview guide to be used as a data-collecting instrument

96

in gathering information on managerial staffing. The inter-
view guide was submitted to a jury of qualified judges for
evaluation. The jury was composed of college professors and
business executives who were knowledgeable on the subject of
staffing. After this evaluation, modifications were made and
the guide was used in five pilot interviews in the Spring
of 1971. The pilot interviews served as a basis to improve and
refine the guide to be used in its final form.

The third major step involved the selection of 50
companies to be included in the study. These companies were
representative of selected categories of industries in the
Oklahoma City area.

The fourth major step was to establish an interview
schedule with 50 personnel executives from the representative
companies who were in positions of authority and responsibil-
ity. In the interview process, valuable information was
gathered on managerial staffing and provisions were made for
the anonymity of the companies included in the study. The
final step was the presentation, analysis, and interpretation
of the data.

In this study, no attempt was made to evaluate the
effectiveness of the managerial staffing procedure in the
various firms. It was not the purpose of this study to explore
the reasons why the various organizations use certain managerial
staffing procedures. The purpose of this study was to identify
and to analyze the procedures used by these industries in
staffing managerial positions.

The findings in this study indicate that the person-
nel department is an important staff function in the organi-
zational structure. All of the companies included in the
study had a personnel director along with many of them having
additional staff executives such as a training director,
employment manager, and a wage and salary analyst.

The personnel executive in most of the companies
in this study had an important, prestigeous title such as
"manager" or "director of personnel". A large group of personnel
executives had the title of vice president of industrial
relations. In most firms, the personnel department is located
at top level management which has a great deal of significance.
Companies are now recognizing the importance of good utiliza-
tion of labor and are giving these duties to a well trained
and educated specialist with top level operational status.

The personnel department is the center of most of the
managerial staffing activity according to the organizations
included in this study. Eighty-four per cent of the firms
reported that their personnel department had total managerial
staffing responsibility up to certain levels in the organization
except for the final hiring decision. All of the firms sur-
veyed indicated some responsibility for managerial staffing
was located in the personnel department. Thus, the identity
of the managerial staffing procedure lies within the activities
of the personnel department.

The first basic step in managerial staffing is
managerial manpower planning. This is indicated by 86 per

cent of the firms in this study. The planning is done on
the middle management level and up by 59.9 per cent of the
companies. The managerial needs are projected ahead for
five or more years. This gives basic lead time to enable
companies to do effective planning in staffing managerial
positions.

Another basic action which parallels managerial
manpower planning is job analysis. A majority of the firms
perform job analysis on managerial positions. Manpower plan-
ning along with job analysis of executive positions form a
solid basis from which to operate the other steps in the
procedure.

Upon the basis of an initiation of manpower needs
by manpower planning or upon the receipt of a managerial
requisition created by an immediate vacancy, the personnel
department moves into step two of managerial staffing. This
step involves the utilization of the sources of managerial
personnel. The companies used several sources to recruit
managerial candidates; however, there were four major sources
and they are numbered consecutively according to their ability
to provide an adequate supply of well qualified managerial
recruits as follows: (1) private employment agencies, (2) col-
lege recruitment, (3) employee referrals, and (4) casual
applications.

After utlizing the sources of managerial supply, the
companies move into the next series of steps called screen-
ing devices. The sequence of the steps in the screening
devices is based on the majority view using the sequence

as given by the companies in the study. All of the companies listed the screening devices in the sequence in which they were given.

The application blank is the third step in the managerial staffing procedure which probably will not be of the weighted type. Only 14 per cent of the firms used a weighted application blank.

The interview is the fourth step in the managerial staffing procedure. The majority of the companies conduct three interviews. The interviews range from one to two hours in length, and are unguided.

Testing is step five for those companies giving tests, however, many companies indicated they are no longer giving tests. The data in this study shows that only one-half of the companies are now using tests.

The next step in the managerial staffing procedure is the reference checks. The character reference, the employment reference, the credit check, and the criminal record check are all used extensively. However, the employment reference check is the most widely used. The reference check is followed by the physical examination which is given by 74 per cent of the firms surveyed and it is the last step in staffing.

The screening devices used in managerial staffing revolve around the significant characteristics and human specifications which are deemed to be important in the

managerial candidate. The human specifications which were identified as being important factors in managerial staffing included a college degree for all levels of management with the exception of the bottom level. Even at the bottom level, several companies required a college degree. It was desirable for a candidate to have a degree in business with four to six hours of mathematics and some computer knowledge. His grade point average was weighted in with other factors such as work experience and amount of self support.

The most desirable human qualities were found to be ability to get along with others, communicative skill, and leadership ability. The weaknesses which were most significant in new managerial candidates were found to be impatience, inability to get along, and poor communicative skill.

Promotion from within offers a supplement to the managerial staffing procedure which is used for hiring outside the company. After going through the staffing procedure designed for hiring from the outside, the managerial candidate is caught up again with internal staffing procedures. The staffing procedure from within starts with the source. The most important sources of managerial candidates from within the company were identified as operations and production, sales and advertising, and finance.

The techniques used to identify and screen these candidates were identified as formal merit appraisal and

recommendations of immediate superiors. Also, recommendations from upper level executives, other department heads, and the personnel department were used as supplementary techniques.

Training programs were major factors in staffing managerial positions from within. Eighty-six per cent of the companies in the study conducted managerial training programs. The training programs varied in length from one month to three years with five companies offering a continuous program.

Various techniques were used to encourage qualified employees to participate in the training programs. The most widely used techniques were employee reviews to evaluate personal development and entering into personnel records additional acquired qualifications gained through training.

The most widely used and effective training techniques in managerial staffing were on-the-job training, job rotation, and "assistant to" positions. In-company seminars and tuition refund programs were used extensively, however, their effectiveness was less than other major techniques.

The course content of the training programs was identified and its effectiveness noted. The course content presents an overview of the human qualities and characteristics which the companies wish to strengthen in order to better prepare the manager for his job. The major subject matter areas are listed as follows according to their effectiveness: (1) Fundamentals of Management, (2) Human Relations, (3) Communications, and (4) Motivation.

A majority of the companies extended their managerial staffing procedures nationally for top management recruits, however, for middle management greater emphasis was found in the regional area. At the lower management levels, the managerial staffing procedure seemed to extend into all geographical areas with about the same amount of emphasis.

The managerial staffing procedure is affected by fluctuations in the economy. The most significant staffing change in a bright economy was that of being more aggressive in recruitment with college recruitment increasing. The most notable change in the staffing procedure during a recession was a more strictly controlled procedure with a severely limited recruiting expense.

The relationship of functional areas to managerial staffing during fluctuations in the economy was established through an identification of sensitive areas. The sensitive areas were those areas which laid off managerial personnel first as a result of a severe recession. The most sensitive areas were identified as operations and production, and sales. Finance was found to be the most stable.

The managerial role demands which will probably increase in the future were identified in this study. The major emphases will be on human relations, communications, and motivation. Therefore, companies in the future will put more emphasis through their managerial staffing procedures on these important characteristics.

The findings indicate, in this study, that many of the companies will initiate some changes in their managerial staffing procedures in the future. The procedure will become more flexible, and will be more synchronized with the times. The staffing procedure will select candidates from personnel inventories on computers and management assessment centers. There will be more manpower planning, more formalized training, and more emphasis on education.

Conclusions

The objective of this study was to determine how selected industries in the Oklahoma City area staffed their managerial positions. The purpose of this study was to identify and to analyze the procedures used by these industries in staffing managerial positions in order to reach conclusions which may be helpful in understanding the nature of managerial staffing. In solving this problem, several conclusions were derived from the major findings. These conclusions are confined within the limitations of this investigation and are presented as follows:

1. The steps in the managerial staffing procedure have been identified as managerial manpower planning, managerial job analysis, determination of vacancy, source of supply, and the screening devices which are application blank, interviews, optional testing, references, and the physical examination.

2. The steps in the managerial staffing procedure are supplemented by the promotion from within procedural

steps. These steps are a source of internal supply, employee evaluative techniques, and training programs.

3. The personnel department has the major responsibility for managerial staffing and in most cases it occupies a place of significance in the organizational structure by having top management status.

4. The public employment agencies play a minor role as a source of managerial personnel in use and effectiveness.

5. Testing is the least used managerial screening device in the managerial staffing procedure. There is a great variety of tests being given which indicates a lack of uniformity among companies using tests.

6. The application blank and the interview are the most widely used screening devices in the managerial staffing procedure. Most companies use multiple interviews of one to two hours in length of an unguided nature.

7. Business degrees are preferred over liberal arts, technical, and professional degrees in staffing managerial positions.

8. The geographical area of search covered in managerial staffing is quite extensive at all levels of management. Companies are quite willing to extend the search to regional and national sources in staffing positions.

9. A college degree is a significant requirement for entry into middle and top management.

10. Managerial training programs are used quite extensively with an indication that they will continue to grow in importance.

11. Motivational, promotional, and communicative techniques are used extensively in order to encourage employees to participate in managerial training programs.

12. Good communicative ability and the ability to get along with others are the most desirable human characteristics sought in managerial applicants. These two characteristics appear in three important tables which were derived from information given by the respondents in this study.

13. Managerial staffing procedures are sensitive to economic conditions with significant changes being noted as the economy fluctuates.

14. The managerial jobs in the finance functions of the company are the most stable during a recession.

15. Operation and production areas are the most sensitive functions of the company during an economic recession by showing a greater loss of managerial jobs.

16. A shortage of foremen, retail store managers, merchandising managers, accounting executives, and quantitative area managers will be evident in the future.

17. The most preferred entry occupations for employees moving into management from within the company are the operations and production occupational areas.

Implications of the Conclusions

Several implications can be drawn from an evaluation and analysis of the conclusions. Some of the implications that appear pertinent are as follows:

1. There is consistency in the application of managerial staffing procedures among companies. This consistency provides an opportunity for an identification and analysis of the various techniques used in staffing.

2. Good human relations not only occupies a place of importance in today's organizations but will continue to receive greater emphasis in the future. Companies are begining to realize that the human element is a great asset to the firm and needs to be cultivated.

3. Companies are investing a large amount of time and money in training programs in order to enable their employees to become more productive. This training emphasis on the part of the company could indicate a philosophy toward employees of enabling each to develop to his maximum ability. The employee may receive a more interesting and challenging job as a result of his training and the company may receive higher productivity.

4. The importance given to the personnel department and its activities could indicate a desire on the part of the companies in this study to give specialized attention to the human problems which may arise in the organization. This

department can give specialized attention to obtaining good

utilization of labor and provide assistance to the line

managers in maintaining good morale among the employees.

5. One who wishes to go into management should have

a college degree with a major in business. His opportunity

for entry into management is not limited to the local demand

as companies are quite willing to recruit on a regional and

national geographical basis.

6. The job opportunities in management in the future

will be great. The companies in this study indicated that

there will be a shortage of managers in several functional

areas.

7. The strong emphasis on good communicative ability

as a necessity for good managers emplies the need for all

those who are concerned with the training and education of

managers to provide every opportunity for the trainee to

develope his communicative ability.

8. The managerial staffing procedures fluctuate with

the changes in the economy. This would indicate that the

staffing procedures are flexible and can enable the company

to adapt to different economic conditions.

Recommendations

The recommendations of this study constitute sug-

gestions which might be helpful in acquiring a better under-

standing of the management process.

1. It is recommended that a study be made of public employment agencies in order to determine why they have become so ineffective as a source of managerial candidates.

2. It is recommended that studies be made relative to testing in the managerial staffing procedure in order to establish guidelines and practices for more effective testing.

3. It is recommended that in depth studies be made on a continuing basis so that new training techniques may be discovered, evaluated, and utilized.

4. It is recommended that more emphasis be placed on human relations, communications, and motivation in the academic environment in order to better meet the needs of industry.

5. It is recommended that the character reference be given less emphasis in managerial staffing as they have become somewhat ineffective and have to be supported by other reference checks.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Books

Beach, Dale S. Personnel. Second edition. New York:
    The Macmillan Company, 1970.

Best, John W. Research in Education. Second edition.
    Englewood Cliffs: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1970.

Calhoon, Richard P. Personnel Management and Supervision.
    New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1967.

Flippo, Edwin B. Principles of Personnel Management. Third
    edition. New York: McGraw-Hill, 1971.

French, Wendell. The Personnel Process. Second edition.
    Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1970.

Haimann, Theo. Professional Management. Boston: Houghton
    Mifflin Company, 1962.

Harrell, Thomas. Manager's Performance and Personality.
    Cincinnati: South-Western Publishing Co., 1961.

Jucius, Michael J. Personnel Management. Seventh edition.
    Homewood: Richard D. Irwin, Inc., 1971.

Koontz, Harold, and O'Donnell, Cyril. Principles of Manage-
    ment. New York: McGraw-Hill, 1968.

Longenecker, Justin G. Principles of Management and Organi-
    zational Behavior. Columbus: Charles E. Merrill
    Publishing Co., 1969.

McFarland, Dalton E. MANAGEMENT: Principles and Practices.
    New York: The Macmillan Company, 1970.

Pigors, Paul, and Myers, Charles. Personnel Administration.
    Fifth edition. New York: McGraw-Hill, 1965.

Scheer, Wilbert E. The Dartnell Personnel Director's Hand-
    book. Chicago: Dartnell Corporation, 1970.

Shuman, Ronald B. The Management of Men. Norman: University
    of Oklahoma Press, 1948.

110

Terry, George R. Principles of Management. Homewood: Richard D. Irwin, Inc., 1964.

Wortman, Max S., Jr. Creative Personnel Management. Boston: Allyn and Bacon, Inc., 1969.

Articles and Periodicals

Ash, S. "Forming Impressions of Personality," Journal of Abnormal and Social Psychology, XLI (1946), 258-290.

Carlson, Robert E. "Selection Interview Decisions: The Effect of Interviewer Experience Relative Quota Situation, and Applicant Sample on Interviewer Decision," Personnel Psychology, XX, No. 3 (Autumn, 1967), 259-279.

Chowdhry, Kamla. "Selection of Executives and Administrator: Implications of Recent Research," Personnel Journal, XLVIII, No. 2 (February, 1969), 102-107.

Dhir, Krishna. "The Problem of Motivation in Management Development," Personnel Journal, XLIX, No. 10 (October, 1970), 837-842.

Didato, Salvatore V. "Some Reminders About Selecting Good Managers," Personnel Journal, XLIX, No. 6 (June, 1970), 489-491.

Dunnette, M. D., and Bass, B. M. "Behavioral Scientist and Personnel Management," Industrial Relations, II (1963), 115-130.

Dunnette, M. D., and Maetzold, James. "Use of a Weighted Application Blank in Hiring Seasonal Employees," Journal of Applied Psychology, XXXIX, No. 5 (October, 1955), 308-310.

Elliott, Osborn. "Headhunters by any other Name," Newsweek, (January, 1966), 44-66.

Foreman, Wayne J. "Management Training in Large Corporations," Training and Development Journal, XXI, No. 5 (May, 1967), 11-17.

Greenlaw, Paul S., and Smith, Robert D. "Manpower Planning Models," Personnel Management, (1970), 85-90.

Guion, Robert M., and Gottier, Richard F. "Validity of Personality Measures in Personnel Selection," Personnel Psychology, XVIII, No. 2 (Summer, 1965) 135-160.

Hinrichs, J. R. "Technical Selection: How to Improve Your Batting Average," Personnel, XXXVII (March, 1960), 56-60.

Life Insurance Agency Management Association. "Career Guidance in the Life Insurance Industry," Personnel Psychology, XXI, No. 1 (1968), 1-21.

Lotz, James R., Jr. "The What, Why, When and How of Executive Recruiting Today," Personnel Journal, XLVIII, No. 7 (July, 1969), 508-512.

Mandell, Milton M. "How to Pick Better Front-Line Managers," Readings in Organization and Management. New York: Holt, Rinehart & Winston, 1963.

Mayfield, E. C. "The Selection Interview: A Re-evaluation of Published Research," Personnel Psychology, XVII (1964), 239-260.

Nordlie, David A. "The Competent Trainer," Training and Development Journal, XXI, No. 5 (May, 1967), 51-54.

Oklahoma Times, May 13, 1971.

Parry, Mary Ellen. "Ability of Psychologist to Estimate Validities of Personnel Tests," Personnel Psychology, XXI, No. 2 (Summer, 1968), 139-147.

Sparks, Charles P. "Validity of Psychological Tests," Personnel Psychology, XXIII, No. 1 (Spring, 1970), 39-46.

Spitzer, Morton Edward, and McNamara, Walter J. "A Managerial Selection Study," Personnel Psychology, XVII, No. 1 (Spring, 1964), 19-40.

Spriegel, W. R., and Dale, A. G. "Trends in Personnel Selection and Induction," Personnel, XXX (1953), 166-175.

Strauss, George. "Organization Man--Prospect for the Future," Readings in Organizational Theory. Boston: Allyn and Bacon, Inc., 1966.

Thomas, William C. "Image of the Personnel Department," Personnel Administration, XXXII, No. 3 (May-June, 1969), 36-39.

Wade, Marilyn. "Personnel Research," Personnel Journal, XLVIII, No. 2 (February, 1969), 145.

Wall Street Journal. January 24, 1966.

Webster, E. C. "Decision Making in the Employment Interview," Personnel Administration, XXII (1959), 15-22.

Wentworth, P. "How to Improve Employment Interviews," Personnel Journal, XXXII (1953), 46-49.

Witkin, Arthur A. "Executive Selection: Short Cuts That Short Circuit--A Psychologist's Reply," Personnel Journal, XLVIII, No. 2 (February, 1969), 140.

Wright, Orman R. "Summary of Research on The Selection Interview Since 1964," Personnel Psychology, XXI, No. 1 (Winter, 1969), 391-409.

Booklets and Pamphlets

Mandell, Milton. "The Employment Interview," A.M.A. Research Study, No. 47, 1961.

National Industrial Conference Board, "Employment of the College Graduate," Studies in Personnel Policy, No. 152, 1956.

Bureau of National Affairs, "Supervisory Development, Part I," Personnel Policies Forum, Survey No. 31, July, 1955.

National Industrial Conference Board, Personnel Practices in Factory and Office: Manufacturing, Studies in Personnel Policy, No. 194. New York: 1964.

Robertson, D. Personnel Testing Practices in Wisconsin Industry, The University of Wisconsin, 1965.

Spriegel, William R., Beishline, John R., and Dale, Alfred G. Personnel Practices in Industry. Austin: The University of Texas, Bureau of Business Research, 1958. Personnel Study No. 8, Revised.

APPENDIX

INTERVIEW GUIDE

SURVEY OF MANAGERIAL STAFFING PROCEDURES

USED BY SELECTED INDUSTRIES

IN THE OKLAHOMA CITY AREA

General Instructions

This is a research project to determine and identify
the procedures used in staffing managerial positions by
selected firms from specified industries in the Oklahoma
City area. The information about your company in this re-
search will be held in strict confidence. Neither you nor
your firm will be identified in any report or publication.

On this and the following pages are a number of items
dealing with staffing managerial positions. Please respond
to each item as completely as possible. Since this is a
survey of a select group, the value of the project is dependent
upon the receipt of complete responses from each firm.

CONFIDENTIAL

Section I--General Information

A. Company Name_____

B. Address_____

C. Number of full-time employees_____

D. The main function of this organization:

      Manufacturing_____

      Service   _____

      Wholesale   _____

Retail   _____

Financial   _____

Other (Please specify) _____

Section II--Company Personnel Department

A. Please list the personnel specialists both full and part-time which are employed by your firm. (List by title)

_____

_____

_____

_____

B. Please indicate the title of the highest personnel officer in your company.

_____

_____

_____

C. Please give a general statement about the amount of responsibility which your personnel department has in staffing managerial positions.

_____

_____

_____

_____

D. Does your company have a managerial manpower planning program for projecting future managerial needs? Yes____ , No____. If yes, at what levels are these plans made?

    1. Top Management Level   _____
    2. Middle Management Level _____
    3. Lower Management Level   _____

E. If your answer to "D" above was yes, please indicate
    how far into the future your managerial manpower planning
    needs are projected.

    1. One year   _____
    2. Two years   _____
    3. Three years   _____
    4. Four years   _____
    5. Five or more years _____

F. Does your company perform a job analysis of executive
    positions so that the information may be used as a basis
    for managerial staffing? Yes____, No____.

G. Please classify the top personnel specialist as to his
    vertical location in the organizational structure.

    1. Top Management Level   _____
    2. Middle Management Level   _____
    3. Lower Management Level   _____

Section III--Managerial Selection--Outside

A. In hiring supervisory and managerial personnel from
    outside, the following sources are used:
    (Please rank according to effectiveness from 1-7)

	Source		Effectiveness of Each Source
1.	Employee referrals	____	_____
2.	Public Employment Agencies	____	_____
3.	Private Employment Agencies	____	_____
4.	Advertising	____	_____
5.	Casual Applications (Unsolicited)	____	_____
6.	College Recruitment	____	_____
7.	Other_____		_____

B. In hiring managerial personnel from the outside, please
    indicate the screening devices which are used and the
    order in which they are given.

    Screening Device

    1. Application blank   _____
            Weighted   ____
            Not Weighted   ____
    2. Testing   _____

3. Interview   _____
4. Character reference _____
5. Employment reference _____
6. Criminal record check _____
7. Credit check   _____
8. Physical exam   _____

If tests are given, please indicate the types of tests.
1._____, 2._____, 3._____.

Please indicate the number of interviews used in the
recruiting process_____.

What is the average amount of time spent on each inter-
view?_____

Please indicate the kind of interviews used_____

C. Please indicate the actual educational requirement for
    various levels of management by checking the proper
    requirement for each level.

	Top Mgmt.	Middle Mgmt.	Lower Mgmt.
Graduate Degree			
Bachelor's Degree			
Junior College			
Technical School			
High School			

D. In recruiting managerial talent, please indicate the
    degree preference by checking the proper classification
    listed below:

    1. Liberal Arts   _____
    2. Business   _____
    3. Technical   _____

E. Please indicate the desirable college level mathematical
    requirement for prospective managers whom you recruit
    by checking the proper listing below:

    1. 0-3 hours of math   _____
    2. 4-6 hours of math   _____
    3. 7-9 hours of math   _____

4. 10-12 hours of math   _____
5. More than 12 hours   _____

F. How much emphasis is placed on grade point average when
    hiring new propsective management people from colleges
    and universities? Please comment below:

    _____

    _____

    _____

G. Please indicate the desirable amount of computer knowledge
    required for prospective managers whom you recruit by
    checking the proper listing below:

        1. Great Amount   _____
        2. Some   _____
        3. Very Little   _____

    Please comment on these requirements: _____

    _____

    _____

    _____

H. Please check below the geographical area covered in
    recruiting managerial talent for the various levels of
    management:

	Lower Mgmt.	Middle Mgmt.	Top Mgmt.
1. Metropolitan			
2. Statewide			
3. Regional			
4. Nationally			

I. Does the company management recruiting procedure change
    from time to time as the economy fluctuates? Yes_____,
    No_____.

    If your answer is yes, please comment as to what the changes
    are in your staffing procedure._____

    _____

    _____

    _____

J. Please check below the functional managerial area or areas which suffer a reduction in managerial personnel first as a result of a severe recession:

    1. Operations or production   _____
    2. Finance   _____
    3. Sales   _____
    4. Personnel Department   _____
    5. Other (Please specify) _____

K. List the most important human characteristics or human qualities which your company looks for in hiring a new manager.

    1._____
    2._____
    3._____
    4._____
    5._____

L. Please list the greatest weaknesses currently found in new managerial recruits.

    1._____
    2._____
    3._____
    4._____
    5._____

Section IV--Managerial Staffing and Training from Within

A. Please check below the most preferred entry occupations of employees before going into management:

    1. Operations and production   _____
    2. Finance   _____
    3. Sales and advertising   _____
    4. Legal   _____
    5. Personnel   _____
    6. Other_____

B. Please mark the following techniques which are used in staffing managerial positions from within:

    1. Formal merit appraisal or employee evaluation_____
    2. Recommendation of immediate superior_____
    3. Recommendations of others
       (Please explain)_____
    4. Length of service requirement before one is eligible
       for promotion into management_____
    5. Other requirements (Please specify)_____

C. Does your organization have a management training program?
Yes_____, No_____.

If your answer to the above question was yes, please indicate the length of time of the managerial training program._____

D. Please indicate below the techniques which you currently use in your management training program and rank them according to their effectiveness from 1-9:

                                                    Effectiveness
   1. Job Rotation   _____
   2. On-the-job Training   _____
   3. "Assistant to" positions   _____
   4. Multiple Management,
      Jr. Board, etc.   _____
   5. On-the-job Coaching
      & Counseling   _____
   6. In-company Seminars
      and Classes   _____
   7. Tuition Refund Programs   _____
   8. Outside Company:
      Short Courses &
      Seminars   _____
   9. Other_____

E. Please indicate below the course content areas which are included as part of your management training program and rank them according to their effectiveness from 1-8:

                                                    Effectiveness
   1. Fundamentals of
      Management   _____
   2. Personnel Management   _____
   3. Human Relations   _____
   4. Motivation   _____
   5. Community Relations   _____
   6. Problem Solving and
      Decision Making: _____
         Quantitative   _____
         Non-quantitative   _____
         Computer Usage   _____
   7. Communications   _____
   8. Other _____   _____

F. Please list below the steps which your company takes to encourage employees to participate in training activities which will enable them to be promoted into managerial positions._____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

Section V--Managerial Staffing and the Future

A. What types of courses and/or emphasis should colleges
   and universities offer in their management degrees to
   enable your company to recruit more effective managers
   in the future?_____

   _____

   _____

   _____

B. Are there any employment areas where managerial manpower
   shortages are predicted to exist in your company in the
   next five to ten years? Yes_____, No_____.

   If yes, in which managerial area are the shortages expect-
   ed to exist?_____

   _____

C. Please list any new trends in managerial staffing which
   you think may be of significance in the future._____

   _____

   _____

   _____

D. Does your company plan to make a change in your managerial
   staffing procedures and training programs in the future?
   Yes_____, No_____.

   If your answer was yes, please list the probable changes.

   _____

   _____